American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842

CONSTITUENT OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF LEARNED SOCIETIES
AND THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF ORIENTALISTS

ABSTRACTS

OF
COMMUNICATIONS
PRESENTED
AT THE
TWO HUNDRED AND TWENTY-EIGHTH
MEETING

PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA

MARCH 16–19, 2018
A. Ancient Near East I: Language & Linguistics. REBECCA HASSELBACH-ANDEE University of Chicago, Chair (1:30 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Frick Room

1. ANDREW BURLINGAME, University of Chicago

Indefinite Pronouns at Zincirli

The language of Kulamuwa’s orthostat inscription, found at Zincirli in 1902, has been the subject of many treatments since the publication of the text (ed. pr. von Luschan 1911). The appearance of a local monumental inscription written in what has been identified as Standard Phoenician (e.g., Tropper 1993: 284) in a region inhabited by speakers of Luwian and Aramaic has generated significant interest in the politics of language at Sam’al (see most recently Niehr 2016). In this connection, one grammatical feature—the peculiar behavior of the pronouns {m} (“what?”) and {my} (“who?”)—has occasionally elicited suggestions of linguistic influence from the Aramaic substrate language (e.g., Sperling 1988: 335; Tropper 1993: 41). While Aramaic parallels for some of the constructions appearing in Kulamuwa’s inscription can certainly be found, past studies have often overlooked the fundamentally distinct character of the construction appearing in lines 10–11. In this presentation, I offer a semantic and syntactic account of these pronouns that (1) provides a solution to this long-standing difficulty and (2) points to Anatolian linguistic influence in the language of this monumental inscription. This second suggestion adds to the growing body of evidence for extensive interaction between the dynasts of Sam’al and the Anatolian monumental traditions of the region and is of particular interest for its potential historical and sociological implications.

2. ØYVIND BJØRU, University of Texas at Austin

Adverbial Use of Prepositions in First Millennium Akkadian

In Neo- and Late Babylonian private letters, and to some extent Neo-Assyrian state correspondence, the compound prepositions ana/ina libbi and ana/ina muhḥi are often used without an object. This feature does not occur in Second Millennium Akkadian in either major dialect strain. The referent of such dangling prepositions is usually easily retrievable from context, but only a minority of instances can be captured by proposed cross-linguistic theories of preposition stranding. I will show how clauses of a circumstantial or contrastive nature have given rise to this syntactic pattern, and further integrate it into a broader theory of how anaphora across clauses has changed throughout the history of Akkadian.

3. PATRICK NIEDZIELSKI, Independent Scholar, Methuen, MA

Configurational Syntax in the Sumerian clause: Evidence from Cross-Referencing

The Sumerian clause is characterized by a highly synthetic verbal complex that is preceded by free nominals, whose relative order is governed largely by information structure. Despite the over century-long study of Sumerian, though, the details of its clausal syntax are poorly understood. The large array of verbal properties that can be marked within the verbal complex, the tendency for pragmatically inferable
nominals to be dropped, and the many different morphological analyses of the verbal complex in the literature have largely conspired against in-depth study of Sumerian syntax.

I argue that the behavior of two of the cross-referencing morphological slots in the verbal template—the final person-prefix (FPP) slot before the verb stem and the person suffix (PS) slot after the verb stem—points to the existence of an underlying configurational structure. In particular, I argue that the PS is not pronominal cross-referencing, as is commonly assumed, but rather true agreement, the result of a (Multiple) Agree relation (Chomsky 2001, Hiraiwa 2001, and others) with the structurally highest active nominal in the clause. In contrast, the FPP is a doubled pronominal clitic that moves into its position in the verbal complex post-syntactically.

In support of this, I provide an analysis of the ergative cross-referencing split between the *hamtu* and *marù* aspects, adapted from previous analyses of other ergative languages. I then show that this analysis allows for a principled account of the third-person plural agent marking in *hamtu* forms, which is distributed between an FPP /n-/ and a PS /-es/.


4. Frederick Bowman, Ohio State University

The Establishment of the Coptic Possessive Article: Hints from Middle Chinese

This paper considers an Egyptian-Coptic construction in the light of a Middle Chinese (MC) analogue. In Chinese, Shi and Li (2002) argue that the establishment of the MC / early Mandarin genitive *de* was owed to that of the classifier system. This creates a new ‘optimal structure’ for noun phrases: ‘NUMERAL + MODIFIER + HEAD’ (*yi shu* ‘one book’ > *yi ben shu* ‘one CLASSIFIER book’). This structure became generalized into a schema ‘MODIFIER+ GRAMMATICAL MARKER + HEAD,’ into which the demonstrative *di* ‘that’ (later *de*) was fit and reanalyzed as a complementizer (*xie ren* ‘the person who writes,’ lit. ‘write person’ > *xie di ren* ‘id.,’ lit. ‘write COMP person’), and thence a genitive. Yap et al (2010) analyze *di* rather as a locative noun while still recognizing the schema originated by the classifier system.

In Coptic, an older possessive construction *ran-k* ‘your name,’ co-occurs with a newer one *pe-k-ran* ‘id.;’ here the possessive affix -k ‘your’ is infixed between definite article *pe* and the nominal *ran* ‘name’ it modifies. This has been proposed (e.g. Haspelmath 2014, Junge 1996) to originate in an appositive construction involving inflected demonstratives: *po-k, ran* ‘that-of-yours, the name’ > *pe-k-ran, your name.* I advance that this may rather also be a schematic development:

Late Egyptian had already developed polysynthetic verbal morphology: *eire-f sotem* ‘he did the hearing’ > *a-f sotem* ‘he heard.’ This became the new ‘optimal structure’ for verb phrases: MODIFIER (TAM) + SUFFIX (AGENT) + HEAD (VERB) = *a-f sotem*. This schema could then be extended into the nominal domain, and the demonstrative *pe* fit into it as *di* was in Chinese: MODIFIER (DEF) + SUFFIX (POSS) + HEAD (NOUN) = *pe-k-ran*. Thus, I propose that the Coptic possessive
article construction arose analogically, *ex nihilo*, with no preceding analogue in the nominal domain.

5. **Peter T. Daniels**, Independent Scholar, Jersey City, NJ

**On Egyptian and South Semitic Letter Order**

The unfamiliar letter-order of Ethiopic came to the attention of European scholars in the mid 16th century; the similar letter-order of Old South Arabian was inferred some 400 years later and confirmed more recently in a few Old North Arabian inscriptions. More recently, though, some late (Ptolemaic) Egyptian documents have been identified as evidence of a similar order in use in the last centuries BCE. The latest addition to the database, however, is of a much older—early New Kingdom—partial attestation of the South Arabian order in Egyptian script. It is thus suggested that the South Semitic order was adopted from an existing Egyptian order. This, however, cannot stand, because Egyptian has no /l/. The South Arabian order begins *hlhm* but the Egyptian order begins *hrhm*. This should not be a problem—except that the Egyptian order includes another /r/, just where the South Arabian /r/ occurs. It thus seems likely that the early Egyptian order is a rendition of the South Arabian order, and not vice versa.

6. **Ki-Eun Jang**, New York University

**The Energetic -n of the Non-Prefix Conjugation in Ugaritic**

The surplus nasal consonant -n attached to verbs before an object suffix, customarily termed the energetic -n, is well-known in Ugaritic. Past discussion of the energetic -n, however, has been predicated on its appearance and usage in the prefix conjugation. In spite of the prevailing occurrence in the prefix conjugation, the energetic -n is not restricted to it. While rare cases of -n in the non-prefix conjugation have been recognized by previous scholars (Verreet 1988; Krebernik 1993; Zewi 1999), the examples are mostly taken from poetic literary texts. Consequently, they are often understood as a stylistic variant. Otherwise, such cases are commonly considered secondary forms derived from the prefix-conjugation.

In this paper, I propose that these explanations for the energetic -n in Ugaritic should be reassessed in light of all evidence for the -n attached to non-prefix conjugation verbs in the Ugaritic corpus. Explanation of the exceptional cases by style only works if the occurrence of -n is limited to literary genres. Yet the existence of the energetic -n in the suffix conjugation from non-literary writing such as letters and legal texts (KTU 2.108; KTU 3.2; KTU 3.5) weakens the explanation for the exceptional cases by style. Its occurrence in a variety of genres suggests instead that it is not a spontaneous stylistic variant, but a scribal convention that applies to everyday written language. If a common origin of -n in both the prefix and the non-prefix conjugations is not assumed, the latter need not be explained by the former. The freestanding usage of -n in the non-prefix conjugation further suggests that there is no need to reconstruct the erased prefix signs as in KTU 1.14 IV 49-50, so that the verbal form in question could be read as a normal imperfective form with energetic -n.
7. **Federico Zangani**, Brown University

Papyrus Anastasi I and Eight Ostraca from the Museo Egizio of Turin

This paper sets out to present eight hieratic ostraca from Deir el-Medina bearing passages from the Satirical Letter of Hori, currently kept in the Museo Egizio of Turin. This literary contest between two scribes is known mainly from P. Anastasi I, and provides invaluable insights into the scribal culture of New Kingdom Egypt. However, it has received far less attention than it would deserve due to the linguistic and interpretational challenges it poses. This paper will study these ostraca philologically and assess how they relate to the papyrus manuscript and how they contribute to our knowledge of this text. Broader considerations will be made concerning its language, content, and its cultural significance within the context of an Egyptian workmen’s community during the Late Bronze Age.

8. **Kathryn McConaughy Medill**, Johns Hopkins University

Canaano-Akkadian and the Idrimi Statue Inscription

The *Idrimi Statue Inscription* (ISI) from Alalah (modern Tell Atchana) has added immeasurably to our understanding of Late Bronze Syria since it was published by Smith in 1949. However, it is notorious for its non-standard Akkadian grammar and paleography. Early studies on the inscription declared the ISI’s language to be full of mistakes. While more recent studies have explained individual problems in the inscription, a systematic framework for the verbal system has been lacking. Following up a suggestion from Dietrich and Loretz (1981), this paper examines three types of non-standard verb forms in the ISI and argues that these are best understood as reflexes of a scribal code similar to the Canaano-Akkadian code of the Taanach and Amarna Letters. Recognition that a similar scribal code existed at the same time as Canaano-Akkadian but outside of Egypt’s imperial borders helps to nuance our understanding of the use and social meaning of West-Semiticized Akkadian codes.

**B. East Asia I: Classical Scholarship.** **David Prager Branner**, New York, Chair (2:30 p.m.–4:00 p.m.) Phipps Room *

9. **Yanxia He**, University of Chicago

Narrating Past in Early China: The Qin National Foundation Myths and the Qin Inscriptions

This paper is a critical examination of the Qin national foundation myths recorded at the beginning of the *Qin benji* (The Imperial annals of Qin) of Sima Qian’s *Shiji* (The Records of Historian) in light of the Qin inscriptions. It will argue that the Qin inscriptions consisted of early bell-chime inscriptions and imperial stele inscriptions are the direct testimonies of the changing ideology of Qin when it transitioned from a local marginal regime to a universal empire. The radical change of cultural orientation discerned in Qin material culture from the *Chunqiu* to Warring States time confirms this ideology adaptation from another angle. We are thus equipped with an insight to probe into the changing dynamics that ultimately produced a variety of Qin national foundation myths collated in Sima Qian’s historiography. As what we will show, the pantheon of Qin ancestors are mythological indexes of this changing ideology. The early Qin national history, of which the Feizi story is part, corresponds to Qin’s effort
to situate itself in the Western Zhou past, as a way to establish the legitimacy for a newly emergent polity in a world dominated by the nostalgia for Western Zhou during the time of Chunqiu. By contrast, the Boyi story evidently tailors to the Warring States cultural milieu when invoking archaic sage kings had become the new manner to understand the Chinese past. More than that, the Warring States political culture defined by bureaucracy is deeply embedded in the narrative of Boyi’s story. Methodologically, it will demonstrate that traditional historiography still may illustrate historical dynamic as long as they bear a critical scrutiny in a time when scholars are penchant for newly excavated texts with regard to ancient civilization studies.

10. Xiaoqing Miao, University of Colorado Boulder

The Self-statement by Historians: from Sima Qian to Liu Zhiji

Since the great Han historian Sima Qian (145–86 BCE) included “Zixu” (Self-statement) as the last chapter of his Shi ji, the self-statement—or “Self-narration”—became an oft-seen feature in historical works from the Han through the Nanbeichao period. The importance of this tradition was noticed 1300 years ago by the Tang historian Liu Zhiji (661–721), who devoted an entire chapter of his Shitong (Historical Perspectives) to the discussion of the self-statement by historians. Liu Zhiji also penned a “Zixu” chapter of his own for his Shitong, although the tradition seems to have been abandoned at the time. Since Liu Zhiji, however, historians’ self-statements, with the exception of the “Zixu” by Sima Qian, have rarely been examined, other than as mining grounds for biographical information. In this paper, I shall discuss the tradition of the self-statement by historians from Sima Qian to Liu Zhiji, with a particular focus on Liu Zhiji and his Shitong. I suggest that the abandonment of this tradition was related to the establishment of the historiographical office in the Tang, which made history that used to be “the words of a single person or a single family” into “the words of a state.” Moreover, because of the establishment of the historiographical office, bureaucracy came to harm historians’ initiatives and often undermined their principles. And the complication of history, now a state-sponsored project, was inevitably influenced by the state’s will, especially the emperor’s wishes.

11. David B. Honey, Brigham Young University

Scholarship or Politics? Some Cultural, Political, and Academic Considerations behind the Imperial Sponsorship of the Correct Meaning of the Five Classics

The primary function of the Correct Meaning of the Five Classics (Wujing zhengyi) was to unify disparate schools of classical exegesis to create an orthodox ideology to support the political unification of the early Tang dynasty. But what were the cultural, political, and academic factors behind imperial sponsorship? In 638 AD, senior classical master Kong Yingda (574–648) was summoned to head up a committee to provide a set of “epexegeses” (shu 疏), sub-commentaries on the most authoritative “annotations” (zhu 注) that were in vogue at the time on the Five Classics of Confucianism. The first version was produced in 642, but some critical aspersions cast against its propensity for prolix prose, unfocused redundancies, and obvious errors led to a new round of revisions. The finished work was officially promulgated in 651.
The high intrinsic value of the *Correct Meaning of the Five Classics* for the history of classical scholarship goes without saying, marking as it does a watershed moment in the development of exegesis. This set of classical texts, annotations, and sub-commentaries became normative for the imperial exams—when attention could be wrested from the *Four Books* (Sisú 四書) starting during the mid-Yuan period—and authoritative for scholarly research today.

This paper will examine some important considerations that motivated the throne to sponsor this grand project which go well beyond the need for ideological unity, most of which focus on the need to strengthen the political, cultural, and academic supremacy of the capital at Chang’an vis-à-vis entrenched interests in Shandong and in formerly southern states beyond the Yangzi River.

C. **Islamic Near East I: Scholars and History.** BRUCE FUDGE, Université de Genève, Chair (12:30 p.m.–2:30 p.m.) Conference Room A *

12. HADI JORATI, Yale University, The Ohio State University

Textual Criticism and Historiography: The Early Ilkhanid Corpus

The Mongol military campaigns of the thirteenth century in the Near East not only destroyed and replaced the vast Khwarazmian empire, they also eliminated a host of local governments, from various Seljuq principalities to the Batini Kingdom and the Caliphate of Baghdad. The successor state that replaced them all, the Ilkhanate of Hülagü, with its imperial ideology, heralded a new era not just in the political history of Iran, but also in Persian historiography, in a way with a much larger scope, with the production of such works of history as ‘Aṭā Malik Juwaynī’s *Tārīkh-i Jahāngūshā*, and Rashīd’s *Jāmī al-Tawārīkh*. These two books are not only are the earliest and most trusted sources for the history of the period, they also became the model for practically all historical writing in Persian up until the modern times, with the second one also serving as the model for the ‘Universal History’ genre in Persian.

Notwithstanding the central position of them both in Persian historiography, the history of the transmission of the texts is complicated, and partially obscured. Although this has been acknowledged in the case of *Jāmī al-Tawārīkh*, neither its full extent nor its implications have been researched comprehensively. In this talk I propose for the first time and argue that Jahāngūshā also suffers from textual complications, for reasons that have to with the turbulent politics of the time, particularly within the administration of the Ilkhanid state. Furthermore, I show that this new reading of Jahāngūshā has serious implications for the history of the early Ilkhanid period, in particular Hülagü’s campaign. This, in turn implies that there are further textual problems with *Jāmī al-Tawārīkh* than previously realized, which sheds new light on not just the text, but the history of its transmission.

13. MICHAEL DANN, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign

Notes on *Rijāl* Literature after Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī (d. 852/1449)

This paper examines an unpublished tenth/sixteenth century biographical dictionary of hadith narrators known as *Ghāyat al-marām ǧī rijāl al-Bukhārī ilā sayyid al-anām* by the Syrian scholar Muhammad b. Dāwūd al-Bazīlī (d. 925/1519). Little is known about the contents or character of *rijāl* literature produced after the seminal
figure Ibn Ḥajar al-‘Asqalānī, whose works have generally been treated as the authoritative summation of the Sunnī ṟiyāl tradition. Al-Bāzīlī’s work, dedicated entirely to narrators found in Šāhīḥ al-Bukhārī, was one of the most popular ṟiyāl texts authored after Ibn Ḥajar and thus holds the potential to shed significant light on how the genre continued to develop after him. My examination of al-Bāzīlī’s work suggests that trends identified briefly by other authors as shaping the work of Ibn Ḥajar continued and in some ways intensified after him. For example, Juynboll has suggested that Ibn Ḥajar “hid” anecdotes with a negative import for prominent narrators outside the biographies of their principal subjects and Brown has drawn attention to the apologetic aims of Ibn Ḥajar’s introduction to his commentary on Šāhīḥ al-Bukhārī, which was devoted in large measure to deflecting potential criticisms of al-Bukhārī’s work. Al-Bāzīlī likewise exhibits a strong propensity to omit anecdotes that cast prominent narrators in a negative light and some of the explicitly apologetic aims of Ibn Ḥajar’s commentarial work bleed into what had traditionally been a genre dedicated to the critical evaluation of hadith narrators irrespective of their presence or absence in a given work. Although these trends are pronounced in al-Bāzīlī’s work, they are not completely linear. On rare occasion he voices criticism of al-Bukhārī’s choices, but on the whole the apologetic tone of his work is virtually unprecedented in the genre of ṟiyāl literature.

14. AAMIR BASHIR, University of Chicago

Training Ḥanafī ‘Ulama’ in the Modern Period (c. 1800–the Present): A Comparative Study of Madrasa Curricula in the South Asian and Turkish Islamic Scholarly Traditions

Ottoman/Turkish and South Asian Islamic scholarly traditions represent two distinct streams of Islamic thought (mainly Ḥanafi) that have developed mostly separately over the last few centuries. In the modern period (c. 1800 – the present), both traditions are characterized by an extensive system of educational institutions, namely the madrasas. While both traditions have been studied to varying degrees by native scholars and Western academics, very few works of comparative study exist. The sole comparative work that focuses on madrasa curricula, namely Francis Robinson’s “Ottomans-Safavids-Mughals: Shared Knowledge and Connective Systems” (1997), does not go beyond the 18th century.

Relying on primary and secondary textual sources complemented by fieldwork in Pakistan and Turkey, in this paper, I document the respective evolution of Late Ottoman/Turkish and South Asian madrasa curricula in the modern period. By comparing the relative attention given to transmitted, rational and ancillary sciences, I demonstrate that whereas the Late Ottoman madrasa curricula were more comprehensive than their South Asian counterparts, contemporary South Asian madrasa curricula are now much more comprehensive than the contemporary Turkish ones. By looking at specific texts and their positions in these curricula, I also identify the relatively stable core of texts in all branches of Islamic learning in the two systems. Like Ebrahim Moosa in his What is a Madrasa? (2015), I argue that this stable core of texts explains the coherence and resilience of the two scholarly traditions. I also argue that production of local texts for ancillary sciences and Ḥanafi commentaries on Ḥadīth works demonstrates increased vitality of the South Asian Ḥanafi tradition as opposed to the contemporary Turkish one. I conclude by suggesting some pre-
liminary explanations for the peculiarities of the way these curricula have evolved, mainly focusing on the particular contexts of late Ottoman/Republican Turkey and colonial/post-colonial South Asia.

15. Kameliya Atanasova, Washington and Lee University

A Sub-Genre of Sufi Autobiographical Writing or Notes on a Page? A look at Ottoman varidät Writings

A popular Turkish Sufi saying is that, “There is no spiritual insight (vârid in Turkish) for the one who does not perform supererogatory devotions.”¹ References to such spiritual insights abound in Sufi literature, where they appear in the form of prophetic dreams, voices uttering Qur'anic verses, and strange bodily sensations. In addition to vâridät, “occurrences”, they are described as fûthâât, “openings,” or tecelliyât, “manifestations.” Despite their ubiquitous place in Sufi writings, including, notably, Ibn ‘Arabi’s Fûthâât-i Mekkiyye, vâridät’s role in the larger context of Sufi autobiographical writing is yet to be assessed.

My paper engages existing paradigms in the study of Sufi self-narratives through an intertextual analysis of a selection of Ottoman vâridät works from the late seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. The goal of my study is to evaluate the internal and external rhetorical and ideological functions of this type of Sufi writing, and assess the usefulness of classifying vâridät as a distinct sub-genre of Sufi autobiography.

Scholarship on Sufi autobiography diverges on the method and scope of genre classification for Sufi memoirs and the functionality of such typologies. While Jamal Elias and Derin Terzioğlu have highlighted common themes that may enable genre classification of Sufi self-narratives, Cemal Kafadar has demonstrated how the broad thematic scope of such works poses challenges to any rigid categorization.

My study takes part in this conversation through a study of the vâridät works compiled by Aziz Mahmud Hüdayi (d. 1628), Ismail Hakki Bursevi (d. 1725), and Haşim Baba (d. 1783), as well as a commentary of Hüdayi’s work by Abdülgani el-Nablusi (d. 1731). I argue that a closer look at Ottoman Sufi vâridät works’ framing techniques and intertextual references allows us a glimpse into the process of literary canon-formation within a Sufi order, and ideological points of consensus and contestation between orders.

D. Islamic Near East II: In Honor of Geert Jan Van Gelder: “Keep the Listener from Dozing Off”. Peri Bearman, Harvard University, Chair (2:45 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Conference Room A *

16. Everett Rowson, New York University

LGBT in Medieval Arabic: A Taxonomy of Sexual Configurations in a Tenth-Century Work of Erotica

The earliest preserved treatise of literary erotica in Arabic, the obscure Ibn Naṣr al-Kâtib’s Jawâmi′ al-ladhadha (“Encyclopedia of Pleasure”) from the late tenth century, offers (amidst many many other things) a fascinatingly analytic taxonomy of possible sexual relations that may be profitably compared to (and in part contrasted with)

¹ Vâdi olmayanın vâridi yoktur.
contemporary “LGBT” shorthand. This paper will summarize Ibn Nasr’s presentation of his taxonomy and explore its implications for understanding what the modern West (but not Ibn Nasr) might term non-heteronormative relations in the medieval Islamic world, but as understood therein, with attention to both sex and gender. Despite being arguably the richest of all Arabic eroticalogical texts, the Jawāmiʿ has been understudied, and its publishing history is deplorable; this paper is intended in part to illustrate its importance for understanding conceptions of sex and gender in the medieval Islamic world.

17. DAVID LARSEN, New York University

Night and Day in Arabic Literary Disputation

The genre of allegorical debate, in which animate, inanimate, and abstract entities vie in contests of denigration and self-praise, goes back to the beginnings of Near Eastern literature. In Arabic it is a highly productive genre, with some pairs of litigants recurring often enough to constitute subgenres unto themselves. And so it is with Night and Day, who are pitted against each other in (at least) five prosimetrum works spanning the 4th/10th and the 14th/19th centuries. The genre’s stability, remarked on by all who study it, is best evaluated through longitudinal surveys of individual subgenres (notably van Gelder’s 1987 study of Pen and Sword, and Heinrichs 1991 on Rose and Narcissus), and that is the approach taken here to debates between Night and Day—“the two ages” made by Arabic writers into a quarreling merism for all sublunary time.

18. LI GUO, University of Notre Dame

Shadow Play Jargons from Post-Mamluk Cairo: Based on Manuscript Evidence

Arabic shadow theatre in post-Mamluk Egypt witnessed an overhaul of sorts, resulting in drastic divergences—in content and form—with the earlier mode. Unlike Mamluk shadow plays that use classical poetry as the main narrative vehicle, the post-Mamluk shadow play lyrics are mostly zajal vernacular verses. No dialogue and staging instructions were to be written out (at least not in the known manuscripts). This points to a trend: the songbook format, from which the performer was free to choose the material for staging. Presumably, he would improvise the dialogue promptly. In order for these poetry anthologies to work as theatrical “scripts,” verses are highlighted by headlines, on account of genre, theme, scene, and even mood, and so forth. These headliners, consisting of catchphrases or short sentences, contain jargons, or technical terms, that are not found in classical lexica or earlier Mamluk texts. In other words, they evidence a new set of vocabulary for shadow play documentation and performance. In my presentation, I attempt at deciphering these terms. Citing examples from the known manuscripts, I catalogue these terms and discuss their function as part and parcel of a new formula for Arabic shadow play composition, preservation, and performance in Ottoman and early modern Egypt.
19. EREZ NAAMAN, American University

“A Glance is Enough”: Gesture in Medieval Islamic Cultures

Gesture is an essential form of human non-verbal communication. Despite its ubiquity, gesture is elusive when it is the object of an inquiry into the pre-modern past. One of the main reasons for that is the notorious difficulty to describe it adequately in words, hence its sporadic, scattered, and lacking representation in textual sources. These limitations notwithstanding, studying gestures in medieval Islamic cultures is possible and much needed. It is required for a fuller understanding of communication and interaction between individuals, and a better picture of social conventions and practices. In fact, some writers and thinkers of the medieval Islamic world noted the centrality of gesture to human communication and discussed it in various contexts. We come across statements and dicta praising gestures, e.g., meaningful glances, as fine and eloquent substitutes for plain words. Other comments coming from a moralist viewpoint advised against excessive gesturing in order to maintain one’s dignity. Alongside theoretical and prescriptive comments, however, substantial descriptive evidence is gained from accounts and poems depicting gestural behavior.

My paper begins with a discussion of various ideas about gesture, gleaned from medieval Arabic sources. I shall then limit myself to two illustrative examples, the first of which involves lovers’ meaningful glances. An important communicative function of gesture was to exchange hidden messages, and we find much evidence of its use among those who needed to protect themselves and conceal their secrets from others. These were notably lovers, who often had to hide their feelings toward their beloved, fearing social disapproval and sanction. My second example concerns the experiences of a traveler from the Islamic West, who was surprised to discover in Syria greeting practices involving gestures very different from those performed in his homeland. We gain much from his traveler’s sensitivity to regional difference and his cultural interpretation.

