

# American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842

CONSTITUENT OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF LEARNED SOCIETIES  
AND THE INTERNATIONAL UNION OF ORIENTALISTS

## ABSTRACTS

OF  
COMMUNICATIONS  
PRESENTED

AT THE  
TWO HUNDRED AND THIRTY SECOND  
MEETING

BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS

MARCH 18–21, 2022



©American Oriental Society 2022  
Ann Arbor MI and New Haven CT

## ABSTRACTS OF COMMUNICATIONS – 232<sup>nd</sup> ANNUAL MEETING

**Belal Abu-Alabbas, Exeter University**

*Lafẓi bi-l-Qurʾān makhlūq?* al-Bukhārī and his Adversaries on the *Lafẓ* Controversy

Towards the end of his life, the prominent hadith compiler Muḥammad ibn Ismāʿīl al-Bukhārī (d. 256/870) conceded that one's utterance of the Qurʾān is created. This view evoked the infamous *miḥna* (inquisition), which had deeply divided the scholarly community and was still a living memory for *Ahl al-ḥadīth*. Because of the alleged proximity of al-Bukhārī's views to those enforced by the caliphal administration, many traditionalists of Nishapur boycotted him, forcing him to relocate to Bukhara from which he was also driven on the pretext of his views on the *Lafẓ*. The sources provide conflicting accounts of the controversy, a function of its long duration and al-Bukhārī's eminence. Based on a close reading of the sources and al-Bukhārī's writings, I provide a full and critical account of the controversy, documenting the theological and legal contexts, the chronology of events, and the intellectual exchanges between al-Bukhārī and his opponents in Baghdad, Nishapur and Bukhara.

**Rodrigo Adem, Georgetown University**

Translating Ibn Fūrak, Translating Reality: *Kalām* Approaches to Natural and Philosophical Language

Based on my ongoing translation project of “The Unadulterated Doctrines of al-Ashʿarī” by Ibn Fūrak (d. 1016 CE) I have noted a significant discussion of the usages of *ḥaqīqa/majāz* dichotomy which are more specifically ontological than linguistic. Rather than a distinction between primary and secondary semantic referents in human usage, the *ḥaqīqa* corresponds to objective, cognizable modal properties (*aḥkām*) of existents, while the “metaphorical” human linguistic approximations of these same phenomena are the very words which permeate the lexicon (*luḡha*). As such, the *kalām* term *ḥaqīqa* here can be described to refer to statements, which, being ontologically-correct, enjoyed a distinct status from what was connotated by natural “lexical” usage, which through coinage (*waḍʿ*) and usage constantly demanded “linguistic license” (*tawassuʿ*) in its imprecision. The primacy of *ḥaqīqa* here is ontological and not

semantic. This contributes to our understanding of classical Ash‘arite philosophy of language with proper attention to the epistemic and ontological implications of our usage of language, and the necessity of a philosophical register which has priority over all linguistic convention. It contributes as well to our understanding of increasing Muslim scholastic belief in the primacy of the terminology of objective reality (*ḥaqīqa*) to explain the underpinnings and basis of the *sharī‘a*.

### Kamal Ahmed, Princeton University

#### Philosophy and Religion in the later works of Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī

In his most recent book, Frank Griffel writes that in the post-classical period Islamic philosophy and theology were divided into two distinct genres, *ḥikmah* and *kalām*. Griffel argues that *ḥikmah* works systematically reported Ibn Sīnā’s philosophy, criticized aspects of his thought, and offered improvements to his philosophical system. Specifically, he suggests that Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī’s criticisms and amendments of Ibn Sīnā’s philosophy were not based on religious grounds but instead represented pure philosophical argument. In contrast, in his *kalām* works, al-Rāzī articulated theological positions that contradicted his own writings in *ḥikmah*. This led Griffel to conclude that al-Rāzī embraced a double-truth epistemology where he ultimately remained undecided between conclusions arrived at through *ḥikmah* or *kalām*.

I argue against the strength of Griffel’s thesis in two ways. First, while al-Rāzī’s earlier works such as *al-Mabāḥith*, *al-Mulakhkhas*, and *Nihāyat al-‘uqūl* may well fit Griffel’s description, his latest works in each genre, the *Ma‘ālim uṣūl al-dīn* in *kalām* and the *Sharḥ ‘Uyūn al-ḥikmah*, reveal a more complicated picture. I suggest that a) philosophical theorizing in *ḥikmah* remains, at least in part, subtly in service of theological ends and b) philosophical speculation in *ḥikmah* is not entirely unconstrained by theological commitments. Second, I show that al-Rāzī’s penultimate works, the *Maṭālib al-‘āliya* and *al-Tafsīr al-Kabīr*, reveal that by the end of his career, al-Rāzī was not as firmly established on the double-truth theory as his earlier works might suggest.

I conclude by recommending that it is not necessary to posit that philosophical activity was free from all theological concerns in order to rescue philosophy from the charge of stagnation.

Rather, for al-Rāzī as well as those before him, attempts to philosophically articulate concepts prompted innovate theorizing that went well beyond theological doctrine and yet was not entirely independent of religion.

### Tanuja Ajotikar The Sanskrit Library

Visismiye or visiṣmiye?

The perfect form of the verbal root *smi* 'to smile' is found in the literature with and without retroflexion, *visismiye* and *visiṣmiye*. Verbal roots beginning with *s* which are listed with initial *ṣ* in the *dhātupāṭha* are subject to retroflexion. A close look at the various *dhātupāṭhas*, both *Pāṇinian* and non-*Pāṇinian*, reveals discrepancies for the entry of the verbal root *smi*. Leibich (1930) and Palsule (1955) give concordances but do not discuss these discrepancies among the *dhātupāṭhas*. Palsule (1961) critically discusses differences among the *dhātupāṭhas* but do not include the issue of retroflexion. Pāṇini lists the verbal root *smi* four times. Editions of commentaries on these rules also show a discrepancy in citing the root with or without retroflexion. It is evident that there is confusion about *smi*. Hence, a question arises whether the forms of *smi* in the perfect occur with or without retroflexion. This confusion starts with the statement in the *Mahābāṣya* on A. 6.1.64, *ajdantyaparāḥ sādayaḥ ṣopadeśāḥ smiṁsvadisvidisvañjīsvapayaś ca srpīsrjīstrstyāseksrvarjam* "All the verbal roots which begin with *s* and are followed by a vowel or dental, as well as *smi*, *svad*, *svid*, *svañj*, and *svap* but excluding *srp*, *srj*, *str*, *styā*, *sek*, and *sr*, are *ṣopadeśa* taught with initial *ṣ*." The discussion on this statement among the commentators does not show any awareness of the inclusion of the verbal root *smi* in this passage. Moreover, the *Cāndravṛtti* cites the passage from the *Mahābāṣya* omitting the verbal root *smi*. This omission indicates that inclusion of *smi* in *ṣopadeśa* verbal roots could be a later addition, and that the form *visiṣmiye* is an historical innovation. The problem reveals the need for more alert critical editing of Sanskrit grammatical texts as well as sensitivity to the details of Sanskrit grammatical treatises in the critical editing of other Sanskrit texts.

**Aseel Alfataftah, Yale University**

The Debate on Women Prophecy in Islam: Its Contexts and the Construction of Knowledge

In this study, I historicize and contextualize the debate on women prophecy in Islam from the 3<sup>rd</sup>/9<sup>th</sup> century to the 12<sup>th</sup>/ 17<sup>th</sup> century and evaluate the ways it impacts Muslim women's epistemic authority as knowers of the divine and interpreters of revelation. I argue that an interdisciplinary approach that reads primary sources from the fields of *kalām*, *ḥadīth*, Qur'an exegesis, law, and history in tandem is integral for reconstructing scholarly contributions to the debate and drawing an accurate topography of the gendered construction of knowledge resulting from it. Meanwhile, through an analysis of some entries on Muslim women in biographical and hagiographical dictionaries and depictions of women characters in *adab* works I interrogate the gap between the formal and the popular as well as that between theory and practice in relation to women's epistemic authority. In conclusion, I maintain that the intricate layers of polemics on women prophets combined with a host of theological, sectarian, and legal underpinnings resulted in excluding them from the history of prophecy in Islam and generated doctrinal ideals that significantly restrain Muslim women participation in religious scholarly circles in the past and present.

**Nick Allaman, Ohio State University**

Unsought Remonstrance: Liu Xiang's Lianzhu and Genre as Leverage

Despite the paucity of extant pieces today, there is no doubt that during the third to sixth centuries, the small aphoristic compositions called *lianzhu* 連珠, or strung pearls, were quite popular. Though often considered short remonstrative works articulating timeless principles, Southern Qi dynasty literatus Liu Xie 劉勰 (465–522) characterized *lianzhu* as “minor tributaries of literature composed in leisure time” and works that at their best express “original ideas in resourceful language.” These two divergent though not mutually exclusive characterizations have inspired generations of scholars to see *lianzhu* as no more than thought exercises performed either to advise a monarch with enduring truths or to aid in perfecting one's own eloquence.

However, the biography of Liu Xiang 劉祥 (451–489) in the *Nan Qi shu* 南齊書 hints at more complex intentions and receptions. This biography is a rare instance in which the historian cites specific works of a scholar in their entirety, not as examples of literary achievement, but to provide a cautionary tale. By examining the circumstances surrounding Liu's composition of his *lianzhu* pieces, as well as of their circulation and reception in the court, I argue that Liu was leveraging the formal features common in *lianzhu* for more complex goals than mere remonstrance. Unlike his forebearers' works, which drew only from the past or from nature to state generally accepted truths, Liu's cleverly crafted pieces extend beyond aphorism. On the onehand he mixes allusions to both past and present circumstances to characterize the current emperor, and on the other hand he uses *lianzhu*'s conventional language to position himself as noless than a wise sage. The punishment Liu suffered as a result belies the conception of *lianzhu* as a "benign" genre of general principles and thought exercises: he was reported by a fellow official and banished to Guangzhou by an angry emperor. Even so, his approach to *lianzhu* survived and permeated *lianzhu* writing long afterwards.

#### **Mohammad Sadeq Ansari, SUNY Geneseo**

Science in the Margins: Using Digital Humanities Tools to Study the Marginalia of Two Manuscripts on the Science of Music from Medieval Islamic World

Manuscripts and manuscript notes have recently garnered a great deal of attention from scholars in helping us better understand the scholarly practices of the pre-modern Islamic world. Some of the manuscripts which we have access to today previously were the personal textbooks of scholars. As such, these manuscripts are full of side notes and comments written by these medieval scholars and reflect what they themselves understood of their subject of study, what they found most interesting in their studies, and how they went about learning them. Scholarship on the history of science used to perceive commentaries and super-commentaries as a sign of decadence and decline of a civilization's scientific output. Fortunately, however, scholars of Islamic science and philosophy have recently dedicated some long overdue attention to these commentaries. At the same time, Digital humanities as a field has witnessed an efflorescence in the past few years, from which Islamic Studies has benefitted as well. Bringing these two trends together, in this paper I will analyze the marginalia of two manuscripts of Šafī al-Dīn al-Urmawī's (d. 1294 CE) *al-Risālah al-Sharafīyah*, a treatise on the science of

music. For my analysis of the marginalia of the manuscripts I will utilize Digital Humanities tools and distant reading techniques such as word frequency modules, topic modelling, and semantic network analysis, that organize and visualize the data in a way that is markedly different from the more traditional close reading exercises. The aim of my presentation is to showcase some of the advantages that these techniques introduce to the field of Islamic Studies and lay the groundwork for future large-scale projects of studying manuscript marginalia using Digital Humanities tools.

### **Nadir Ansari, University of Toronto**

The Aims and Methods of Modern *tafsīr*: Sayyid Ahmad Khan's Qur'anic Hermeneutics and the Authority of the Bible

The paper investigates the approach of Syed Ahmad Khan (d. 1898, India) to the interpretation of the Qur'an with reference to his doctrinal intervention about Biblical authenticity, and aims to rectify the prevailing misunderstanding that Khan favored unqualified acceptance of the authority of the Bible. In his early career Khan compiled three volumes of his commentary on the Hebrew Bible and the New Testament (1862-65) arguing that the Bible has remained free of literal and verbal interpolations, and that the traditional Muslim trope of Biblical interpolation (*tahrīf*) merely refers to the Biblical translations, variant readings, manuscripts, scribal errors, responsa, and interpretations – not to textual corruption per se. Secondary scholarship on Khan's Biblical commentary (e.g. Christian Troll, Avril Powell, Bruce Lawrence, and Charles Ramsey) came late and, in eulogizing Khan's openness to the Bible, largely failed to take a holistic view of Khan's oeuvre and his broader methodological strategies: it misconstrued Khan's strategy of Victorian tolerance as theology. First, Khan's acceptance of the Biblical authority was at best conditional and included caveats that largely vitiated it. Secondly, in supporting the Biblical authority, he was responding to, and distancing himself from the powerful polemics against Christian missionaries led by the traditional *ʿulamāʾ* who were implicated in the Mutiny and the accompanying existential crisis. And, thirdly, in his commentary on the Qur'an (1880-95), he explicitly repudiated key passages of the Bible as he sought to reconcile Islam with the modern natural sciences. Khan's aims in his biblical commentary were contingent, instrumental, political, and polemical, and did not cohere with some of his aims in the Qur'anic interpretation (which frequently relied on the Bible). Khan's commentaries on the Bible and the



Qur'an are signs of the postcolonial ambivalence, existential aporia, and conflicting objectives of the modernizing Muslim reformers in the nineteenth century India.

**Sean W. Anthony, Ohio State University**

The Justly Killed Imam: A Mu'tazilī apologia for the killing of the caliph 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān (r. 23-36/644-656)

Recent years have witnessed the discovery and publication of numerous texts attributed to prominent thinkers from the Mu'tazilah whose works were once thought to be lost. One of the most interesting of these is a book attributed to Abū 'Alī al-Jubbā'ī (d. 915) called *Kitāb al-Maqālāt*, which contains an array of polemics directed against rival Muslim religious movements. This paper focuses on two sections of this work dedicated to a sustained polemic against the so-called 'Uthmāniyyah – the partisans and defenders of the third caliph 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān (r. 644-65). For those familiar with the largely hagiographical treatment of 'Uthmān's caliphate prevalent in Sunni historiography, the treatment of 'Uthmān's assassination in the *Kitāb al-Maqālāt* is striking. The author makes a passionate case for why the killing of the caliph 'Uthmān in 36/656 was not only a just and righteous act but also was an act done with the consensus (*ijmā'*) of the early community of Muslims. This paper reviews and presents these arguments as an early (and rare) Muslim apologia for regicide, situates them in the context of early Arabo-Islamic historiography of the ninth-century CE, and evaluates whether or not they support, or undermine, the text's attribution to al-Jubbā'ī.