20. LARA HAR, Princeton University

Plot in Aristotelian Arabic Poetics

It is well known that Arabic philosophy had a unique reading of Aristotle’s Poetics. Having understood the work as part of the Organon, they interpreted poetry as a kind of syllogism. This led them to understand the Aristotelian concept of mimesis as simile (tashbih). In this talk, I investigate what they make of Aristotle’s concept of plot (mythos), which is translated, among other terms, as khurifa (fictional story). I will try to make sense of this understanding, focusing on Ibn Sīnā’s commentary on the Poetics, with some reference to later philosophically influenced works, including al-Qarṭājānī. I will consider the implications of their understanding for medieval Arabic conceptions of narrative, fiction, and the representation of reality.

21. GEERT JAN VAN GELDER, University of Oxford

Ibn Sīnā the Poet

That Ibn Sīnā (d. 428/1037), the famous philosopher and physician, also composed Arabic poetry is well known. Especially popular was his long medical poem, versified knowledge without literary pretensions, meant to be memorised. The encyclopædia of
physicians by Ibn Abī Usaybi‘ah (d. 668/1270), `Uyūn al-anbā`, contains some “true” poetry attributed to him. The most famous piece, an allegorical poem on the human soul, is probably not by him, but other poems are certainly authentic. Surprisingly, for someone that famous, it seems that they have hardly been studied. A few longer poems are characterised by archaic style and recondite vocabulary. An amusing incident in Ibn Sīnā’s life sheds light on this; it turns out that I was not the first to struggle with them.

E. South & Southeast Asia I: Veda 1–3. (1:30 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Conference Room B

Section 1: Rhetoric and Meter. STEPHANIE JAMISON, University of California, Los Angeles, Chair

22. JARROD WHITAKER, Wake Forest University

Scorched-Earth Polemics and the Power of Hate-Speech in Vedic Poetry

This paper will analyze the poetic and political function of hate-speech in the Rgveda and Atharvaveda, particularly in the use of the verb √dvīṣ (“to hate”) and its appearances in formulaic language such as “he who hates us, whom we hate” (e.g., RV.3.53.21cd: yo no dvīṣṭy...yām u dvīṣmās...) and the nominal compound brahmadvīṣ- (“brāhmaṇ-hater”). While hate-speech may reflect the defensive or threatened nature of early Vedic life, poets use such polemical language deliberately to express their command of Speech (vāc) and the power of their sacred formulations (brāhmaṇ).

In these terms, such language is a necessary component of priestly discourse because insults, preemptive verbal strikes, and retaliatory speech acts demonstrate performatively the truth of the poet’s verbal power and his willingness to defend it. Consequently, by discrediting the veracity of real or imagined rivals and in seeking their destruction, early Vedic poets strategically present themselves as authoritative, in touch with the gods, and worthy of patronage. Such language is integral to many Rgvedic and Atharvavedic hymns and forms part of the larger discursive framework that functions to underscore the exclusionary nature of priestly communities.

23. JOEL BRERETON, University of Texas at Austin

How the Gāyatrī Became the Gāyatrī

The Rgvedic Gāyatrī or Sāvitrī verse—RV 3.62.10 tāt savitūr vāreṇyam bhārgo devāsyā dhīmahi | dhūya yó naḥ pracodāyāt—is the most famous single verse and ritually most significant verse of the Rgveda. It was and is taught in the upanayana rite of Vedic initiation and repeated in the daily samādhyā. Variants of the Gāyatrī occur in the worship of the greatest gods of the Hindu tradition. But why should that verse have had such a destiny? Why should it and not one of the Rgveda’s many more elegant, more lovely, or more complex verses become the text’s legacy mantra? Others have raised this same question, but they have not provided a satisfactory answer. This paper will not provide one either. Rather, it will chart the rise of the Gāyatrī within the Vedic corpus and thereby clarify not why this verse rose to prominence but how. It will argue that this process had already begun within the Rgvedic period itself and that it developed especially within the White Yajurveda. By the late Vedic period, the Gāyatrī occupied a central position within the ritual traditions of all other Vedic schools as well.
Identifying the type of rhetoric employed in Vedic discourse is integral to translation. For example, Jamison and Brereton applied careful poetic analysis, such as detecting the omphalos structure and unpacking figurative language, to clarify elements of puzzling hymns in their translation of the *Rgveda*. Building on Renou’s work, Thompson recorded discernible features of *brahmodya*, which he refers to as a type of ritualized verbal contest divided into various classifications. As a result, he found more examples of *brahmodya* than had been known previously. He also looked into truth acts (*satyakriya*) as a category of speech acts separate from oaths, vows, confessions, curses, and blessings. Gonda wrote a book on *Mantra Interpretation in the *Satapatha Brāhmaṇa*, in which he distinguished mantras from other types of ritual speech. In his dissertation, Smith focused on monologues in which the Rgvedic poet asserts himself to be Indra. Brereton investigated what he calls the enigma in Vedic, asserting, “The lack resolution within the hymn causes the audience of RV 10.129 to reflect” (see “Edifying Puzzlement”). Taking as my starting point the work of Renou, Thompson, and Brereton, this paper will explore Vedic koans—to borrow a term from Buddhism. A koan is a question, to which sometimes the teacher gives a puzzling answer, used as a means to open the student’s mind to a mode of knowing beyond thinking. In *Zen Buddhism*, Suzuki suggests that meditation on the question, which itself is half the solution, changes one’s perception by forcing the mind to relinquish, and thereby go beyond, cognitive thought (135). Is a similar a strategy used in Vedic revelations? If so, identifying cases of koans could contribute to how such passages are understood.

**Section 2: Objects and Entities.** Jarrod Whitaker, Wake Forest University, Chair

25. Caley Charles Smith, McGill University

The Ritual Function of the Family Maṇḍala in the Rigveda

This talk attempts to re-think the Rigvedic maṇḍalas not as formerly independent collections, but as textual divisions serving some ritual application. In order to make the case that the maṇḍala reflects a performative and not a historical reality, I will demonstrate that the family books were created at the same time as evidence that dividing poetic material into discrete subgroups was something important to redactors of the text as opposed to its contributors. If the family maṇḍalas are not formerly independent collections, then they were created whole-cloth by a later generation by some rubric which assigned poetic material to a particular maṇḍala. Just as the content of the hymns is overwhelmingly committed to the performance of the Soma sacrifice, I will argue that the interpretative decision represented by division of a maṇḍala is also an expression of this commitment. It stands to reason the ritual performance presupposed by a given hymn is not that presupposed by another hymn, for any two poems may have been composed by different human poets from different region and centuries. The structure of the anthology as a whole, however, would have been created to serve the Soma ritual as it was known to the Rigvedic redactors. The structural features of the Rigveda, therefore, provide us with insight into the ritual as it was practiced at the end of the Rigvedic period.
26. **Stephanie Jamison**, University of California Los Angeles  
**A Golden Amulet in Vedic and Avestan**

In Rigveda I.33.8 the hard-pressed enemies of Indra and the Ārya forces that he is favoring “adorn themselves with a golden amulet” (híranyena maññā śumbhamānāḥ). This attention to personal adornment seems out of place in the desperate battle context in which they find themselves, but it has attracted almost no comment. (Geldner suggests that it helps them see in the dark.) As has long been known, the phrase híranya- mañ- has a correspondent in the Younger Avestan hapax compound zarmumaini- (Y.14.33), an epithet of a vulture or other bird of prey. I will argue that in RV I.33.8 “adorning themselves with a golden amulet” is a figurative expression for becoming food for vultures. The image of birds of prey scavenging on the battlefield is of course a common and powerful trope later, in the Sanskrit epic.

27. **Hans Henrich Hock**, University of Illinois  
**Two Watery Problems in the Rig Veda**

The question of how to interpret the word samudrā in the Rig Veda has been recently revived by Aklujkar (2014) and Stuhrmann (2015). Both argue that samudrā refers to a salt-water ‘sea’ or ‘ocean’. Aklujkar finds further support for his interpretation at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Samudra.  

Stuhrmann defends his interpretation against Klaus’s (1989) interpretation of samudrā as ‘breiter Strom’, in the context of a broader argument in favor of contact between invading Indo-Aryans and late stages of the Indus Civilization. Aklujkar’s argument comes in the larger context of the controversy whether the Sarasvati river flowed to the sea and whether the epithet sīndhumātā can be interpreted as ‘mother of the rivers/of the Sindhu’.

This paper examines Stuhrmann’s and Aklujkar’s arguments, focusing on the linguistic and philological evidence, and setting aside their broader prehistorical claims and the differences between the two.

Stuhrmann’s arguments for interpreting samudrā as ‘sea, ocean’ include revival of Thieme’s proposal that salilā and sarāt are related to Western Indo-European words for ‘salt’ and the claim that the occurrence of śaṅkhā ‘conch’ and kīśana ‘pearl’ attest to contact with the sea. I show that Thieme’s interpretations of passages such as RV 7.49.1, 7.70.2, 10.129.3 as referring to a salty flood are forced (in fact, it is difficult to imagine how āpo devir could emanate from a “salzige Flut”), and that Klaus’s and other earlier scholar’s interpretations of samudrā, sarāt, and salilā as ‘flood (etc.)’ are preferable. Regarding ‘conch’ and ‘pearl’, Stuhrmann ignores the possibility that these may reflect long-distance trade relationships and, perhaps even more important, the existence of pearl-producing freshwater mollusks in South Asia (e.g. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pearl#Freshwater_and_saltwater_pearls)

Regarding Aklujkar’s arguments, note that only some of the views referred to at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Samudra support an interpretation of samudrā as a salt-water ‘sea’; early on, the article states that ‘The precise semantic field of the Vedic word is difficult to establish’. More specifically, Aklujkar’s interpretation of sīndhumātā (RV 7.36.6), though supported by Sāyana, is problematic. Not only does its accent on the first compound member favor bahuvrihi interpretation, the other occurrences of the compound (with the same accentuation) occur in contexts where
only a bahuvihi interpretation is possible (RV 1.46.2, 9.61.7, 10.78..6), and the same holds true for all other compounds with accent on the nominal first member and mātr or another kinship term as second member. Moreover, nothing in the context of the verse or the entire hymn forces a reading ‘mother of the rivers/of the Sindhu’ rather than ‘whose mothers are the [just-mentioned] rivers’.

We must therefore conclude that neither an interpretation of samudrā (and even more so sarīt, salītā) as referring to ‘sea, ocean, salty flood’ nor a reading of sīndhumātā as ‘mother of the rivers/of the Sindhu’ is supported by conclusive evidence. The broader prehistoric claims of Aklujkar and Stuhrmann will have to rely on other evidence.

References


Klaus (1989) – Samudrā im Veda. ZDMG Suppl. 7

Stuhrmann (2015) – Schiffahrt im Rigveda. EJVS 22(3)

Section 3: Recitation and Contemplative Practice. Joel Brereton, University of Texas, Chair

28. Finnian Gerety, Institute of Sacred Music, Yale University

The Leaves and the Pin: the Construction of OM in Vedic Prose Texts

While the Sanskrit mantra ‘OM’ has been central to recitation, ritual, meditation, and yoga in South Asia for the last three thousand years, very little is known about its origins and early history. In this talk, I trace the formative development of OM in Vedic texts and ritual, focusing on its construction in the Brāhmaṇas and Āraṇyakas, neglected prose genres that precede the celebrated Upaniṣads. My aim is to emphasize the interplay between ritual performance and textual discourse in the middle Vedic period, and to show how this cross-pollination contributes to OM’s rise as a key emblem of Vedic authority and soteriology. I take as my case study a famous Upaniṣadic simile comparing a pin’s perforation of leaves to OM’s penetration of speech; this image has often been interpreted as that of manuscript leaves pierced by a pin to thread them together. By tracing this imagery back past its locus classicus in the Chāndogya Upaniṣad to its antecedents in the obscure prose texts of the Jaiminiya school of Śaṁaveda, I show that the simile of the leaves and the pin is strongly influenced by OM’s recitational contexts in sacrifice. Accordingly, I offer an alternative interpretation of the imagery that is rooted in Vedic ritual and unrelated to manuscript culture.

29. Neil Dalal, University of Alberta

Smṛti as Contemplative Practice in Advaita Vedānta

According to Brhadāraṇyaka Upaniṣad 1.4.7, people misunderstand the ātman as incomplete, viewing it as different names and functions like breath when breathing, sight when seeing, and mind when thinking. Instead, “one should know (these functions) as the self alone” (ātmyety evopāśita) for they all become one in it. Śaṅkara places great importance on ātmyety evopāśita as direct knowledge of one’s nondual self, rather than enjoining action or meditation. He devotes an extended commentary on it, in which he discusses a “continued memory of self-knowledge” (ātmajānānamṛṣītantati).
This *smṛtisantati* plays an essential role in his commentarial debate with Mimāmsaka ritualists on 1.4.7, and is an important key to understand his view of contemplative practice and living liberation, yet it remains a mysterious phenomenon. It is not clear what exactly *smṛti* is, whether recollection, recognition, or attention. How does it arise? And what relationship does it have to forgetting and cessation of mind? In this paper, I parse out the possibilities of *smṛtisantati* and analyze its function in Śaṅkara’s epistemology of liberation. I explore the possibility that *smṛtisantati* is a unique instance of a continuous stream of cognition (*dhrāvāhikabuddhi*), and argue that *smṛti* is best understood here as re-recognition rather than memory.

### A. Ancient Near East II: Identity

**KAREN SONIK, Auburn University, Chair**  
(9:00 a.m.–10:00 a.m.) *Frick Room*

#### 30. Sigrid K. Kjær, University of Texas at Austin

**Gentiles and Riff-Raff: Terms of Othering in Ethiopic and Old South Arabian Texts**

In Late Antique Yemen, more precisely 517–525 CE, a fervently religious king called Joseph dhu Nuwas took power and waged war against the Christians in the area. This king and his kingdom was Jewish. When the Ethiopian King Kaleb got wind of the acts perpetrated by dhu Nuwas he sent an army across the Mandeb Strait but failed initially at killing dhu Nuwas. Ultimately, the Ethiopians prevailed in Yemen, and killed dhu Nuwas, and burnt down the temples.

Only a handful of contemporary epigraphs describe these events, in fact only three in Late Sabaic, and two fragmentary compositions in early Ge'ez. These texts are royal and ideological texts using the terminology of the winning side to describe the other, the enemy. Although dhu Nuwas ultimately lost, the Sabaic inscriptions we have describe a moment in time in which he was winning and had the impetus and momentum to have monumental inscriptions put up.

This presentation analyses the terms used by either side to describe the opponent. Until dhu Nuwas, pre-Islamic Yemen had had a varied religious milieu of Christians, Jews, and polytheists living—presumably—in relative peace. The inscriptions from both ancient Yemen and Ethiopia describe parts of the process of “othering,” in which the opponent group is defined in terms erasing their essential humanity, which allows for the perpetration of violent acts. By using the theoretical framework of “othering,” the epigraphs are analyzed and thus this paper will argue, that both sides used terminology deliberately framing the opponent as Other, which allowed for extreme acts of massacre and destruction.

#### 31. Zachary Rubin, Brown University

**“Who are you? Who are you?” The Sons of Nippur Text and Scribal Identity at Assur**

The bilingual composition concerning the Sons of Nippur is only attested in a single manuscript from Assur, which Erich Ebeling first published as LKA 76 in 1953. In what appears to be a lopsided dialogue, the Sons of Nippur declare their affiliation with the city of Nippur and the gods of the Ekur temple, describing themselves only in a series of epithets that seem to allude to both divine and human characteristics. While
the text never offers a coherent statement about their identity, the Sons of Nippur might be associated with a class of apkallû sages. This identification is supported by a chronicle preserved on the reverse of the tablet that describes anecdotes in the lives of four postdiluvian apkallû, who are also known from the incantation series bit mûserî. Otherwise, the Sons of Nippur text is unique and thus difficult to place in the wider corpus of Mesopotamian literature. Although isolated lines from the text have been dealt with sporadically in modern scholarship, the composition itself has been largely neglected. In this paper I will first present an edition of the text and then discuss its idiosyncratic, possibly corrupted language, and the role the text may have played in the local identity of the scribal community at Assur.

B. Ancient Near East III: Literature. PIOTR MICHALOWSKI, University of Michigan, Chair (10:30 a.m.–12:00 a.m.) Frick Room *

32. GINA KONSTANTOPOULOS, University of Helsinki
The Forest as a Boundary-Zone in Mesopotamia

From the carnelian and lapis lazuli trees Gilgamesh encounters near the end of his journey to the Cedar Forest, a location widely represented in both Sumerian and Akkadian texts, the forest stands as a common marker of distance in Mesopotamia. As it was an inherently unfamiliar, foreign, and even dangerous environment to the Mesopotamian mindset, the forest could be cast as an opponent or obstacle to be overcome. It was also the setting for larger-than-life adventures, as is most prominently seen in a number of literary texts centered on Gilgamesh, as well as the Sumerian epics featuring Lugalbanda. This paper considers the ways in which the forest was depicted in both Sumerian and Akkadian sources, examines where certain forests were arguably located within the landscape of these literary texts, and considers how those locations could, and did, shift from text to text. These depictions could be utilized to serve a specific textual narrative, as well as employed for broader social and political purposes. Through considering representations of the forest, it becomes clear that while the forest may be utilized in a number of ways and sees some variance in its different depictions, the fundamental role it plays in texts remains both constant and complex. On the one hand, the forest shares several symbolic elements found in its depictions in later folklore and mythology, such as its liminality and role as a possible home to monstrous or supernatural creatures. However, the forest in Mesopotamia was also an important economic resource, one which kings and heroes sought to control while also fearing the danger it represented. This tension underlies and informs its complicated construction in Mesopotamian texts.

33. MATTHEW RICHEY, University of Chicago
The Ugaritic ʼiglu ʾatûku “Bound Calf” among ʾAnatu’s Antagonists

In the third column of the third tablet of the Ugaritic epic poem Baʾlu (RS 2.[014]+ iii:38’–46’ = KTU1 1–3 1.3), the goddess ʾAnatu is approached by Baʾlu’s envoys. Without waiting to hear their message, she assumes they require her military expertise. “What enemy appears before Baʾlu?” she asks and demonstrates her ability to counter any foe by enumerating previous triumphs, including {šmt . ʾgl . īl . ʾtk} šammittu ʾiglu ʾili TK “I smote (the) TK(,) calf of ʾIlî” (l. 44’). Despite extensive scholarship
on Baalu and this enemy-list, scholars have offered only occasional hypotheses as to the meaning of \{tk\} in this context. Most prefer the root \(\sqrt{tk}\) to denote “attack” and interpret the present occurrence as a semantically active nominal form.

I argue that more emphasis should be placed on the Ugaritic root \(\sqrt{tk}\) always elsewhere denoting “bind.” This root occurs in Baalu and related texts (RS 1.006:7 [= KTU\(^{1-3}\) 1.13]; 2.[014]+ ii:11’ [= KTU\(^{1-3}\) 1.3]; 5.180+5.198:2’ [= KTU\(^{1-3}\) 1.7]), in all instances predicated of `Anatu. The present enemy is thus plausibly interpreted as `igla `Ilu `atukka “the bound calf of `Ilu,” with \{tk\} analyzed as a G passive participle m.s. \(\sqrt{tk}\). Notably, in the Sumerian poem Angim, Ninurta is said to have hung \{ab-dab\} “captured cows” and \{am-dab\} “captured bulls” on his war chariot among other trophies that represent defeated antagonists; these particular terms, which head the list, may have been intended as a collective designation for the trophies. This and similar tropes are described to suggest that—while the designations and sequence of `Anatu’s conquests are quite distinct from those found in the relatively abundant Mesopotamian enemy-lists—the Ugaritic tradition is loosely connected to these and shows occasional commonalities in enemy appellation.

34. Karen Sonik, Auburn University

The Women of the Standard Babylonian Gilgamesh Epic

The relative scarcity of female figures in the extant written and pictorial sources of the ancient Near East has long been remarked. Significant scholarly efforts over the past three decades have, consequently, examined closely those limited contexts in which female figures do appear in order to shed new light on their roles and status in Mesopotamia (social, political, religious, legal, economic, funerary, and otherwise), as well as to illuminate those few female figures that have loomed unusually large in the extant sources. What these scholarly efforts have revealed is striking. Third millennium BCE texts, objects, and images attest to the presence and participation of female figures in crafting and entertainment, cultic and temple contexts, and legal and economic transactions, as well as to their status and agency both in life and in death. And yet, by the early second millennium BCE, the marginalization of both goddesses and mortal women in literary, pictorial, and (arguably also) social contexts seems already to have been well underway.

This paper examines outcomes of some of the processes of female marginalization—the developing constraints on female agency, as reflected in the minor, generalized, and supporting roles in which even the great goddesses are increasingly cast; the modeling of ideal(ized) social functioning and behaviors, with an emphasis on female figures as intercessors and helpers; and the appearance of vivid literary and pictorial demonstrations of the consequences of violating established gender norms or boundaries—as they emerge or are belied in the Standard Babylonian Gilgamesh Epic. It also highlights, however, the ways in which the generic classification of female figures, and the over-eminishing of their superficial commonalities, has tended to obscure even the remarkable features or functioning of specific individuals.
When is a Door Not a Door? The arkabinnu in Mesopotamian Sources

This paper will examine the evidence for the arkabinnu, the “unfinished door” famously invoked by Gilgamesh in his rejection of Ishtar in the Standard Babylonian epic. Despite the description of the door in malku = šarru as “unfinished” (lā qatitu), which is corroborated not only by the Gilgamesh epic but also by Old Babylonian literary attestations, the arkabinnu’s construction (i.e., what it might have looked like) remains unknown. This paper proposes a reconstruction of the arkabinnu based upon an identification with Sumerian argibil(lu), another poorly understood term attested already in the Early Dynastic period.

Becoming a Sage: Creating, Editing, and Reading Qin Songs in Late Ming Print Culture

How did the way of transmission shape the transmitted? In the field of traditional Chinese performative genres such as song and drama, scholars have noticed that the print culture from the late Ming period onward shaped the content and interpretation of performative works in various ways (He 2013, Lowry 2005, Swatek 2002). In this paper, I go further to argue that print culture also inspired new ways of composing songs and brought about new types of songs in the late Ming. I illustrate my point by focusing on qin songs (songs accompanied on the qin zither). Unlike other late imperial performative genres that were usually tied to popular forms of performance, qin song distinguished itself as an elite musical genre: the songwriters and editors with high literacy spoke directly from the practice of playing these self-same qin songs. Thus, the current scholarly neglect of qin song has largely limited our understanding about the interaction between print and performance in the late imperial China.

Through an intratextual reading of Yang Biaozheng’s (c. 1520–c. 1590) book of qin songs, I argue that the consciousness of immortalizing oneself by print triggered new types of qin songs that we do not see before. As I will show, the songs present Yang himself as a transcendent person comparable to both Confucian sages and Daoist immortals, and he indeed became remembered as a shengxian (sage and worthy) by later qin practitioners. While Kai-wing Chow (2004) points out that book publishing helped unsuccessful civil service examinees to gain cultural power, my research further exemplifies how book publishing in the musical and performative realm was involved in self-cultivation and sagehood by foregrounding the connections between self-cultivation, self-presentation, and performance.
37. SHAN REN, University of Alberta

**Literary Contact Nebulae in East Asia—Adaptation Novels during the 16th to 19th Centuries**

In this paper, I analyze the impact of the Japanese invasions of Korea (1592–1598) on the construction of literary contact nebulae in East Asia, by examining the circulation, translation and adaptation of classic vernacular novels like *Romance of the Three Kingdoms* and *Three Words* among China, Japan and Korea. Much effort has already been made in studying adaptation novels. In *Literary Migrations-Traditional Chinese Fiction in Asia (17th–20th centuries)*, Claudine Salmon looks in the circulation of Chinese novels in Japan, Korea, Northeast and Southeast Asia. In *From Sanguo Zhi Yanyi to Samgukchi: Domestication and Appropriation of Three Kingdoms in Korea*, Hyuk-chan Kwon analyzes how *Romance of the Three Kingdoms* was translated and adapted by the Koreans after the Japanese invasions. However, there still lacks an approach to link Chinese, Japanese and Korean adaptation literature to their post-war stances. In “Rethinking the World in World Literature-East Asia and Literary Contact Nebulae”, Karen Thornber analyzes the complex web of circulation among Chinese, Japanese and Korean literary networks during the Japanese Empire period and the post-war period (after 1895). I try to apply the structure of this system to the 16th–19th centuries, a time period to some extent share a similarity with the wartime and post-war East Asian literature she analyzed. By analyzing how Chinese classic vernacular novels like *Romance of the Three Kingdoms and Three Words* circulated, translated, adapted and cited, it can be concluded that though after the war, China, Japan and Korea started to compete with each other on the issue of legitimacy, all three countries desired to build a literary community with their neighbors.

38. ANTHE RICHTER, University of Colorado Boulder

**Writing the Ailing Self: Autobiographical Accounts of Illness in Early Medieval China**

This talk is dedicated to the rhetorical analysis of illness narratives in early medieval Chinese self-writing. It will first elaborate on reasons for the rarity of accounts of the physical in Chinese autobiographical literature of the period, whether related to illness and healing or not, and then set out to determine the rhetorical functions of those illness narratives that have made it into self-writing. These functions clearly emerge as genre-specific conventional patterns. In autobiographically inspired authorial prefaces, illness—and in particular coping with illness and other physical challenges—is usually incorporated into a self-narrative of strength and grandeur, as, for instance, in the autobiographical writings of Cao Pi (187–226) and Xiao Yi (508–554). In letters, a decidedly different form of literati self-expression, much depends on the type of correspondence: personal letters about illness in intimate exchanges proceed very differently from semi-official letters, in which health reports frequently occur in the context of pleading illness to justify retirement or reclusion. Real or feigned illness as an excuse to escape onerous official, social, or familial obligations turns out to be a powerful motif throughout much of early medieval autobiographical literature. The analysis of illness narratives in autobiographical accounts of illness and healing promises to add an important facet to our understanding of early Chinese self-writing.
39. Ryan Schaffner, University of Virginia

Name Dropping: Designators for Jesus in 8th and 9th Century CE Muslim and Christian Disputational Literature

Yasū and ‘Īsā are both Arabic names that are translated correctly into English as ‘Jesus.’ Yet, the Arabic-speaking Christian community has historically used Yasū, while the Muslim community has historically used ‘Īsā, which is the name used for Jesus in the Qurʾān. Furthermore, Jesus is often referred to by the filial terms of ibn and walad, as well as the honorific title, al-Masīḥ. This paper focuses on the use of those designators for Jesus in Muslim and Christian disputational literature of the 8th and 9th centuries CE, including the works ascribed to (whether legitimately or not) Ibn al-Layth (d. ca. 819), al-Qāsim b. İbrahim (d. 860), ’Alī al-Tabarî (d. ca. 860), al-Jāhiz (d. 868f), Ibn Qutayba (d. 889), the Byzantine emperor Leo III (d. 741), Theodore Abū Qurrah (d. after 816), Timothy I (d. 823), Ḥabīb ibn Khidma Abū Rāḥit. (d. ca. 835), ’Ammār al-BAṣrī (d. mid-9th cent.), Abū al-Masīḥ b. Isḥaq al-Kindī (likely d. 9th cent.), and Abūf of Tiberias (ca. late 9th cent.). Through an analysis of the use of the designator(s) chosen for Jesus in these works, and the respective purposes therein, I will demonstrate that the designator used is deliberate and serves as a marker for: (1) religious affiliation; (2) distancing from biblical material; and/or (3) appropriation of previous scriptures.

40. Nathaniel A. Miller, University of Cambridge

Reading Across Confessional Lines in Ayyubid Egypt: A Judeo-Arabic Document with Two New Poems by Ibn al-Kızānî

The Geniza documents contain a small but significant number of Arabic poems by Muslim authors, some of which are written in Arabic, although most are in Hebrew transliteration (Judeo-Arabic). These tend to fall between the disciplinary cracks of Judaic studies and Arabic literary studies, with the most significant examination of these texts being that of Hartwig Hirschfeld in a series of articles published between 1903 and 1906. I will translate and discuss a number of the as yet unpublished Arabic and Judeo-Arabic Geniza documents.

In particular, an undated paper bifolium, T-S AS 161.50, contains one complete 3-line poem and one 4-line fragment, both in Hebrew transliteration, attributed to the Egyptian Sufi Muhammad ibn İbrahim Abū ‘Abd Allāh, known as Ibn al-Kızānî (d. 562/1167). The texts are interesting in their context for a couple of reasons. Firstly, neither are present in his published diwān. Secondly, in the Egyptian section of his anthology Kharīdat al-Qasr; Saladin’s secretary ’Imād al-Dīn al-Iṣfahānī (d. 597/1201) testifies to the interest of Saladin in Ibn al-Kızānî. We are thus in a unique position to evaluate the readership of this poet; while it is already known that he possessed a sect of followers known as Kızānîyya, his popularity evidently extended not only across confessional lines to be read in a Jewish milieu, but also reached elite levels, despite his (according to ’Imād al-Dīn) “heterodox” beliefs.

Evidently, then, Ibn al-Kızānî merits more attention, and this and similar Judeo-Arabic Geniza documents can contribute to our understanding both of the development of Sufism and Arabic Sufi poetry, and of the religious milieu in Egypt at the
time of the emergence of the Ayyūbid dynasty, especially by throwing light on inter-
religious and unorthodox currents normally not understood to have been promoted
by Saladin and his avowedly Sunni successors.

41. TARA STEPHAN, New York University

Social Regulation in the Mamluk Period: Women and Non-Muslims

This paper examines state and scholarly attempts at social regulation during the
Mamluk period (1250–1517). I argue that, as a result of increasing political and eco-
nomic forces, both external and internal, the Mamluk government and some of the
scholarly elite sought a return of divine favor by attempting to reorient society back
to the customs of the time of the Prophet Muhammad and his Companions. Such
reorientation included strict social hierarchies in which different genders, religions,
and classes had distinct appearances and roles in urban space. Especially during the
middle decades of the 14th and 15th centuries, bans on women in public and violence
against Coptic Christians were frequent, while, especially in the 14th century, scholars
wrote in new genres: polemics against Copts and treatises against innovation. The
latter treatises detailed the polluting forces of women and non-Muslims, particularly
Christians, in society, to varying degrees depending on the aims of the author. Several
of the anti-innovation treatises were written in the early to mid-14th century, at what
I argue is a height of economic and political tensions, due to a series of weak rulers and
frequent outbreaks of the plague. Previous scholarship has argued that bans on women
in public was a result of more restrictive gender relations in the Mamluk period, in
contrast to the Fatimid and Ayyubid periods. However, by comparing these bans on
women’s clothing and public presence with restrictions on Copts and violence against
churches and monasteries, it is clear that bans against women can be contextualized
as a reaction to larger political and economic forces. The state and scholars were, in
different ways, working toward the same goal of social regulation and strictly defined
social hierarchies.

42. ELON HARVEY, University of Chicago

Five Are Killed: A Reconstructed Ḥadīth and Its Talmudic Parallel

Scholars have long been divided on the authenticity of Ḥadīth traditions and the
possibility of convincingly ascribing to the earliest Islamic generations material written
down centuries later. In this paper, I trace the development of a Prophetic tradition
concerning the permission to kill five animals in the ḥaram in Mecca and its vicinity,
and ascribe it to one of the Prophet’s closest companions. Furthermore, I establish a
pre-Islamic provenance for this tradition.

First, by analyzing the contents (mutūn) and chains of transmission (asūnūd) of
more than 300 versions of this tradition, I am able to reconstruct a lost early version
of it. This process is similar to the reconstruction of a lost original text on the basis of
its extant manuscripts. I attribute this reconstructed version with high probability to
ʿAʾisha, the Prophet’s wife. I also identify various changes made in the tradition over
the generations, reflecting different legal or personal proclivities of individual Ḥadīth
transmitters.

Second, I compare the reconstructed version to a parallel passage recorded in both
the Palestinian and Babylonian Talmuds regarding five animals that may be killed
on the Sabbath (JT Shabbat 14:1, 14b; BT Shabbat 121b). As an external source, this passage corroborates the reconstructed version. I show that not only are both sources structurally and stylistically similar, but their respective juridical and religious contexts share many important similarities. These points of congruence between the Talmudic passage and the hadith tradition underscore the strong link between them, and clarify the pre-Islamic provenance of the tradition.

Finally, I combine the conclusions about the early roots of this tradition with the conclusions concerning the link between it and the Talmudic passage, and describe how the tradition evolved over time from its pre-Islamic beginnings until its being recorded by the various hadith compilers.

43. Jessica Andruss, University of Virginia

“O Israel, Repent and Return!”: Arabic Preaching in Medieval Jewish Discourse

Sermons appear throughout Arabic literature—in collections of exemplary oratory, in handbooks for preachers, and in treatises on rhetoric. They are defined as much by their rhetorical features as by their thematic emphases on eschatology, penitence, and piety. The practice of embedding sermons in written documents exists in Jewish as well as Muslim texts from the medieval Islamic world. The Jewish examples have little in common with the rabbinic genre of homiletical midrash, but instead implement the techniques and themes of Arabic preaching that are familiar from classical Islamic oratory (khutba) and sermons of pious counsel (waż).

This paper examines Jewish discourse about preaching alongside excerpts of Jewish sermons in Arabic. The role of preaching in medieval Judaism was a matter of sectarian debate. The Karaites—a Jewish scripturalist movement that coalesced in the ninth century Islamic East—argued that calling others to repent was a religious obligation. The persuasive homilies that they crafted to fulfill this obligation are preserved in an array of literary forms, from epistles and circulars to biblical commentaries. This paper will include examples from the writings of Daniel al-Qūmīsī, Salmon b. Yeruḥīm, and Sahl b. Maṣliḥah.

By drawing on Jewish sources, this paper treats oratory as an Arabic cultural form that is shared across religious communities. Moreover, the focus on texts from the ninth and tenth centuries fills a temporal gap in scholarship on Arabic sermons, which has productively examined oratory from the pre-Islamic through the Umayyad periods, and later traditions of public preaching from the twelfth century onward. Finally, the paper addresses the literary frameworks in which we encounter an ostensibly oral form, and argues that sermons found in textual sources may constitute a type of preaching that imagines its audience primarily as a community of readers.

E. Islamic Near East IV: Fakhr al-Din al-Razi. Carl Sharif El-Tobgui, Brandeis University, Chair (10:45 a.m.—12:00 p.m.) Conference Room A *

44. Michael A. Rapoport, Yale University

Razi’s Red Lines: Defense of Ash’arism in his Commentary on Ibn Sīnā’s Pointers and Reminders

Scholars are increasingly taking note of the importance of Ibn Sīnā’s (d. 428/1037) Pointers and Reminders—especially its commentary tradition—for the study of post-classical Arabic philosophy. Two entries in the recent Oxford Handbook of Islamic
Philosophy (2016) focus on the most influential commentaries: those by Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī (d. 606/1210) and Naṣīr al-Dīn al-Ṭūsī (d. 672/1274). In the entry on Rāzī, Shihadeh decries the standard interpretation of these texts, which sees Rāzī as a theologian following in the footsteps of Ghazālī (d. 505/1111) in criticizing Ibn Sīnā. He argues that studying Rāzī’s commentary within its own context, rather than in the shadow of Ghazālī, shows that he was more than an Ashʿarī reflexively criticizing Ibn Sīnā.

Shihadeh correctly labels this standard narrative of Rāzī as reductionist. His work, along with that of Wisnovsky, Ahmed, McGinnis, and others, has demonstrated the fluidity of disciplinary boundaries in the postclassical era and the folly of making assumptions based on labels like theologian and philosopher. Nevertheless, I will show that we cannot escape the long shadow cast by Ghazālī and his Incoherence of the Philosophers. A close reading of Rāzī’s text reveals it to be a product of its milieu, in which many Ashʿarī scholars saw philosophers as crypto-infidels. This shines through most clearly when Rāzī charges Ibn Sīnā of hypocritically couching his philosophy in religious language to appear devout. Nearly accusing Ibn Sīnā of apostasy, Rāzī is very much following in Ghazālī’s footsteps.

45. Giovanni Carrera, McGill/Harvard University

The Evolution of the Razian Corpus: The 14th–15th Century Transmission and Exegetical Practice on al-Rāzī’s Works

This paper aims to elucidate the reception of the work of the Persian polymath Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī (d. 606/1210) within the Islamic intellectual landscape. The critical evaluation of the Razian corpus undertaken by his successors will emerge as being a crucial step in the broader development of the post-classical Islamic intellectual legacy. In particular, a hereto overlooked commentary activity on the Razian corpus by Levantine and North African scholars of the 13th and 14th century will provide evidence for the significance of al-Rāzī’s thought across diverse intellectual milieus.

In the last two decades, scholars have come to agree on a more positive evaluation of the role of the kalām-falsafa relationship in the post-classical intellectual period. More specifically, the reception and critical evaluation of Avicennian philosophy by Ashʿarite and Maturidite scholars prompted a gradual convergence of kalām and falsafa. This newly synthetic trend stemming from the commentaries and epitomes on the Avicennian corpus is now known as neo-Ashʿarism. Scholars are recently recognizing the work of al-Rāzī as the turning point of this intellectual trend that combines together crucial elements of Avicennian philosophy with the broader Ashʿarite framework; accordingly, scholars agree that the philosophical and theological debates of the 13th and 14th century intellectual centres of Tabriz, Damascus and Cairo revolved around the Avicennian and Razian corpus. Although al-Rāzī’s influential works on kalām, ʿikna and logic, such as the Muḥaṣṣal, the Mulakhkhaṣ, and the al-ʿAyyiūt al-bayyinat fi-l-mantiq are known to have become widespread madrasa manuals, their reception by the following generation of scholars remains to date unexplored.

In this paper I will present unprecedented textual evidence and bio-bibliographical data that witness hitherto overlooked commentary activity on the Razian corpus that parallels the Avicennian commentary tradition. In particular, I will present some aspects of the reception of al-Rāzī’s work by looking at lesser known works by his successors of the 13th and 14th century, such as Athīr al-Dīn al-Abharī, Afdal al-Dīn
al-Khûnaṭî, Najm al-Dîn al-Kâṭîbî, Sirāj al-Dîn al-Urmawî and Ibn Taymiyya, and the intellectual contexts in which they operated. I will show that these scholars were actively committed to transmitting the Razian corpus by means of commentaries and critical epitomes in order to evaluate, adopt and reject crucial aspects of al-Râzî’s neo-Ashârism. The study of the Razian commentary tradition will reveal the extent to which the Razian thought dominated the 13th and 14th century intellectual milieus of northern Iran, Anatolia, Syria and Egypt and, more broadly, the Islamic intellectual landscape.

46. Nora Jacobsen Ben Hammed, University of Chicago

Epistemological Skepticism and the Sanctity of Knowledge in Fakhr al-Dîn al-Râzî

Until relatively recently, Fakhr al-Dîn al-Râzî (d. 606/1210) was understood not as an innovator of philosophical theology, but as one of the primary theologians who sought to eradicate the influence of Avicennian philosophy. Instead, Râzî’s criticisms should be seen to represent critical engagement by which he appropriated methods but challenged conclusions (the same manner in which Avicenna approached Aristotle). His later works, such as al-Maṭâliḥ al-āliyya, must be reconsidered as genuine developments of philosophy in the Islamic world. My paper, in line with the work of scholars such as Robert Wisnovsky, Ayman Shihadeh, and Bilal Ibrahim, addresses epistemological concerns expressed by Râzî. As Ibrahim noted in Freeing Philosophy from Metaphysics, and Shihadeh in The Teleological Ethics of Fakhr al-Dîn al-Râzî, Râzî is skeptical about the ability of the human being to acquire knowledge of the essences of phenomena. Further, it appears that Râzî does not believe the human being to be capable of producing any new knowledge whatsoever, per Meno’s paradox, without divine aid. I explore these assertions of the limits of human knowledge in the Maṭâliḥ (not addressed on this point by previous scholars), as well as the implications of this epistemic skepticism, which has the effect of both limiting human knowledge production and sanctifying rational inquiry as possible only through divine grace. I argue that for Râzî, the human soul can acquire knowledge strictly through building upon self-evident (or, better yet, God-given) knowledge (al-badîhiyyat), as well as by divine revelation and inspiration. This departure from Avicennian epistemology allows Râzî to free the access to, and production of, knowledge and gnosis from the confines of the body, and to further allow for the continued and potentially dynamic grasping of this knowledge in the felicitous continued existence of the rational soul after the death of the body.

F. South and Southeast Asia II: Indic Sciences: Grammar and Astronomy.
Hans Henrich Hock, University of Illinois, Chair (9:00 a.m.–11:30 a.m.)
Conference Room B

47. Yiming Shen, University of Oxford

More on Šeṣāḍrisudhî against Nâgeśa: Šeṣāḍrisudhî’s Rejection of the paribhâṣā
yadâgamâs tadguṇîbhûtâs tadgraṇhaṇâcena gṛhyante

In the Aṣṭâdhyâyî system, paribhâṣâs (metarule) are indispensable elements that help interpret sūtras and clarify the prakriyâ (technical derivation). The paribhâṣâ
yadâgamâs tadguṇîbhûtâs tadgraṇhaṇâcena gṛhyante (ypbh), tentatively translated as
“Āgamas added to their āgamins [= yad= tad= that to which an āgama is added], being subordinate to their āgamins, are [also] referred to by the designation of the āgamins”, is a paribhāṣā dealing with āgamas (augment; e.g. the initial a in imperfect forms like abhavat). It aims at removing such difficulties as encountered in the prakriyā of lavitr “he who cuts”, where the āgama i, due to its intervening position, prevents the replacement of ā by o conditioned by the immediate following of the suffix tr (Aṣṭādhyāyī 7.3.84). Within the Pāṇinian tradition, the ypbh appeared for the first time not in the Aṣṭādhyāyī, but in the Mahābhāṣya, and hence it is not clear whether Pāṇini himself accepted this paribhāṣā when he constructed his system. Most of the commentators in the tradition e.g., Nāgėśa have taken the position that Pāṇini did accept the ypbh in the very beginning, yet there are also contradicting voices—for example, Śeṣādrisudhī in his commentary Paribhāṣābhāṣkara argues against Nāgėśa’s views in Paribhāṣāsendusēkhara and tries to reject the ypbh altogether. He argues that by understanding the augmenting operation as a type of substitution (in lavitr above: tr replaced by itr rather than an āgama i added to tr), all the functions of the ypbh could be achieved by sūtra 1.1.56 sthānivād ādesō ‘nalvidhau (according to which substitutes are to be treated like substituends), thus leaving the ypbh redundant. In the current paper, I first present Nāgėśa and Śeṣādrisudhī’s arguments in this fascinating polemical confrontation, and then give my own critical remarks. To my knowledge, this is the first time this issue is treated in detail.

48. Jo Brill, University of Chicago

Reference in the Aṣṭādhyāyī

Last year at this meeting, I presented some observations about the way that Pāṇini refers to verbal roots in Sanskrit, using data mostly from the kṛt section of the Aṣṭādhyāyī. This paper changes the point of focus to the huge taddhita section and extends the examination of reference beyond verbal roots to all components of the various rules. What can we learn from the formal aspects of these rules?

Bhate (1989: Pāṇini’s Taddhita Rules) lays out categories for the hierarchy by which the rules are arranged. First, five prayāya-adhikāras assign a general suffix. Beneath each of these, artha-adhikāras refer to the source sentence from which the taddhita derivation starts. Last come the special rules, which for each sense/artha, give or describe the stems to which the general suffix (or some particular suffix) is appended.

I adapt Bhate’s framing to examine three types of consistency for Pāṇini’s metalinguistic use of inflectional endings. First, is Pāṇini’s use of inflectional endings consistent with the target language? Does he follow his own rules? Second, is his use of case endings in the taddhita section consistent with that in the kṛt section? Finally, does “consistency” vary by item type? For example, is there more or less consistency for stems (pratipadikas) versus prayāya or conditions?

For a few prominent sūtras I look to the Mahābhāṣya and the Kāśika and their respective commentaries. I also look to the modern commentary given by Grimal, Venkatatora Sarma, and Lakshminarasimham in their latest volume on examples in the Pāṇinīya tradition, which gives complete prakriyās for the examples which Bhaṭṭoji Dīṣṭa chose to illustrate in his taddhita-related prakaraṇas.

Last, I reflect briefly on what factors may account for these patterns of usage and suggest some directions for further research.
49. Bill M. Mak, Kyoto University

Garga and the Gārgīyajyoṭiṣa

Within the Indian astral tradition, Garga has long been considered an important author of jyotiṣa texts of the saṃhitā variety (miscellaneous divination). His Gārgīyajyoṭiṣa, a work of sixty-four chapters, contains materials which Weber, Pingree and Mitchiner dated to around the first century C.E. Some of the unique contents of the work such as the three/six/nine-fold division of the nakṣatras, and the auspicious and inauspicious activities associated with the nakṣatras and the tithis, appear to have had widespread influence in the South Asian subcontinent during the first millennium, spreading as far as to East Asia and Southeast Asia. The Gārgīyajyoṭiṣa was also one of the main sources of Varāhamihira’s encyclopedic Brḥatsaṃhitā as the commentator Bhaṭṭotpalap remarked. The text is noted particularly for its historical value as it contains some of the oldest references to the Indian invasion of the Yavanas (Greeks) in the chapter of Yugapurūpa. In 1987, Pingree published a paper titled “Venus Omens in India and Babylon,” drawing parallels between the Akkadian Enu en Anu Enlil and Šumma Ālu with passages from the Gārgīyajyoṭiṣa, as “the first steps toward the goal of explicating [the] Indosopotamian connection”. Although Pingree provided an English translation of the Venus chapter and a summary of the remaining planetary chapters, the Sanskrit text was never edited and published, and remains one of his unfinished projects, which both Pingree and Mitchiner described as an “urgent necessity”. In this paper, I will examine Garga as the author as seen in the text, as well as in the writing of subsequent authors such as Varāhamihira and Bhaṭṭotpalap. An edition of the opening and selected passages from the astronomical chapters of this important text based on six manuscripts, some hitherto unexamined, will be presented for the first time.

50. Andrea Gutierrez, University of Texas at Austin

The Purport and Transmission of the aṣṭadosas of Cooking

Pākaśāstra texts often include a list of doṣas (mistakes) caused by the improper preparation and cooking of foods. The first attested list of these doṣas appears in the Sanskrit Pākadarpana, a royal cookbook, but reappears in pākaśāstra cookbooks until the nineteenth century CE. This list has a few commonalities with food doṣas in āyurveda and duṣṭa foods recorded in dharmaśāstra as unfit for eating (abhojya). However, as I elucidate the Pākadarpana’s list of mistakes that are specifically culinary and procedural in nature, I aim to demonstrate that the list establishes a technical discourse of pākaśāstra with the unique priorities of this genre. I also trace this culinary list in its transmissions into the modern period in texts that claim the authority of being pākaśāstra. The list’s presence in modern-era cookbooks lends credence to my argument of the Pākadarpaṇa as a culinary text and a primary mūla for the śāstra of cooking.

Appreciating this list’s culinary ambit helps us revise previous scholarly assumptions of the Pākadarpaṇa as a text of āyurveda and dietetics. This paper sheds light on an under-explored text and may also expand our understanding of courtly culture in terms of the textual production of culinary literature involving royal practices of consumption (bhoga). Further, a reconsideration of details from the pākaśāstra genre can move our academic exploration of Sanskrit food discourses beyond the lens of treating
food medicinally, as in *ayurveda*, and beyond the basic structural categorization of food as 
(a)*bhakṣya*, (a)*bhojya*, *peya*, *lehya*, and so on.

**A. Ancient Near East IV: Religion. Gary Beckman, University of Michigan, Chair (2:00 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Frick Room**

51. Paul Delnero, The Johns Hopkins University

   Lamenting (and) Politics in Early Mesopotamia

   Ritual lamenting is widely attested as cultic practice for over two millennia in ancient Mesopotamia. Textual descriptions of how, when, and why laments were performed are rare before the first millennium, but the content of the relatively large number of Sumerian laments dating to the Old Babylonian Period (ca. 2000–1595 BCE) provide indirect evidence for the function and purpose of ritual lamenting in early Mesopotamia. While many studies have analyzed the content of the laments to determine their religious significance, the political dimension of Sumerian lamenting has rarely been considered. In this paper, a preliminary attempt will be made to identify the political function of the laments by considering evidence such as the relationship between the Sumerian laments and the so-called city laments, which have an overt political-ideological subtext, and the political function of lamenting in other historical and cultural contexts.

52. JoAnn Scurlock, Elmhurst College

   Nippur’s Galileo Problem

   In a recent article (JCS 68), Steve Tinney publishes a Middle Babylonian offering list from Nippur that, he argues, shows that the rise of Marduk to the head of the pantheon as reflected in the *Enuma elish* was earlier than previously suspected and reflects the reception of Babylonian intellectual creations in Assyria via Nippur. Unfortunately for Tinney’s argument, a late cultic commentary reveals that Nippur never did, in fact, accept the rise of Marduk to the head of the pantheon. This paper attempts to understand Nippur’s reaction.

53. Aren M. Wilson-Wright, University of Zurich

   When Did Yahweh Become the Patron Deity of the Northern Kingdom?

   Many scholars argue that Yahweh became the patron deity of the Northern Kingdom by the 9th century BCE under the Omride dynasty. They base this argument on a reference in the Mesha Stele to a temple of Yahweh in Israelite-occupied Nebo and a creative interpretation of 1 Kings 16:32, according to which Ahab builds an altar to Baal in the temple of Yahweh. This paper seeks to challenge the scholarly consensus. I will begin by arguing that the Mesha Stele and 1 Kings 16:32 indicate that the patron god of the Omride dynasty was not Yahweh, but rather Baal. The Mesha stele differentiates between Ahab’s patron deity, called “his beloved” in line 12, and Yahweh, while 1 Kings 16:32 actually states that Ahab erected an altar of Baal in the temple of Baal. I will then marshal comparative Israelite and ancient Near Eastern evidence to show that Yahweh first became the patron deity of the Northern Kingdom under either Jehoash or Jeroboam II. One of the Kuntillet Ajrud inscriptions, dated to the reign of Jehoash, mentions Yahweh of Samaria and could therefore refer to a
royal cult of Yahweh in Samaria. 1 Kings 12:26–29, on the other hand, states that Jeroboam II instituted a royal cult of Yahweh at Dan and Bethel.

54. **K. Lawson Younger, Jr., Trinity International University – Divinity School**

The Identification of the Deity Aramiš/Aramis of Qarnē/Qarnīna/Qarnayim

Up until 2012, a deity named Aramiš/Aramis was known exclusively through a theophoric element in personal names. The deity’s identity remained a mystery. But with the discovery of the Esarhaddon Succession Treaty from Tell Tayinat, an association with the city of Qarnē/Qarnīna/Qarnayim came to light. This paper will propose an identification of this deity based on the available data found in the personal names, toponymy, and iconography.

55. **Victoria Almansa-Villatoro, Brown University**

“The Metal of the Sky”: Words and Conceptions of iron in Egypt and the Near East

This paper notes the similarity between the words for “iron” in Sumerian and ancient Egyptian, as well as the symbolic meaning of that metal in the ancient Near East. I suggest that the Sumerian terms an-na, an-bar and KU₃.AN mean “that which belongs to the sky,” “that which was sent out (from) the sky,” and “the sky-metal” respectively, and are therefore comparable with the Egyptian bꜣn pt “the metal of the sky.” A study of the symbolism and importance of iron in Egypt and the Near East through textual and archaeological evidence indicates that despite the similarities, the religious aspect of iron had its own specialized character in Egypt, where it appears closely connected with cosmogony and afterlife since the very beginning of Egyptian culture. I propose for the first time that the Egyptians saw the sky as an iron container of water, pieces of which fell to the earth in the shape of meteors and were used to produce ritual objects. Past scholarship that acknowledged a lexicographical relationship in the words for “iron” in Egyptian and Sumerian explained it as a result of cultural influence, but in this study the possibility of a common anthropological response to natural phenomena like comets and meteors is preferred due to the high level of integration of the cosmological nature of iron in the Egyptian imagery. The potentiality of studying obscure aspects of ancient civilizations through the cognitive information that can be inferred from etymology and mythopoetic thought is presented as a way to explain common reactions of different civilizations to similar stimuli.

**B. East Asia III: Language and Dialect. David B. Honey, Brigham Young University, Chair (1:30 p.m.–3:00 p.m.) Phipps Room**

56. **Yichun Xu, Ohio State University**

Making Cakes Out of Morning Dew: Wu Vernacular in the Mid-Qing Novella, *He Dian* (Which Classic?)

*Which Classic?*, written in the mid-Qing by Zhang Nanzhuang under the pseudonym, Passerby (guoluren), was circulated in manuscript form for several decades before it was published by Shenbao guan in the late 1870s. It was a comic novella consisting of ten chapters, written in the traditional vernacular “chaptered novel form.”
Which Classic? was also recognized by contemporary scholars as one of the earliest extant novels making extensive use of Wu lexical items (Song 1999, Rea 2015). Previous English-language scholarship (Wang 1997; Rea 2015) has written about the novella from the perspective of its themes, use of vulgar language, and the inter-textual networks generated from its paratext. This paper brings a more sustained focus onto its use of language. Which Classic? was written in a language that is a mixture of idioms and set phrases in classical Chinese, plain Chinese (baihua) (Shang 2014), and Wu lexical items. First, inspired by Shang Wei’s article on the issue of “vernacular” and Patricia Sieber’s upcoming journal article on the Cantonese narrative poem, Huajian ji, I argue that Wu vernacular not only can harmoniously coexist with two other linguistic registers—plain Chinese (baihua) and classical Chinese—in a single text, but also can be used, not necessarily as a lower linguistic register, but as a literary device that is more on a continuum with the other two. Furthermore, Wu vernacular in the text was not necessarily valued as ‘obscene’ or ‘profane,’ in contrast to the conclusions of the studies cited above. In other words, I argue that the use of Wu vernacular, along with the playful and comic use of the other two linguistic registers are all working together as a self-conscious literary experiment by Zhang Nanzhuang, the author of Which Classic?.

57. David Prager Branner, New York

How Simple is the Grammar of the Bronze Inscriptions?