**Nicholas Aubin, University of Warwick**

Avicenna Encounters a Partisan of the Void: A New Source for an Unorthodox Sect

Did any medieval Islamic thinkers truly deify void space? An exchange of letters between Avicenna (d. 1037) and an anonymous follower adds new evidence to that effect. This short but rich pair of letters, which has until now never been properly edited or studied in its own right, deals with a range of philosophical and theological concerns about the ontological status of space (void), and offers a fascinating glimpse at a philosophical/theological position known otherwise only through vague and spare doxographic reports. The first letter, from the disciple to Avicenna, apparently preserves an earlier interaction between this disciple and an anonymous

third figure, who propounds a daring theory of space (*wusʿa*) as ultimate Principle, using Qurʾānic language to justify his claim that space is an eternal, Necessary Being, allowing for all other beings. This thinker is to be seen in a tradition of thinkers described elsewhere as the Partisans of the Void. In his reply, Avicenna provides a doxographical history of the idea of void through antiquity, beginning with Pythagoras and Hesiod, moving to the atomists, and ending with the orthodox position on the void as demonstrated by Aristotle. He is careful to exonerate the ancients from ever having worshiped or revered the void. Avicenna then fleshes out his own account of how the mind's faculty of estimation is responsible for tricking the intellect into positing a void in the real world. To rebut the divinizing claims made by the anonymous Partisan of the Void, he concludes with an important distinction between necessary conditions and necessary principles. This short document presents multiple points of comparison with Avicenna's other works, on crucial topics including the epistemological value of estimation, while also fleshing out the views of a otherwise marginalized sect in the classical period of Islamic thought.

**Richard E. Averbeck, Trinity Evangelical Divinity School**

**The Gods in the Gudea Cylinders**

There is good reason to believe that the household analogy of the temple arose naturally and organically out of the clan and household world of those who lived in Sumer from the earliest days of sedentary and urban development in the southern alluvium down to the end of the third millennium BCE. Religious traditions tend to be conservative and, therefore, accumulate over time. Later traditions do not normally "replace" earlier ones, but transform and reshape them in accord with new developments in historical, political, cultural, and economic conditions. Temple texts serve a natural curatorial role in maintaining these traditions.

Gudea Cylinders A and B date to near the end of the third millennium and constitute one of the most important temple building compositions from the ancient Near Eastern world. While recounting Gudea's building of the new Eninnu temple for the divine couple (Ningirsu and Baba), this magnificent poetic narrative also naturally includes much about the many other gods who supported and participated in the project. Enlil and Enki are of primary importance, but in very different ways, which become clear when the references to them are considered in detail.

Other major and minor deities also come into the picture in appropriate ways at certain points in the narrative. These references to the many deities involved in building the temple reveal much about the accumulated religious traditions of the gods in ancient Sumer.

**Jahnabi Barooah Chanchani, University of Michigan [Withdraw]**

Avian Kinship and the Death of Birds in the Valmiki *Ramayana*

When Rama is traversing dreaded Dandakarayana in central India looking for his abducted wife Sita, he meets the noble vulture Jatayu on the forest path. Jatayu tells Rama that he had bravely fought Ravana and had tried to prevent him from kidnapping Sita but failed. Moments later Jatayu passes away. Thereafter, Rama cremates him in a manner benefiting his own father. In this paper, I will first analyze Jatayu's fragmented memories and emotions of grief and loss as Rama processes Jatayu's death. Next, I will consider how Jatayu's death compares with that of the male *krauncha* bird narrated at the beginning of the *Ramayana* from the vantage point of characters in the epic. Finally, I will interrogate what the death of these two birds may have meant for readers of the *Ramayana* in later centuries as the *Ramayana* grew from a text to a tradition. In all these ways, my paper will shed new light on kinship as an interspecies phenomenon and on discourses on loyalty, affiliation, companionship, and animal ethics in early India.

**Stefan Baums, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München**

The Dharmarājika Vase from Butkara and the Role of Eye Copies in Kharoṣṭhī Epigraphy

In the course of its excavations at Butkara I from 1956 onwards, the Italian Archeological Mission in Swat unearthed a fragmentary inscribed earthenware vase (CKI 218 in Baums & Glass, *Catalog of Gāndhārī Texts*). In his 1962 edition, Luciano Petech provided a reading and discussion of the fragments then available. The vase holds special interest because it refers to a Dharmarājika stūpa at Butkara, a title only held by one other stūpa in the region, that of Taxila. Since Petech's publication, additional fragments of this vase were found, but are currently only available in the form of an eye copy made by the same draftsman as the partial eye copy in Petech's article. Without reading knowledge of the Kharoṣṭhī script, he

faithfully reproduces what he saw on the fragments, but the resultant shapes are not always easy to interpret for a specialist in Kharoṣṭhī epigraphy. This paper will present a tentative reading of all fragments of the vase now available on the basis of the eye copy and on the background of the relevant epigraphic formula. It will then discuss other cases of Kharoṣṭhī inscriptions – typically found in the early days of this field of study – that are only available in eye copies, outline the problems that their interpretation presents, and suggest how best to approach this material.

**Gary Beckman, University of Michigan**

Corruption in the Hittite Administration

Given the paucity of judicial records in the archives of Hatti, examination of administrative malfeasance and abuse of office by members of the Hittite bureaucracy entails consultation of other types of texts—particularly of instructions for office holders and of inventories of the furnishings of cultic institutions. I will present a typology of self-dealing among Hittite officials and also consider the Hittite vocabulary for fraud or treachery as well as the problematics of recognizing corruption in an ancient society.

**Thomas Benfey, University of Oxford**

Religious, Land, and Head Taxes in the Middle Persian Documents from Early Islamic Iran

Several of the Middle Persian documents from seventh- and early eighth-century Qom touch on the taxes demanded at the time, as Dieter Weber has demonstrated. Although it is critically important in this connection, the evidence these documents furnish has yet to be integrated into the scholarly consensus about the early Islamic fiscal system's formation. There are also several problems with the previous interpretations of these documents—to be more specific, the existing scholarship has not properly identified the taxes they discuss. In this talk, examining the near-contemporary documentary evidence from Egypt and Afghanistan in Arabic, Greek, and Bactrian, as well as the writings of Islamic-era historians, I will offer a more accurate account of the taxes discussed in these early Islamic Middle Persian documents, and what, in turn, they have to tell us about early Islamic social, economic, and administrative history.

**John Lowe, Jim Benson and Yiming Shen, University of Oxford**

Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa and Nāgeśa on Negation

The correct understanding of negation is an important philosophical and linguistic question. While the theories of negation in Indian philosophical systems such as Navya-Nyāya and Mīmāṃsā have been well studied (among many others, for example, Matilal's *The Navya-Nyāya doctrine of Negation*, HOS 46, 1968), the theory of negation developed by the later Indian grammatical (vyākaraṇa) tradition, which set itself in direct competition with Nyāya and Mīmāṃsā, remains underexplored. We report on a detailed study and comparison of five discussions of negation, two by Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa, in his *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇa* and *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇsāra*, and three by Nāgeśa, in his *Laghumañjūṣā*, *Paramalaghumañjūṣā*, and *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntamañjūṣā*. On the basis of these texts we establish in broad terms the grammarians' theory of negation, and we compare and contrast this with the competing views of the Naiyāyikas and Mīmāṃsakas. At a greater level of detail, however, we find differences not only between Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa and Nāgeśa, but even between the different works of each author. This enables us both to trace the development of grammatical theorizing about negation, and also to gain a better understanding of the relations and differences between these five major texts of the late grammatical tradition.

**Marie Bizais-Lillig , University of Strasbourg / USIAS (France)**

Towards a topical grammar of medieval poetry: uncovering clusters of poems based on semantic field associations

This paper builds on a long tradition of poetics and examines the power that lies in structural characteristics of text. *Topoi*, for instance, play a central role in the literary realm because they echo previous text usages and shared expectations among readers. Michael Riffaterre and Stephen Owen for both French and Chinese literature have minutely illustrated how a specific word is more often than not combined with another specific word and how this word association carries more meaning than the individual words by themselves. Predictable word combinations belong to the same dynamics as *topos*.

This paper argues that the cases which were selected to demonstrate regular word association are part of a larger phenomenon, *i.e.* topical association.

In this project, topical association is tracked within large anthologies (*Wenxuan*, *Yutai xinyong*, *Quan Sanguo shi*, *Quan Liuchao shi* along with *Quan Tang shi*). It is mapped thanks to digital tools based on carefully designed semantic fields.

This methodology identifies groups of early medieval poems that share at least two topics in common and details which word(s) of the semantic fields appear in each poem. This information offers insights on what might have motivated some of the word choices in our body of texts – either tone patterns, lexical evolution, or double reference to different source texts.

If we widen the scope from early medieval China to the medieval period in the narrow (Tang) or larger sense (Tang-Song), the information that we gather will allow us to look into topical associations throughout periods of time and poetic genres and subgenres. We shall thus be able to raise questions such as the following one: How to define lines of continuity between particular clusters of poems from the Six Dynasties and from the Tang that share a specific topical combination?

**Øyvind Bjørn and Na'ama Pat-El, The University of Texas, Austin**

The Missing Link: There is no Copula in Akkadian

Unlike many West-Semitic languages, for most of its history Akkadian did not develop a copula. Some scholars (GAG §196c; Anttila 2000: 107; de Ridder 2018 §676) argue that at least in Neo-Assyrian, and possibly in Middle Assyrian, a copula on the basis of the 3rd person personal pronoun is used; for example, É-MEŠ *ra-a -pa-a-te ši-na* (SAA 1 124 o 5-6) 'The houses are built'. Copulas whose source is a personal pronoun are attested in many languages. In most cases, the copula construction developed from a reanalysis of a topic-comment construction, namely a nominal sentence where a constituent was topicalized via left dislocation. Although there are no diachronic studies of the copula in Akkadian, studies on other Semitic languages, like Hebrew and Arabic, largely corroborate this scenario.

In this paper, we will argue that the 3rd person personal pronoun in Neo-Assyrian has not in fact grammaticalized to become a copula. We will discuss a number of issues to substantiate our claim, among which the anaphoricity of the pronoun, its position, allomorphy, and distribution. We will show that the pronoun in Akkadian shows none of the expected behaviors of a copula and therefore should not be considered one.

### Kevin Blankinship, Brigham Young University

#### As Barren as Mother Eve: Why Some Poems End Better than Others, According to Classical Arabic Critics

“If the beginning of a poem is its key, the end must be its lock.” This dictum by Ibn Rashīq al-Qayrawānī in *Al-ʿUmdah* summarizes a broader attitude among classical Arabic critics about poetic closure: that it must impart, in the words of Barbara Herrnstein Smith, a sense of “the settled finality of self-evident truth.” Although critics who discuss poetic endings generally focus on the successes, some talk about bad endings too, such as the examples provided by Ibn Rashīq, the long list given by Ibn ʿAbd Rabbih in the “Al-Zumurrudah al-thānīyah” (The second emerald) of his *Al-ʿIqd al-farīd*, or the tally of al-Mutanabbī’s “qubḥ al-maqāṭi” (ugly endings) in al-Thaʿālibī’s *Abū l-Ṭayyib al-Mutanabbī wa-mā lahu wa-mā ʿalayh*. However, these critics almost never explain why they think bad endings are bad, in contrast to the reasons they give for why good endings are good. This discrepancy obscures a key part of classical Arabic “practical criticism” and the aesthetic sensibilities that underlie it.

This paper is a first attempt to sort out why classical Arabic critics felt the way they did about bad endings, or at least, why they liked some endings better than others. To get at the answer, I look at statements made in books about rhetorical figures (*badīʿ*), handbooks on poetic craft (*ṣināʿat al-shiʿr*), literary anthologies like al-Maqqarī’s *Nafḥ al-ṭīb*, and works of practical criticism like al-Qāḍī al-Jurjānī’s *al-Wasāṭah bayn al-Mutanabbī wa-khuṣūmih*. Initial results show a preference for poems whose closing lines resemble closures in the Qurʾān, based on a statement by Ibn Abī al-Iṣḥāʿ that the endings of Qurʾānic suras are models of command, counsel, and praise. Critics prefer endings that, like the classical Greek standard of harmony, balance, and proportion, avoid *takalluf* or *taṣannuʿ*, that is, forced and artificial-sounding language. They also look for poems that announce their endings very clearly so as not to be like

prose, which, in the minds of some critics, can go on and on. Finally, they ask that poets take the occasion for their poems into account, so as not to say things that audiences—especially patrons—would not like to hear. This goes along with an overall sensitivity to the poet’s message, which should be clearcut and integral to the poem as a whole.

**Radha Blinderman, Harvard University**

Balarāmapañcānana’s *Prabodhaprakāśa*: a Śākta Take on Grammar

This paper focuses on the little-studied phenomenon of ‘sectarian grammars’ of Sanskrit, specifically on the *Prabodhaprakāśa*, Balarāmapañcānana’s grammar (circa. 17<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> century AD) in the Śākta religious tradition of West Bengal, and the ways in which it compares with its 16<sup>th</sup> century Vaiṣṇava predecessor, Jīva Gosvāmin’s *Harināmāmṛtavyākaraṇa*. These authors innovated with paronomastic (*śleṣa*-based) terminology as a tool for theologization of grammar, Jīva being the first author to use the names of gods and their entourage as grammatical terms. A pejorative tone has been established in regard to these grammars since the early days of Indology, when Rajendralal Mitra (1877) characterized their terminology as ‘strange’, ‘absurd’, ‘extravagant’, and even a ‘ridiculous superstition’. Later, S.K. Belvalkar (1915) described their presentation of grammar as ‘dull’ and ‘uninteresting’, ‘having no history’ and ‘lacking improvement on the existing texts on grammar’. The *Prabodhaprakāśa* received little attention since and remained misquoted and miscategorized by generations of scholars.

The purpose of this paper is to present new information, respond to past critique, and offer a revised and hopefully unbiased assessment of the *Prabodhaprakāśa* by analyzing its major features: 1) religiously inflected grammatical terminology, grammatical rules yielding *śleṣa*, and other mnemonic techniques; 2) theology-infused grammar, and Śākta attitudes towards Vaiṣṇava content; 3) attitude towards grammatical authorities like the Pāṇinian and Kātantra schools; 4) the alleged ‘simplification’ of grammar in the arrangement of rules, terms and derivations. This paper attempts to understand the *Prabodhaprakāśa* on its own terms and why the author thought that Śāktas should have their own grammar.



Finally, this paper discusses the historical significance of this intersection of religion and grammar in the *Prabodhaprakāśa* and concludes with examples of how the analysis of Śākta and Vaiṣṇava grammars contributes to the field of *vyākaraṇa* and religious studies.