In recent studies I have argued for a very simple model of Classical Chinese grammar. The model to describe the language in the received corpus of texts from the millennium covering the Eastern Zhòu 周, Warring States (Zhànguó 戰國), and Hán 漢 eras (770 B.C.E.–C.E. 220). How well does the model cover the language of earlier periods and texts that have not been subjected to editing? To answer that question, I examine several dozen well-understood bronze inscriptions, mostly from the Western Zhòu (1046–771), and tabulate the coverage of their linguistic behavior by the syntactic rules in the simple model.

58. Richard VanNess Simmons, Rutgers University

Further exploration of Mandarin Sòng, Jīn and Yuán Rhyming Practice

This presentation continues my ongoing examination of the rhyming practice of early Mandarin of the 12th through the 14th centuries. The subjects of the investigation include the 14th century rime book, Zhòngyuán yīnyún 中原音韻 (compiled by Zhōu Déqìng 周德清 [1277–1365]; published in 1341), as well as other evidence of Sòng, Jīn, and Yuán period Mandarin, such as that reflected in cí lyric rhyming practice. We surmise that Mandarin was undergoing significant change in this three-century period. The changes included the rise of a new form of Mandarin in the north—the Zhòngyuán yīnyún type, as well as changes in the older Mandarin as it migrated south and relinquished dominance in the Central Plains to the new Mandarin. Kāifēng Mandarin of the Northern Sòng was probably a conservative variety that still had at least 7 tones (píng 平, shǎng 上, qū 曲, and rù 入), and breathy-voicing in the initials of the lower register tones. In addition, it is highly likely that the old Kāifēng type retained the final consonants -m, -p, -t, and -k. In contrast, the newer Zhòngyuán yīnyùn type had lost the rù tone as well as the final consonants -p, -t, and -k.

– 29 –
southern descendants of the old Kaifeng/early Central Plains type eventually lost lower register qù and rù tones; though the final consonants may have lingered in various sub-varieties for a century or two. The present report examines rhyming in Sòng, Jin and Yuè cí poetry and other contemporary evidence in comparison to the rhyming categories codified in the Zhōngyuán yìngyín. We consider how the rhyming practices of various authors reflect the influence of Central Plains Mandarin of various periods and seek out the differences and similarities with the Zhōngyuán yìngyín system.

C. East Asia IV: Poetry. Antje Richter, University of Colorado at Boulder (3:30 p.m.–5:00 p.m.) Phipps Room

59. Li E, Susquehanna University

Outside of the City: Nature and the Reconstructed Space of “Mountains and Forests” in Yang Wanli’s (1127–1206) Poems

“Mountains and forests (shanlin),” in premodern China, carries the implication of withdrawal from public life due to political disappointment. In this paper I discuss how Yang Wanli, a twelfth-century poet, reconstructed the metaphorical term to make it fit in his poetic discourse. Yang, while stressing shanlin as the preferred site for the poets to compose poetry, brings his conception of the notion to a contrast with the newly emergent space of cities, which shifts away from shanlin’s traditional reclusive overtone and adds to it a sense of plebeianism, a life style of countrymen and low-rank officials different from that in the urban centers of power, societal success, and political ambition. Yang takes interest in locales outside of the cities that could both stimulate poetic composition and provide a place of living for the majority of poets at his time, who were either low rank officials or non-position holders. This speaks of Yang’s attempt to make a connection between the poet’s physical existence and his poetic being, both bound to locality. More importantly, Yang shows that shanlin was transforming from a metaphorical space to a concrete place, livable, travelable, sensible and inspiring. This newly constructed idea of shanlin, I argue, represents one key component in Yang’s effort to speak for his fellow twelfth-century poets and redefine their politically and geographically marginalized identity in face of their changing social status due to the dramatic social, political, and institutional changes of the time.

60. Thomas Donnelly Noel, University of Vermont

The Poetics of Divination and the Prosody of Mountains and Waters: A Vertical Perspective

Scholars have long contrasted the Chinese poets Tao Yuanming 陶淵明 (365–427 CE) and Xie Lingyun 謝靈運 (385–433 CE) in terms of their personae, diction, use of allusion, and the genres they are credited with founding. However, the imagistic prosody shared by both poets in their depictions of natural scenery remains a topic meriting further scrutiny. This paper compares Tao and Xie by examining the visual techniques of their poetic imagery within the greater scheme of newly emerging intellectual, religious, and prosodic trends of the Six Dynasties that were dependent upon earlier poetics of visual augury. By tracing their use of the utterance yangfu
(peering down and glancing up), the visual poetics of these two lyricists will be reconsidered alongside other contemporaneous divinatory, geographic, and literary “viewings” of the natural world that use analogous terminology. Consequently, this study will argue that while Tao Yuanming and Xie Lingyun constructed imagery, lyrics, and personae that appear dissimilar if not even contradictory, in fact both relied upon a common visual prosody which was the result of not only concurrent innovations in Chinese lyricism and criticism, but longstanding attitudes towards the natural world and its linguistic representation. In so doing, this paper will further highlight the still underappreciated similarities that exist between the works of these two poets, while allowing for greater insight into the correlations that ran between alternative forms of linguistic visuality and the poetic depictions of the natural world in Early Medieval China.

61. PAUL W. KROLL, University of Colorado

Li Bo and the zan

When scholars speak of “Tang poetry,” they almost always mean poems only in the shi 詩 form. Equally important, though sadly neglected, are poems in the fu 賦 form, about which I have spoken and written elsewhere. Among the other, even more grievously ignored forms of Tang verse is the zan, which might be called a laud, encomium, or appreciation. As one might expect from the name, these are usually focused on a particular object or individual. Only a handful of the hundreds of zan from the Tang dynasty have been remarked on or translated in Western scholarship. This communication will comment on the features and use of this verse-form during the Tang, with special attention to some of the seventeen extant zan composed by the great poet Li Bo (701–762?).

D. Islamic Near East V: Early Islamic History. MAREIKE KOERTNER, Trinity College, Chair (1:00 p.m.–3:00 p.m.) Conference Room A

62. PHILIP GRANT, University of Edinburgh

Hierarchy at Samarra, and Elsewhere: Violence, Political Order, and the Abbasid Caliphate of the 3rd Century AH

In 869, on hearing of the death of two secretaries after five hundred lashes, the caliph al-Muhtadī exclaimed (according to al-Ṭabarī), “is there no choice of punishment other than the whip or death? Is there nothing better?” The evidence suggests probably not; more importantly, this lack of an alternative teaches us something important about the role of violence in maintaining the Abbasid empire. While this period is often referred to as the “anarchy at Samarra”, if we understand the events of the time in the light of anthropological theories of politics, the fighting between different Turkish military factions and the rapid succession of caliphs deposed and brought to power in palace coups starts to look less like an aberration and more like a perpetuation of hierarchy by other means. “Anarchy” is a misnomer. Through comparing the functioning of the caliphate in this period with the operation of the quasi-state established by the Zanj rebels at the same time, we realize that even a rebellion many of whose adherents were ex-slaves did not so much offer an egalitarian critique of the Abbasid regime as create an alternative polity that functioned in much the same way as the state it
fought against. It depended on violence that was spectacular, bloody, and male in order to establish, defend, and perpetuate itself. Its eventual defeat by al-Muwaffaq and his forces had nothing to do with the ending of supposed anarchy in the capital, but with a more efficient organization of the central hierarchy. Zooming out, the story of the classical Abbasid caliphate becomes one of hierarchy at Baghdad, hierarchy at Samarra, and again hierarchy at Baghdad. A brief comparison with other agrarian empires suggests that reproduction of hierarchy through spectacular violence should be understood as inherent to the political organization of such regimes.

63. ANDREW MCLAREN, Columbia University

What Makes Historiography Islamic? The khilāfa of Ḥasan b. ʿAli in Arabic and Persian Texts

The relationship between Arabic and Persian historiography is underexplored, perhaps because the chronological and socio-political spaces between them are so vast. It is difficult to imagine history writing in environments as distinct as the early ʿAbbāsid caliphate and the decline of the Timūrids sharing much in common at all. On the other hand, the consistent reappearance of certain historiographical focal points—like the political history of the early caliphate and its significance—provides a way into comparison. Given that these various historians were often covering the same ground, how did they deal with similar events? Do the differences in their approaches reflect the differences in their socio-political contexts?

This paper sketches an answer via case study, comparing the portrayal of the khilāfa of Ḥasan b. ʿAli in earlier Arabic texts (like al-Ṭabarī and Ibn Aʿtham al-Kūfī) with later Timūrid-era Persian ones (like Mirkhwānd and Ghaffārī Qazwīnī). Certain concrete relations are evident: Arabic texts are commonly quoted by the latter, predominantly those texts already translated into Persian. The intertextuality created by these quotations, moreover, has interpretive implications. Recent research has argued that narratives in Persian-language histories were shaped by literary sensibilities bearing moralizing or ethical approaches. In this case, however, it is apparent that the Persian histories are not made of freely invented narratives but are rather structurally indebted to the Arabic texts from which they draw. This raises important questions: to what extent is the relationship between these two traditions determined by textual relations, and to what extent does it represent a shared idea of the significance of the past? The paper concludes with a brief consideration of how Arabic and Persian texts narrating the past fit into the larger category of ‘Islamic historiography.’

64. BRIAN ULRICH, Shippensburg University

Factionalism and Eastern Conquests during the Marwānid Period

This paper argues that during the early eighth century, an important element in the course of the Islamic conquests was that commanders sought to conquer areas in which their rivals within the caliphate had commercial interests, rivalries which map onto the development of the division between “northern” and “southern” Arabs. In doing so it builds on views of the Islamic conquests as originally a decentralized movement, most recently argued by Robert Hoyland based on non-Islamic sources, and suggests that central direction was only truly coming about in the early 700’s
when al-Ḥaǰǧāj b. Yūsuf and Yazīd b. al-Muhallab were viceroy of the east with tight loyalties to the reigning caliphs.

Key evidence for this argument comes not from the standard Arabic accounts, but from Persian regional chronicles. In one, the Chachnāma, we see that al-Ḥaǰǧāj and his generals consolidating control over Makrān and conquering Sind encountered resistance from people with names indicating Omani origin. This goes against the theory that Omani Arabs were, to use Hugh Kennedy’s phrase, an “important lobby” for the conquests of that region. At the same time, al-Ḥaǰǧāj’s general Muslim b. Qutayba never campaigned in the lands south of the Caspian Sea, which Ibn Isfandiyār in Tārikh-i Kabaristān attributes to the ties between Ibn Qutayba and Kabaristān’s ruler.

65. SEAN W. ANTHONY, The Ohio State University


In the cultural memory of early Muslim historiography, the reputation of the caliph ‘Umar ibn al-‘Abd al-‘Azīz (r. 99–101/717–20) as a pious ruler and a reviver of the sunnah distinguished him from other dynasts of the oft-maligned Umayyad caliphs. This reputation and, moreover, his close ties with the scholars of early Medina also ensured that his legacy of his tenure as caliph, albeit brief, carried long-lasting effects for how piety-minded scholars came to articulate the normative ideals of Islamic rulership for generations after his caliphate. The efforts made to preserve his letters on jurisprudential and theological affairs and to recount his caliphal polices stand as an enduring testament to his much-vaunted stature, especially as preserved in early hagiographical works such as the Sīrat ‘Umar ibn ‘Abd al-‘Azīz by Abū Muḥammad Ibn ‘Abd al-Ḥakam (155–214/722–829).

This paper discusses a newly discovered letter attributed to ‘Umar II hitherto overlooked by modern scholars. This letter survives in Yaḥyā ibn ‘Abdallāh ibn Bukayar’s (d. 231/845) recension (riwāyah) of the Muwatā‘ of Mālik ibn Anas (d. 179/796). Titled al-Risālah fī l-fay (Eng. The Treatise on the Collective Wealth of the Muslims), the letter has likely been neglected by modern scholarship due to the fact that—of the many recensions of Mālik’s Muwatā‘ to survive—Yaḥyā ibn Bukayar’s recension is the only one which remains unedited and accessible only in manuscripts. This paper provides an overview of the contents of the letter, the views it espouses regarding fay, and what light it might shed on the image of ‘Umar II as a caliphal reviver of the sunnah.

E. Islamic Near East VI: Theology. PAUL WALKER, University of Chicago, Chair (3:15 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Conference Room A*

66. RACHA EL OMARI, University of California Santa Barbara

“God Only Does Good Acts, Despite His Capacity to Do Evil Acts”: A Diachronic Look at a Muʿtazilī Precept

At the center of the Muʿtazilī theory of divine justice is the axiom that God only does good acts and the goodness of these acts is known on the basis of objectively and universally knowable causes. It is well-known that this axiom elicited a great rebuke
of the Muʿtazilis, most systematically from Abū l-Ḥasan al-ʿAshʿarī (d. 324/935–6) and his followers, who accused them of depriving God of His power. The extent to which this axiom presented the Muʿtazilis themselves with an inner challenge to formulate a coherent theory of divine agency is much less known. This paper shows how this precept that God only does good constituted an ongoing inner challenge to the Muʿtazilis’s formulation of a coherent theory of divine agency by providing a diachronic investigation into the genesis of one crucial qualifying clause they introduced to it, such that it read: “God only does good acts, despite His capacity to do evil acts.” This paper adds to the conclusions of earlier studies on various and conflicting Muʿtazilī stances on the question of divine capacity for action (qudra), especially the stances of al-Nazzām (d. between 220/835 and 230/845), Abū l-Hudhayl (d. c. 227/842), and al-Murdhar (d. 226/840–1) (Frank 1985; van Ess 1985, Monnot and Gimaret, 1986; de Smet, 2010), by drawing on the newly discovered and edited corpus of Muʿtazili works that have become available over the past two decades (Schmidtke, 1997; Schmidtke 2006; Adang, Madelung, and Schmidtke, 2011) and on more recent studies on Muʿtazili ethics and logic (Vasalou, 2008; Shihadeh, 2013).

67. Steven Gertz, Georgetown University
   
   We Are God’s Champions: Wilāya in the Work of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī and Qāḍī al-Nuʿmān

   This paper compares the concept of wilāya as articulated by the Ismāʿīlī missionary Qāḍī al-Nuʿmān (d. 363/974) in his manual of fiqh Daʿwāʾī l-Islām (The Pillars of Islam) with the Sīra al-awliyāʾ (Life of the Friends of God) of the earlier but still roughly contemporary Sufi master al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī (d. 298/910). Prof. Hermann Landolt has drawn a rather sharp distinction between Sufi and Shiʿa concepts of wilāya, arguing that Sufism, with its reliance on the ideal of poverty, is more in line with a “Meccan” understanding of wilāya, which one might roughly translate as “friendship with God”; while Shiʿa, on the other hand, tend to think of wilāya from a “Medinan” perspective, i.e., as a position of authority or governance in the community of Islam. This paper argues that study of Qāḍī al-Nuʿmān and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī suggests rather that Sufis and Ismāʿīlīs, separated though they were by the newly polarized frontier of the Fāṭimid-ʿAbbāsid border, in fact had remarkably similar understandings of wilāya. Specifically, these authors agreed that the awliyāʾ were chosen by God and that the knowledge they have comes from God, that the wali is not antinomian but rather upholds the law and encourages his disciples to follow it, and that the wali enjoys an important role as judge on the Last Day. The paper concludes that despite significant differences between those who perceive the wali to be of the line of ʿAlī and those who make no such requirement, Muslims in fact enjoyed wide agreement on what the qualities of the wali should be.

68. Elias G. Saba, Grinnell College
   
   God’s Language or Human Language: Lexicography, Synonyms, and Theology in the 4th/10th Century

   My presentation studies the Arabic tradition of lexicographical distinctions (al-furrūq al-lughawiyya), through the fourth/tenth century, as a particularly theological activity. A lexicographical distinction compares the minute semantical differences between near synonyms; books of lexicographical distinctions are collections of these
comparisons. This genre of lexicography emerges in the fourth/tenth century, well after lexicography has been established as an intellectual activity. The genre of distinctions builds on earlier interest in compiling lists of rare words and obscure usages (al-farq; al-gharib wa-l-nawādīr) by scholars such as Qutrub (d. 206/821), al-Asma’ī (d. ca. 213/828), and others. By the time that al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī (d. ca. 320/932) and Abū Hīlāl al-‘Askārī (d. ca. 400/1010) compose their works on lexicographical distinctions, however, the term furūq is not simply synonymous with rare or strange usage, but rather furūq is inextricably linked to conceptions of synonymy. Al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī’s book is titled Distinctions and the Impossibility of Synonymy (al-Furūq wa-man al-tarāduf). Similarly, al-‘Askārī begins his own work by disavowing the existence of true synonymy in Arabic. It is important to note that the change in focus towards synonymy came with a change of terminology. My paper argues for the importance of theology to this early philological activity and analyzes the ways in which al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī and al-‘Askārī use philosophical ideas and pre-Islamic poetry to highlight polemical theological arguments about the Arabic language and its relationship to the Divine.

69. HANS-PETER POEKEL, Orient-Institut Beirut

Intellectual Encounters on the Inimitability of the Qur’ān in the Context of Muṭtaṣīlī Thought

The “inimitability of the Qur’ān” (ījāz al-qur’ān) is an important pillar of Muslim belief and an elaborated expression of a common religious experience among the Muslim community, namely that the Qur’ān must be a miracle of divine origin due to its lingual, structural and aesthetic beauty. Although the warranty of inimitability is given in several verses of the Qur’ān, the elaboration of what ‘inimitability’ meant was mainly the achievement of Muslim scholars from the early Abbasid period onwards. The main question focused on the difficult issue of how the fundamental experience of the Qur’ān as an expression of metaphysical beauty in human language can be considered as a legitimate revelation within the framework of a monotheistic understanding of prophecy.

My paper will draw attention to the debates on the Qur’ān as a miracle (muṣjīz, muṣjība) within the intellectual context of the Muṭṭazila. I will focus mainly on al-Jāḥīz (d. 255/869) and Ibn Qutaybah (276/889) within their specific context, and enhance this focus with a transregional perspective provided by sources from the developing Ibāḍīya that had been already contributing some initial ideas on the topic. These debates took place within the challenging and inspiring milieu of inner- and interreligious discussions concerning the liability and truthfulness of faith. It seems that these debates shared a common intellectual background of logical argumentation within the realm of the Arabic language on the one hand, and theological concepts across religious communities on the other. My aim is to emphasize the hermeneutical endeavor of scholars who engaged in these debates to explain faith as a religious experience in the face of the other, an attempt that includes the possibility of misunderstanding as well as comprehensive acceptance or rejection.

– 35 –
70. SAYEH MEISAMI, University of Dayton

Intellection and the Evolution of the Human Soul in the Philosophy of Ḥāmil al-Dīn Kirmānī

This paper focuses on the theory of knowledge in the work of Ḥāmil al-Dīn Kirmānī (d. 1021), a Medieval Shīʿī thinker of the Fatimid era. Through analysis of his epistemic narratives and arguments, the paper argues that Kirmānī’s epistemology has a soteriological orientation as he explains the nature and function of knowledge from the perspective of the salvation of the human soul. Based on textual evidence from his Rāḥat al-aql, I will argue that Kirmānī’s theory of knowledge and intellection is developed within his metaphysical psychology which appears in continuation with his discussion of the animal soul, yet differentiated from it by human spiritual teleology. In this regard, I will also argue that Kirmānī relies on the Aristotelian concepts of “form” and “actualization” to frame his evolutionary narrative of the soul based on knowledge acquisition. In Kirmānī’s discourse on knowledge, intellection facilitates the existential growth of the soul out of its imperfect worldly state toward an intellectual life akin to the sacred world of the intellects. Finally, Kirmānī’s approach to knowledge anticipated later Islamic epistemology in the Shiʿī world, most prominently that of Mullā Ṣadrā Shīrāzī (d. 1635 or 1640).

71. SHATHA ALMUTAWA, Willamette University

God in Rasāʿil Ikhwan al-Ṣafāʾ

Rasāʿil Ikhwan Al-Ṣafāʾ (Epistles of the Brethren of Purity) are known to cover a wide variety of topics, beginning with the quadrivium—arithmetic, geometry, music, and logic—and ending with magic. Less known is that these eclectic tenth-century treatises approach religion systematically, and demonstrate a sophisticated understanding of God. The Iraqi authors approach God through multiple lenses at once: Qurʾān, Neoplatonic philosophy, and the theological debates of early Islam. The anonymous authors respond to divisive controversies between philosophers, theologians, and jurists, both Sunni and Shiʿī: God’s essence and attributes, the createdness or eternity of the Qurʾān, the createdness or eternity of the world, and God’s justice and knowledge of particulars. This paper examines Ikhwan Al-Safa’s treatment of these topics in two forms: first, in allegorical narratives scattered throughout the epistles, and second, the syllogistic prose of Epistle 42 (“On the Religious Sciences”).

So far scholarship has focused on Ikhwan Al-Safa’s identity and religious affiliation, as well as the dating of the Rasāʿil. Important contributions were made in Nader El-Bizri’s edited volume The Ikhwan Al-Safa and Their Rasāʿil, but for the most part scholarship on Ikhwan Al-Safa has not dealt with their interpretation of Islamic doctrine. Ian Richard Netton’s Muslim Neoplatonists examined their Greek sources, Seyyed Hossein Nasr’s An Introduction to Islamic Cosmological Doctrines deals with their cosmology, and several works by Godefroid de Callatay deal with their shiʿīsm, astrology and magic. Carmela Baffioni has written about their idea of resurrection and several aspects of their logical works. Their idea of God has not been examined yet.

This paper argues that Ikhwan Al-Safa have a systematic approach to religion and God in particular that critiques kalam but also borrows directly from it. Their philosophy of religion presents a unique response to debates raging in their time.
72. John M. Taylor, University of Texas at Austin

Idealized Masculinity in the *Nalopākhyāna*: Nala’s Empowerment through the Eight Boons

The *Nalopākhyāna* (“Episode of Nala”), contained within the *Mahābhārata’s Aranyaka-parvan*, tells the famous love story of Nala, king of the Niṣadha kings, and Damayantī, a princess of Vidarbha: falling in love from afar, they become married despite interference from the gods, lose everything through Nala’s gambling, are sent into exile and separated in the forest, and are eventually reunited, allowing Nala to win back his rightful kingdom. This paper will focus specifically on the eight boons that Nala receives from the four “World Guardian” deities (lokapāla-)—Indra, Agni, Yama, and Varuṇa—immediately following his marriage to Damayantī at her *svayamvar* ceremony. Previous scholarship on these boons seems to treat them primarily as a literary device; that is to say, the superhuman abilities that Nala receives through his boons are important because they are the markers that Damayantī uses to identify Nala after he has been transformed and made unrecognizable following their separation in the forest. In this paper, however, I will argue that these eight boons hold deeper significance for how Nala is depicted as an idealized man and ritual participant. Through his boons, Nala is supremely empowered to perform Vedic sacrifice: he is given unlimited control over fire and water, two of the fundamental components of the sacrifice, he is endowed with abilities reminiscent of Indra, the Ṛgvedic male *par excellence*, he is allowed to wear one of the marks of divinity, as identified by the *Nalopākhyāna* itself, and finally, he may even be permitted to partake in the gods’ portion of the sacrificial oblations. In short, this paper argues that Nala’s boons carry greater symbolic weight, beyond their obvious narrative function, and that this symbolism can help us better understand the role of Vedic ritualism as a form of idealized masculinity within the *Mahābhārata*.

73. Aaron Sherraden, University of Texas at Austin

Śāmbūka’s Long, Winding Road to Heaven

The story of Śāmbūka’s death had palpable ramifications not long after the episode appeared in the *Vālmīki Rāmāyana’s Uttarakāṇḍa*. In *Vālmīki* as we know it today, Rāma kills the dharma-transgressing śūdra ascetic, Śāmbūka, in order to revive a brahmin boy who died at a young age. Many who have engaged with the *Rāmakathā* after *Vālmīki* show a decided discomfort with Rāma’s judgement in this episode, which is evident from the variety of different methods of reimagining the story.

This paper will explore the Śāmbūka episode as told by Kālidāsa in his *Raghuvaṃśa* and the precedent it set for authors of *Rāmāyaṇa* texts in the centuries to come. Drawing on the work of Robert Goldman, Sally Sutherland Goldman, Hans Bakker, and Michael Willis, among others, I hope to create a clearer picture of how the Śāmbūka episode was dealt with in the period after *Vālmīki*. Kālidāsa’s careful portrayal of Rāma’s actions toward Śāmbūka presents a useful link at a crucial period of transition in the ways the Rāma story was narrated and Vaiṣṇavism was expressed. Kālidāsa develops on Vālmīki’s exposition of Śāmbūka’s death, ultimately changing its outcome. In the *Raghuvaṃśa*, Rāma sets Śāmbūka on a virtuous path simply through his
contact with the righteous king, deadly though it may be. This rendering of the story and the circumstances surrounding its creation would ultimately have far-reaching consequences as devotion to Rāma began to take hold in India.

74. Raj Rajan, Philadelphia

Time and Caste as the Justifiers of Parasaruma’s Action and Chirakarin’s Inaction in the Mahabharata

Matricide, adultery and disobedience to one’s father are great sins. There are two stories in the Mahabharata which utilize these three transgressions to present Parasaruma and Chirakarin as ideal sons worthy of emulation. When Rishi Jamadagni suspects his wife Renuka of adultery he asks his son Parasaruma to kill his mother. The son does it without hesitation. The father praises him for his obedience, blesses him and offers him a boon. Parasaruma asks his father to restore his mother to life and the rishi does so. In the other story Rishi Gautama finds that his wife Ahalya had an affair with Indra. He asks his son Chirakarin to kill his mother and then leaves to perform his penance. Chirakarin never acts without contemplation. He deliberates whether he should obey his father and be guilty of matricide or disobey him, spare his mother and avoid the sin of matricide. He decides to disobey his father and refrain from killing his mother. After his penance, Gautama feels that he had improperly ordered his son to kill his mother and he hopes that he had not killed Ahalya. When he comes home he is greatly relieved to see his wife alive. He blesses his son even though he had disobeyed him.

How could both acts be praiseworthy? One son obeys the father and kills the mother while the other disobeys the father and spares the mother. Mahabharata does not offer any explanation. I propose that time and caste are the reason that makes these opposite actions are commendable. Time, in this context, refers to whether the story is told before or after the Kurukshetra war. And an examination of the caste (Brahmana or Kshatriya) of the narrator, victim and the son reveals why such obedience/disobedience and killing/sparing is exactly what one would have expected.

G. South and Southeast Asia IV: Material Textuality in Early India 1–3. (1:00 p.m.–5:30 p.m.) Conference Room C *

Section 1. Patrick Olivelle, University of Texas, Chair

75. Richard Salomon, University of Washington

Echoes of the Questions of King Milinda in Gāndhārī (?)

When the Buddhist literature of ancient Gāndhāra began to be rediscovered some two decades ago, one of the texts which seemed most likely to be found among the new manuscripts was the “Questions of King Milinda” (Pali Milinda-pañha). For although the Milinda-pañha survives only in Pali and Chinese versions, it had been postulated that the original text had been in Gāndhārī, since it was set in the northwestern realm of the Indo-Greek king Menander (2nd century BCE).