**Martin Braun, Hannes A. Fellner, Bernhard Koller, Austrian Academy of Sciences**

A Digital Research Tool for the Study of Central Asian Brāhmī

The purpose of this paper is to introduce and demonstrate a web application for the study of Central Asian text corpora, including Sanskrit, Saka, and Tocharian. The development of this application constitutes a major aspect of the research project “The Characters that Shaped the Silk Road,” which, starting from the seminal work by Lore Sander (Sander 1968), aims at developing a new paleographic classification system for the various forms of Central Asian Brāhmī. The web application serves the function of providing a platform through which scholars can access and query the project database in a way that can be tailored to their own research questions. In anticipation of its public release, which is scheduled shortly after the AOS meeting, we present some of the main features of the application with a special focus on its applications for paleographic research. At the core of this functionality lies the systematic association of the narrow transcription of an *akṣara* with its precise location on a photograph, which enables queries that return images of the *akṣaras* themselves rather than mere transcriptions. In Fellner, Koller, and Braun 2019 we demonstrate how a database with these properties has already led to new insights into the different developmental stages of Central Asian Brāhmī. We now show how our web application can be used in order to perform similar queries in a much more flexible and open-ended fashion. By cross-referencing paleographic queries with other types of properties associated with the digital text editions, it becomes possible to compare multiple tokens and variants of the same *akṣara* within user-specified sets of data, including individual manuscript fragments, fragments found in specific regions, as well as data sets spanning multiple languages. Our goal is therefore to provide the field with a tool that is flexible enough to tackle research questions far beyond the scope of our own project.

Fellner, Hannes A., Bernhard Koller, and Martin Braun (2019). “Digital Approaches to the Linguistic and Paleographic History of Tocharian B.” *Proceedings of the 30th Annual UCLA Indo-European Conference*. Ed. by David M. Goldstein, Stephanie W. Jamison, and Brent Vine.

Bremen: Hempen: 61–76.

Sander, Lore (1968). *Paläographisches zu den Sanskrithandschriften der Berliner Turfansammlung*. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

**Joel P. Brereton, The University of Texas at Austin**

Stanley Insler's Mātariśvan

In 1984, Stanley Insler read a paper on the deity Mātariśvan, in which he argued for a new interpretation of the name of the god, discussed his character and function in the Ṛgveda, and supported a controversial view that connects Mātariśvan to Greek Prometheus. He never completed an article based on this essay, but his handwritten manuscript and notes for developing his argument were among the papers left by him. I hope to publish his essay together with additions and minor edits. The paper I will present gives Insler's argument and offers an expansion of his discussion of the early history of the god.

**David Brick, University of Michigan**

Reexamining the Identification of the Hindu Jurist Dhāreśvara with King Bhoja of Dhārā

Numerous Dharmaśāstra commentaries cite the views and sometimes even the very words of an author named Dhāreśvara. And although Dhāreśvara appears to have been a formidable thinker on certain aspects of Hindu law, most notably on inheritance, no Dharmaśāstra work ascribed to him survives. As a result, we know little about him. The accepted scholarly position, first argued by P. V. Kane in his monumental *History of Dharmaśāstra*, has been that Dhāreśvara is none other than King Bhoja of Dhārā—classical India's most famous royal patron of the arts and a prolific and celebrated author in his own right. While the identification of the jurist Dhāreśvara with King Bhoja has gone unchallenged for many decades and has been based upon seemingly compelling evidence, this paper will present new evidence that casts it into serious doubt. Specifically, it will draw attention to the numerous references to Dhāreśvara in an incomplete and unpublished commentary on the *Yājñavalkya Dharmaśāstra*. Given that this commentary survives primarily in a Nepalese manuscript apparently dated to 1002 CE and that

Bhoja's reign is generally held to have started no earlier than the start of the eleventh century, it will argue that the identification of the jurist Dhāreśvara with king Bhoja of Dhārā should now be rejected.

**Timothy Cahill, Loyola University**

Phonetic Elegance in Sanskrit *Kāvya*: tracking poetic practice using aesthetic guidelines

Scholarship on the relationship between literary practice and theory has received considerable attention in Indology for a century, and especially over the last two decades. Comparatively little work has been done, however, on the phonetic guidelines that apply to poetic composition in later Sanskrit *kāvya*. These apply to phonetic juxtapositions involving vowel length, conjunct consonants, visarga assimilation, etc. A rare presentation of such rules is found in the first *ānana* of Jagannātha's *Rasagaṅgādhara*. The paper is based on a close translation of the section, together with an analysis of the examples that are introduced by Sanskrit commentators. It will also consider the recomposed poems that Jagannātha Paṇḍitarāja supplies to show how certain inelegant combinations can be avoided, especially in poems that target particular *guṇas* (e.g., *mādhurya*, *ojas*, *prasāda*).

The conventions of Sanskrit *kāvya* are extensive, involving a mastery of metrics, grammar and a burgeoning system of figures and styles. The paper considers new literary conventions introduced in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries and argues that we can see poets' responses to them in the later variants that show up in the late anthologies. Specific guidelines on phonetic elegance suggest that some revisions were intentional. Old Sanskrit poems that violate the later guidelines reappear in updated forms in anthologies. The paper traces their transmission to show how such infelicitous wordings are received. Whereas Jagannātha presents us with cases of explicit authorial revision, the older poems present evidence that a slow process of editorial 'improvement' was at work. These phonetic preferences matched the sensitivities of a literary milieu that had not yet codified them for composing *kāvya* at the time when much of India's classical literature had been composed.

**John Clayton, University of California, Los Angeles**

The Lengthening of *\*i, \*u > ī, ū* / *\_\_rC* in Sanskrit

Indo-Aryan differs notably from Iranian in its treatment of PIE syllabic liquid-laryngeal sequences (*\*lH, \*rH*): While both branches produce anaptyctic vowels before the liquid (PIE *\*d̥l̥h₁gʰó-* > Ved. *dīrghá-*, OAv. *darəya-* 'long'; PIE *\*p̥l̥h₁nó-* > Ved. *pūrṇá-*, OAv. *pərəna-* 'full'), Indo-Aryan produced sequences *-īr-* and *-ūr-* containing long high vowels before consonants. This increase from the bimoraic syllable in *\*p̥l̥h₁μ.nó-* to the trimoraic syllable in *pūμμrμ.ṇá-* could be understood as a compensatory lengthening following the deletion of the syllable-final laryngeal (*\*p̥l̥h₁μ.nó-* > *\*puμrμHμ.nó-* > *pūμμrμ.ṇá-*), but this could require the laryngeal's mora to "leap over" the intervening *r* on the way to lengthen the vowel, a situation prohibited by the Well-Formedness Condition of Goldsmith (1979, p. 48). Instead, I propose that *\*i, \*u > ī, ū* / *\_\_rC* because of difficulties with the articulatory sequencing of pharyngeal gestures in the Proto-Indo-Aryan high vowels *\*i, \*u* and "velar" (per the Prātiśākhya) rhotic *\*r*. This lengthening not only applied in *\*-ir(H)C-*, *\*-ur(H)C-* sequences from PIE *\*-l̥HC-*, *\*-r̥HC-* but also to other, laryngeal-less sequences in Indo-Aryan:

Instances of *\*u > ū* / *\_\_rC* in Indo-Aryan:

PIE *\*dʰur-tí-* > Ved. *dhūrtí-* 'harm' (RV)

PIE *\*ǵur-ské-ti* > Ved. *hūrchatī* 'fall away' (MS)

PIE *\*h₃w̥rdʰ-wó-* > Ved. *ūrdhvá-* 'upright' (RV)

PIE *\*surgʰ-s-ye-ti* > Ved. *sūrksyati* 'take care for' (Kāth., MS)

These instances of lengthening have either gone unnoticed or been deemed irregular (e.g. *L/V*², s.v. ? *\*surgʰ-*, n. 4). While I have yet found no probative examples to (dis)prove *\*-irC-* > *-īrC-*, this too likely underwent the same lengthening. These results both inform us about the phonetic properties of the segments involved and solve longstanding issues with *seṭ*-seeming *-ūrC-* forms built to otherwise *aniṭ*-appearing *√Cvr-* roots.

**Patrick T. Cummins, Cornell University**

Kumārila and the Revival of Grammarian Philosophy of Language Abstract word

This paper explores the early-modern revival of grammarian philosophy of language in Bhaṭṭojīdīkṣita's *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntakārikā* and Koṇḍabhaṭṭa's *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣana* by way of

their newfound attention to Kumārilabhaṭṭa. While the grammarian revival has recently garnered substantial attention (e.g., Diaconescu 2012), key intellectual-historical threads have yet to be traced.

The thread I will trace here begins with Kumārilabhaṭṭa, who, in his *Tantravārttika* (c. 660-70CE) at the “The Topic of the Agent” (*kartradhikaraṇa*), flagrantly manipulates Pāṇini and Patañjali on 2.3.1 and 4.21-22 to argue that the verbal suffix (the *tin*) only directly signifies the agent’s number, not the agent (*kart*). Kumāṛila’s denial that the verbal suffix expresses the agent reinforces his core Mīmāṃsā theory that the finite verbal suffix expresses the “bringing into being” (*bhāvanā*) as the governing linguistic item.

Perhaps surprisingly, no grammarian answer to Kumāṛila emerges until a thousand years later at Benares, with Bhaṭṭojīdīkṣita and Koṇḍabhaṭṭa, when both Bhāṭṭa Mīmāṃsā and Vyākaraṇa had experienced a renaissance via new forms of critical and historicist engagement with the discipline’s foundational treatises (McCrea 2008, Bronkhorst 2005; 2008). Bhaṭṭojī first embeds positions hostile to Kumāṛila within his magnum opus, the *Śabdakaustubha*, and outlines a framework for a grammarian philosophy of language in his short verse work, the *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntakārikā*. Koṇḍabhaṭṭa then, in the *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇa*, launches a full-scale assault on Kumāṛila, revealing inconsistencies and deploying concepts from Nyāya. In doing so, Bhaṭṭojī and Koṇḍa advance against Kumāṛila a grammarian theory of the sentence whereupon the verbal root (*dhātu*), not the verbal suffix (*tin*), is the primary qualificand. While they seek to establish their theory as on a continuum with the views of the ancient grammarians (Pāṇini, Yāska, Bhartr̥hari, etc.), and while these ancient grammarians may have held similar positions (Cardona 2019), as we will see, the grammarian theory Bhaṭṭojī and Koṇḍa advance is in fact something quite new.

**Kayla Dang, Yale University**

Zoroastrian “History” according to Islamic Sources

Building upon recent research seeking to contextualize Zoroastrian Middle Persian texts in the Islamic context in which they were written, this contribution examines the process by which the history of the Zoroastrian religion was understood and imagined by ninth and tenth century Zoroastrians and their Islamic counterparts.

There are few “histories” or historical narratives within extant Zoroastrian sources. Zoroastrian historiography, if it is discussed at all, is usually conflated with or conceived as an integral part of Persian or “Iranian” history, that tradition (or traditions) called the *Xwadāy-nāmag* or “Book of Kings,” and as part of the “sacred history” of *Ērānšahr*. Thus, Arabic historiographical sources from the early Islamic period are usually regarded as translations or recensions of the Persian “Book of Kings,” and taken as representative of a general and largely oral Iranian historiographical tradition. Alternatively, these and other Arabic sources are commonly examined for their (often polemical) views about Zoroastrian belief and practice.

This paper, by contrast, investigates how Arabic sources, particularly historiographical and geographical works from the ninth and tenth centuries, present Zoroastrian history, with attention to the foundations of its religious institutions, i.e., the priesthood, its offices, and their relationship to state authority. This is part of a larger project to reconstruct and assess the notion of Zoroastrian history in the medieval period. Not only were there multiple versions of this history in circulation at this time, but Arabic sources (including those regarded as recensions of the putative “Book of Kings” tradition) differ considerably from contemporary Zoroastrian Middle Persian ones. Zoroastrian historiography not only existed in antiquity but was in many ways distinct from the religious history encapsulated in the Persian “Book of Kings” tradition(s); its development should be regarded in its own social and political context in the ninth and tenth centuries.

**David Danzig, New York University**

The Judean Peasants of Yaḥūdu, Babylonia: Their History, Identity, and Demographics on an Imperial Estate

The preliminary scholarly conceptualization of the Babylonian rural social landscape, gleaned from the cuneiform Yaḥūdu Corpus, is of a general multiculturalism. The onset of acculturation is said to be evidenced by the plethora of inter-cultural contact found in these texts. In contrast to this position, I show that there is a large dichotomy between the Judean farming peasantry of the village of Yaḥūdu and the local elite of that community. Whereas the current notion of inter-ethnic contact and resultant multiculturalism is accurate at the level of the local elite, the Judean

peasants lived in cloistered isolation and maintained their tightly-knit ethnic community over the course of three generations in Yaḥūdu.

In this paper, I analyze a group of texts related to the tax farming of Aḥīqam, the main protagonist of Group 1 of the Yaḥūdu Corpus, from the bowfiefs of the Judean *šušānū* workers of Yaḥūdu. Through these texts, I reconstruct the whole peasant community of Yaḥūdu, their general ethnic identity, and estimated population, from the time of its settlement there (after 587 BCE) until the time of Aḥīqam (c. 516-510 BC).

I also collect the information for estates of high imperial officials in the Neo-Babylonian and Achaemenid Empires. Although a number of scholars have noted the existence of these estates, none has yet integrated our knowledge of them and discussed them as an intentional phenomenon in these empires that continued through the eras of these empires. I situate the community of Judean forced immigrants of Yaḥūdu in this context, as a multigenerational, largely ethnically homogenous, peasant enclave within an imperial estate. Finally, I propose that this reconstruction may serve as a template for how we understand the relocation and identity development of groups of forced immigrants within the Babylonian countryside during the Neo-Babylonian and Achaemenid Empires.

**Donald R. Davis, Jr., University of Texas at Austin**

The Meaning of *svadharma* in Classical Sanskrit

In this communication, I will substantiate the claim that *svadharma* in classical Sanskrit means “the rights and duties proper to one’s social position, especially caste and life-stage.” In spite of assertions to the contrary by well-known scholars, it does not mean “personal law,” “one’s own dharma,” “private morality,” and the like. I examine the patterns in hundreds of instances of the word in several genres of Sanskrit. The proper or appropriate source of law or morality in *svadharma* is a group, not an individual. Furthermore, the most common group in question is a social class (*varṇa*), a caste (*jāti*), or those in an idealized stage of life (*āśrama*). Less frequently, it refers to duties and rights that emerge from membership in another social group such as a guild, a monastic order, a military unit, or a family. In every case, however, the *dharma* in

question belongs to a socially defined group and to the set of norms recognized by that group. *Svadharma*, therefore, refers to an external morality imposed by a group, not to an internal sense of personal duty, responsibility, or circumstance.