Contrary to these expectations, the “Questions” has still not been found among the fragmentary remnants of Gāndhārī texts, which now number in the hundreds. However, a set of small fragments of an otherwise unidentified scroll do refer to an elder (thero) called Nāgasena, who is the chief interlocutor with the king in the “Questions”
and who is otherwise unknown in Pali literature. Moreover, the wording of these fragments resemble that of the *Milinda-paniha* in several respects. Thus, although the manuscript in question is evidently not the *Milinda-paniha* itself, it implies that there was, as expected, a Gândhári version of that famous text. That text itself, however, still remains to be found.

76. **Zhang Zhan**, New York University, Institute for the Study of the Ancient World

**How to Make a Contract in Khotanese?**

In this paper, I will study the formulae and formats of contracts in Khotanese in comparison with contracts in other languages from the neighboring areas, including the Kharoshthi ones from Niya, the Sogdian ones from Mount Mug, the Bactrian ones from Afghanistan, the Tumshuqese ones from Tumshuq, and the Chinese, Tibetan, and Uighur ones from Khotan, Turfan and Dunhuang, so as to investigate possible links among the scribal conventions of these cultures.

In recent years, I have been re-editing and re-translating the secular Khotanese documents from Khotan. I first divide these documents into six archives according to their dates and provenance, then subdivide those in each archive by genre. When arranged in this way, these documents represent a close-knit and cross-linking network of information that sheds light on various aspects of life in Khotan. Contracts, among others, stand out as a prominent genre. Incorporating new discoveries, I will conduct a systematic analysis of all extant Khotanese contracts. I will dissect each contract into several key components and produce a general template of Khotanese contracts, which in turn will be used as a basis for further comparison. I will demonstrated that conventions in Khotanese contracts are a direct continuation of those of Gandhari contracts of Niya from the fourth century.

77. **Joseph LaRose**, McMaster University

**Lost in Edition: Punctuation in Indian Buddhist Monastic Legal Texts**

I will focus on two Sanskrit texts, the *Carmavastu* (“Section on Leather” from the *Mūlasarvāstivādin vinaya* (“Law Code of the Mūlasarvāstivādins”) and Viśākhadeva’s *Vinayakārīka*, a verse commentary on the *Mūlasarvāstivādin vinaya*. Despite their value as rich sources for understanding the social and economic history of Indian Buddhism, the manuscripts of these monastic legal texts remain, aside from some notable exceptions, poorly edited and poorly understood. I argue that, by paying careful attention to the particular ways that the Sanskrit manuscripts of Buddhist monastic legal texts are punctuated, we can gain insight into the editorial strategies of their first-millennium authors and redactors. This information is not available to those working from available editions of these texts, or from classical Chinese or Tibetan translations of these texts.

Using the *Carmavastu* as a case study, I will be able to demonstrate how punctuation in this manuscript is used to group together what may at first seem to be unrelated rules. For example, a rule prohibiting monks from touching women and a rule preventing monks from holding on to the tails of cows may at first seem unrelated. But, the particular use of punctuation in this text indicates that they both fall under the larger category of rules governing the crossing of rivers. Viśākhadeva’s
Vinayakārikā will allow me to demonstrate the consistent use of this particular strategy for the punctuation of monastic legal texts.

While the main argument of my paper is concerned with the role of punctuation in these Buddhist manuscripts, I also make claims regarding the importance of studying manuscripts in general and the need for better editions of these manuscripts. The punctuation of the Caravastu is not reproduced in any available print editions of the text (Dutt 1950, Bagchi 1967–1970, vol. 2). Neither, I should note, is the punctuation reproduced in the electronic version of the Caravastu found on the Göttingen Register of Electronic Texts in Indian Languages website. The punctuation conventions I discern in the manuscripts under consideration will not be evident to scholars without access to either the manuscripts themselves or to reliable editions of them.

Works Cited


78. James B. Apple,

Atiša’s *Bodhipathakrama: A Significant, yet Forgotten, Manuscript in the History of Inner Asia

This paper examines the structure and content of the *Bodhipathakrama, a previously unstudied important manuscript preserved in Tibetan and attributed to Atiśa Dīpankaraśrījñāna (ca. 982–1054). Atiśa’s *Bodhipathakrama, one of the earliest “stages of the path” works composed in Inner Asia, is found among the recently published Tibetan manuscript facsimiles of the Collected Works of the Kadampas (bka’ gdoms pa gsung ’bum, 2006-2015). Atiśa, an Indian Buddhist mahāpañḍita during the first half of the eleventh century, is well known among both traditional Tibetan and modern scholars for his *Bodhipathapradīpa (byang chub lam gyi sgron ma) composed in Western Tibet for his Tibetan royal disciple lha bla ma Byang-chub ’od. The *Bodhipathapradīpa is generally considered to be the prototype for all subsequent stages of the path (lam rim) literature in Tibetan scholastic history. In contrast, Atiśa’s *Bodhipathapradīpa is virtually unknown to traditional and modern scholarship. This paper analyzes the structure and content of this important work and describes a number of small accompanying texts found within the 91 folio cursive script manuscript. The paper then compares the structure and content of Atiśa’s *Bodhipathapradīpa to Atiśa’s *Bodhipathapradīpa. This comparison illustrates that Atiśa’s *Bodhipathapradīpa includes topics found in later Tibetan stages of the path literature but absent from Atiśa’s *Bodhipathapradīpa, demonstrating that the *Bodhipathapradīpa was more influential than is commonly known. The paper concludes that the *Bodhipathapradīpa was composed for Atiśa’s close disciples within a context of teachings for individuals of highest capacity within the stages of the path approach. In its conclusion, the paper also suggests the historical conditions for why

1 http://gretil.sub.uni-goettingen.de/gretil/1_sanskr/4_rellit/buddh/vinv05_u.htm

– 40 –
this important text by Atiśa has been forgotten and not acknowledged by subsequent generations of Tibetan scholars.

Section 2. Richard Salomon, University of Washington, Chair

79. Matthew D. Milligan, Georgia College & State University

Variance and Usage of Early Buddhist Investment Formulae: Comparing Indian and Sri Lankan Epigraphy

Written records of early Buddhist investments appearing in stone appear all throughout the Early Historic Period (300 BCE–300 CE) in South Asia. These so-called ‘donative inscriptions’ number in the multiple thousands and appear prominently on public and private monuments. However, to date, little work has been done to link the geographic and diachronic development of the most recurring and perhaps important part of the written records: the verbs and associated participles. Nearly all these multiple thousands of inscriptions utilize some derivation of the Sanskrit verbal roots √dā, √kṛ, √sthā, and/or √nī. Tracing the variance and usage of these verbs and participles according to both time and space, this paper attempts to delineate the historical trajectory of early Buddhist economic development as it pertains to precise terminologies in the collective stored consciousness of the sāṅgha itself. Did certain early Buddhist communities make more or less use of one or more of these verbal roots to describe their communal acts of endowments? If so, is there any indication as to why? Attitudes towards the outward patronage and construction of monumental material culture may reflect crucial internal attitudes of a burgeoning religious community seeking to root itself and differentiate from existing religious groups. Preliminary research suggests there may have been a vast divide in verbal expressions used according to sponsored monument, region, and also historical era. Sri Lanka in particular reflects unique divergences (and convergences) to verbal expressions used in central India during the same time period.

80. Madhusudan Rimal, University of Alberta

The Rasaratnākara or “Oceans of Mercury” is one of the major treatises on South Asian alchemy and iatrochemistry. This text is ascribed to Nityanātha or Nityanāthasiddha, son of Pārvatī. Meulenbeld in his book, A History of Indian Medical Literature (2002) argues that “this work is dated to the first half of the fifteenth century” (p. 665). The Rasaratnākara is divided into five sections: (I) Rasakhan.ā, (II) Rasendrakhan.ā, (III) Vāda-, or Rddihkhanḍa, (IV) Rasāyanakhanḍa, and (V) Mantrakhanaḍa. This work was of great importance, as is shown by the many manuscripts are preserved in India, Nepal, UK and elsewhere. There are 25 manuscripts of this treatise found in Nepal. Some of them are complete and some have just a section or two.

This paper reviews all the corpus of Rasaratnākara manuscripts found in Nepal. The Nepalese-German Manuscript Cataloguing Project (NGMCP) has catalogued all these manuscripts. And the forerunner of NGMCP, the Nepalese German Manuscript Preservation Project (NGMPP) collected all those manuscripts and microfilmed them. What is the dating of the scribes? In what places were those copies done? Are there any images on those manuscripts and what scripts are used on those manuscripts?
Why is there so many manuscripts of a single text? Are those copies of a single archetype? Some of the manuscripts were copied in the same place. So was there any atelier work? These are the major questions this paper will address.

81. Ryan Richard Overbey, Skidmore College

On Some Uses of the Buddhist Abecedary in the Mahāvairocana Sūtra

Throughout the vast corpus of Buddhist dhāraṇī literature we find theoretical reflection on the meaning and function of individual syllables. By framing syllables as “gateways” or “doors” (Skt. aks. aramukha, Ch. zìmén 門) to key doctrinal concepts, Buddhists established a one-to-many relationship between syllables on a page and teachings in the heart. Other analyses would stress the interpenetration of all syllables, allowing the one-to-many abecedary to explode into a many-to-many network of universal emptiness.

Both Janet Gyatso (1992) and Ronald Davidson (2009) have fruitfully explored the complex semiotics of the Buddhist abecedary in dhāraṇī literature, demonstrating the productive interplay of the doctrines of emptiness and the technologies of literacy. But the history of the Buddhist abecedary does not end here. In the second half of the first millennium CE, Buddhist ritual manuals began to use the syllable doors as tools of invocation, seeds for the visualization of deities.

In this paper I continue my exploration of the uses of the Buddhist abecedary in tantric texts and commentaries. Having already established a clear line of intellectual continuity between the early Perfection of Wisdom literature, the dhāraṇī literature, and early tantric texts like the Amoghapāśakaśitarajā, in this paper I explore the uses of syllables in the Mahāvairocana Sūtra, a foundational text for East Asian esoteric Buddhism. I will pay particular attention to the Sanskrit varṇamālā in Chapter 2, as well as to the recitation of the “Wheel of Letters” in Chapter 10. Close examination of the root text, along with commentaries by Buddhaguhya and by Yixing 行, will reveal yet more profound lines of continuity with the earlier tradition, prompting us to ask yet again what, if anything, is new about esoteric Buddhism.

82. Benjamin Fleming, University of Oxford

The Ownership of Kingdoms According to the Vivādabhāṅgārṇava

Between 1788 and 1794, Jagannātha Tarkapāñcāna, Rādhākānta Tarkavāgīśa, and a team of other Bengali pandits compiled an elaborate digest of Dharmāśāstra texts for William Jones and the British East India Company. The resulting compilation, the Vivādabhāṅgārṇava (A Sea of Waves of Litigation), was translated by Henry Colebrooke and published to much acclaim as A Digest of Hindu Law on Contracts and Successions (1797–1798). “Colebrooke’s Digest,” as the translation was popularly known, became an influential treatise in the subsequent construction of Anglo-Hindu private law.

Much has been written about the Vivādabhāṅgārṇava: its role in the furtherance of colonial hegemony, its relationship to Colebrooke’s theory of schools of Hindu law, and its limitations as a code of positive laws. This paper attends to a novel discussion concerning the ownership (svatva/svāmītvā) and alienability (deyatva) of kingdoms (rāstra) that appears at the end of the Vivādabhāṅgārṇava’s section on the rescission of gifts (dattānapakarman). The compilers of the Vivādabhāṅgārṇava deploy a
characteristically Bengali juridical principle of factum valet to argue that, provided they are of sound mind, monarchs and princes may divide and distribute their realms amongst their children however they please.

The great novelty and interest of this passage is that the compilers make their argument by analyzing various episodes from the Rāmāyaṇa of Vālmiki and Vyāsa’s Mahābhārata. The compilers use these narrative episodes as springboards for an elaborate, highly technical debate about the nature (and limitations) of the royal ownership of kingdoms and about the relevance of the epics to contemporary—eighteenth century—legal debates concerning the rights of ownership and succession amongst Bengali Zamindaris.

This paper summarizes the Vivādabhaṅgārṇavā’s arguments, situates the text against the backdrop of the intellectual and legal history of late eighteenth century Bengal, and makes a few observations concerning the importance of this ‘Epic Jurisprudence’ to our understanding of early colonial Dharmaśāstra. The paper is accompanied by an annotated transcription of the relevant passages that I made from Colebrooke’s personal copy of the Vivādabhaṅgārṇavā that is held by the British Library.

Section 3. DAVID BRICK, Yale University, Chair

83. ELIZABETH ANGOWSKI, Harvard University

Reimagining Vessantara in Tibet: New Scholarship on the Life of Drimé Kunden

This paper presents new scholarship on the Life of Dharma King Drimé Kunden, a telling of the Vessantarajātaka in Tibetan. Although the Pāli Vessantarājātaka and its adaptations for performance in communities across South and Southeast Asia have received extensive scholarly attention, comparatively little scholarship has been conducted on the Tibetan telling of the story, popular among Buddhists across the Himalayas. My talk will examine the Life of Drimé Kunden not in isolation, but as one knot in an intertextual web of Tibetan historical, biographical, and hagiographical literature that spans the twelfth to fifteenth centuries. Paying special attention to two narrative episodes in the Mani Kambum (compiled between the twelfth and thirteenth centuries) in which we find the Tibetan emperor Songtsen Gampo (ca. seventh century) regaling his court with tales of his previous life as a veritable Vessantara, I will argue that the Life of Drimé Kunden likely predates its earliest attributed discoverer, the Bhutanese treasure-revealer Pema Lingpa (1450–1521). I will also suggest, based on comparison of the Life of Drimé Kunden with other Tibetan works that are adapted for performance, several ways in which scholars might look to the Life of for new insight into the history of Tibetan opera and the development of certain literary practices that feature ideologically in adaptations of Indian Buddhist tales for the performing arts in Tibet and Bhutan.

84. ELIZABETH A. CECIL, Leiden University

Seeing Double in Daśapura: Yaśodharman’s Twin Columns as Monuments to Competition and Camaraderie

In 1886 J.F. Fleet discovered remains of two monumental inscribed columns lying scattered in the fields around Sondhni, a small hamlet 4 km southeast of Mandasor
in Madhya Pradesh. As ancient Daśapura, the greater Mandasor area rose to regional prominence as the capital of the early Aulikaras in the 6th century—a local ruling family who, together with a lineage of prominent merchants who called themselves Naigamas, formed a corporate political entity that established control over a region strategically located at the heart of the North Indian economic and political landscape. The Aulikaras may have fallen into obscurity were it not for the flamboyance of a king named Yaśodharman, who commissioned the pair of massive stone columns, adorned with eulogistic inscriptions, to celebrate his defeat of the Hūna Mihirakula around 532 CE, whose father, Toramāṇa of the Eran Boar Inscription, had defeated the Guptas just a few decades before.

The inscribed pillars at Sondhni are monumental texts of critical importance for early Indian history; yet, there has been little effort to read the monuments in their larger regional and social contexts. This paper proposes a new interpretation of the Sondhni monuments with particular attention to the political relationships that the two columns were designed to materialize. Considering the conflicts that linked localized ruling families and defined the region’s political geography, Yaśodharman’s monuments at Sondhni should be read in light of the Vaiṣṇava memorial landscape of Eran, a monumental dialogue amongst contemporaries and competitors. In addition, this paper also considers a fundamental, but as yet unanswered question: namely, why are there two seemingly identical columns with the same inscription at the same site? Incorporating unpublished graffiti from Sondhni, I suggest that the two columns memorialize the Aulikara-Naigama alliance.

85. Peter C. Bisschop, Leiden University

Brothers in Arms or Brothers in Trouble? The Twin Shrine, Column and Varāha at Eran

The monumental site at Eran in present-day Madhya Pradesh is one of the most well-known sites of the Gupta period, featuring in almost all textbooks on Indian history, archaeology and art-history. Yet, there are many aspects of the site that still await further study, while a proper understanding of the development of the site as an integrated whole is still lacking. In the present paper I will take the entangled lives of two brothers (Mātrīviṣṇu and Dhanyaviṣṇu) as an entry point to exploring the site. Their lives are reflected by at least three monuments of Eran: (1) a twin shrine whose original dedication is not known, (2) a column erected by the two brothers in direct line with the twin shrine, and (3) a massive Varāha image established by the younger brother Dhanyaviṣṇu after the death in battle of his older brother. Drawing attention to some remarkable comparable features of the Vākāṭaka site of Rāmagiri, I will propose a new model for understanding the development of the complex.

A. Ancient Near East V: History. Steven Garfinkle, Western Washington University, Chair (9:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) Frick Room *

86. Joshua Jeffers, University of Pennsylvania

New Visual Evidence for the “City on the Seashore” Scene in Sennacherib’s Throne Room

On the walls of the Southwest palace at Nineveh, Sennacherib carved magnificent representations of military achievement that portray the king’s victories over the
enemy in his efforts to preserve and expand the Assyrian empire. One of the more famous scenes among them is the so-called “City on the Seashore” on Slabs 1–18 of the palace’s throne room. This scene depicts a Phœnician foe attempting to escape Sennacherib’s advance by taking to ships and fleeing into the open sea. The slabs carved with this relief program have long since crumbled to dust, but during the British excavation of the site in the 1840s, A. H. Layard drew the reliefs on Slabs 14 and 15, thus preserving their contents. However, given that Slabs 16 and 17 were so heavily damaged, he decided not to copy them. Fortunately, L. W. King took a single photograph of those slabs during his re-excavation of the site in 1903, which to this day serves as the only evidence for their reliefs. Since King’s photograph is of poor quality and since it is true that the upper portion of Slabs 16 and 17 is heavily damaged, scholars have only ever commented on the lone row of Assyrian soldiers and prisoners appearing in the slabs’ bottom register. Yet on a closer examination of the upper register of Slab 16 in the photograph, it possible to discern additional visual elements of this relief program that have gone unnoticed until the present time. Furthermore, these new features prove crucial in reconstructing the overall artistic plan of Slabs 14–18, and they reveal a narrative program not found elsewhere in Sennacherib’s palace.

87. Adrianne Spunaugle, University of Michigan

Landscapes of Empire

Human agency notwithstanding, anthropic events are routinely mitigated by various factors in the environment or landscape. “Landscape,” in this sense indicates a “dynamic space of social, cultural, and ecological significance, which develops interactively with the human societies occupying it” (Förster et al, 2012). In preparing a social history, therefore, the significance of “landscape” is quite high, as it influences and (often) determines the level of human agency expressed at any one time. Therefore, the attempt is made to consider both humanity’s influence upon landscape, as well as landscape’s influence upon humanity—to understand how landscapes mitigated migration and how humans structured their environments. History, as the record of human actions, is inextricably bound to natural environment, and it is from this perspective that I approach the formation of the first millennium’s empires. The aridification attested during the transition from Bronze to Iron ages was catalyst for the desertion of prime areas in both Assyrian and Babylonian heartlands, which in turn proved to be a driving concern in the respective empires’ policies: including deportation. This paper explores the social world of the ancient Near East via a landscape-centered approach to the formation of ethnic groups, specifically as present in Babylonia during the latter first millennium BCE. Building from a geo-archaeological presentation of landscape, against which I read the contents of various letters and administrative texts, I suggest that a change in climate greatly affected the (re-)institution of empires during the first millennium.

88. Anna Glenn, Johns Hopkins University

ˇSirgida—Hymns and Royal Ritual in the Old Babylonian Period

Sumerian hymns labeled with the subscript ˇsirgida are a well-known component of the Old Babylonian hymnic corpus; however, the essential characteristics of this
hymnic type, as well as the social context in which the širgida-hymns were performed and copied, are yet to be thoroughly explored. The goal of this paper is to examine one aspect of these issues: namely, the role of the Mesopotamian king in the širgida-hymns. In the first part of the paper, I present new evidence to argue that the Mesopotamian king plays a greater role in each of the preserved hymns than previously recognized. In the second part of the paper, I take a closer look at the way the Mesopotamian king is portrayed in the širgida-hymns, looking specifically at how this portrayal might relate to the hymns’ performative ritual context.

89. Ryan H. Schnell, University of Chicago

Shall No Man Raise His Sister’s Son?: The Anatolian Avuncular System in the II and I Millennia BCE

Building off the work of Sürenhagen (1998) and Goedegebuure (2006), this paper proposes and elucidates the existence of an Anatolian system of familial inheritance that was avuncular in character, extant in the II and I millennia BCE. Unlike many of their geospatial and temporal contemporaries, there is evidence that select Hittite and Lycian elites did not inherit their offices patrilinearly, but instead through an avuncular chain of mother’s brother to sister’s son. This situation elevated the rank of the Tawananna in the Hittite Old Kingdom, who, as the sister of the Tabarna, or Great King, provided him with a royal heir. This is contra the work of Bin-Nun (1975), who hypothesized a purely matrilinear succession. Utilizing research done by Levi-Strauss (1969, 1974) on the avunculate and comparative Indo-European material, the basis for avuncular relationships can be established as normative in the Indo-European sphere. The particular variant of structure seen in the Anatolian sphere can be examined through several means, namely: linguistically, textually, and numismatically (in the case of Lycia). The Karum Kanesh texts, the Tale of Zalpa, the Testament of Hattusili, the Proclamation of Telipinu, and various ritual texts form the basis of evidence for avuncular structure in the Old Hittite Kingdom; epichoric inscriptions and numismatic evidence provide evidence for its existence in Lycia. Due to the nature of the evidence, it would seem that avuncular inheritance structure was primarily practiced by royal and priestly elites, evolved out of a Luwo-Hattic substrate in prehistoric Anatolia, and ceased to be practiced by the New Kingdom in the case of the Hittites and by the fourth century at the latest in the case of the Lycians.

References


90. Alexander Nagel, Smithsonian Institution, National Museum of Natural History

Babylon is Here. Scholarship on Ancient Mesopotamia in Washington, D.C., around 1900

Although largely forgotten, Baghdad-born Gabriel Oussani (187–1934) heightened interest in the United States about the material remains of cities such as Assur, Babylon, Mosul. Today, the Smithsonian Institution’s National Museum of Natural History in Washington, D.C. holds one of the largest collections assembled by Oussani, including a collection of seals, cuneiform tablets, and sculptural fragments, many of which were collected from dealers in Hillah on the ruins of ancient Babylon in the late 19th century.

In the Fall of 2017, a student curated exhibition, supported by the Iraqi Embassy and New York University Washington, D.C., highlighted some of these materials and Oussani’s intellectual contributions. The exhibition also introduced ongoing research on archives and correspondence related to Oussani and his contemporaries with the project “Babylon is Here. Mesopotamia Matters in Washington, D.C.” This presentation will introduce this project, and provide an overview of research on the realities of American-Mesopotamian relationships and cultural diplomacies from the last quarter of the 19th century into the first decades of the 20th century. New research on the objects and holdings related to U.S. consuls and missionary men in Baghdad and Mosul will be featured along with the work of scholars educated in the Ottoman Empire. This research allows intellectuals and scholars to look back at the early years of the American Oriental Society with member ties to D.C. based individuals such as Immanuel Casanowicz (1853–1927) and Cyrus Adler (1863–1940), and academic institutions in Washington, D.C. and the East Coast. Against this background, the project also allows intellectuals to re-evaluate and contextualize current early 21st century politics on scholarship and cultural diplomacies with the Middle East.

91. David Danzig, Institute for the Study of the Ancient World, New York University

Ethnicity in Upper-Class 1st Millennium BCE Nippur, or What’s in a List of Names?

A contribution to the study of ethnicity in first millennium BCE Nippur, central Babylonia, is here inferred from a non-descript school exercise, viewed in the context of its textual corpus. The bulk of the corpus published in Cole’s Early Neo-Babylonian Governor’s Archive (1996) consists of letters, mainly related to economic matters of a group of upper-middle class Nippureans, as per the review of Van Driel (1998). Included are some school texts, such as Text 124, a metrological exercise combined with an exercise on personal names, which perhaps amounts to a practice ration disbursement text. This text stands out because of the names that appear within it—approximately 75% are also attested in the letters from the same corpus. There is a direct relation between the school exercises and the letters because they were discovered in the same archaeological context. From this I deduce that the names used in this exercise belonged to people from the student scribe’s family’s social circle in upper-middle class Nippur. Further analysis of the language of the names shows that at least 80% of the names attested in both Text 124 and the letters are of the Babylonian language. Due to the socio-linguistic situation of 8th century BCE Nippur and taking into consideration the complex issues regarding name language and ethnicity, I
further argue that this tablet gives evidence for an ethnically Babylonian social circle of upper-middle class Nippureans that largely excluded persons of non-Babylonian ethnic identity. This result helps in setting up a putative dichotomy between city and countryside in the Nippur vicinity at this time that parallels an ethnic distinction between Babylonian identity versus various non-Babylonian ethnicities. The potential ongoing coincidence of this ethnic and residential divide will be traced through the rest of the millennium in my dissertation project.

B. East Asia V: Sinological Perspectives. Richard VanNess Simmons, Rutgers University, Chair (10:00 a.m.–11:30 a.m.) Phipps Room

92. Mario De Grandis, Ohio State University

Anthologizing Hui Folk Literature for Nation Building

Commenting on the collection of German tales compiled by the Grimm brothers, Donald Hasse surmises that it “played a significant role in establishing the shared cultural tradition and sense of national identity that were critical to the process of nation building” (Haase 2008: 663). Hasse’s comment lends comparative insight into situating the anthologies of Hui folktales in China in the country’s national building project since the nineteen fifties. Following the German model, the Chinese government launched large-scale projects to collect and compile folksongs and narratives (Bender 2013), all of which took place against the state-engineered formation of the “fifty-six ethnic groups.” Hui Folk Legends and Stories (1984)—the only anthology of Hui folk literature with a national scope—was compiled and published in this national context. But was this anthology merely a product of China’s nation building?

The framework and paratexts of Hui Folk Legends and Stories clearly follow the state’s guidelines to define ethnicity. The ideological orientation of the anthology adheres to state’s in that there are explicit references to political events, and the stated purpose of promoting “Socialism with Chinese characteristics” in the editorial language. The stories in the anthology, however, undermine the state-sanctioned notion of Hui ethnic unity. As a whole, the stories in the anthology exhibit great diversity of narrative forms, styles and themes, hinting at divergent traditions and practices. My study speculates that the heterogeneity of Hui folk literature reflects the fact that historically separate Hui communities had few or no relations with one another (Gladney 1996). Thus, the anthology appears at once to promote as well as challenge the national story of a united Hui ethnicity. This seemingly self-contradictory phenomenon shows that folk literature, in its edited form, cannot be easily subjugated under the nation-building project.

93. Gang Zhou, Louisiana State University

Sinology, Sinologism, New Sinology

A few years ago I wrote a book review of Ming Dong Gu’s Sinologism: An Alternative to Orientalism and Postcolonialism. In his book, Gu uses the term Sinologism as a blanket term for everything that is wrong with Sinology. Around the same time, I came across David Honey’s book entitled Incense at the Altar: Pioneering Sinologists and the Development of Classical Philology. In his book, Honey treats Sinology as a tradition represented by his heroes such as Edouard Chavannes, Paul Pelliot, James
Legge, and Arthur Waley. Honey’s book ends with a resounding declaration: “No one can expect more from the Past.” Placing Gu’s book side-by-side with Honey’s, I ask in my review when we might have a third book that presents both the right and wrong sides of Sinology, or the inner logic that makes Sinology what it is.