**Jessie DeGrado, University of Michigan, and Madadh Richey, Brandeis University**

Swords into Ploughshares: The Khirbet ‘Aṭaruz Moabite Inscription

In 2010, an inscribed stone incense altar was uncovered in an Iron Age II temple complex at the Jordanian site of Khirbet ‘Aṭaruz (خربة عطورون). Currently housed in the Madaba Archaeological Museum, the artifact bears two inscriptions, designated Inscription A and B respectively in the recently published *editio princeps* (Bean et al. 2018) and dated palaeography to the late ninth or early eighth century BCE. The first edition and all other presentations have understood Inscription B to be the laconic description of a military encounter involving “Hebrews” (*ʾbrn*). Although the text itself is unbroken and the editors’ graphemic identifications can be confirmed via RTI photography, their lexical interpretations result in a syntactically disjointed and, as they put it, “tentative” translation (Bean et al. 2018: 229). We present a new morphological, lexical, and syntactic analysis of Inscription B and argue that it records a list of commodities given to the temple at Khirbet ‘Aṭaruz. The items acquired include grain (*ʾbrn*), formerly understood as “Hebrews,” and products from the threshing floor (*grn*), formerly understood as “foreigners.” In addition to yielding a syntactically coherent text, our morphological analysis has implications for the final line of Inscription A (*bz kl 10*), which likely records the total sum of goods exchanged, rather than identifying objects as plunder.

**Leo Depuydt, Brown University**

The Nature of the So-called Neutral Tone in Chinese

In some languages, syllables are typically pronounced with distinct tones exhibiting different pitches or pitch intervals, a bit like musical notes or intervals. It is normal for two words to be distinguished just by tone. The best-known tonal language is Chinese, spoken or studied in some form by close to a third of the world’s population. Different Chinese dialects have different numbers of tones. The national language of China, Modern Standard Chinese, also called



Mandarin, is based mainly on the Beijing dialect. Mandarin has four tones. But there is also a so-called fifth or neutral tone. Both terms are misnomers because the phenomenon is portrayed as the presence of something. But it involves an absence, namely of tone. More appropriate is “zero tone,” also found in the literature. The Chinese term is qing sheng “weak tone.” The neutral tone does exhibit some different types of pitch depending on which tone precedes. But these pitches are secondary. And above all, they do not affect meaning, as true tones can and do. Neutral tone is generally defined in grammars and textbooks as lack of a meaningful tone as a property of a syllable. But that is not what is essential about it. The time has come to treat the neutral tone all anew in its proper, and much wider, context. The paper looks at the matter from two angles. The first is practical and avoids all reference to theory or other languages so as to be accessible to beginning students of Chinese. This angle concerns consequences for the accurate pronunciation of Mandarin. The second angle includes some theory and makes reference to other languages and a larger body of relevant literature. The seeds for treating the neutral tone in its proper context were sown at the end of the nineteenth century.

**Johan Elverskog, Southern Methodist University**

**Why Did the Uyghurs Become Buddhist?**

In 762 CE, the ruler of Uighur steppe empire, Bügü Khan, converted to Manichaeism. The Uighur elite continued to embrace this tradition even when their empire on the Mongolian plateau collapsed and they fled to present-day northwest China. But around the year 1000, the Uighurs converted to Buddhism, the dominant religion among their subject peoples—the Chinese, Sogdians, and Tocharians—and would remain Buddhist until their conversion to Islam centuries later. This talk explores the Uighurs’ conversion in the larger context of Eurasian geopolitics and the contemporary messianic belief that the end of the Dharma was nigh.

**Julie Ershadi, University of California, Los Angeles**

Self-Rewriting in Persian Ghazal Poetry: Experimenting with Meter, Rhyme and Imagery in 14<sup>th</sup> Century Shiraz

Jahān Malik Khātūn (d. after 1382 C.E.) was a princess of the Perso-Mongol Injuid dynasty in 14th century Shiraz and a poet at the court of her uncle, Shaykh Abū Ishāq (d. 1357). She is the only major female poet of the premodern Persian lyric tradition and was a contemporary of Hāfiz of Shiraz (d. 1390) and Kamāl Khujandī (d. 1400), as well as a prolific imitator of Sa'dī of Shiraz. Her *dīvān*, or collected works, which she appears to have compiled herself and for which she wrote a short yet revelatory introduction, contains various pairs of ghazals that are similar or identical in content and structure, demonstrate a clear pattern of correspondence, and thus appear to be iterative drafts experimenting with particular images and rhetoric, almost as a writing exercise.

The existence of revisionary renditions of a classical ghazal poet's works would be unusual, but this paper addresses the sociopolitical milieu in which Jahān wrote in order to demonstrate how the influence of more liberal Mongol attitudes toward women, as well as the tacit protection of her paternal uncle and other male relatives, would have created the circumstances in which an elite woman may have enjoyed the social freedom to publicly compose, compile, and present for critique her writings. While the scholarship has very little access to information about the crafting process of the typical premodern Persian lyric poet, and even less access to the lives of women in premodern Iran, Jahān's drafts represent a rare opportunity to explore these topics in depth.

This study also identifies for the first time the structural patterns that demarcate what we call 'draft poems' in Jahān's *dīvān* and takes advantage of the scarcely-seen opportunity to examine the development of a poet's craft by analyzing versions of lines in the *dīvān* and comparing them to one another and to the works of other, contemporary major poets on lexico-syntactic, rhetorical, and lyrical-aesthetic grounds.

Hannes A. Fellner, University of Vienna

Demotic Varieties of Central Asian Brāhmī

Among the many varieties of the Central Asian Brahmi script in the Tarim Basin (Tarim Brāhmī) of the first millennium CE, there are ductus which differ from the usual book script varieties called “business” or “cursive” in the literature (Sander 1968). This variant of Tarim Brahmi is usually said to be used for secular purposes. It is written with brush on media different from poṭhī-style sheets of paper and seems to be almost exclusively confined to Tocharian and Saka. There is no systematic paleographic treatment of this “cursive” Brāhmī type. In this talk I will argue that the “cursive” Tarim Brāhmī was mainly used by non-professional writers, but not exclusively for secular purposes. I will show that there are different chronological and geographic varieties of this “demotic” script which contrary to the received opinion were used in different contexts; for example, while Tocharian B demotic Tarim Brāhmī is indeed used primarily in secular documents, Tocharian A demotic Tarim Brāhmī is actually used for Buddhist texts. The goal of the paper is to present a paleographic classification of the demotic varieties of Tarim Brāhmī along linguistic and philological criteria, thereby also shedding light on literacy in the Tarim Basin.

Ching, Chao-jung. 2017. *Tǔhuǒluó yǔ shìsú wénxiàn yǔ gǔdài qiūcí lìshǐ* 吐火羅語世俗文獻與古代龜茲歷史 (Tocharian secular texts and history of ancient Kucha). Beijing: Beijing daxue chubanshe.

Fellner, Hannes A., Bernhard Koller, and Martin Braun (2019). “Digital Approaches to the Linguistic and Paleographic History of Tocharian B.” *Proceedings of the 30th Annual UCLA Indo-European Conference*. Ed. by David M. Goldstein, Stephanie W. Jamison, and Brent Vine. Bremen: Hempen: 61–76.

Sander, Lore (1968). *Paläographisches zu den Sanskrithandschriften der Berliner Turfansammlung*. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

Zhao Li, and Rong Xinjiang. 2020. *Qiūcí shíkū tíjì* 龜茲石窟題記 (Cave Inscriptions in Ancient Kucha). Shanghai: Zhongxi shuju.

**Michael Fiden, University of Texas at Austin**

The Incorporation of *Atharvan* Ritual Elements in the *Baudhāyana Gṛhyasūtra*

Building on Marko Geslani's work on *śānti* rites, this paper will explore in more detail the reactions of the *Yajurvedic* tradition to the rising political power of the *Atharvan* tradition in the *sūtra* period. Namely, I argue that the *Yajurvedic* tradition responded to this trend by incorporating *Atharvan* ritual elements into their own ritual frameworks, thus capitalizing on the successes of the *Atharvan* priesthood and leeching power in the public arena. In other words, the *Yajurvedic* tradition adapted to a changing political environment by integrating critical *Artharvan* ritual apparatuses into their own milieu. The mechanisms and contexts of these integrations can shed new light on these changes, as well as on the continuing tension between the *Atharvavedic* tradition and the other three Vedas, which are often conceptualized as a cohesive unit standing above and apart from the *Atharvaveda*. This paper will explore the strategies of incorporation employed by the *Yajurvedic* tradition by comparing the constellations of *Artharvan* ritual elements which appear in *Baudhāyana* material, belonging to the *Taittirīya* school of the *Kṛṣṇa Yajurveda*, with their articulations in the *Atharvaveda*. Specifically, this paper will consider the *Baudhāyana Gṛhyasūtra* and its appendices, such as its *śeṣasūtra*, in light of similar ritual topics in the *Kauśikasūtra* of the *Atharvaveda*. This paper will demonstrate that the *Yajurvedic* material displays wholesale borrowing of *Artharvan* ritual elements presented as constellations of rites articulated together in *Yajurvedic* frameworks. Particularly, *Atharvan* ritual elements are found in constellations containing the preparation of appeasement water (*śāntiyudaka*), the ritual platform (*sthaṇḍila*), and an amulet (*pratisara*).

**Elaine Marie Fisher, Stanford University**

Sanskritic Śaivism in the Vernacular: Rethinking Vīraśaiva Origin Stories

What do we mean when we speak of “Vīraśaivism”? In 2018, the state of Karnataka officially recognized Liṅgāyatism as a minority religion, distinct from Hinduism. According to advocates for separate religion status, however, “Vīraśaivism” is the polar opposite of the Liṅgāyat movement. Liṅgāyat reformers equate “Vīraśaivism” specifically with the Pañcācārya tradition, which traces its origin to a set of five legendary teachers who are believed to have manifested spontaneously out of five *śivaliṅgas* spread across the Indian subcontinent. Supposedly a

reactionary twentieth-century movement, the Pañcācārya tradition is emplotted as replacing social revolution with caste consciousness, devotion with ritualism, and Kannada with Sanskrit. Scholarship to date, thus, has viewed the notion of five *ācāryas* as an extremely modern and politically motivated interpolation to Vīraśaiva traditions.

In this paper, I draw on unstudied textual material in Sanskrit and Kannada to identify an earlier synthesis of the Pañcācārya tradition can be traced back early modernity. Rather than constituting a single orthodox or reactionary brahminical lineage, the five—or often four—*ācāryas* served primarily a ritual motif that appeared with particular frequency in Kannada Vīraśaiva texts. Building on my presentation at this conference in 2019, I demonstrate in this paper that even early modern Kannada works of narrative literature generally associated today with reformist Liṅgāyat lineages incorporated variable sets of four or five *ācāryas* as a central component of their initiation rituals. In other words, I aim to demonstrate that we can trace the synthesis of a tradition associated with the Pañcācāryas to early modern Karnataka, to Kannada rather than Sanskrit, and to a social structure that was not exclusively—or, likely, even primarily—Brahminical in nature.

**Christopher T. Fleming, University of Oxford**

Dharmaśāstra and the Death of Vālin in the *Kiṣkindhākāṇḍa* of Vālmīki's *Rāmāyaṇa*

In *Kiṣkindhākāṇḍa*, Sarga 16 of Vālmīki's *Rāmāyaṇa*, Rāma kills Vālin while the latter is distracted by Sugrīva. In Sarga 17, Vālin charges Rāma with a series of legal infractions: 1) violation of *jus in bello*; (cf. Manu 7.92); 2) want of a legitimate *causus belli* (cf. Manu 7.207); 3) punishment of an innocent person (cf. Manu 7.27); and 4) hunting a prohibited quarry (cf. Manu 5.17). In Sarga 18, Rāma responds to Vālin's indictment, averring that: 1) the laws of *hunting*, rather than the laws of *war*, were applicable in this situation (cf. Manu 5.22-3); 2) Vālin's hostility with Sugrīva provided a *casus foederis* for Rāma's intervention (cf. Manu 7.207); and 3) Vālin committed a capital offence (cohabitating with Sugrīva's wife), that Rāma was obliged to punish (cf. Manu 8.359 & 9.57-8). Vālmīki portrays Rāma's defense as a success, with Vālin requesting that, "if... I unwittingly censured you... please be gracious and forgive me... (*Rāmāyaṇa* 4.18.57)"

I draw on the opinions of three *Rāmāyaṇa* commentaries, the *Amṛtakataka*, the *Tilaka* (of Nāgeśabhaṭṭa), and the *Rāmāyaṇaśiromaṇi*, to evaluate the coherence of Rāma and Sugrīva's legal logic. While these commentaries conclude that Rāma's role as a *punisher*, rather than as a *hunter*, justified his breach of the laws of war, they identify a contradiction in Rāma's reasoning: if Vālin, *qua* animal, was not afforded the protection of *jus in bello*, how could he, *qua* animal, be punished for committing a *humanum scelus*? The commentaries, I demonstrate, resolve this tension by advancing two arguments vis-à-vis Dharmaśāstra and animals: 1) that legendary, anthropomorphic animals, such as Vālin, Jaṭāyus, and Garuḍa, are sufficiently humanlike to be bound by the dictates of Dharma; and 2) that all animals, from the humble pigeon to majestic Rāma, follow a natural law that repudiates wife-snatching. *Cum simia peccaverit, absolvendus est homo*.

### **Bruce Fudge, Université de Genève**

M. A. Khalafallāh and the Afterlives of the Prophets

*al-Fann al-qāṣaṣī fī l-Qur'ān al-karīm* (1950-1951), by Muḥammad Aḥmad Khalafallāh (1916-1991) is a book whose contents are made much more interesting by virtue of the polemic they provoked. When presented as the author's doctoral dissertation at Cairo in 1947, the reaction of academics and journalists was overwhelmingly negative, and Khalafallāh did not receive his degree. Even his advisor voiced only tepid support, and Khalafallāh was left alone to defend himself.

In the dissertation and the lightly revised monograph that followed, Khalafallāh essayed a "literary" analysis of quranic narrative, arguing that the details and the specific events in quranic stories should not be taken literally. There is no need, he claimed, to iron out the apparent contradictions and harmonize the different versions. What matters are the themes and motifs that reflect the situation of the Prophet Muḥammad and the nascent community of believers. These elements, the "themes" of the narratives, constitute a literary or psychological truth far more important than literal or factual truth.

Khalafallāh and his book are celebrated in some circles as a pioneer of new quranic interpretation, a hero of free speech who stood up to hidebound Azharite tradition. There is

some truth in this view. However, this paper argues that Khalafallāh's book is more usefully seen in the larger context of what happens to quranic prophets (and most of quranic narrative involves the prophets) in the modern age.

The first part of the paper describes Khalafallāh's argument and his sources of inspiration (mainly Fakhr al-dīn al-Rāzī and Muḥammad 'Abduh). The second part considers the role of prophets in the Quran, and how radically Khalafallāh wishes to depart from convention. A third section considers Khalafallāh alongside a number of other twentieth-century *auteurs* who also gave offense by their novel treatment of quranic prophets (Ṭāhā Ḥusayn, Naguib Mahfouz, Youssef Chahine, Salman Rushdie). Each case is unique, but taken together they provide a series of markers indicating limits of what one may say. They also indicate a persistent desire to push against those limits.

#### **Omid Ghaemmaghami, State University of New York at Binghamton**

#### **The Discovery of the Oldest Known Manuscript of the Kitāb-i-Aqdas in the West and Further Notes on Dating the Book's Composition**

Among the holdings of Columbia University's Rare Book and Manuscript Library is the oldest known manuscript in the West of the Kitāb-i-Aqdas, the central book of the Bahá'í canon, written by Mírzá Ḥusayn-'Alí Núrí, known as Bahá'u'lláh (d. 1892). The manuscript (call number X893.7 B11) was donated to Columbia University by the reverend James Bassett who in 1872, under the auspices of the American Mission Board, founded the first American mission in Tehran. The manuscript Bassett donated to Columbia University contains the following prefatory note: "A Copy of the Book of the Baub of Akka in Arabic, with interlinear translation in Persian, presented to Rev. James Bassett by the chief of the Baubees in Tehran, Persian." Known as the "Mother Book" of the Bahá'í teachings, the Kitāb-i-Aqdas constitutes the central religious text of the Bahá'í Faith. Yet the circumstances of its composition in 'Akká and its dissemination in Persia in the 1870s require further study. This communication will shed light on these topics through study of a number of passages in the writings of Bahá'u'lláh that help establish a terminus ad quem for the completion of the book. Special attention will be given to the Columbia University manuscript of the Kitāb-i-Aqdas donated by Bassett. Who was the "chief of the Baubees in Tehran" who delivered the manuscript to Bassett? How does the Columbia University manuscript compare with other manuscript witnesses of the Kitāb-i-Aqdas? And what can be learned about the Bahá'í community in Tehran in the 1870s from Bassett's descriptions of his encounters with them?

Petra Goedegebuure, Oriental Institute, University of Chicago

“The people of Hatti often speak about my match!”. The Luwian verb *tiššā(i)-* ‘to shape; to ready; to arrange, align; to match’

In her communications with Ramses II about his future Hittite bride, Queen Puduḫeba praises her successful union with Ḫattušili III:

“When the Sun Goddess of Arinna ... made <me> Queen, she matched me with your brother, and I produced sons and daughters. As a result, the people of Ḫatti often speak of my :*annān tiššān*” (KUB 21.38 obv. 57’-59’).

Luwian *annān tiššān*, nom.-acc.s.neut. participle of *tiššā(i)-* (although the acc.s.comm. of nominal *\*tiššā-* is also an option (< adj. *\*dʰiǵʰ-s-o-* or *\*dʰiǵʰ-s-eh₂-*)), is not well understood, and the same applies to the verb, which allegedly has unrelated meanings: “mobilize, keep going(?)” and “give (final) shape” (HEG T/3:377). Rieken (2002:409-10), however, shows that *tiššā(i)-* only means “in Ordnung bringen, richten, formen, fertig bringen, herstellen”. As a regular derivation of PIE *\*dʰeiǵʰ-* ‘coat, knead’ *tiššā(i)-* originally means ‘to shape’ (Rieken l.c.). Unfortunately, redefined *tiššā(i)-* still shows no connection with the different meanings proposed for :*annān tiššān* (“besondere Fruchtbarkeit” Helck 1963:92; “experience? and capacity for nurture?” Hoffner 2009:287).

I argue that most additional meanings of *tiššā(i)-* are the result of semantic metatypy. The source of this change is the Hittite verb *ḫandā(i)-* ‘to align, ready; compare; match’ (for these improved translations see Melchert 2020). The original conceptual closeness of *tiššā(i)-* and *ḫandā(i)-* is illustrated by “Let them bring out the carts. Then, arrange (and) ready them (*ḫandāi : tiššāi*)” (KUB 36.12 iii 13’-14’) and the fact that both verbs translate Hurrian *muž-* ‘to shape, order’.

The semantic development of *tiššā(i)-* was as follows: ‘shape an object’ > ‘make ready’. The latter meaning is also attested for *ḫandā(i)-*, and hence, in a bilingual environment, *tiššā(i)-*



acquired the connotations ‘arrange, align, match’. It is ‘match’ that we need for Puduḫeba and Ḫattušili III:

“As a result, the people of Ḫatti often speak of my match (= *annān tiššān*)”

#### References:

- HEG: Tischler, Johann (1994). *Hethitisches Etymologisches Glossar* Teil 3, T/D3 (IBS 20) Innsbruck.
- Helck, Wolfgang (1963). “Urḫi-Tešup in Ägypten.” *JCS* 17: 87-97.
- Hoffner, Harry A. (2009). *Letters from the Hittite Kingdom*. Atlanta.
- Melchert, H. Craig (2020). “Hittite *ḫandā(i)*- ‘to Align, Arrange, etc.’ and PIE Metaphors for ‘(morally) right’.” in *Dispersals and Diversification: Linguistic and Archaeological Perspectives on the Early Stages of Indo-European* (edd. Thomas Olander and Matilde Serangeli), 166-78.
- Rieken, Elisabeth (2002). “Ein Lautgesetz und der Obliquusstamm des uridg. Personalpronomens der 1. und 2. Person Plural.” In *Novalis Indogermanica. Festschrift für Günter Neumann zum 80. Geburtstag* (edd. Matthias Fritz and Susanne Zeilfelder). Graz, 407-16.

#### Robert P. Goldman, The University of California at Berkeley

##### Crime and Punishment: Sexual Violence and its Consequences in the Sanskrit Epics

As is widely understood the narratives of the great ancient Indian epic poems, the *Rāmāyaṇa* and the *Mahābhārata*, are centered around and draw much of their emotive force from their episodes of sexual assault upon their respective heroines, Sītā and Draupadī.

Less well known and commented upon, however, is the way in which both of the traditional authors of the works, the ṛṣi Vālmīki and Vyāsa, are seemingly obsessed with the theme of sexual violence, overdetermining it with multiple episodes of abduction and assault against the epic heroines and a striking number of less prominent female characters. Each of the poems’ many acts of such gendered violence is followed by an instantaneous or deferred punishment through which the assailant is subjected to psychological or physical harm from loss of libido up to mutilation and even death. Some of these punishments raise questions about the very

concept of gender, as the poets dwell upon an anxiety of the retributive gender transformation of men into real or transgender women.

I will argue that, through these episodes, the epics register deeply rooted attitudes about these critical issues and serve as vehicles for their dissemination in ways that continue to inflect thinking and practice of gender in South Asian society. These attitudes, of course are by no means unique to the cultures of that region. They are found in all patriarchal cultures around the world. This being the case, the South Asian representation of gendered crime and punishment should be of interest to scholars in virtually all areas of the humanities and social sciences.

**Kashi Gomez, University of California, Berkeley**

*kaveḥ pramādaḥ kṣantavyaḥ*—the poet's 'mistake' ought to be permitted

To critique Kālidāsa is almost unforgiveable. Such an offense is the dark cloud that hangs over the reputation of Ghanaśyāma, and by extension his co-wives, Sundarī and Kamalā. A prolific eighteenth-century commentator and poet, Ghanaśyāma is widely cast as 'vain,' 'overconfident,' and 'conceited.' His co-wives, who authored a joint commentary to supplement that of Ghanaśyāma on Rājaśekhara's play, the *Viddhaśālābhāṇjikā*, are alternately cast as Ghanaśyāma masquerading as his wives or adept stylistic imitators. Examining the stylistic particularities of this commentarial trio, this paper takes up the question of how we interpret critique and criticism in relation to *kāvya*, positing an alternate reading of such critique which is based not in ethics but in socio-linguistic concerns.

Eschewing more practical commentarial functions, this commentarial trio regularly deploys a set of unique commentarial expressions calling attention to Rājaśekhara's apparent linguistic mistakes. Rather than reading these critiques of Rājaśekhara as a sign of vanity in a decadent period of decline, which is implicit in the rhetoric surrounding Ghanaśyāma, I argue that these commentarial interpolations, which rely heavily on literary precedent and the validity of local usage, reorient our reference point for linguistic authority. Sometimes, no reconciliation is offered by the commentators for an incorrect usage, and sometimes we are asked to exercise forbearance or compassion towards a particular usage that stretches grammatical conventions.

The critiques and criticisms of the commentators ask us to reconsider the stake we put in linguistic regulations.

**Camryn Good, University of California, Los Angeles**

Gender Trouble at Elephantine: A Case for Reconstructing Gender at Elephantine through the Mibtahiah Archive

Within the last decade, there has been an increase in gender- and sexuality-based methodological approaches in Ancient Near Eastern studies, a vast improvement from the Victorian roots of our field. However, as these methodological approaches grow in popularity, new problems begin to arise that scholarship must contend with. As a case study of this methodology and its complications, I will reexamine the Mibtahiah legal archive at Elephantine, a collection of legal documents circa 5th century BCE that recount a woman's life and various legal dealings, discussing and recontextualizing the prior work on the subject by Tal Ilan and Bezalel Porten in the light of queer theory. This theoretical approach positions sexuality and gender as categories to be analyzed outside of any assumed heteronormativity. I argue that in using queer theory as a theoretical framework for interpreting the contracts of the Mibtahiah archive, we can better understand and expand the revolutionary work done by previous feminist scholars on Elephantine. Destabilizing the construct of "Woman" and comparing Mibtahiah's economic status with that of the Mesopotamian *nadītu*, creates a more nuanced reconstruction of a feminine gender and the experience of womanhood that is rooted in the specific culture, time, and space of Elephantine.

Consequently, applying queer theory to "non-queer" texts continues to be a promising avenue for future inquiries in Ancient Near Eastern studies; especially as these queer analyses continue to yield highly nuanced understandings of texts, in turn aiding scholars in their development of new knowledge. Thus, this paper serves to not only emphasize the importance of such analyses, but also underscores the role and effect of queer theory on current research, especially that which employs a theoretically feminist approach.

**Jane Gordon, University of Chicago**

The Matter of Time in *Standard Babylonian Gilgamesh* XI 207-241

This paper offers a narratological reading of the pivotal scene in Tablet XI of *Standard Babylonian Gilgamesh* in which Gilgamesh fails to achieve immortality. In this scene, Uta-napishti sets Gilgamesh a test—to stay awake for six days and seven nights—which Gilgamesh instantly fails, thereby proving that he will die. While Gilgamesh sleeps, Uta-napishti and his wife decide that she will bake bread each day that Gilgamesh remains asleep and place it by his head, so that the collective bread loaves, in their varying states of staleness and decay, materially communicate the passage of time.

Building on past scholarship by Ebeling, Oppenheim, Böhl, and Steinert, among others, that investigates the symbolism of sleep and bread in this passage, I illuminate how these individual components of the scene work together to illustrate the epic's theme of mortal time. The actions that occur in the scene, sleeping and preparing food, themselves indicate Gilgamesh's mortality. They constitute both quotidian ways in which human beings spend their lives, and activities undertaken in order to prolong our lives by warding off death. In this passage, sleep and bread thematically recapitulate and engender each other, as each in its own way enacts both human life and its inevitable end in death. Through the manner in which the scene plays out, the text not only tells Gilgamesh, and tells us, that Gilgamesh is mortal, it also narrates what that means through symbolic actions that reflect the mortal experience of time.

**Raashid Satpal Goyal, Cornell University**

Terms Denoting Arabness in the Poetry of Pagan Arabia

In an article that appeared in the *Encyclopædia Biblica* (v. 1, 1899), Theodor Nöldeke listed six verses of poetry in which appears the term *ʿarab*. Although most of these linguistic witnesses or *shawāhid* were, as Nöldeke acknowledged, of little evidentiary value, he found the evidence sufficient to conclude that an extra-tribal concept of Arabness antedated the Islamic period. But the meagreness of such poetic attestations has led most scholars to consider Arabness as a largely Islamic phenomenon. Thus concludes also Peter Webb's *Imagining the Arabs* (2016), a recent, exhaustive study. I here reconsider the question in light of a significant number of

additional poetic materials, particularly *shawāhid* for three other terms besides *‘arab*. These terms—the singular form *‘arīb*, and the plural forms *a‘arīb* and *a‘rāb*—are generally not recognized as variants or close relatives of *‘arab*, as the classical lexicographic tradition prescribes for them entirely divergent meanings. I will argue, however, that the transformation of this vocabulary as reflected in Islamic scholarship modifies or fails to correctly interpret pre-Islamic usage. In the antiquated idiom of the *jāhilī* poets, as their poetry makes abundantly clear, the terms were recognized as generic identifiers of Arabness. It is consequently to be questioned whether Islamic developments contributed more to congealing a budding sense of Arab identity or to altering the meaning of Arabness to accord with new realities.

### **Laura Grestenberger Austrian Academy of Sciences**

#### Revisiting voice and verbalizing morphology in Indo-Iranian denominal verbs

Denominal verbs in Indo-Iranian (and other Indo-European languages) exhibit a great deal of variation with respect to their voice morphology, telicity, and Aktionsart. The aim of this paper is to reassess Indo-Iranian denominal *(a)ya*-stems and to provide some preliminary conclusions as to the expected 1) argument structure, 2) voice morphology, and 3) *Aktionsart* of their different discernible subclasses, with a focus on Vedic formations.

Denominal verbs have been discussed by, e.g., Jamison (1983), Tucker (1988), Insler (1997), and Rau (2009), but the relationship between voice morphology, *Aktionsart*, and argument structure in these verbs has not been addressed systematically up until now. While some generalizations have emerged, e.g., that causative-factitive denominal and deadjectival verbs alternate between active and middle endings like primary formations (in line with cross-linguistic observations), other verb classes are far less transparent in this regard. In particular, the behavior of the “act like”-class and of denominal and deadjectival experienter verbs is not well understood and rarely discussed. The former tend to surface with middle morphology in related languages (e.g., in Latin) and in Indo-Iranian itself (cf. Ved. *indrayante* ‘they act like Indra’, *vṛṣāyāte* ‘acts like a bull’, *vīráyate* ‘acts like a hero’), while some derivationally and semantically similar denominal verbs like *bhiṣajyá-* ‘heal’ (*bhiṣáj-* ‘healer’; Av. *biṣaziia-* ‘heal’) take active morphology.

A second issue concerns the transitivity of denominal verbs, that is, their ability to take direct objects, both for the “act like”-class and the quasi-“object incorporation” class, e.g., Ved. *mantráyate* ‘speaks mantras’ (*mantra-*), *vasnayáti* ‘negotiates (a price)’ (*vasná-* ‘price’), etc.

In addition to these issues, I will address the variation between Vedic and Avestan in the treatment of these classes, and comment on the theoretical implications and the comparative reconstruction of these verbs and their voice morphology.