This essay may be seen as one of the initial attempts to reflect upon Sinology as a tradition, a profession and a mode of intellectual inquiry. By commenting on two essays, each proposing a distinctive version of “New Sinology”: Geremie R. Barme’s “On New Sinology” (2005) and Jue Chen’s “Earl Miner: New Sinology through Comparative Literature” (2014), I propose my own version of “New Sinology.”

94. Suah Kim, Tongmyong University

Chan Buddhism and Chan-ch’a rite in Korean Buddhism

Chan-ch’a rite is performed to be based on the Chan-ch’a shan-o yeh-pao ching (Scripture of Diving the Requital of Good and Evil Actions), appeared in the late Sixth century in China. Whalen Lai defined the main character of this scripture as a karmic fortune-telling text that is the Buddhist answer to the I ching (Book of Changes).¹ This paper aims to examine the relationship between Chan Buddhism and divination rite in Korean Buddhism in general, and the Goryeo dynasty in particular.

In Korean peninsula, Monk Wonkwang (원광) introduced the Chan-ch’a rite to the Shilla Kingdom in the approximately 6th century. After Wonkwang, Jinpyo (진표) had further developed this rite in the 8th century and his idea was naturally transmitted to the Goryeo dynasty throughout his disciples. Because Jinpyo’s disciples had occupied the temples of the Dharma Characteristics School, Buddhist scholars have only focused on the relationship between the Chan-ch’a rite and the Dharma Characteristics School during the Goryeo dynasty.²

However, recent studies have been revealed that various divination rites were largely performed by political and social purposes during the Goryeo dynasty. Even the King ordered to perform the rite in order to make major decisions.³ Thus, in this paper, I would deal with two aspects; first, how Chan-ch’a rites were diversified in Korean Buddhist world in general, and second, how Chan Buddhism dealt with the Chan-ch’a rite from ritual and theological perspectives during the Goryeo dynasty in particular.

95. SHUAIB ALLY, University of Toronto

Jurjānī on the Relationship between Eloquent Speech and the Psychology of the Listener

‘Abd al-Qāhir al-Jurjānī (d. 478 H/1079 CE) has been inaccurately portrayed (Abu Deeb, 1979; Larkin, 1995) as failing to consider the effect speech has on the listener. This is problematic because it does not account for a distinctive feature of Jurjānī’s contribution to pragmatics: fashioning grammatical and eloquent speech requires a speaker give due consideration to a listener’s psychology. My paper addresses this mischaracterization with special attention to Jurjānī’s primary work in Arabic linguistics theory, Dalā’il al-fījżā’ (Proofs of Inimitability). Specifically, I assess examples Jurjānī gives to demonstrate that beauty in speech derives from the speaker structuring it semantically such that it accords to various levels of a listener’s real, imagined, or even alleged psychology—to match a listener’s reasonably expected or imputed mindset; or to pre-empt them from misunderstanding; or to even insinuate they hold false beliefs they do not actually maintain. This analysis will show that the extra-linguistic factor (Firanescu, 2011) of due deference to the psychology of the listener as a component of eloquent speech is a thoroughgoing feature of Jurjānī’s work. Shedding light on this unappreciated contribution to the Arabic linguistic tradition also allows us to position Jurjānī as building upon Sibawayhi’s approach (d. 180 H/796 CE) to the linguistic awareness and competence of the speaker (Baalbaki, 2007). It will further allow a consideration of how Jurjānī can be brought to bear on more recent discussions of pragmatic presuppositions (Stalnaker, 1974), and how this relates to relative well-formedness (Lakoff, 1971). This investigation into a specific theory of Jurjānī’s will provide a clearer account of why he is widely considered the founder of Arabic rhetoric.

96. CARL SHARIF EL-TOBGUI, Brandeis University

From Legal Theory to Erkenntnistheorie: Ibn Taymiyya on Tawātur as the Ultimate Guarantor of Human Cognition

In his groundbreaking study on the typology of Islamic legal theory, Aron Zysow remarks that, in contrast to legal systems where legitimacy is defined in institutional terms, the authority of law in Islam has primarily been a question of epistemology. The lynchpin of this textual epistemology is the concept of tawātur, or “recurrent mass transmission.” Like knowledge gained through the senses, Muslim epistemological theory considers the knowledge produced by tawātur to occupy the highest rung on the scale of epistemic warrant, namely, that of certainty (yaqīn). Non-mutawātir (or āhād) reports, by contrast, can give rise only to probabilistic knowledge (zann) of authenticity.

This paper explores tawātur in the thought of the Ḥanbali polymath Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728/1328) from two distinct angles: that of legal theory and that of Ibn Taymiyya’s philosophical epistemology more broadly. In the realm of uṣūl al-fiqh, Ibn Taymiyya expands the number of mutawātir reports through the category of “special tawātur”
that exists among the specialists of a given discipline, particularly that of hadith. Beyond this, he does away with the categorical distinction between mutawātir and non-mutawātir reports altogether, delineating a number of circumstances under which ḥadīth reports may also yield knowledge and thus be considered “fi ma’nā al-mutawātir,” resting his legal theory on the directly and purely epistemological division between “that which yields knowledge” and that which does not.

The real novelty of Ibn Taymiyya’s approach to tawātir, however, lies in his unique expansion of the concept to the realm of human cognition as a whole. The most basic and certain knowledge (beyond the revealed texts) derives from the senses and the a priori axioms of reason. These faculties, however, are subject to corruption, particularly (in the case of reason) through extended exposure to specious doctrines that violate basic rationality. Ibn Taymiyya ultimately appeals to a type of pan-human tawātir of reason and sense experience in his bid to defend his conception of common-sense rationality against what he sees as the recondite—and incoherent—musing of the falāṣīfa.

97. ABDULLA GALADARI, Al-Maktoum College

The Epistemology of the Qur’ān on Faith

The Qur’ān frequently abhors blind faith in its arguments against non-believers. To have faith for the reason that people saw this is what their forefathers have done is repeatedly detested. Nonetheless, the Qur’ān repeatedly asks people to believe in its message. How does the Qur’ān distinguish between both kinds of faith? This paper argues that the Qur’ān uses two distinct linguistic expressions for faith, “ṭīmān,” with its root (ʿamn) meaning safety, and “żann,” with its root meaning dogmatic zeal. Although the term “żann” has evolved to mean conjecture or speculation in Arabic, its Semitic root, as attested in its usage in Hebrew and Aramaic, means to have unwavering dogma, and is sometimes used in such definition in some prophetic traditions (ḥadīth). Linguistically, the Qur’ānic concept of “ṭīmān” may be compared to taking refuge (saddhā) in Buddhism, in that it means to have faith through experience and insight (prajñā), as portrayed in the Kalama Sutta, and not zealous dogma, which is also frowned upon in Buddhism. Various Buddhist Suttas and the Qur’ān differentiate between two types of conviction, that which is received through discernment and understanding, and that which is blind. This opens the door to further understand the concept of “ṭīmān” (faith) in the Qur’ān, which is trusting and taking refuge in God and the Qur’ānic teachings, and not to blindly have conviction, even in God. As such, the Qur’ān shows cues of an attempt to harmonize faith and reason in its philosophy of religion.

98. SUHEIL LAHER, Hartford Seminary

Phonological Flux: The Hijazi-Tamimi Linguistic Dichotomy in Nafi’i’s Qirā’ah

This paper discusses how the canonical Qur’ānic transmissions from the Madinian Nafi’ (d. 169h) and Kufan ‘Āsim (d. 128h) confirm the second Islamic century to have been a time of phonological flux and diversity, in which the (generally-upheld) dichotomy between early Western (Hijazi) and Eastern (Tamimi) Arabic dialects was still present. The data also calls into question the geographic distribution of one of the dichotmous features, the imalāh.
Rabin’s wide-ranging study Ancient West Arabian, still a foundational resource, asserts that the Western (including Hijazi) dialects were rather different from the Eastern dialects, and that the latter (through their greater influence on Classical Arabic) eventually displaced the former. His data reaffirmed a Hijazi-Tamimi dichotomy initially framed by Sibawayh (d. 180). Rabin suggests imalah of III-y verbs is a Hijazi phenomenon, a thesis supported in more recent studies from al-Jallad (who studied early transcriptions of Arabic in Greek, and phonetic shift patterns), and van Putten (who reasoned on the basis of Quranic rhyme patterns).

My paper explores both the E-W dichotomy and the imalah through phonetic data from the qira’at. It is the first attempt to systematically study all canonical variants transmitted from a single eponymous reciter, and to correlate these with biographical data to attempt to construct a more coherent picture of the state of the language. The data is seen to confirm the broad outlines of the East-West dichotomy, as well as Rabin’s thesis of Western features gradually being sidelined by increasing Eastern dominance. For the imalah, however, I argue that while the sum of data remains inconclusive, and its interpretation influenced by one’s assumptions about other aspects of the unthinkable there is reason to question, or at least qualify, the thesis of III-y imala being a Western phenomenon.

D. Islamic Near East VIII: Libraries and Manuscripts. Ahmed El Shamsy, University of Chicago, Chair (10:45 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) Conference Room A

99. Kyle Wynter-Stoner, University of Chicago

The Movement and Destruction of Books in the Libraries of Mamluk Cairo

The madrasas of Mamluk Cairo performed a wide range of societal and religious functions. These madrasas not only served as centers for religious learning, but also as architectural testaments to the power and munificence of the rulers and administrators who built them. Thanks to the religious endowments (waqf, pl. awqāf) of sultans and high ranking state officials, madrasas provided such services and amenities as lessons on jurisprudence, Qur’ānic recitations, stipends and dormitories for students, imams to lead prayers, clothing and lessons in the Qur’ān for orphans, and, for the interest of this study, libraries.

In this paper, I will expand on the current research available on the status of madrasa libraries in Mamluk Cairo. What little research that exists on this subject often contrasts a golden age of Mamluk libraries with the plunder of these libraries during the Ottoman invasion of Egypt (922/1517) and their subsequent decline. However, upon a closer reading of several Mamluk historical sources and religious endowments deeds, it becomes clear that madrasa libraries in Mamluk Cairo were by no means stable institutions. Books in these libraries were constantly in danger of being lost or destroyed due to theft, confiscation by political authorities, natural disasters, and negligence. Moreover, I contend that by tracing the movement of library books throughout Mamluk Cairo and by understanding general library practices of the time, we can begin to address the larger question of why some of these libraries, along with the madrasa institutions to which they were attached, fell into ruin during the Ottoman period.
“Marginal Note by My Sheikh”: Edward Lane and al-Ṭanṭāwī’s Annotations to The Thousand and One Nights

Two of the best known English versions of The Thousand and One Nights, those of Edward Lane (1839–41) and Richard Burton (1885–88), are as notable for their notes and commentary as for their translations. On the Arabic side, though, the Nights were not the kind of book that required a commentary, no doubt a factor in its supposedly dubious (or at best, non-canonical) status among the literary and cultural elite.

However, the Rare Books Department of Cambridge University possesses an Arabic commentary of sorts on the Nights, commissioned by Edward Lane to assist him in his translation. The commentator is Muhammad ‘Iyād al-Ṭanṭāwī (1810–61), who would eventually come to hold the Chair in Arabic at the University of St. Petersburg.

Back in England and working on his translation, Lane had al-Ṭanṭāwī send him, in installments, annotated pages of the Bulaq edition (1835) of Al-f laylah wa-lyayah. Lane expressed his gratitude for his “sheykh’s” philological comments and corrections, while adding that he did not always concur, and had added marginalia of his own to the edition, in the hope that it may eventually “be of great utility to many students of the Arabic language.”

It is not clear that the annotated Nights copy has attracted the students Lane was hoping for. References in secondary scholarship are few (two, to my knowledge thus far) and somewhat misguided.

My proposed communication is based on a study of al-Ṭanṭāwī’s notes to the Nights. It addresses the following topics: (1) the commentary itself, that is, what does a nineteenth-century sheikh’s commentary on the Nights look like? What would he comment on, and what would he find in need of explanation? Do the glosses give any indication as to the standing of the Nights amongst the Cairene ‘ulamā’?; (2) the extent of Lane’s reliance on the commentary for his translation and his notes. Did he give sufficient credit to al-Ṭanṭāwī? In addition, the study of the commentary permits us to add some intellectual and scholarly details to the biography of al-Ṭanṭāwī.

Theory and Practice in the Paratextual Audition Notices of Princeton University Library Hadith Manuscripts

This paper examines the institution of the paratextual reading/audition notice (samā‘āt), in both theory and practice. Audition notices are ubiquitous in manuscripts, hadith manuscripts in particular, produced from the fifth/eleventh century to the tenth/sixteenth century. Reading notices provide the historian with a wide range of unique documentary data, including information about the transmitting authority, and their auditors, such as their gender, age, social status, profession and places of origin, as well as how often they attended or were absent from the readings of a particular text and are a rich source for the social and intellectual history of the communities that created them. An audition notice was composed on a manuscript following the completion of a reading of the text for the purposes of transmission and was intended to function as proof that those named therein had audited the text so that they might later transmit the text themselves, as any claim to have audited a text without the proof of an audition notice was suspect at best. Because they
were an essential element in the transmission of manuscripts, from as early as the fifth/eleventh century, hadith scholars were articulating protocols for the composition of audition notices in manuals of usūl al-hadīth. These protocols detail, among other things, the proper format an audition notice should take, the essential elements that it should include, and where it should be composed within the manuscript. Based on a study of two hundred and twenty-three audition notices I discovered while surveying the nine-hundred and twelve hadith manuscripts housed in the Princeton University Library Collection of Arabic and Islamic Manuscripts, this paper examines the extent to which the practice of composing audition notices follows the theoretical protocols laid out by Medieval hadith scholars.

E. South and Southeast Asia V: Millennials Reading Sanskrit Kāvya in the Second Millennium 1–3. (9:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) Conference Room B

Section 1: Court Poetry. Shaman Hatley, University of Massachusetts Boston, Chair

102. Eric Moses Gurevitch,
“Removing the Conflict Between Textual Authority and the Worldly”: New Epistemic Virtues for Old Śāstric Models in Jayasimha II’s Court

The court of the Western Cāḷukya ruler Jayasimha II (r. 1015–1043) attracted a number of scholars who produced śāstric texts in both Sanskrit and Kannada. These authors situated their texts in relation to their patron and their colleagues, and invoked a set of epistemic virtues developed within the “New Kannada” (hōṣagannāda) literary movement from 150 years earlier. The incorporation of epistemic virtues from this literary movement into already available śāstric genres led to the production of a new set of working objects of scholarly inquiry, and new ways of approaching the natural and social worlds. This paper will explore this intellectual environment through a close reading of Candrarāja’s Madanatilakam, a Kannada kāmaśāstra that was presented as “removing the conflict between textual authority and the worldly,” and which was taken as a model for poets writing in Kannada in the coming centuries.

103. Jahnabi Barooah Chanchani, University of Michigan
Amaru Inside and Outside the Malwa Court

How was a lyrical Sanskrit literary masterpiece understood about a millennium after its composition? In this paper, I query this question focusing on four engagements with the Amaruśataka (One Hundred Verses of Amaru, AS hereafter), a collection of love poems. At the centerpiece of my study is a richly illustrated manuscript of the AS prepared in Malwa in the 17th century. This manuscript is today dispersed in several collections. In each folio, the text is contained in a compartment in the uppermost register and a large painting is set beneath it. Many paintings depict lovers in pavilions. In this paper, I ask: what kind of a reader of the AS was the painter (or whoever provided painting guidelines to him)? I compare the Malwa painter’s visions of the AS with my analysis of reading practices deployed by three of the text’s most well-known commentators: Arjunadevavarma (13th century, Malwa), Vemabhūpāla (15th century, Andhra), and Ravicandra (undated, Bengal). I further ask: do textual and pictorial engagements with Sanskrit kāvya in the vernacular millennium seek to vernacularize the kāvya, and if so, how do they do this? What are the similarities and differences
between their methods and goals? I locate this project at the interstices of scholarship on the formation of literary communities, development of exegetical practices, and South Asian painting. In doing so, I engage in a conversation with recent works such as Deven M. Patel’s *Text to Tradition*, Sheldon Pollock’s essay, “What Was Philology in Sanskrit?” Yigal Bronner’s essay, “Double-Bodied Poet, Double-Bodied Poem” and older works by art historian Moti Chandra.

104. DOLORES PIZARRO MINAKAKIS, Cambridge, MA

A Lion’s Roar in the War of Poets: Creating Canon in the *Āryāsaṅgīta*

The early 13th-century poetic compilation, the *Āryāsaṅgīta*, may perhaps be considered unusual in that its author, Govardhana, seems to arrange his own place within a Sanskrit literary canon that he himself delineates. Appropriately for such a massive collection (756 verses), the *Āryāsaṅgīta* boasts a lengthy introductory section that pays homage to several expected deities, such as Śiva, Viṣṇu, Pārvatī, Lākṣmī, and Gaṇeśa (verses 1.1–1.28). However, soon thereafter, the poet shifts his tone and begins to list the authors that came before him, including Vālmīki, Vyāsā, Kālidāsa, Bhavabhūti, Bāṇa, and a poet who seems to be Govardhana’s own father, Nīlāmbara, as well as his patron, King Lākṣmīnārāyaṇa (verses 1.30–1.39). After this section, Govardhana goes on to pay tribute to poetry, *rasa*, and—naturally—his own abilities (verses 1.40–1.54).

This paper will closely examine the verses in praise of the poets and poetry that preceded and inspired the *Āryāsaṅgīta*. I posit that Govardhana has carefully chosen the texts and authors that he names and is, in fact, creating his own Sanskrit canon in selecting which works are represented. Naturally, in the creation of this canon, he also includes himself, establishing his own œuvre as, perhaps, the apotheosis of the courtly poetic literature to which he owes so much.

Just as interesting as the texts and writers that Govardhana names are, perhaps, the ones he chooses to omit. In earlier presentations, I have delved into the *Āryāsaṅgīta*’s relationship with earlier Prākrit lyric poetic tradition, as well as tensions visible between “high” and “low” language in the text itself. In this paper, I will also be exploring some obvious omissions and their significance with regard to both this text and the changing literary milieu in which it was produced.

Section 2: Poetics. TIMOTHY LUBIN, Washington and Lee University, Chair

105. RADHA BLINDERMAN, Harvard University

Jiva’s Theory and Practice of Śleṣa

Jiva Gosvāmin is an author for whom paronomasia (*śleṣa*) is not just a literary trope. He brings it beyond the scope of *kavya* by injecting grammatical and other texts with a layer of theological content. His reasons for making *śleṣa* ‘the vehicle of religion’ are not just aesthetic, but rather rooted in his theology and epistemology. It is a practical expression of his philosophical commitment to the idea that since everything, including the phenomenon of language, is created by the Divine, all words, both *vaidika* and *laukika*, should signify the Divine either directly or indirectly.

This idea greatly influences his innovative presentation of Sanskrit grammar in the *Harināmāṁrtavāyākaraṇa*. In the scope of the present paper, however, I will focus on
what created Jiva as a grammarian: Jiva as a poet, commentator, literary critic and theologian. I will analyze examples of ślesa from his original kāvyā, Gopālacampū, and from Kramasandarbha, his commentary on the Bhāgavatapurāṇa. Jiva relies centrally on ślesa in his exposition of new theological ideas and categories; for example, to prove that Caitanya is an avatāra of Kṛṣṇa, or that language praises the Divine even independently from the intention of the speaker. I will seek to establish connections with his work on poetics, Bhaktirasūmaṭaśeṣa, and the portions of the Śatsandarbhas where he philosophically grounds his views on the relation of language and the Divine. I will also attempt to show what is new about Jiva’s use of ślesa, building on Yigal Bronner’s Extreme Poetry: The South Asian Movement of Simultaneous Narration. My central argument is that as a theologian Jiva has much scope for originality, being one of the first to theorize the Caitanya bhakti movement, and this relative freedom of architect of a nascent theology allows him to experiment and stretch the boundaries of ślesa in new ways.

106. JAMES REICH, Pace University

Flaws and Ends: The Dharmakīrtian Basis for Mahimabhaṭṭa’s Poetic Teleology

This paper will examine Mahimabhaṭṭa’s treatment of literary flaws [doṣas], showing that the theoretical basis for his approach is drawn from Dharmakīrti’s similar treatment of debate flaws in Vādaṇyāya. While Mahimabhaṭṭa is often remembered for his criticisms of theory of dhvani, it its theory of poetic flaws that really went on to become influential. By reducing the large number of poetic flaws to a few categories, Mahimabhaṭṭa usefully organized what had previously been a haphazard collection of terms in a way that was attractive to later theorists. The basis for this reduction was an insistence on the strict teleology of poetry—that all aspects of poetry are intended to assist in producing an awareness of rasa. Because of this, poetic flaws can all be understood as different ways of interrupting or impeding this process, and can be organized accordingly. This insistence on poetic teleology is very similar to Āndavardhana’s earlier poetic teleology, which is based in Mīmāṃsā, and it has therefore been assumed that Mahimabhaṭṭa also grounds his teleology in Mīmāṃsā. However, close attention to his text reveals that Dharmakīrti’s Vādaṇyāya is actually the principle source for this idea. In this text, which Mahima quotes more then once, Dharmakīrti takes the previously haphazard lists of debate flaws given in the Nyāya tradition and reduces them to a small number of categories, guided by the assumption that the only goal of a debate is to produce an awareness of truth in the listener. It can therefore be shown that this text furnishes a direct model for Mahima’s teleology-based reduction of poetic flaws. This connection further illustrates one important way in which Buddhist assumptions about language and practicality became quietly influential on the entire later history of Sanskrit literary theory.

107. DAVID BUCHTA, Brown University

On the Virtues of Intentionally Bad Poetry

The definition of kāvyā (poetry) in Mammaṭa’s Kāvyaprakāśa (11th c) includes the criterion that it must be [basically] free of doṣas (faults). The analysis and exemplification of potential poetic faults form a major part of most works of Sanskrit alaṅkāraśāstra (poetics). Often, the verses cited as examples of doṣas in alaṅkāraśāstra...
works are not traceable and are almost certainly the poetician’s own creation. When these verses are understood as intentionally bad, the profound cleverness of their composition can be appreciated. This paper draws upon the verses illustrating doṣas from the Kāvyaparakāśa and Baladeva Vidyābhūṣaṇa’s Sāhityakaumudi (18th c), a Vaiṣṇava reworking of the former. The paper suggests three possible motivations for composing original verses instead of drawing from prior poetic works: 1) avoiding critique of earlier poets, at least in Baladeva’s case; 2) showing extreme, easily recognizable examples of the faults in question, much like some of the examples of logical fallacies in Nyāya texts; and 3) demonstrating the poetician’s own skill and cleverness. The paper will also consider how these verses are meant to function as examples. Yigal Bronner suggests that doṣas often represent “shadowy ślesas” and raises issues of authorial intent. While recognizing the value of Bronner’s insight, this paper proffers that the second meanings in these cases are best read as intentionally constructed by the poetician, but meant to be read as examples of faults as if they were unintended. Thus, the connection between ślesa and doṣa is perhaps more tenuous than Bronner indicates. Finally, this paper considers how this insight can help to identify an episode from the Caitanyacaritāmṛta, an early 17th century hagiography of Caitanya, as fictional.

Section 3: Regional Kāvya. Elaine M. Fisher, Stanford University, Chair

108. Anand Venkatkrishnan, Harvard University

Jackfruit in the Rasam: Religion and Aesthetics in Premodern Kerala

As Sheldon Pollock noted in his essay “Sanskrit Literary Culture from the Inside Out,” the Bhāgavata Purāṇa presented itself not only as the quintessence of Brahmanical scripture, but as the paradigmatic kāvya. This prompted many of its readers to treat the text through the lens of Sanskrit poetics. The concept of bhaktirasa, or the aestheticized emotion of religious ecstasy, is said to have found its most mature form among the Gauḍīya Vaiṣṇava theologians Rūpa and Jīva Gosvāmin in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. In this paper, I offer evidence for an alternative history of bhaktirasa as it manifested in the writings of two Śaivas in Kerala, Pūrṇasarasvatī and Rāghavānanda, over the same period of time. As scholars of Sanskrit kāvya in their own right, they highlighted the literary qualities of the Bhāgavata Purāṇa, but their analysis was also speckled with Śaiva and Śākta metaphysics. Indeed, their interest in religion as literature extended beyond the Bhāgavata to a broad array of stotra-kāvyas that fused the erotic and the devotional in the language of belles-lettres. Hansa Stainton has studied the genre of stotra-kāvya among the Śaiva poets and scholars of medieval Kashmir; I focus here on their successors in Kerala. I locate their writing at the nexus of a number of religious, philosophical, and literary trends: between Śaivism and Vaiṣṇavism, between praise-poetry and scriptural exegesis, and between austere philosophical traditions and exuberant literary aesthetics. Ultimately, I offer sources for a new reception history of the Bhāgavata Purāṇa.
109. TIMOTHY LORNDALE, University of Pennsylvania

Slaying Śiṣūpāla in a Southern Tongue: The Reception of Māgha’s Śiṣūpālavadha and its 15th Sarga in Old Kannada

Māgha’s Śiṣūpālavadha (The Slaying of Śiṣūpāla; ŚV), a 7th century Sanskrit poem, which expands upon Kṛṣṇa’s conflict with Śiṣūpāla in the Mahābhārata, was an immensely popular text in premodern South Asia. In addition to a rich manuscript and commentarial tradition, the ŚV had a profound impact on literature composed in regional languages, such as Old Kannada. Māgha’s linguistic and literary influence can be found in the Kannada Mahābhārataśas, the Neminātha narratives, Vaisānava purāṇas, as well as poetics texts.

My paper focuses on Pampa’s Mahābhārata: the Vikramārjunavijaya (c. 941 ce; VAV). Through a close reading of its Śiṣūpāla episode (vv. VI.6–66), I argue that the VAV imports descriptive and narrative elements that are unique to the ŚV into its telling of the epic. Beyond the question of influence, I contend that the VAV’s interpretation of this episode can also help shed light upon the ŚV’s textual history, especially its 15th canto. Bronner and McCrea (2012) argue that Śiṣūpāla’s critique of Kṛṣṇa in the 15th canto exists in two recensions: one preserved in the text of Vallabhadeva’s commentary (10th c.) and another in Mallinātha’s (15th c.). They convincingly demonstrate through a stylistic and lexical analysis that the recension of Mallinātha’s text is most likely the original, the other being a later interpolation. However, there is still a 700-year gap between Māgha and his commentator, Mallinātha, to account for. My paper argues that Pampa’s VAV, which is roughly contemporaneous to Vallabhadeva’s commentary, not only preserves the narrative found in Mallinātha’s recension, several identical stanzas are found in the VAV, translated into Kannada. Additional evidence from Ranna’s Sāhasabhīmavijaya (c. 997), written only a few decades later, supports this finding. As I demonstrate in this paper, the narrative evidence found in the Kannada Mahābhārataśas bolsters Bronner and McCrea’s argument, as well as gives a glimpse at an Old Kannada poet’s translation process.