### **Frank Griffel, Yale University**

Two Conflicting Concepts of the Relationship Between Philosophy and Revealed Religion in Ibn al-Akfānī (d. 749/1348) and Tashköprüzādeh (d. 968/1561)

In my recent book *The Formation of Post-Classical Philosophy in Islam* I try to show that a particular concept of relationship between philosophy and revealed religion develops during the 6<sup>th</sup>/12<sup>th</sup> century in the Islamic East. According to this concept, which emerges in the oeuvre of authors such as Fakhr al-Din al-Rāzī (d. 606/1210), philosophy is seen as a parallel approach that exists side-by-side of revealed religion and the sciences connected to it. Al-Rāzī, for instance, wrote books of *kalām*, where he defends key elements of an Ash‘arite reading of revelation, such as God’s free will and the temporal creation of the world, and he wrote “philosophical books” (*kutub ḥikmiyya*) where he argues in favor of major elements in Avicenna’s philosophical system, such as a self-necessitating God and an eternal world with no beginning in time. The concept that emerges in the Islamic east puts *ḥikma* and *kalām* on an equal footing and, without resolving the conflict between them, assumes that humans are unable to decide which of the two is ultimately true.

Parallel to this development, Averroes (Ibn Rushd, d. 1198) in his *Faṣl al-maqāl* also develops a pattern of relationship between philosophy and revealed religion. Based on al-Fārābī (d. 339/950–51), Averroes teaches that revealed religion is inferior to philosophy as it is a mere means of conveying philosophical truths to those who are intellectually unable to pursue it.

In this paper I will look at the catalogue of the sciences by the Mamluk thinker Ibn al-Akfānī (d. 749/1348) and show how he applies Averroes’ model of the relationship between philosophy and religion. Yet when the Ottoman thinker Tashköprüzādeh (d. 968/1561) adapts certain passages from Ibn al-Akfānī’s catalogue in his own ordering of the sciences, he changes them so that they express the concept developed in the Islamic east.

Beatrice Gruendler, Freie Universität Berlin

Quotable Mutanabbī

Al-Mutanabbī (d. 354/965), one may claim, is the classical Arabic poet who most permeates Arabic language and literature and has penetrated into its deepest fibre. Since the fourth/ tenth century., he figures in debates about *sariqāt* in classical Arabic poetics, whose parameters were honed based on his innovations, and the development of the concept of metaphor, notably in al-Jurjānī's *Asrār al-balāgha* is largely based on his poetic images. Yet his *qaṣīdas* are riddled with linguistic and rhetorical intricacies, which puzzled at times even his (numerous) commentators. Here I want to focus on several early collections that are devoted to al-Mutanabbī, selecting such verses that were quotable as discrete entities, condensing universal meanings into few words, and at the same time easy to understand.

These microtexts then traveled through Arabic writings across the centuries. Collections to be discussed are the *Amthāl* by al-Ṣāhib b. 'Abbad (d. 385/995) and the epistle by Pseudo- al-Hātimī (written at the end of the sixth/twelfth century), the latter matching the verses with prose maxims attributed to Aristotle. A further list of proverbial sayings by al-Mutanabbī is given by al-Tha'ālibī (d. 430/1039) in his *Yatīma*, cut down to mere hemistichs. To this one can add the role of al-Mutanabbī's verses used as examples in the *Talkhīṣ*, or *Middle Commentary*, of Aristotle's *Poetics* by Ibn Rushd (d. 595/1198), which is more of a creative adaptation of Aristotle's work to the givens of classical Arabic poetry, and in which al-Mutanabbī outnumbers all other cited poets. The purpose of this paper is to establish overlaps and differences between these reuses of his verse, the underlying motives of their selection, and the impact this had on the poet's reception.

Charles G. Häberl, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey

Binding the Lion: Numerology in the Mandaean Tradition

To this day, Mandaeans employ two systems for representing quantities: the familiar decimal system, which governs words and phrases (e.g., *tren* 'two', *esro* 'ten', *tressar* 'twelve', etc.), and

a unique notational system employing the 22 letters of the Mandaean alphabet (e.g., a = 1, b = 2, bi = 12). This latter system is used exclusively for numerological purposes, e.g., assigning *malwaši* ('Zodiacal') names to reflect the astrological circumstances of the hour of birth, and divining the future of those so named.

Significantly, Mandaean numerology employs a hybrid decimal-duodecimal system, which it applies to the morae of the syllable rather than the individual segments denoted by the alphabet, e.g., the names ram (RA.M) and haua (HA.UA) both have a numerological value of 1, which is calculated by adding up the values of the morae and consulting the digit 0 position,  $(148_{12} + 1_{12}) + (34_{12}) = 181_{12}$  and  $(5_{12} + 1_{12}) + (6_{12} + 1_{12}) = 11_{12}$  respectively, rather than  $241_{10}$  and  $13_{10}$  as in other more familiar systems from the same region. Although the system is functionally duodecimal, its ultimate decimal origins are illustrated by the symbols denoting the digit 1 position, e.g., i =  $10_{10}$  rather than  $10_{12}$  (=  $12_{10}$ ), k =  $20_{10}$  (=  $18_{12}$ ) rather than  $20_{12}$  (=  $24_{10}$ ), etc.

Prior to Stefana Drower's translation of the *Book of the Zodiac* (1949), almost nothing had been published concerning Mandaean numerology (Mandaic gimat aria, from Greek *gēmetriā*), and little has been contributed to its study over the intervening years. Those scholars who have addressed this work and did not deprecate its value for the study of the occult sciences have focused on forms of divination other than numerology (e.g., astromancy, somatomancy, etc.), and particularly how they relate to the Mesopotamian traditions that preceded them. In this communication, I shall illustrate this system for the first time and situate it in its proper context.

### **Dr. Hanan Hamza, Iraq Museum and Ali Hussein Mohsin Iraq Museum**

#### **The Topography of Ninḥursag's Mound Field and its Irrigation Facilities**

Mound fields are man-made hills which are constructed by farmers, and the workers whom they hired, to elevate the ground and plot their fields upon those mounds. Near the mound they would build a reservoir (to control the flooding) along with a water distributor and a pond to collect excess water. Our investigation of mound-fields incorporates 17 Ur III texts recorded in BDTNS as well as one unpublished text housed in the Iraq Museum (IM 183038) which records a receipt for planting seeds (Ur-E11-e) in the Ninḥursag field in the city of Umma.



In addition to analyzing mound fields in written texts, we also examined evidence from archaeological excavations of this type of ancient agricultural practice. Not only did we find many archaeological articles to strengthen our point, but various professors who have worked on excavations and serving sites in Iraq informed us that mound fields were still in use by indigenous farmers until the 1970s. They, furthermore, explained the purpose of making mound fields, and why farmers only recently stopped constructing these fields, and what they replaced them with. To conclude our investigation, we conducted a visit to College of Agriculture at the University of Baghdad where we asked professors who are specialists in Iraqi agriculture and land reclamation to confirm our ideas about mound fields. Mr. Ali Mohsin presenting the results of this unpublished research as a paper on the behalf of both of us as co-authors at the AOS meeting with accompanying PowerPoint presentation, included photographs, animations, and illustration.

### **Rebecca Hasselbach-Andee, University of Chicago**

#### **Eblaite Lexicon: The Seemingly “Mixed” Character of Eblaite Particles**

While Eblaite (2370-2320 BCE) phonology and morphology exhibit a fairly uniform system, meaning a system with hardly any by-forms, the lexicon of Eblaite is much more diverse. It contains lexemes that can be associated with Akkadian, that is, East Semitic, and lexemes that are only known from West Semitic. A representative sub-set of lexemes that show this type of diversity are particles. This talk will look at conjunctions and, in particular, prepositions, that have more than one form. The distribution of different forms (for example the prepositions *in* ‘in, by’ and *mīn* ‘in’) can help us distinguish different registers of the underlying language that are used in particular settings, such as literary versus non-literary texts. Other prepositions, such as *ana* ‘to, for’, seem to be primarily used in non-local texts and thus indicate an awareness of registers appropriate for local versus non-local use. Once the different usages are identified, the lexicon in general will be compared to the findings based on particles and be integrated into a broader sociolinguistic model. With this approach, the paper goes beyond previous analyses of Eblaite who commonly treat Eblaite as a uniform language. Instead, this paper claims that Eblaite is more diverse, and that the linguistic diversity found in the language might be caused by outside influences such as language contact and/or different registers, some of which were influenced by languages that were not native to Ebla.

## Bibliography:

- Archi, Alfonso. 2003. Archival Record-Keeping at Ebla 2400-2350 BC. In *Ancient Archives and Archival Traditions. Concepts of Record-Keeping in the Ancient World*, edited by M. Brosius, 17-36. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Archi, A. 2006. Eblaite in its geographical and historical context. In *The Akkadian Language in its Semitic Context*, edited by G. Deutscher and N.J.C. Kouwenberg; 96-109. Leiden: Nederlands Instituut voor het Nabije Oosten.
- Archi, A. 2015a. The Chronology of Ebla and Synchronisms with Abarsal, Tuttul, Nagar and Nadaba, Mari, Kish. *ARCANE* 3: 163-180.
- Biggs, R.D. 1981. Ebla and Abu Salabikh: The Linguistic and Literary Aspects. In *La lingua di Ebla: Atti del convegno internazionale (Napoli, 21-23 aprile 1980)*, edited by L. Cagni; 121-133. Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale.
- Butterlin, P. 2018. From Mari to Ebla, Designs of Interculturality? In *Ebla and Beyond*, edited by P. Matthiae, F. Pinnock and M. d'Andrea; 141-167. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Catagnoli, Amalia. 2012. *La grammatica della lingua di Ebla*. Firenze: Dipartimento di Scienze dell'Antichità, Medioevo e Rinascimento e Linguistica.
- Fronzaroli, Pelio. 1984. The Eblaic Lexicon: Problems and Appraisal. In *Studies on the Language of Ebla*, edited by P. Fronzaroli; 117-157. Firenze: Istituto di Linguistica e di Lingue Orientale, Università di Firenze.
- Fronzaroli, Pelio. 2014. "Thus Spake the Man of Mari (*ARET*XIII 15 v. I 4-8, III 13-17). Scribal Schools and Chancery Language in the Ebla Texts." In *Linguistic, Oriental and Ethiopian Studies in Memory of Paolo Marrassini*, edited by Alessandro Bausi, Alessandro Gori, and Gianfrancesco Lusini, 417-444. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Kogan, Leonid and Krebernik, Manfred. 2021. Eblaite. In *History of the Akkadian Language, Volume 1*, edited by Juan-Pablo Vita; 664-989. Leiden: Brill.
- Pinnock, Frances. 2006. Ebla and Ur: Relations, Exchanges and Contacts between Two Great Capitals of the Ancient Near East. *Iraq* 68: 85-97.
- Tonietti, Maria V. 2013. *Aspetti del sistema preposizionale dell'Eblaite*. Venezia: Ca'Foscari.

The Aorist in Vedic Sanskrit does not ordinarily have imperfective meaning, nor does it typically take primary endings. However, there are a series of root Aorists that have primary endings in the *Ṛgveda*, as well as one thematic Aorist, as follows:

(1) Aorists with primary endings in the *Ṛgveda*

- a. *kṛtháh*, *kṛtha* (e.g., *RV* X.97.9d)
- b. *gathá* (*RV* VIII.20.16)
- c. *bhūtháh*, *bhūtaḥ* e.g., (*RV* VI.67.5c)
- d. *takṣatha* (*RV* IV.36.3d, X.53.10b; see Narten 1964:124–5)

In addition, there are several *ā*-final root-Aorist stems that are attested with primary endings:

(2) *ā*-final root Aorists with primary endings in the *Ṛgveda* and *Atharvaveda*

- a. *dāti* (*RV* IV.8.3c, V.48.5d, VI.24.2d, VII.15.12d, VII.42.4d)
- b. *dhāti* (*RV* II.38.1c, IV.55.1d, VII.90.3b)
- c. *pānti* (*RV* II.11.14d), *pāsi* (*RV* I.134.5fg); *pātháh* (*AV* VII.29.1)
- d. *sthāti* (*RV* II.31.3c)

While the forms built to *ā*-final roots in (2) may be understood formally as subjunctives (e.g., *dhāti* < \**dʰeh₁eti*), several of them occur in highly presential contexts (Whitney 1889:301, §836a), favoring a non-subjunctive interpretation (e.g., *pānti* they are drinking at *RV* II.11.14cd; cf. Jamison 2015:ad loc.).

Hoffmann (1967:111) has demonstrated that the forms in (1) above serve a particular role, namely as functional injunctives in paradigmatic slots where the formal injunctive is morphologically identical to the imperative. So, because speakers associated injunctives like 2PL. *kṛtá* with the imperatival meaning ‘make!’, there seems to have been a sense that the gnomic-habitual functions typical of injunctives were not readily accessible to these forms. In

order to convey gnomic-habitual meaning, the primary endings were added, creating a series of hybrid Aorists with primary endings used functionally as injunctives, of the type 2PL. *kr̥tha* 'you make (characteristically)'.

I propose that the forms in (2) are motivated along the same lines as those that Hoffmann (1967:111) proposes for those in (1) and are thus functionally injunctive. The root Aorists built to *dhā-* 'put' and *dā-* 'give', for instance, lack imperative forms, so the injunctives *dhāt* and *dāt* fill in in this role of their respective paradigms (Hoffmann 1967:256, 261–2). It seems that the imperatival meaning was so strongly associated with these injunctives that other meanings generally available to injunctive forms (e.g., gnomic-habitual) were not accessible. Accordingly, primary endings could be added to these stems in place of the secondary ones in order to disambiguate their function as gnomic-habitual, thus producing *dhāti*, *dāti*, and so on.

Further, I compare forms of this kind to the verb *tezzi* 'says' in Hittite. This verb (original sense '\*puts') corresponds formally to Ved. *dhāti* 'puts', as it were < \**dʰeh₂-ti*. While I do not suggest that this correspondence shows the form \**dʰeh₂-ti* to be reconstructible for PIE, it does indicate that there was nothing wrong *in principle* with the combination of root-Aorist stems with the primary endings in Indo-European. The general scarcity of such forms is explained by the fact that there were typically better options available to the languages for use with primary endings, namely derived Present stems (e.g., *dád dhāti* 'puts', 'is putting').

## References

- Hoffmann, Karl. 1967. *Der Injunktiv im Veda: Eine synchronische Funktionsuntersuchung*. Heidelberg: Winter.
- Jamison, Stephanie W. 2015–. *Rigveda Translation: Commentary*. Accessed 15 May 2021. WordPress. <http://rigvedacommentary.alc.ucla.edu/>.
- Narten, Johanna. 1964. *Die Sigmatischen Aoriste im Veda*. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.
- Whitney, William Dwight. 1889. *A Sanskrit Grammar*. Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel.

**David Hollenberg , University of Oregon**

The Nusayri Teaching Circles of 10<sup>th</sup>-11<sup>th</sup> century Iraq and Syria: A Portrait

In his magisterial *Humanism in the Renaissance of Islam*, Joel Kraemer describes the different types of voluntary associations that flourished under the Buyids in Iraq in the fourth/tenth century. Among them were “schools,” informal circles constituted around a teacher, who served as an educator and spiritual guide who provided a path to perfection and felicity (Kraemer, *Humanism*, xii). Recently, interest in medieval Islamic esotericism has, likewise, attempted to situate works of allegorical works within the socio-political context in which it was disseminated. For example, in his important recent article “Esotericist Reading Communities and the Early Circulation of the Sufi Occultist Ahmad al-Buni's Works,” Noah Gardiner argues that al-Buni's compositions circulated in circles characterized by a “*batin*” (esoteric) Koranic exegesis intended for a spiritual elite, the claim that the group alone knows the truth; and practices to protect the secret knowledge from falling into the hands of those outside the initiated community. While Gardiner's theoretical framing is a model of clarity, the sources he uses are limited for describing the character of these esoteric reading circles.

In this presentation, I describe a source that provides an extensive portrait of esoteric circles, a hitherto unpublished fifth/eleventh-century Nusayri doctrinal source called *Manhaj al-‘ilm wal-bayān wa-nuzhat al-sama’ wal-‘ayan* (The method of knowledge and clarification and the pleasure of hearing and witnessing) which the tradition ascribes to the Nusayri sage named Muhammad b. ‘Isa ‘Ismat al-Dawlah. The *Manhaj* is an anthology of anecdotes and doctrines from the preceding two centuries, often placed in the context of circles of spiritually elite initiates of Ja’far al-Sadiq (d. 765) and his students. This paper will explore what this source can teach us on the content and social organization of Nusayrism in the period, and, more broadly, the gestalt of esotericist quietism in medieval Islam.

**Anahita Hoose, University of California, Los Angeles**

Syntactic and Functional Evidence for *Āpat* as an Ex-Perfect

A semantic idiosyncrasy may preserve a clue to the origin of the thematic aorist *āpat* to the Sanskrit root √*āp* ‘obtain’, along with its compounds (*prāpat* etc.). In the Śunaḥśepa story (*Aitareya Brāhmaṇa* VII.13-18), *prāpat* (VII.14) is the only aorist not to encode a result state.

Instead, it is perfective, in which regard it patterns with perfects, the perfect being the normal narrative tense in the form of Middle Vedic represented by this text. As suggested by Stephanie Jamison (p.c.), *āpat* may be in origin a remodeled perfect (< *āpa*). The *Aitareya Brāhmaṇa* form immediately precedes *tam* 'him', perhaps suggesting the origin of the reanalysis: sequences like *āpa tam* could have been understood as *āpat tam* etc. The thematic aorist is generally not a particularly common type ("taken, in [the Vedas] and [the Brāhmaṇas] together, by nearly eighty roots" [Macdonell 1916: 167]). My presentation will review the attestations of *āpat*, *prāpat* and other compounds in the Vedas and Brāhmaṇas, considering the syntactic contexts and aspectual functions of all tokens.

Cardona (2002), who holds that Pāṇini's functional distinction between the three finite pasts reflects linguistic reality as seen in Vedic texts, correctly states that the Śunaḥśepa story "shows near perfect conformity" with the Pāṇinian system (Cardona 2002: 235). The sole inconvenient detail is the imperfect *prāpnot* (also at VII.14), which violates Pāṇini's rule that the imperfect is restricted to the prehodiernal past and appears in a formulaic context where multiple other passages have aorists. If *prāpat* is a remarked perfect and functions like a perfect, this may explain the imperfect's employment in a context where an aorist is expected, assuming that no old aorist is available. Explaining this deviation from the Pāṇinian system further confirms the reality of the system where no such special lexical factors apply.

## References

Cardona, George. 2002. The Old Indo-Aryan Tense System. *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 122.235–243.

Macdonell, Arthur Anthony. 1916. *A Vedic Grammar for Students*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Tianyun Hua, University of California Davis

Between Realism and Utopianism: World Travel and National Dream of Chinese Labor in Late Qing Fiction

While world travel seems to be a priority that only belongs to the upper class or intellectuals, this paper focuses on a larger but often forgotten group, the laborers who were sent overseas to work. Labor mobility was previously considered as a silent and passive factor in global colonization and imperialization. But when the late Qing Chinese laborers regain their subjectivity, an ultimately different travel literature and more complex social stories begin to unfold. The two representative late-Qing novels focusing on the Chinese laborers overseas, *Bitter Society* (1904) and *Golden World* (1907), depict the reasons why they choose or are forced to go overseas, how they travel among various destinations by plan or by accident, how they work there (usually under inhuman mistreatments), and how they fight or escape. *Bitter Society* provides a realistic sketch of lower-class people's miserable lives in Qing Dynasty and their painful journeys from Suzhou to Peru, from San Francisco to Hong Kong. *Golden World* combines many different genres including speculative fiction, social fiction, martial-arts fiction. Its realistic stroke depicts the tangled power relationships among laborers, merchants, provinces, and governments, while the imaginative stroke depicts a utopia similar to the peach blossom spring which not only survives but also thrives in the dangerous modern world. Examined under the historical context of The Chinese Exclusion Act in the US (released in 1882 and made permanent in 1902) and the reactions to it in China's society (including related writings of Liang Qichao and Lin Shu), this paper further shows that the literary writings of Chinese laborers overseas reveal anxiety about modernization, generate the national identity and nationalism, and contain paradoxical attitudes towards colonization.

Tariq Jaffer, Amherst College

Evidential Miracles as Proof of the Prophet's Truthfulness: A Study of the Meaning and Role of *Tasdīq* in *Mu'jizāt* Discourse

In his autobiography, *Al-Munqidh*, Ghāzālī (d. 1111) warns his reader against accepting Muhammad's miracles as evidential of his truthfulness. It is now well established that Ghāzālī, in order to dispel any doubts that his reader might have about existence of prophecy and Muhammad's prophethood, developed a "proof" which verifies *that* prophethood exists and that Muhammad's truthfulness could be measured by the prescriptions that he issued for Islamic ritual and practice. Ghāzālī's method of leading his reader to truth in this area has been studied (Menn, Frank, Griffel), and its institutionalization into later Sunnī thought has also been elaborated (Jaffer).

But before Ghāzālī called into question whether *mu'jizāt* could serve as evidence of the prophet's truthfulness, the idea of miracle as proof was discussed intensively by different school traditions of *kalām*—Mu'tazilites, Ash'arites, and Māturīdites. This study focuses on the meaning, significance, and role of *tasdīq* ("verification") in *kalām* schools from the time of Ash'arī (d. 935) until Jurjānī (d. 1413)—*tasdīq* being the divine act which verifies the truthfulness of one who claims to be a prophet.

This study analyzes the notion of *tasdīq* in relation to broader considerations about *mu'jizāt* within different schools of *kalām*, including the criteria that *mutakallimūn* list for the realization of *mu'jizāt* and theological theories of divine and evidential signs. The objectives of this study are: (a) to determine the meaning and role of *tasdīq* in these discussions, taking into account that *mutakallimūn* even within single school traditions were divided on this; (b) to chart process through which the notion of *tasdīq* was worked into conceptualizations of *mu'jizāt*; and (c) to discuss how the principle of *tasdīq* was contested within the different schools of *kalām*.



**Stephanie Jamison, University of California, Los Angeles**

Another, Unrecognized, *cvī* Construction in the Rigveda: Philological and Literary Aspects

The *cvī* construction, well known and widespread in Classical Sanskrit, is far rarer in Vedic. In particular there is only one likely example in the Rig Veda, the striking form *akhkhalīkītya* ‘making ribbit / making syllables’ in the “Frog” hymn, RV VII.103.3, identified by Thieme (1954), though already suggested as a possible example by Whitney (Grammar, p. 401). In this presentation I will identify a second possible RVic example, found in the finale to the dazzling ākhyāna hymn X.28 attributed to the tricky poet Vasukra (RV X.27–29). The phrase in question, *suśāmī abhūvan*, is generally analyzed as containing the instrumental singular of the stem *suśāmī-* ‘good labor’ which would double, etymologically, morphologically, and syntactically, the immediately preceding instrumental plural *śāmībhiḥ*. This interpretation produces a flat-footed pleonastic “with labors, with good labor” that is unworthy of the pyrotechnics that precede it in the hymn. For literary reasons, then, it’s worth taking another look at *suśāmī* in this passage. I analyze it as belonging to the indeclinable *śām* ‘weal, luck’, reformed into *suśāmī* to serve in a *cvī* construction with √*bhū*, meaning ‘become lucky’.

The phrase will be discussed in the context of its verse and its hymn, with some remarks about its place in the developing *cvī* construction in Vedic—along with a brief and cautionary treatment of the supposed prehistory of the formation, which, however, I have discussed elsewhere.

**Joshua Jeffers, University of Pennsylvania**

Scribal Notations on Tablets Bearing Ashurbanipal’s Royal Inscriptions

Ashurbanipal, the last great king of the Neo-Assyrian Empire, has significantly more cuneiform tablets that bear royal inscriptions preserved for his reign than does each of his predecessors. These tablets mainly represent copies or drafts of inscriptions that were either written or intended to be written on various media, such as clay prisms to serve as foundation documents, objects to be dedicated to various deities, steles to be erected, and epigraphs to be inscribed on palace walls. While the contents of many of these tablets have been known for some time,

scholars have not closely examined the scribal notations on the left edges and in the margins or blank spaces of the tablets that were generated during the scribes' editorial activities. These notations provide us with a glimpse of how the scribes conceptualized the contents of the tablets and how they modified their texts, though in some cases the scribes employed notations without indicating what function they were supposed to serve.

### **Hureyre Kam, Yale University**

Al-Māturīdī an atomist? – Deconstruction of a widespread misreading.

Al-Māturīdī (d. 333/944), alongside al-Ash'arī (d.324/936), is regarded as a thought leader and founding figure of Sunnī theology. While we are very well informed about al-Ash'arī's works and his theological worldview, we knew very little about the theology of al-Māturīdī until recently. Before the Kitāb at-Tawḥīd, his *summa theologica*, was re-discovered and had been edited in the 1970's, we could only put together an estimate on his theological positions from the works of his successors such as Abū l-Mu'īn an-Nasafī (d. 508/1115). Now that we can study his thoughts first hand, it becomes evident that we have to revise our understanding of his theological positions. In this paper I am suggesting that we have to differentiate between al-Māturīdī himself and the school of thought that is named after him.

The Māturīdīya, which followed an-Nasafī as the actual founder of this school of thought, adapted atomism as a methodological framework for theological discourse. This was the kind of atomism that was developed and implemented by Mu'tazilite scholars. Al-Ash'arī, as an ex-Mu'tazilite, also adopted atomism as the basis for systematic-theological discussions. This is why atomism became a standard for Sunnī theologians in the formative period of Islamic theology (2nd–4th/8th–10.th centuries). The secondary literature on al-Māturīdī that is currently available still has a distorted perception on his views regarding atomism and consequently on his theological concepts. His Kitāb at-Tawḥīd is still interpreted through the lens of later Māturīdī scholars. In discussing four major arguments, this paper will demonstrate that al-Māturīdī was in clear rejection of atomism as a methodological foundation for systematic theology, as he was trying to fight back the Mu'tazilī influence in Transoxania.

**Sravani Kanamarlapudi, University of Texas at Austin**

Transposing Arjuna in Space and Time: Reframing Tiṇṇaṇ in a Telugu Sthalapurāṇa

The story of Tiṇṇaṇ—a Śaiva devotee famously known as Kaṇṇappar for his ultimate act of gouging out his eye to replace the bleeding eye of the Śivaliṅga of Śrīkāḷahasti, an important Śaiva temple site located in the Telugu-Tamil borderlands of south India—is “among the most well known and oft-depicted in South Indian literature and temple iconography” (Monius 2004). For instance, Tiṇṇaṇ’s story features in texts such as Cēkkiḷār’s *Periyapurāṇam* (twelfth century Tamil), Pāḷkuriki Somanātha’s *Basavapurāṇamu* (thirteenth century Telugu), Dhūrjaṭi’s *Śrīkāḷahastimāhātmyamu* (sixteenth century Telugu), and Civappirakāca Cuvāmikaḷ’s *Cīkāḷattippurāṇam* (seventeenth century Tamil). While these depictions maintain the core narrative, they include variations that are important to pay attention to as they reveal interesting information about their authors and the worlds that they inhabit.

Drawing upon Anne Monius’s (2004) and Whitney Cox’s (2005) interpretation of this story as it appears in the *Periyapurāṇam*, this paper will throw light on the story as it appears in two Śrīkāḷahasti Sthalapurāṇas, *Śrīkāḷahastimāhātmyamu* and *Cīkāḷattippurāṇam*. After presenting an overview of the story from these texts, I will particularly focus on probing into why the *Śrīkāḷahastimāhātmyamu* suddenly starts to reframe the tribal hunter Tiṇṇaṇ as the reincarnation of Arjuna from the *Mahābhārata*, and on what this investigation reveals about the authorial and cultural anxieties involved in this reframing.

**Tynan Kelly, University of Chicago**

Explicit Matn Criticism in Gharīb al-ḥadīth: Language and Sunnah According to Abū ‘Ubayd and Ibn Qutaybah

A thorn in the side of many scholars of early Islam is the apparent lack of criticism of *ḥadīth*’s content (*matn*) among Muslim scholars. The received wisdom is that the only concern of transmitters was verification of the chain of transmission (*isnād*), which connects a given *ḥadīth* back to the Prophet. While there is truth to this characterization, it misses out on an important aspect of *ḥadīth* criticism that emerged during the 3<sup>rd</sup>/8<sup>th</sup> century at the same time *isnād* criticism was maturing and the codification of the corpus beginning in earnest. Many works with the title

*gharīb al-ḥadīth* (unfamiliar words in *ḥadīth*) were produced at this time; the specialized lexica did far more than gloss ancient forgotten words in the corpus. In these works, we find detailed examinations of the phonetics and morphology of these words, particularly how they relate to transmission. Furthermore, the task of these works was not simply providing glosses and explanations for these words but to situate them anthropologically and aesthetically in Arab society at the dawn of Islam. That is, works on *gharīb al-ḥadīth* endeavored to authenticate the Arabic character of *ḥadīth*, expunging linguistic anachronisms down to the letter and tracing the emergence of a distinct Islamic *sunnah*. In this paper, I show that this development happened early and is perceptible in the *gharīb al-ḥadīth* works of Abū ‘Ubayd al-Qāsim ibn al-Sallām (d. 224/838) and Ibn Qutaybah al-Dīnawārī (d. 276/889). These works set an example that was followed by lexicographers and jurists for centuries afterwards and still loom large over our understanding of the semantics of *ḥadīth* today.