110. YANG QU, Harvard University

Ritual, Kingship, and Realpolitik: Secrets of the 14th Century Old Javanese Poem Sutasoma Kakawin

Written by Mpu Tantular, a member of the courtly elite, the famous 14th century poem Sutasoma Kakawin has sparked scholarly research and debates on the coexistence of Śaivism and Buddhism in pre-modern Java and Bali. Though extensive research has focused on interpreting the so-called Śiva-Buddha dynamics, few scholars have shed light on the seemingly unrelated subplots that Mpu Tantular inserted in the poem. Through an analysis of these subplots, labeled by pioneering scholars as ‘extraneous,’ I tackle the following questions: Why did Mpu Tantular include these subplots in his intriguing and colorful poem if they are indeed meaningless and extraneous? What are their role and function? And what do they tell us about the religious and political culture in 14th century Java?

I will indicate that nothing extraneous exists in this work. By synthesizing both historical and archaeological documents, I contextualize and analyze these subplots of Sutasoma Kakawin in their historical settings. My investigation on the subplots of Sutasoma Kakawin elucidates how Mpu Tantular corporates stories and ideas from
India and weaves them into the intricate Javanese stories of the Prince Sutasoma, and how this jewel of Old Javanese literature also reflects the localized practice of using religious traditions to legitimize kingship in pre-modern Java.

A. Islamic Near East IX: Joint Session with Ancient Near East. SEAN W. ANTHONY, Ohio State University, Chair (1:00 p.m.–2:30 p.m.) Conference Room

111. CHARLES G HÄBERL, Rutgers University

A Chronicle of the Late Sasanian Empire

The Great Treasure is one of the chief scriptures of the Mandæan community formerly from Iraq and Iran. It comprises two volumes in one manuscript: a right-hand one, which is concerned primarily with this world, and a left-hand one, which concerns the fate of the soul after death. Once the reader has completed one volume, s/he can flip the entire manuscript around and continue reading the second. The larger right-hand volume is a miscellany of texts, including prayers, moral instructions, cosmologies, and—in its final chapter—a universal history. The oldest known manuscript of this text was completed on Saturday, July 8th, 1561 CE, but since Lidzbarski’s landmark translation was published in 1925, a scholarly consensus has emerged that it must originally have been composed at some point in Late Antiquity, and that the universal history is the key to narrowing down its date of composition.

Similarly, Lidzbarski and his successors posit that it cryptically refers to the Prophet Muhammad and the Arab rulers who succeeded him. Because the dates of these figures cannot be reconciled with the reigns of other rulers mentioned in the text, all these scholars have concluded that it must have been composed considerably later than the events it depicts, and certainly no earlier than the late 7th to early 8th century. To the contrary, a straightforward reading of the text, tethered to astronomical phenomena such as the annual eclipse of Wednesday, June 19th, 475 CE and historical events such as the Zoroastrian calendar reform of 375 AY / 1006 CE, reveals that this chapter is an accurate and likely contemporaneous chronicle of events from the late 5th century to the turn of the 7th century, and that it does not mention Islam at all, either directly or indirectly.

112. KEVIN VAN BABLEDL, Yale University

Western Iranian Words in Tenth-Century Arabic Sources

This presentation analyzes Western Iranian words and sentences cited in Arabic sources written by tenth-century Western Iranian authors of Arabic works, such as Ḫāmza al-Īṣfahānī and Abū Ḥātim ar-Rāzī. These authors are normally regarded as “Persians,” and that is indeed the Arabic term for them, but the case is not so simple. Certain features mark at least some of the “Persian” words that they cite as non-Perside, northwestern Iranian words, not New Persian, the language that scholars normally assume these individuals spoke. In a rare example of a Western Iranian sentence cited in its entirety in the tenth century, Ḫāmza uses a transitive preterite verb in ergative construction, clinching the case that New Persian was not his vernacular. This syntactic pattern is, rather, typical of Parthian and Middle Persian. The primary vernacular of these authors appears to be Western Middle Iranian speech,
perhaps closer to Parthian than to New Persian. This observation forms one part of
a larger argument that New Persian was not used in western Iran until courtiers and
administrators of the Seljuqs brought that language westward from Xurāsān in the
eleventh century. Only thereafter did New Persian gradually become the chief medium
of urbane expression in the region that is today Iran. The so-called Central Iranian
dialects, used today in villages and small towns in western Iran, are the vestiges of
this widespread, non-Persian, form of western Iranian, now largely displaced by the
national use of New Persian.

113. Kayla Dang, Yale University
Lost and Found in Transmission: Another Look at Zoroastrian Priests in Islamic
Era Sources

The Zoroastrian priesthood was greatly diminished over the centuries after the
Arab conquest, and its traditions so scattered that only a fragment of the Zoroastrian
knowledge that had once existed still remained by the 9th and 10th centuries. It even
appears that the priests who redacted and composed the Zoroastrian texts in that
time all came from a single priestly family. But there is a considerable gap between
the 9th- and 10th-century Zoroastrian priests and their predecessors in the Sasanian
period, and a further gap between all of them and the surviving scribal tradition.
What was lost, and found, in these gaps of transmission?

To begin, I examine one narrative of the Zoroastrian past in both Arabic and
Middle Persian sources: the transmutation of the copper ordeal from the prophet
Zarathuštra to a Sasanian priest, and its significance for the entire institution of the
priesthood. The fullest version as recounted by al-Bīrūnī (d. 440/1048) in his Kitāb al-
ātār al-bāqiya is not often discussed but offers an important witness to the functioning
authority of the Zoroastrian priesthood in the 11th century—which begins to look not
so much like a relic of the past as a reinvention of it, institutionalized in a new way.

Taking another look at the Arabic sources, my research questions standard narra-
tives of Zoroastrian history through the focus of priestly transmission. What happens
to orthodoxy once the state that sponsored it no longer exists? Who are the 9th-
and 10th-century Zoroastrian priests mentioned by al-Mas'ūdī, al-Bīrūnī, and several
other early scholars of the Arabic literary tradition? Do the glimpses of these priests
accord with what we know of the priesthood from Zoroastrian sources? And when
Zoroastrian priests are informants for their material, how does the content of their
transmission differ from one author to the next?

114. Thomas Benfey, Princeton University
Uranius and Khusrō I: The Limits of Reason in Late Sasanian Iran

In this paper, I will take a close look at the figure of Uranius, a philosopher in the
Skeptical tradition of Pyrrho and Sextus Empiricus, whose travels between the capitals
of the sixth-century Roman and Iranian empires, and favorable reception at the court
of Khusrō I, the Iranian king of kings, are narrated in Agathias' Histories. While
Agathias describes Uranius in rather disparaging terms, and deploys this account of
Uranius as the linchpin of a broader attempt to discredit Khusrō as the “philosopher-
king” he had been rumored to be, here I will argue that Uranius and his relations
with Khusrō attest to more than Khusrō and Uranius' limited philosophical acumen,
or Agathias’ personal prejudices. I will first show how Dādār b. Dādukht’s Rāsta, an account of conversations between a Zoroastrian priest and Roman philosophers at the court of a Sasanian king of kings, purportedly translated from Middle Persian to New Persian, may corroborate the fact of Uranus’ journey from Rome to Iran. Then, building on Joel Walker’s appeal to view Agathias’ account of Uranus as broadly indicative of the state of philosophy in Late Antique Rome and Iran, I will examine why Uranus’ philosophical orientation may have been received favorably by Khusrō and his associates, and what this reception shows about the intellectual atmosphere at the late Sasanian court. Words attributed to Khusrō in the Middle Persian Dēnkard will feature prominently in my presentation of this courtly milieu.

B. Islamic Near East X: The Maghrib. Scott Lucas, University of Arizona, Chair (1:00 p.m.–2:30 p.m.) Conference Room B

115. Sabahat Adil, University of Colorado at Boulder
   Memories of a Prophetic Past: Arabic Didactic Poetry in the Early Modern Mediterranean

   The subject of rhetoric that spans the full spectrum of emotion, the Prophet Muhammad (d. 11/632) has been memorialized in various types of writing since the time of his passing till the present day. Building upon previous scholarship on the memory of Muhammad in Arabic literature, this paper examines poetry produced in the eleventh/seventeenth-century Mediterranean as a way to map how early modern Muslims defined, wrote about, and ultimately memorialized their past on the basis of earlier texts. Central to this paper are two virtually unknown works by the prolific North African Muslim scholar al-Maqqarī (d. 1041/1632), The Flowers of the Calyces Regarding the News of the Turban (Azhār al-kimāma fī akhbār al-imāma) and The Triumph of the Exalted in the Praise of the Sandals (Fath al-muta‘āl fī madh al-nī‘āl). Specifically, they focus on sartorial elements, namely the turban and the sandal, as a means of characterizing and praising Muhammad. In terms of form, these works fall into a body of didactic literature in versified form (rajaz; urjūza). Based on extant manuscripts, these works were also known to have circulated extensively in West Africa, suggesting their broad reach.

   Through a careful and contextual analysis of these heretofore untranslated works, this paper argues that these texts suggest a concern on the part of the author—and, by extension, his audience—to memorialize the distant and collective Muslim past in the eleventh/seventeenth-century Mediterranean, a time of increasing sociopolitical volatility and change, on the basis of established textual precedents. Thus the discourse developed during the early modern period in the Mediterranean more broadly must be seen as a crucial link between the medieval and the modern, and ideas forged at this time present important implications for modern discourse that invokes the past.

116. Rodrigo Adem, Harvard University
   The Most Precious Pursuit: Ibn Tūmart’s Theological Activism in Context

   Much has been written on the early Almohad religious mission in Muslim N. Africa and Spain in the 12th century CE and its noteworthy hybrid of “charismatic” Berber
messianism and “rationalist” theology. Rather than contribute to a narrative of regional exceptionalism, however, these paradoxical aspects of Almohad ideology should be viewed as embodying common processes in the reconstitution of Islamic religious authority from Iran to Iberia between the 10th and 11th centuries concomitantly with the propagation of kalām, Islam’s distinct form of scholastic theology. Such theological reformulations not only challenged the scholarly status quo with respect to their epistemic frameworks, but also “indigenized” the universalistic aspect of epistemic self awareness within public articulations of religious authenticity. In this light, this paper examines the Aʾazz mā yutlab of Ibn Tūmart, (the foundational theological text of the Almohads) with an eye to situating it more fully within these transregional trends in 11th century Muslim kalām that wedded discourses of theological and legal epistemology discourse with new modes of subject formation and politics in the public sphere.

117. Dagmar Anne Riedel, CCHS-CSIC & Columbia University

Taking Advantage of Popularity: The Rich Evidence of the Long Reception of al-Qāḍī ʿIyāḍ’s Kitāb al-Shifāʾ

I will explore how research on a very popular Arabic literary work like the Kitāb al-shifāʾ, which is ascribed to the important Malikī jurist and Almoravid partisan ʿIyāḍ b. Mūsā al-Yaḥṣūbī (1083–1149), can serve as a proof-of-concept study to address structural challenges when working with primary sources in Arabic script. For the time being, research on the intellectual history of Muslim-ruled premodern societies in Eurasia and Africa is impeded by two related phenomena: the absence of bibliographic control so that it is impossible to know with a modicum of reliability how many copies of an identified literary work in Arabic, Persian or Turkish—to name just the three most important languages of the Islamic civilization before 1800—are extant and accessible, and the Saidian rejection of Orientalist philology. Taken together these two phenomena impact textual research on the written primary sources in Arabic script, since the ignorance about a work’s extant witnesses limits the ability to construe plausible assumptions about the relationship between its known witnesses.

Since this situation is unlikely to change any time soon, the question arises of how to design a research project that takes advantage of the current status quo, despite all its shortcomings, while opening fresh perspectives on understanding the intellectual history of Muslim-ruled premodern societies in Eurasia and Africa. Since the Kitāb al-shifāʾ is one of the enduring “post-classical” bestsellers of literature about the Prophet Muḥammad (d. 632 ce), the work has been preserved in hundreds of manuscript copies in libraries worldwide. During the last years, I have compiled a corpus of about 200 manuscript copies of the Kitāb al-shifāʾ, which constitutes, however, a random sample because of the absence of bibliographic control. But the relative size of this random sample makes it feasible to argue the corpus will reflect at least general trends with regard to the transmission and circulation of the Kitāb al-shifāʾ. My working assumption is that an analysis of the copies’ codicological evidence and written paratexts will reveal new insights into the relationship between reading practices, manuscript manufacture, and the manuscript book trade.
Barley in Anatolian and Tocharian

The *communis opinio* holds that the PIE word for ‘barley’ was *iyeo-* (Ved. *yāva-m.*, YAv. *yuua-*, Gk. *zeia*), e.g. Blažek 2013. Many recognize direct reflexes of this protoform in Hittite *ewa(n)-* and Tocharian B *yap* (Pinault 2008). If true, this item would be the one reconstructable designation of a specific domestic grain for the highest node of PIE. This reconstruction would have significant implications for the dating of the initial splits of PIE since the spread of domesticated barley can be dated archaeologically (Dong et al. 2017, Spengler et al. 2016, et al.). In fact, reconciling the linguistic *communis opinio* with the archeological and genetic data proves remarkably difficult, especially for the Tocharian facts. In this talk I will reexamine the philological data of Hittite and Tocharian and show that the Tocharian form should not be derived from a PIE protoform, but instead must be explained as an early loanword from Indic. This explanation is less problematic phonologically and morphologically and is more consistent with what can be gleaned from the archaeological record.

References


Presenting the Past in Middle Indic

The Old Indo-Aryan finite past tense forms (aorist, imperfect and perfect) are lost in Middle Indic and generally replaced by forms of the old past passive participle (contributing to the emergence of New Indo-Aryan split ergativity); however, historic presents may also be used in narratives of past events. While the rise of the past participle has attracted extensive scholarly attention, the factors deciding when a present is used instead of a participle have not previously been explored. In this paper, I argue for a connection between the choice of a given verb form (participle, present or finite past) and the desired aspectual reading. I compare the usage of two texts in different Middle Indic languages, the Pāli *Appaṇaṇaka-Jātaka* (tokens: 92) and the Jaina-Māhārāṣṭri *Agaḍadatta* (tokens: 98).

In both texts, there is a clear relationship between a verb’s aspectual reading and its morphology. In Pāli, participles may only have perfective/anterior aspect and historic presents are almost exclusively associated with imperfective aspect: there are 9...
imperfective tokens and 1 with uncertain aspect. Aorists (the main surviving finite past tense) are predominantly perfective (48 tokens), but may also be imperfective (10 tokens). In Māhārāṣṭrī, where aorists are absent, participles are almost always perfective/anterior (65 tokens beside 1 imperfective participle and 3 uncertain readings), while historic presents are generally imperfective (22 tokens). The situation thus resembles that found in Pāli, but the Māhārāṣṭrī correlation between presents and imperfectivity is weaker, since my short text sample contains 5 presents with perfective aspect (all from different lexemes). This may indicate that perfective aspect was the default in Māhārāṣṭrī, meaning that it could be associated with a greater number of forms than imperfective aspect.

120. FRANCESCO BURRONI, Cornell University

Tocharian B Compounds between Indo-European Inheritance and Indic Influence

§1 Topic to be treated. This contribution aims to improve our understanding of Tocharian B compounding by: (1) refining our knowledge of certain phonological, morphological, and syntactic features of TB compounds on the one hand; and (2) assessing the impact of language contact on TB composition on the other.

§2 Contribution and relation to previous scholarship. I will focus on these aspects of TB compounding:

§2.1 Phonology. I will show that the puzzling ‘accentuation’ of TB compounds (cf. remarks of Marggraf 1970:64f., Pinault 2008:563–4, and Adams 2015:184–5) poses no special problem and can be captured by assuming generalized peninitial stress (with a prohibition against final stress and clash) and multiple phonological representations reflecting different degrees of compositionality. In analyzing TB compound stress, I will also shed light on the origin of the TB interfix -ā-/a/, whose status as a relic or innovation is debated (cf. Pinault 2008:563). I will argue that the data suggest an epenthetic origin in line with general processes of TB phonology.

§2.2 Morphology/Syntax. Based on a collection of all the compounds in the TB corpus (partly based on Bernhard 1958), I will try to answer the following questions. What word classes can be (productively) combined in a TB compound? How are the compound members distributed among TB word-classes? Are there gaps in what can or cannot be compounded? What is the morphological shape of compound members? What are the possible lexical outputs of TB compounding? I will argue that the TB facts are mostly in line with cross-linguistic distributions (Guevara & Scalise 2009). Interestingly, however, TB seems to exhibit a constraint against verbal stems in composition. This will be further motivated by offering a novel Indo-European background for the derivation of TB verbal governing compounds (VGC) in -i (e.g. TB yolo-yāmī ‘evil-doer’) as containing nominalized forms of the verb (building on Fellner 2016 who suggested a similar account for the VGC in -a- and pointed out some interesting distributions).

§2.3 Language Contact and Prehistory. Finally, I will challenge the idea that TB compounding (cf. Meunier 2015:9, passim) is a non-productive process arising under Sanskrit influence, by (i) evaluating the exact number of TB compounds directly modeled on Sanskrit; (ii) showing that TB has traces of fossilized compounds that cannot be analyzed; and (iii) pointing out that TB shares with Tocharian A a set of compounds that must be reconstructed for Proto-Tocharian, a period for which Indic influence can probably be excluded.
§3. Conclusions. This enquiry shows that a proper analysis of compounding may significantly improve our understanding of TB by shedding light on both certain synchronic linguistic features of the language and its prehistory and contacts with other languages in the area.

References


121. John Huehnergard and Na’amá Pat-El, University of Texas at Austin

The Origin of the Semitic Relative Marker

All Semitic languages use a relative marker as at least one strategy of relativization, and all branches show reflexes or relics of reflexes of an interdental relative marker (East Semitic *θē*; West Semitic *דֵּיה*). There is a widely accepted hypothesis among Semitists that the relative pronoun was originally identical to the proximal demonstrative, based on the formal identity between the bases of the two in West Semitic, and on the cross-linguistic common process of Demonstrative > Relative (Heine and Kuteva 2002; Diessel 2009). In this paper we will show that there are a number of significant problems with the reconstruction of the relative pronoun, which, when taken together, make tracing its origin to the demonstrative unlikely. We will discuss the syntactic behavior and morphology of the relative marker to show that it cannot be easily derived from the demonstrative. Instead, we will argue, the opposite is true: the demonstrative in West Semitic is a secondary formation derived from the relative marker.

122. Emily Barth, Cornell University

Deconstructing Adverbal Accent Shift

A hypothetical process of ‘adverbal shift of accent’ is universally assumed, e.g., by Whitney 1889 through Gotó 2013, to explain the irregular accent of several dozen adverbially-used case forms in Vedic, which are differentiated from non-adverbial counterparts purely by a contrast in accent. But the pool of affected forms is so broad and inconsistent that it is difficult to define the rules and distributional restrictions of the process. For example adv. *dravát* ‘at a run, quickly’ beside *drávant-* ‘running’ appears
to show rightward accent shift to a suffix. But among numerous adverbial n. sg. acc. participles, only *dravāt (and perhaps *patayāt ‘in flight’) shows any trace of abnormal accent. Likewise loc. sg. *upākē ‘close by’ apparently shows adverbial accent shift onto a case ending, in comparison with f. du. *upāke ‘neighboring(?).’ But adverbial accent shift cannot explain the oxytone accent of unambiguously adnominal loc. du. *upākāyos RV I.81.4. Nor can it account for the semantic change that accompanies the leftward shift from inst. sg. *dīvā ‘through heaven’ to dīvā ‘by day,’ which both function adverbially.

In this paper I argue that when we reject the idea of a generalized rule of adverbial accent shift and instead analyze the examples individually, more convincing derivational explanations present themselves. For example *dravāt can be analyzed as a neuter *(E)t-stem abstract, or as the product of analogy with oxytone -vāt adverbs. The accent of *upākē can be taken as underlying; it is more economical to take barytone f. du. *upāke as the outlier, with substantive retraction. Attributing their accentual irregularities to ‘adverbial accent shift’ has forestalled further philological investigation into a number of formally ambiguous or problematic adverbs. By providing alternative analyses for key cases I show that we must either eliminate ‘adverbial accent shift’ entirely, or at least severely limit its scope of application within the Vedic grammar.

123. Benjamin W. Fortson IV, University of Michigan

The Repartition of Inherited Tense-stems in Anatolian

In Proto-Indo-European, verbs could form up to three tense/aspect stems—present, aorist, and perfect—each of them morphologically distinct for any given verb. Anatolian famously collapsed this system into one where each verb has but a single stem for forming both the present and the preterite. Some Anatolian verb-stems continue old present stems, while others continue old aorist (or much more rarely, perfect) stems; in verbs of the latter kind, a new present was created by backformation. Thus *kuēnzi ‘kills’ goes back to the PIE present *(g)wenti, while tézzi ‘says’ is a new creation back-formed to the preterite tét ‘said’, which continues an aorist *(dheh)ti; there is no trace of the original PIE present *(d)hedheht. Can any rationale or pattern be discerned as to when it was a present stem that survived, and when it was an aorist or perfect? In many cases, of course, we do not know which stem might be inherited, and there are many innovative stems as well; but a sizeable-enough core of identifiable old formations is available for investigation. Earlier researchers have engaged with some aspects of this question (e.g., Jasanoff 2003, Villanueva Svensson 2007/2008 [2010] and 2010/2011 [2012]); this paper seeks to achieve a more comprehensive treatment.

References


B. Islamic Near East XI: Sufism and Exegesis. Kameliya Atanasova, Washington and Lee University, Chair (8:30 a.m.–10:30 a.m.) Phipps Room

124. Salimeh Maghsoudlou, Yale University

What Was Problematic in ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt al-Hamadānī’s Zubdat al-Ḥaqīqīq?

‘Ayn al-Quḍāt al-Hamadānī (d. 525/1132) is known to be one of the thinkers of the sixth/twelfth century who suffered persecution, and was ultimately executed due to some of the statements that he made in his book Zubdat al-Ḥaqīqīq. In his apologia, written from prison, ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt came back to this book and tried to project to it an interpretation that was at odds with the content of the book as we know it today. In my paper, I will assess the strategies that ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt employed in his apologia to discard the charges of heresy and the ways that he used to alleviate some of his contested positions. I will argue that these strategies can be reduced to two: (1) ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt tried to hide the philosophical aspect of the book and presented it to be an anti-falsafa treatise, despite the fact that the major part of it was a reiteration of Avicennan philosophy; (2) He highlighted the Sufi character of the book and categorized it as belonging to the genre of Sufi literature, whereas not even once, he used the words taṣawwuf or ṣūfīyya in the Zubda. I will argue that Zubda was not written as a book of Sufi literature and that ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt’s efforts in depicting it as a book about Sufism and against philosophy in his apologia betrays this fact. The genre to which this book belonged can be identified in light of al-Gazālī’s revivalist agenda, as it was displayed in Iḥyā’ al-ḥalām al-dīn. Elements of taṣawwuf and falsafa were integral parts of the new discipline that was established by al-Gazālī in Iḥyāʾ and was adopted by ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt in Zubda, but neither taṣawwuf nor falsafa could solely be held responsible for the form and the content of ‘Ayn al-Quḍāt’s book. In retrospect, the harsh backlash that Zubda has received from the immediate intellectual community was a sign pointing toward the novelty of the discipline to which it belonged, as was the case, a decade earlier with al-Gazālī’s Iḥyāʾ.

125. Scott Lucas, University of Arizona

Legal Interpretations of Sūrat Yūsuf in Yemen: A Study of Zaydi Qurʾān Commentaries

The genre of Qurʾān commentary (tafsīr) in the Zaydi tradition remains almost entirely unexplored. Zaydis did not compose many original works of tafsīr, relying instead on the Muʿtazili commentaries of al-Ḥakīm al-Jishumi (d. 494/1101) and al-Zamakhsharī (d. 538/1144). However, one consequence of their intense study of al-Jishumi’s commentary, called al-Tahdhib, was that several Zaydi scholars from the 14th–17th centuries in Yemen composed commentaries dedicated exclusively to the legal verses of the Qurʾān. The first Yemeni Zaydi to do this was Muḥammad b. al-Ḥāḍī b. Tāj al-Dīn (d. 720/1320), whose book, al-Rawḍa wa al-ghadīr only became fully accessible recently through the Yemeni Manuscript Digitization Initiative, hosted by Princeton University Library. (An autograph manuscript of the final third of this book is held by the Biblioteca Ambrosiana [A6].) This book was expanded by Yūsuf “the Jurist” b. Ḥāḍīb (d. 832/1428-29) in his five-volume al-Thamarāt al-yānīrā, which subsequently was abridged by Fakhr al-Dīn al-Najrī (d. 877/1472) in a work generally titled Shāfiʿī al-ʿalād.
The goals of this paper are threefold. First, it seeks to alert scholars to the existence of at least three legal Qur˒ān commentaries in the Zaydi tradition. Second, it reveals the profound impact al-Jishum˒ı’s al-Tahdhib had on Zaydi scholars in Yemen, who not only preserved it, but used it as a platform for their own local tradition of tafsir. Finally, through an analysis of these commentaries on the legal verses in Sūrat Yusuf (Q. 12), this paper will highlight how Zaydi jurists were in close conversation with Sunn˒ı legal opinions as they elaborated the legal implications of Qur˒ānic verses.

126. Aiyub Palmer, University of Kentucky

A Structural Analysis of the Ring Analogy in Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı’s Fuṣṣūṣ al-Ḥikam and Its Relationship to the Ring Analogy of al-Ḥakim al-Tirmidhi

This paper analyzes al-ハウスim al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s use of the ring analogy and presents an argument for al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s influence on Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı’s doctrine of walāya. Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı scholarship accedes to the influence al-Tirmidhi had on the thought of Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı, but does not indicate specifically in what ways al-Tirmidhi may have impacted Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı’s doctrine of walāya. Chodkiewicz devotes a sizeable portion of his Le sceau des saints to al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s major ideas related to walāya, however he mostly recounts the current scholarship on al-Tirmidhi and does not discuss al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s use of analogy in relation to walāya, nor does he discuss the ring analogy in particular. Bernd Radtke is best known for his scholarship on al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s doctrine of walāya, however, he also does not discuss the importance of the ring analogy in structuring al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s notions of walāya. This argument presents a structural relationship between the way al-Tirmidhi and Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı both articulate their respective doctrines of walāya. Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı scholars such as William Chittick seem to assume that the analogies Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı uses in the Fuṣṣūṣ al-Ḥikam are not central to his doctrine. When we compare Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı’s use of the ring analogy in the Fuṣṣūṣ al-Ḥikam to al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s use of the ring analogy throughout numerous works of his such as Nawādir al-Usūl and Ilm al-Awily˒ı, we see that Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı must be using the same ring analogy for a deliberate purpose. Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı applies a number of structural transformations to al-Tirmidhi˒ı’s basic use of the ring analogy. While al-Tirmidhi˒ı uses the ring analogy to explore the relationship of the ordinary Muslim to the wali, Ibn ‘Arabi˒ı uses this same analogy to explore the relationship between the wali and the prophet.

127. Jeremy Farrell, Emory University

At the Origins of Sufi Prosopography: A Lost Work by Ja˒far al-Khuld (d. 959)

Prosopography—or “group biography”—represents a major source of information about the early activities of a variety of pre-modern Islamic social and religious movements. As is the case with other movements’ literature, the first extant works of the Sufi prosopographical tradition (Sulami 1953/1960; Isfahani 1932–8) are relatively late (late-tenth/eleventh century), as opposed to the movement’s origin (mid-ninth century; Melchert 1996). My research toward reconstructing an early, non-extant, work in this genre by Abu Muhammad Ja˒far al-Khuldi (d. 959) shows that the early historiography of Sufism departs substantially from that of later works.

The consideration of non-extant works of Sufi prosopography goes back well over a century. The earliest efforts by Massignon (Passion 1922, Vol II; second edition 1975, Vol. IV) and Pedersen (1960) focused on a purportedly lost work by Abu ‘Abd...
al-Rahman al-Sulami (d.1021), entitled *Tawrikh al-Sufiya*. Sezgin (1967) elaborated on a wider array of “lost” titles, and his work has been restated severally (Chabbi 1976; Böwering 1980; Alikberov 1995; Knyst 2000; Karamustafa 2007). As relates to al-Khuldi, the premise that he wrote a work has been challenged by Mojaddedi (2001: 53f), who asserts that that material ascribed to al-Khuldi “probably” represents an unsystematic “notebook.”

To the contrary of Mojaddedi’s conclusion, it is possible to show that a systematically circulated history of early Sufism by al-Khuldi achieved widespread recognition. A variety of late-tenth century sources, most famously Ibn al-Nadim (d. 998) ascribed a book to al-Khuldi. Citation patterns in one later Sufi prosopography, al-Isfahani’s (d. 1038) *Hilyat al-awliya*, suggest that he had access to a work highly similar to that obtained by Ibn al-Nadim. Finally, initial review of the contents of this reconstructed text suggests al-Khuldi excluded non-Iraqis from the early history of Sufism, and emphasized the ascetic—rather than mystical—doctrine of these early figures.

---

C. Islamic Near East XII: Intellectual History. Garrett Davidson, College of Charleston, Chair (10:45 a.m.–12:15 p.m.) Phipps Room *

### 128. Amir Toft, Yale University

**Revaluing the Price of Blood: The Economics of *Diya* in the *Aşl* of Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan al-Shaybānī**

The concept of *diya*, a payment offered to a victim’s kin in compensation for bodily injury or homicide, has received little close analysis from scholars who study Islamic jurisprudence. It is often rendered as blood price or blood money or, in faulty comparison to medieval Germanic law, bloodwite or wergild. In determining the price of blood, the controlling principle is usually taken from *qiṣās*, the Islamic law of retaliation (or *lex talionis*) in which physical wrongs are retributively punished by inflicting a harm on the offender equivalent to the one suffered by the victim. The blood price is thought to be a way of compensating loss when retaliation is unavailable for one reason or another.

While these descriptions of *diya* and *qiṣās* are facially accurate, they gloss over the messier economic details of Islamic doctrine and misapprehend the controlling principle of homicide. In this paper I argue that, at least in the Hanafi school, the doctrinal point of departure in Islamic jurisprudence *diya*, not *qiṣās*, and that, accordingly, the controlling juridical principle for remedying physical wrongs is distributivism, not retributivism. We have the benefit now, with the recent complete publication of the *Aşl* by Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan al-Shaybānī (d. 189/805), of gaining more direct insight into how the earliest expositors of the Hanafi school, through casuistic inquiry, worked out the doctrine on homicide and personal injury. I argue, substantively, that the economic concern of compensating loss doctrinally preceded the social concern of deterring wrongdoing through retributive punishment. I also argue, methodologically, that analysis of such offenses as personal injury and homicide should be separated from an inquiry into criminal law, which tends to skew the doctrine by exaggerating the function of punishment.

– 69 –
The Pagan Origin of Christmas According to 'Abd al-Jabbār’s Taḥḥīt

After his monumental catalog of Muṭtazīlī doctrine, the chief qāḍī of Rayy ‘Abd al-Jabbār al-Hamadānī (d. 1024) is perhaps best known for a remarkable narrative outlining Christianity’s gradual corruption at the hands of the Romans. The narrative constitutes a long digression embedded in his Kitāb taḥḥīt dalāʿīl al-nubuwwa (Affirmation of the Proofs of Prophethood) in which ‘Abd al-Jabbār argues that, far from being the religion instituted by the prophet Christ, Christianity is nothing more than Roman polytheism in disguise. One of ‘Abd al-Jabbār’s most striking claims regards the holiday of Christmas. According to the qāḍī, the celebration of the Nativity of Christ began as a pagan winter solstice holiday called the Nativity of Time.

Since ‘Abd al-Jabbār himself attributes this Nativity of Time holiday to “the Romans and the Greeks”, earlier scholars have attempted to identify it as a festival known from Graeco-Roman antiquity—the Saturnalia, the natalis invicti, or a festival of the god Aión. I will demonstrate that these identifications are incorrect. Rather, the Nativity of Time to which ‘Abd al-Jabbār alludes was a late ancient Aramaean winter solstice festival described in a number of Syriac and, crucially, Arabic sources. I argue that ‘Abd al-Jabbār, steeped in Muṭtazīlī doxographical literature, learned of this winter solstice festival in reports on the doctrines and practices of the Sābians of Harrān, probably from a lost work by al-Ḥasan ibn Mūsā al-Nawbahātī (d. 912–922), a Shīʿite scholar influenced by Muṭtazīlism.

‘Abd al-Jabbār’s conflation of Harrānīan religion with that of the ancient Greeks and Romans in his Christmas account and elsewhere reveals his unique historical vision of a primordial western paganism still operating in Byzantium under the guise of Christianity. In turn, his historical approach to Christmas directly influenced the qāḍī’s most illustrious later reader, Ibn Taymiyya (d. 1328).

Studying Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa as a Discourse

In the early 20th century, Western scholars of Islamic Studies frequently studied accounts of the life of Muḥammad in a binary way by distinguishing between ‘scholarly’ and ‘popular’ narratives. The common underlying assumption was that the ‘genuine’ accounts portraying the ‘historical’ Muḥammad had been corrupted over time by popular beliefs and folklore that were most commonly expressed in miraculous accounts. As a consequence, works of Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa and Qīṣaṣ al-Anbiyāʾ were oftentimes discredited as not having been part of the ‘legitimate’ Islamic scholarly discourse but rather the product of popular veneration.

In this paper, I present the case Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa. While this literature has previously been dismissed as the product of popular prophetic veneration, I argue for its scholarly origin by identifying 24 scholars of Ḥadīth who authored Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa compilations that have previously been insufficiently considered. However, Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa is not restricted to the field of Ḥadīth but is also addressed in works of theology as well as compilations of biblical and pseudo-biblical references. I, therefore, adapt suggestions that Michael Pregill has recently made regarding the study of Qīṣaṣ al-Anbiyāʾ, and argue that Dalāʿīl al-Nubūwa is best approached as a form of scholarly discourse reflecting specific ideological purposes. As such, works of Dalāʿīl
al-Nubawi do not simply cater toward the community’s need for edification and veneration but rather seek to establish evidence for Muhammad’s prophetic mission in light of non-Muslim challenges and position Muhammad within the framework of previous prophets by appropriating and reinterpreting biblical prophetic legacies.

131. Deborah Tor, University of Notre Dame

The Eclipse of Khurasan in the Twelfth Century

The province of Khurasan constituted the center of political, cultural, and religious life in the Sunni Islamic world from the ninth- until the mid-twelfth century, after which Khurasan was completely eclipsed. The question of how this occurred has remained almost completely unstudied; and the one study that there is—Richard Bulliet’s Cotton, Climate, and Camels—does not consult the key primary literary sources for the time. The purpose of this paper, therefore, is first to explain and demonstrate the flaws in Bulliet’s use of the evidence on which his theory rests, including scientific and climatological studies he did not consult; then to examine what the main primary sources for the twelfth century history of the central and Eastern Islamic lands—e.g., those of Nishāpūrī, Bundārī, al-Ḥusaynī, Sībī b. al-Jawzī, Mīrkhwānd, et al (none of which was consulted by Bulliet)—reveal about the catastrophic cultural and political eclipse of Khurasan in the mid-twelfth century. It will be proven, on the basis of the primary source evidence, that this catastrophe was not due to a long decline caused by “climate, cotton and camels”—in fact, Khurasan was according to all accounts doing very well until the 1150s—but rather to concrete human agency and action: namely, the province’s destruction by the rampaging Oghuz Turkmen after Sultan Sanjar had been taken captive by them in 1153, thus leading directly to the downfall of the Great Seljuq Sultanate as well as to the physical destruction of the province and its infrastructure.

D. South and Southeast Asia VI: Law and Society in Early India 1–3. (9:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.) Conference Room B *

Section 1: Monasticism and Antinomian Practices. MARK MCCLISH, Northwestern University, Chair

132. Patrick Olivelle, University of Texas at Austin

Saṅghabheda: Political and Monastic

The notion of saṅghabheda, that is, dissection or causing dissection in a saṅgha, occurs in three distinct contexts: in the Buddhist Vinaya, in the Separate Edict of Aśoka, and in the book on confederacies (political saṅghas) in Kaṭūṭila’s Arthaśāstra. Scholars seem to be confident that they have a clear idea of its meaning within the Vinaya and in Kauṭiliya. The interpretation of the expression in Aśoka’s writing, however, has caused disagreement. This has been caused principally by the fact that Aśoka’s use of saṅghabheda has been viewed exclusively from a Buddhist and more particularly from a Vinaya point of view. The notion of bheda, however, is prominent in the literature on politics and statecraft and is one of the four elements of political strategy called upāya (sāma, dāna, bheda, and dānda). Kaṭūṭila recommends bheda as the most effective means of subduing a political saṅgha. Indeed, in the discussion between the Buddha and Vassakāra, the envoy of King Ajātasattu, given in the
Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra, the Buddha himself talks about the danger of dissension and the importance of unity within the political saṅgha of Vajjis. My paper considers the possibility of interpreting Aśoka’s opposition to saṅghabeda in the Buddhist saṅgha within the context of royal policies toward political saṅghas.

133. CLAIRE MAES, University of Texas at Austin

Householder in the Early Jaina Sources. A Philological Examination of the Ardhamāgadhī terms gihattha (Skt. grhaustha) and gāhāvā (Skt. grhapati)

In her recent and seminal paper presented at the American Oriental Society, Stephanie Jamison demonstrated how the term grhaustha is a neologism in the Dharmaśtras. Being the technical term for the brāhmanical householder, grhaustha is the central figure in the dharma literature. Given this fact, it is surprising that the term did not develop from an orthodox brāhmanical context. As Jamison noted, grhaustha is absent in Vedic texts, where the dominant term for householder is grhapati. Observing how in Middle Indic Sources, Pāṇīceptors of grhaustha often occur in a contrastive pair with ascetics or those who go forth from home, Jamison suggests that the brāhmanical term grhaustha must have been adopted from the śrāmanic discourse. My paper seeks to join this discussion by offering a critical examination of the various occurrences of the Ardhamāgadhī terms gihattha (Skt. grhaustha) and gāhāvā (Skt. grhapati) in the early Jaina sources. The Jaina sources that will be examined are the Ayāraṅga Sutta, the Śuyagadām. ga and the Uttarajjhayāna Sutta, which are considered to belong to the oldest strata of the Jaina canon

134. SAMUEL GRIMES, University of Virginia

Trangressive Sexual Practices in the Padmāvatī Commentary of the Caṇḍamahārosaṇaṭantra

A single commentary exists for the Caṇḍamahārosaṇaṭantra—the Padmāvatī—the only witness of which is preserved in a sole, palm-leaf, thirteenth-century manuscript in Kathmandu. Prior to its dissolution in India, the mature monastic interpretation of activities done by an advanced practitioner, but in violation of celibacy vows (that is, trangressive, sexual yoga), was to sublimate the less palatable practices, taking them symbolically instead of literally, and transforming them into visualization practices done in meditation. I believe that when the monastic system was domesticated in Nepal, former monks took these same practices with them, and rejected the practices of those yogins and householders taking the texts literally as degenerate and incorrect. The Padmāvatī commentary of the Caṇḍamahārosaṇaṭantra offers a reverse interpretation, calling those who would consider the sexual language of the tantras symbolic to be “drunken madmen”. It is within this milieu that I suspect the text to have been composed. Dr. Péter-Dániel Szántó and I translated and prepared an edition of the chapter of the text on trangressive sexual practices (as yet, unpublished). As we moved through the text it became apparent to me that the author was a reactionary, responding to a domestication of antinomianism and advocating a revival of trangressive practices. The timing of the Padmāvatī overlaps a centuries-long period that witnessed the end of celibate monasticism in Nepal, as monks became married householders. Certain linguistic and vocabulary choices of its author, Mahāsukhavajra, also suggest a Newar origin. Because of the Padmāvatī manuscript’s status as a codex unicus (apographs of the manuscript exist, but no other independent witnesses of

– 72 –
the text), there is no possibility of collation. This sole witness is also the first known instance of evidence for the existence of the Candamahārūṣapatantra. All witnesses of the müla appear after the 1297 date of the Padmāvatī manuscript.

Section 2: Dharmasāstra and Śaivism. David Buchta, Brown University, Chair

135. David Brick, Yale University

Śaiva and Dharmaśāstra Treatments of Penance in Comparative Perspective

A recent book by R. Sathyanarayanan (Institut Français de Pondichéry 2015) has made available to a broad Indological audience for the first time two digests of Śaivasiddhānta penances and other expiatory rites, both of which rather confusingly bear the identical title Prāyaścittasamuccaya. One of these Prāyaścittasamuccayas, which Sathyanarayanan has critically edited and translated, is a work of the twelfth-century author Trilocanaśiva. The other is a slightly earlier work by Hṛdayāśiva; and there exists an important twelfth-century Newari manuscript of this work, of which Sathyanarayanan gives a complete transcription in a lengthy appendix to his book. Significantly, both of these works are essentially digests or nibandhas in that they are topically arranged compendia of earlier Śaivasiddhānta scriptures on penance rather than original scholastic works per se. Given their forms and especially their contents, they naturally beg comparison with roughly contemporaneous Dharmaśāstra works on the same topic, with which they bear a number of obvious similarities, but also several crucial differences. It is, therefore, the purpose of this paper to highlight certain salient differences and similarities between these two sets of sources on penance in medieval India and to comment on the general extent to which Dharmaśāstra has influenced Śaivasiddhānta treatments of the subject. In this regard, special attention will be drawn to the fact that while Dharmaśāstra sources on penance place a great deal of emphasis on loss of caste (patana) and uniformly regard public penances for publicly known sins as standard, the opposite seems to be true of Śaiva treatments, which overwhelmingly focus on the personal, soteriological aspects of sin and its ritual expiation.

136. Jason Schwartz, University of California, Santa Barbara

We Belong to the Jāti of the Gods: A Preliminary Study of the Śivadharmavivaraṇa, an Unpublished work of non-Brahminical Dharmaśāstra

Drawing upon the author’s critical edition in progress of select portions of the manuscript, this paper will offer the first comprehensive treatment of the codex unicus of the Śivadharmavivaraṇa, an unpublished commentary on the circa 5th–6th century Śivadharm. One of the most important sources for the study of lay religion in medieval India, the root text of the Śivadharm has been the subject of a multi-decade collaborative research project conducted out of the university of Leiden and will serve as the subject of a special session at the 17th annual World Sanskrit conference in Vancouver in the summer of 2018. It is hoped that introducing the scholarly community to this unnoticed and surprisingly learned work of Śaiva scholasticism will make a contribution to these efforts.

I will argue that, although the text is transmitted in an irregular and archaic Malayalam script, the work was most likely composed in the medieval Deccan. On the basis
of internal evidence, its unnamed author appears to have been an ācārya within an Ātimārga lineage who can plausibly be identified as a Kālamukha; a tradition whose textual corpus has been almost entirely lost. Subversively deploying a conceptual vocabulary provided by mainstream medieval dharmasastra, in its first chapter the Vivaraṇa offers a reading of the Śivadharma that treats the work as offering a pointed critique of the norms of varṇaśramadharma with concrete real world implications at the level of social comportment. Succinctly, our only surviving second-order reflection on the Śivadharma understands the work in a manner that conflicts with the emerging scholarly consensus pertaining to the Śivadharma corpus’s relationship with Brahminical normativity, but in fact strongly matches the multilingual inscriptive record.

137. ELAINE M. FISHER, Stanford University

A Microhistory of a South Indian Monastery: The Hooli Brhanmatha and the Intellectual History of Sanskritic Vīraśaivism

When speaking of the intellectual history of India, it has often been said that our archival record lacks adequate context for identifying the influence of individual social actors or institutions on their surrounding communities of knowledge. Fortunately, in the case of early modern south India, there are a few exceptions. When applied to the centuries before the dawn of colonialism, this sort of microhistory can shed light on the continuing vitality of Sanskrit in the vernacular millennium and the growing influence of religious institutions, such as the south Indian monastery, on transregional shifts in thought and practice. Such an approach is particularly timely in the study of Vīraśaivism, generally cast in academic literature as a “devotional” (bhakti) tradition in which Sanskrit scripture and intellectual production have been incorrectly presumed to be entirely adventitious and to play an inconsequential role in the community’s multifaceted history.

This paper focuses on a key moment of alliance between Sanskrit and the south Indian vernaculars in Vīraśaiva textual history through the lens of a case study of a single matha in northern Karnataka—and one that proved remarkably influential on the intellectual and liturgical history of Sanskritic Vīraśaivism across the Indian subcontinent. Originating centuries earlier as a Kālamukha network center, which was already steeped in Sanskrit learning, the Hooli Brhanmatha emerged during the Vijayanagar centuries as a central voice in the consolidation of the modern-day Pāncācārya Vīraśaiva lineages and the Śivadvaita philosophical tradition. Drawing on several un-studied works from the pontifical lineage of the Hooli Brähmanathā through the sixteenth century in Sanskrit and Kannada, as well as epigraphical data and original records preserved in the matha itself, I demonstrate how the microhistory of a single monastery can speak to the impact of innovation on long-lasting shifts in religious identities across regions.

Section 3: Customs and Practices. JAMES B. APPLE, University of Calgary, Chair

138. MARK MCCLISH, Northwestern University

The Samavrতa Balance in Ancient India

At 2.19.12-16, the Arthaśāstra describes the construction of a balance it calls the Samavrতa (‘even-round’). Unlike pan-scales, which possess arms of equal length on
both sides of a pivot from which the beam hangs, the Sanavṛttā is apparently an unequal-arm balance, in which the pivot divides the beam into two arms of unequal length.

There has been some debate over whether the balance described in this passage is of the ‘bismar’ or ‘steelyard’ variety. The former type is the less complex of the two. The item to be weighed is suspended from one end of a long beam. The beam itself is then hung from a rope or cloth, which is slid along the shaft of the beam until the beam hangs horizontal to the ground. Markings on the shaft of the beam record various weight denominations, and the position of the rope indicates the weight of the item. On a steelyard, the beam is attached to a fixed pivot, which yields two arms of unequal and unvarying length. From the short arm a scale-pan is hung in which the item to be weighed is placed. The longer arm features a sliding weight called a ‘poise’ or ‘counterpoise’. Like the bismar, the shaft of the beam is inscribed with marks, and the poise is slid along the shaft until the beam hangs horizontal from the fixed pivot. The weight is then read from the mark where the poise is positioned on the long arm of the beam.

There has been some debate about whether the laconic instructions at Arthashastra 2.19.12–16 describe a bismar- or steelyard-type balance. KANGLE (1960) at first argued in detail that the text described the construction of a steelyard balance, but seems to have changed his mind by the time he produced his edition of the text (1972, 2nd ed.). OLIVELLE (2013) has argued that it appears to be a steelyard balance. In my presentation, I will look at this passage in the context of material and visual evidence from premodern South Asia and argue conclusively that the text is describing the construction of a bismar balance. I will also provide a few suggestions on the proper translation of descriptions of other balances in the text.

139. Christopher Fleming, University of Oxford

Epic Jurisprudence: The Ownership of Kingdoms According to the Vivādabhaṅgāṛṇava

Between 1788 and 1794, Jagannātha Tarkapañcāna, Rādhākānta Tarkavāgīśa, and a team of other Bengali pāṇḍits compiled an elaborate digest of Dharmaśāstra texts for William Jones and the British East India Company. The resulting compilation, the Vivādabhaṅgāṛṇava (A Sea of Waves of Litigation), was translated by Henry Colebrooke and published to much acclaim as A Digest of Hindu Law on Contracts and Successions (1797–1798). “Colebrooke’s Digest,” as the translation was popularly known, became an influential treatise in the subsequent construction of Anglo-Hindu private law.

Much has been written about the Vivādabhaṅgāṛṇava: its role in the furtherance of colonial hegemony, its relationship to Colebrooke’s theory of schools of Hindu law, and its limitations as a code of positive laws. This paper attends to a novel discussion concerning the ownership (svatva/svāmitva) and alienability (deyatva) of kingdoms (rāṣṭra) that appears at the end of the Vivādabhaṅgāṛṇava’s section on the rescission of gifts (dattānapakarman). The compilers of the Vivādabhaṅgāṛṇava deploy a characteristically Bengali juridical principle of factum valet to argue that, provided they are of sound mind, monarchs and princes may divide and distribute their realms amongst their children however they please.
The great novelty and interest of this passage is that the compilers make their argument by analyzing various episodes from the Rāmāyaṇa of Vālmīki and Vyāsa’s Mahābhārata. The compilers use these narrative episodes as springboards for an elaborate, highly technical debate about the nature (and limitations) of the royal ownership of kingdoms and about the relevance of the epics to contemporary—eighteenth century—legal debates concerning the rights of ownership and succession amongst Bengali Zamindarīs.

This paper summarizes the Vivādabhāṅgūṇava’s arguments, situates the text against the backdrop of the intellectual and legal history of late eighteenth century Bengal, and makes a few observations concerning the importance of this ‘Epic Jurisprudence’ to our understanding of early colonial Dharmāśāstra. The paper is accompanied by an annotated transcription of the relevant passages that I made from Colebrooke’s personal copy of the Vivādabhāṅgūṇava that is held by the British Library.

140. TIMOTHY LUBIN, Washington and Lee University

Jayanta Bhaṭṭa on Studying the Atharvāśiras and Feeding Brahmins

The feeding of learned Brahmins at the conclusion of rites of offering to one’s ancestors was a practice introduced in the period when the Vedic domestic ritual codes were being composed. The precise qualifications of a suitable Brahmin guest at such feedings was a matter of some discussion among ritual authorities, though the basic criterion was prior study of the Veda. It later became a trope for texts claiming to present the quintessence or summary of Vedic knowledge to assert that such-and-such text fulfills that criterion. The Atharvaśiras, a short work expounding the sacred syllable OM as the essence of Rudra (the supreme divinity) and of the Vedas, makes this claim. The title of this work may be older than even its earliest form recoverable from the manuscript evidence, since its mention in the Mahābhārata seems to refer to a text composed entirely of mantras (which the extant Atharvāśiras is not). The ninth-century Kashmiri Paippalādin scholar Jayanta Bhaṭṭa provides probably the earliest testimony for the extant Atharvāśiras in that he cites its “announcing of the fruits” section (phalāśruti) in order to support the claim (itself controversial) not just that the “Atharvaveda” has full “Veda” status alongside the Rgveda, Yajurveda, and Sāmaveda, but that it is in fact superior to the rest in that studying just a portion of it (viz., the Atharvāśiras) is sufficient to fulfill the criterion of Veda-learning, making one a “row-purifier” (paṅkti-pāvana) in the Brahmin-feeding rite.
Index of Abstracts

Adem, Rodrigo, 50, 61
Adil, Sabahat, 61
Ally, Shuaib, 50
Almansa-Villatoro, Victoria, 28
Almutawa, Shatha, 36
Andruss, Jessica, 22
Angowski, Elizabeth, 43
Anthony, Sean W., 33, 59
Apple, James B., 40, 74
Atanasova, Kameliya, 8, 67
Barooah Chanchani, Jahnabi, 54
Barth, Emily, 65
Bashir, Aamir, 7
Bausch, Lauren, 12
Bearman, Peri, 8
Beckman, Gary, 27
Benfey, Thomas, 60
Büschop, Peter C., 37, 44
Björn, Oyvind, 1
Blinderman, Radha, 55
Bowman, Frederick, 2
Branner, David Prager, 4, 29
Brereton, Joel, 11, 14
Brick, David, 43, 73
Brill, Jo, 25
Buchta, David, 56, 73
Burlingame, Andrew , 1
Burroni, Francesco, 64
Carrera, Giovanni, 23
Cecil, Elizabeth A., 43
Connelly, Coleman, 70
Dalal, Neil, 14
Dang, Kayla, 60
Daniels, Peter T., 3
Dann, Michael, 6, 20
Danzig, David, 47
Davidson, Garrett, 53, 69
De Grandis, Mario, 48
Delneri, Paul, 27
E, Li, 30
El Omari, Rasha, 33
El Shamsy, Ahmed, 52
El-Tohgui, Carl Sharif, 22, 50
Farrell, Jeremy, 68
Fisher, Elaine M., 57, 74
Fleming, Benjamin, 42
Fleming, Christopher, 75
Fortson IV, Benjamin W., 66
Fudge, Bruce, 6, 53
Galadari, Abdulla, 51
Garfinkle, Steven, 44
Gerety, Finnian, 14
Gertz, Steven, 34
Glenn, Anna, 45
Grant, Philip, 31
Rajan, Raj, 38
Rapoport, Michael A., 22
Reich, James, 56
Ren, Shan, 19
Richey, Matthew, 16
Richter, Antje, 19, 30
Riedel, Dagmar Anne, 62
Rimal, Madhusudan, 41
Rowson, Everett, 8
Rubin, Zachary, 15
Saba, Elias G., 34
Salomon, Richard, 38, 41
Schaffner, Ryan, 20
Schnell, Ryan H., 46
Schwartz, Jason, 73
Scurlock, JoAnn, 27
Shen, Yiming, 24
Sherraden, Aaron, 37
Simmons, Richard VanNess, 29, 48
Smith, Caley Charles, 12
Sonik, Karen, 15, 17
Spunaugle, Adrienne, 45
Stephan, Tara, 21

Taylor, John M., 37
Toft, Amir, 69
Tor, Deborah, 71

Ulrich, Brian, 32
van Bladel, Kevin, 59
van Gelder, Geert Jan, 10
Venkatkrishnan, Anand, 57

Walker, Paul, 33
Weiss, Michael, 63
Whitaker, Jarrod, 11, 12
Wilent, Andrew, 18
Wilson-Wright, Aren M., 27
Wu, Zeyuan, 18
Wynter-Stoner, Kyle, 52
Xu, Yichun, 28
Younger, Jr., K. Lawson, 28

Zangani, Federico, 4
Zhan, Zhang, 39
Zhou, Gang, 48