**Sinae Kim, Princeton University**

From Codicology to Sociality: A Study of Dunhuang Manuscript S.3872

The Dunhuang manuscript S.3872, a late medieval Chinese scroll of the Buddhist sūtra lecture text (*jiangjing wen*) on the first chapter of the *Vimalakīrti Sūtra*, has a non-standard way of composition compared to other surviving manuscripts of the same genre. The physical features of the manuscript—its variously sized panels, traces of cutting and pasting, signs of multiple handwritings, and correction marks—indicate that multiple people had engaged in the copying, writing, proofreading, editing, and rearranging of the manuscript as well as its performance. The genre of sūtra lecture texts, which are written scripts or lecture notes Buddhist proselytizing monks used to lecture mainly for the laity on Buddhist scriptures, consists of three sequential subgenres, namely, scriptural passages (*jing*), the preacher’s explanation in prose (*bai*), and the preacher’s paraphrasing in verse (*chang*). This paper pays particular attention to the untypical way of the composition of the scroll, which reveals that sūtra lecture texts were not always copied or composed sequentially from *jing* through *bai* to *chang* by the same person. Based on the physical features of the manuscript, the paper argues that multiple preachers had inserted their exegeses into the existing scroll, on which scriptural passages and the paraphrasing of them in verse are already written by different hands. This paper concludes by further arguing that not only the content of the text but also the physical features of the manuscript can attest to

the fluidity and spontaneity of the preacher's explanation in prose. The manuscript thus offers a glimpse into the communal nature of Buddhist popular preaching.

**Martin Braun, Hannes A. Fellner, Bernhard Koller, Austrian Academy of Sciences**

A Digital Research Tool for the Study of Central Asian Brāhmī

The purpose of this paper is to introduce and demonstrate a web application for the study of Central Asian text corpora, including Sanskrit, Saka, and Tocharian. The development of this application constitutes a major aspect of the research project “The Characters that Shaped the Silk Road,” which, starting from the seminal work by Lore Sander (Sander 1968), aims at developing a new paleographic classification system for the various forms of Central Asian Brāhmī. The web application serves the function of providing a platform through which scholars can access and query the project database in a way that can be tailored to their own research questions. In anticipation of its public release, which is scheduled shortly after the AOS meeting, we present some of the main features of the application with a special focus on its applications for paleographic research. At the core of this functionality lies the systematic association of the narrow transcription of an *akṣara* with its precise location on a photograph, which enables queries that return images of the *akṣaras* themselves rather than mere transcriptions. In Fellner, Koller, and Braun 2019 we demonstrate how a database with these properties has already led to new insights into the different developmental stages of Central Asian Brāhmī. We now show how our web application can be used in order to perform similar queries in a much more flexible and open-ended fashion. By cross-referencing paleographic queries with other types of properties associated with the digital text editions, it becomes possible to compare multiple tokens and variants of the same *akṣara* within user-specified sets of data, including individual manuscript fragments, fragments found in specific regions, as well as data sets spanning multiple languages. Our goal is therefore to provide the field with a tool that is flexible enough to tackle research questions far beyond the scope of our own project.

Fellner, Hannes A., Bernhard Koller, and Martin Braun (2019). “Digital Approaches to the Linguistic and Paleographic History of Tocharian B.” *Proceedings of the 30th Annual UCLA Indo-European Conference*. Ed. by David M. Goldstein, Stephanie W. Jamison, and Brent Vine. Bremen: Hempen: 61–76.

Sander, Lore (1968). *Paläographisches zu den Sanskrithandschriften der Berliner Turfansammlung*. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

**Gina Konstantopoulos, University of California Los Angeles**

Those Distant Days: Constructing and Defining Time in Sumerian and Akkadian Texts

Time is represented in a number of ways in Sumerian and Akkadian texts, serving a variety of functions. In her 1983 article, "Ethnopoetry and the Enmerkar Epics," Adele Berlin presented three distinct temporal settings within Mesopotamian literary texts, particularly myths and epics: historical time, mythic time, and fabulous time, where time could loop back on itself, flow slowly, or not move at all – a category unsurprisingly often featured in creation myths and cosmological texts. This paper analyzes the narrative functions of different types of temporal and chronological frameworks, following the tripartite division discussed by Berlin. Though fabulous and mythic time are most often found in literary texts such as myths and epics, we may find episodes of more fluid time embedded within texts that otherwise adhere to linear chronological structures. Here, I focus in particular on the ways in which a number of temporal settings may exist within the space of one text, and how the text transitions from one definition or "type" of temporal setting to another. Even royal inscriptions, which most often appear firmly set in historical time, may anchor themselves to earlier, more open-ended, chronological forms. Examining these shifts provides further insights into the texts themselves, as well as how time could be manipulated and utilized in such narrative spaces.

**David Larsen, New York University**

Banausic craft in early Arabic poetry: Hands at work

No people on earth is innocent of handcrafts, but for Bedouin nomads, a radical estrangement from the crafts is alleged by every scholar to write about them since al-Jāḥiẓ and Ibn Khaldūn. Descriptions of artisan labor in early Arabic poetry are therefore of high interest for the views they give of life outside the nomadic world. Sometimes, craftworkers are mentioned by way of metonymy for crafted things the poet is describing (in the way that the swordsmith is an attribute of the poet's sword). Another way that craftworkers are represented is in similes and metaphors for bodies in motion, and very often these tropes are centered on the workers' hands. As such

they form a subset of the motif I call “hands at work and play” (exemplified by the “hands of a gambler” simile in the Mu‘allaqa of Imru’ al-Qays), in which all sorts of dynamism are described by similitude to the movement of a pair of hands. By attending to these fleeting images, it is possible to attend to banausic labor of the pre-Islamic period and after, including the work of women weavers (especially matweavers) and other professions that early Arabic poetry does not otherwise represent.

### **Jaehyuk Lee, Ohio State University**

#### **Identity Crisis of Literati and Romanticization of Enforced Freedom: Qiao Ji’s “the Songs of Fisherman”**

The present essay explores Qiao Ji’s 喬吉 (c. 1280–c. 1345) “Songs of Fisherman” (Yufuci 漁父詞), which consist of twenty colloquial songs (*sanqu* 散曲). Ever since the prototype of fisherman was built as a symbol of reclusion in *Zhuangzi* 莊子 and the Songs of Chu (*chuci* 楚辭), it has developed into numerous types of literary characters in specific social and cultural contexts. Compiling a genealogy of fishermen, Chinese scholars have traced its origin, enumerated individual cases, and categorized them into several major types, such as a Taoist hermit, a refugee from political upheaval, a temporary recluse with political aspiration, an official who retired after remarkable achievement.

However, the fisherman in Qiao Ji’s *sanqu* songs cannot be classified into any of the above-mentioned flat and stereotypical characters in the pedigree of fishermen. Politically castrated, the Chinese intellectuals under Mongol rule underwent an unprecedented threat to their identity as the leader of society and constructor of social and moral order in communities. The present study explores how reclusion was understood and chosen as a dominant lifestyle in the specific social and political contexts of the Yuan Dynasty period and how it was visualized in Qiao Ji’s “the Songs of Fisherman.” By doing so, this study aims to highlight reclusion as an aggressive attempt to overcome the identity crisis of Chinese intellectuals under Mongol rule, not just as a passive refuge from political upheaval and social discrimination or a result of expulsion from the political world. Furthermore, this study also will demonstrate that Qiao Ji’s “Songs of Fisherman” was not only a “reflection” of the author and the world, but the songwriting itself was a literary “practice” for overcoming the identity crisis.

Michael Lessman, Yale University

## Phenomenal Physics: the role of *lawāzim* in Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's Philosophical Account of Substance

In this paper I interpret Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's account of atomism and hylomorphism in his commentary on Avicenna's *Ishārāt wa-l-tanbīhāt*. I suggest that diachronic methods for interpreting al-Rāzī's works of *kalām* and *ḥikma* can overlook the fact that al-Rāzī's epistemology in fact permits both endeavours to be rational accounts of nature. I build off of recent scholarship that argues for al-Rāzī's phenomenalism, which is the view that the question of whether essences exist (regardless of whether they are atoms or forms) cannot be determined by reason. Al-Rāzī's embrace of this view would imply a friction with both Avicenna and early *kalām*, since both views take for granted that physical phenomena tell us about the essences of things. Thus, while there is not any epistemic pressure to choose between a phenomenalist atomism and hylomorphism, there is epistemic pressure for al-Rāzī to reject essentialism in favour of phenomenalism.

My paper demonstrates how this aspect of al-Rāzī's soft skepticism leads him to novel breakthroughs in his account of hylomorphism in his philosophical works. This novel approach takes its building-blocks from the notion of *lawāzim* (necessary concomitants) treated in Avicenna's *al-Shifā'* I.5. Al-Rāzī uses this notion to present a hylomorphic theory that does not depend on the existence of forms. Rather than being a composite of matter and form, substance for al-Rāzī is a necessary concomitant (an essential feature) of body. That is, body considered generally implies that a substance (a particular thing) is always included. That particular thing may be an atom; it may also be a form-matter compound. In allowing for both, by cutting the Gordian knot of essentialism, al-Rāzī's phenomenalist physics has already parted ways from the usual dichotomy of atomism contra Avicennism.

LI Sijia, University of Colorado

## To Be Imperfect: Cancellations (*tumo*), Spontaneity, and the Second-Best Calligraphy

In the year 758, Yan Zhenqing (709–785), one of the most influential calligraphers in the Tang dynasty (618–907), wrote a eulogy in honor of his nephew Yan Jiming (d. 756). Yan Jiming was killed brutally at Changshan in the An Lushan Rebellion (755–763). Not until two years after Yan



Jiming's death did Yan Zhenqing manage to find his remains. To memorialize his nephew, Yan Zhenqing wrote out the eulogy. The calligraphy of the eulogy, usually identified as "Ji zhi gao" (Draft of the Eulogy for My Nephew [hereafter: "Draft"]), would be celebrated as "the second-best calligraphy in running script under Heaven" (*tianxia xingshu di'er*). This art object has survived until the present in its almost original form. At the same time, the text of the eulogy, frequently entitled as "Ji zhi Jiming wen" (Eulogy for Nephew Jiming [hereafter: "Eulogy"]) has also been transmitted in many sources.

The significance of differentiating the calligraphy "Draft" from the text "Eulogy" lies in foregrounding the nature of "Draft" as an art object or an artistic manuscript that bears an abundance of informative details that are missing from the text. I thus suggest regarding the "Draft" as a paratext of the text "Eulogy," using a term proposed by Gérard Genette, in virtue of its directing and deepening readers' understanding of the text. Yan Zhenqing's practice *tumo* (to ink out, to cancel, cancellation) on the "Draft" is one of paratextual information proffered by the prominent calligraphy. Taking this as an example, this essay endeavors to demonstrate how a calligraphic work influences our reading of the text on it. Methodological inspirations are drawn from multiple studies on Chinese traditional literary theories, calligraphic studies, and English manuscript studies.

#### **Mi Liu, Arizona State University**

Inclusion over Confrontation: A Frontier Strategy in the Ming *Zaju* Play, *Huang Tingdao Spurs the Shooting Star Horse at Night*

The Ming *zaju* play *Huang Tingdao Spurs the Shooting Star Horse at Night* attracts very few research interests, possibly because of its seemingly clumsy great reunion ending. The Confucian scholar Huang Tingdao is sent to Shatuo, the Turkic tribe, to lobby for their tribal treasure, the shooting star horse. While Huang promises he can effortlessly bring back the horse with his fluent Shatuo language, he does not speak a word of the language when he is there. Moreover, he only brings back Chacha, the tribe chief's daughter he married, to the Central Land. Yet, his return is still celebrated as a triumph. I argue in this paper that the play stages Huang's mission as a successful frontier strategy, because he actually facilitates the inclusion of Shatuo in the Central Land society. It is indicated that Huang does speak the Shatuo language, but he uses

only the Han language to have Chacha do the same. This linguistic tactic shifts Chacha's dominating voice of a tribal ruler to a female voice in patriarchal family, and thus includes Huang's Shatuo family in the ethical territory of the Central Land. Shatuo is bureaucratically included in the empire when Chacha is persuaded by Huang to come to the Central Land as his wife, an imperial official's titled wife. With this action, her family and the tribe they head are included in the emperor's serving class as well. Additionally, the mission twice highlights the intellectual prowess outdoing military force in unifying "within the four seas": a Confucian scholar, stands out from all the military experts, is selected to be the suitable envoy to Shatuo, a warrior land, who further annexes the land with only verbal stratagems.

**Timothy Lornale, University of Pennsylvania**

Blurred Beginnings and Endings: Notes on the Compositional History of the Inscription at the  
Brahmajinālaya in Lakkunḍi

The Kannada inscription (*S//* 11.1, no. 52 ) at the Jain *basadi* in Lakkunḍi (Dharwar dist.) is perhaps the most well-known epigraph from the reign of Satyāśraya (r. 997-1008 C.E.) of the Western Cālukyas. The reason for its fame stems from its patron, the widow Attimabbē, who, both during her lifetime and in the centuries that followed, came to embody the paradigmatic example of a Jain devotee and patron (Srikantaiah 1948; Taylor 2016). In the first 62 of its 88 lines, the inscription describes her family tree and lauds her patronage of Jain institutions across the Deccan, before detailing her endowment of a village to the temple she previously had constructed. While scholarship has overwhelmingly focused on Attimabbē's munificence (Hampana 1996, Kumari 1994; Pariti 2007) in the main part of the inscription, very little attention has been paid to the final 26 lines and their relationship to the document as a whole. This includes the editors who skimmed over the content of these lines in the original publication (1940). In this paper, I explore these final lines discussing the donations of a garden to the temple in order to reassess the compositional history and rhetoric of this inscription. Building on the work of T.N. Srikantaiah (1948), as well as the epigraphic corpus from Lakkunḍi between the 11<sup>th</sup>-13<sup>th</sup> centuries, I contend that this section of the epigraph is from a later period and potentially involves multiple strata of donations. There even appears to be an endowment made in Attimabbē's name at least a century after her death. I hold that such an attribution plays a part

in the larger hagiographical tradition developing around this famous widow. This paper aspires to complicate our understanding of medieval Kannada epigraphy, focusing on a neglected portion of a well-known inscription.

**Diego Loukota Sanclemente, University of California, Los Angeles**

*Ne hāḍe vajrropamā vaśārā*: The Internal Chronology of Indic Loanwords in Khotanese and its Implications for Khotanese Buddhism

Indic loanwords are a highly visible component within the lexicon of the Middle Iranian Khotanese language. Even though such loanwords are present in every area of the lexicon, given that a substantial part of the extant Khotanese literature consists of translated or original Buddhist texts, the religious terminology is particularly well attested. The corpus of Indic doctrinal loanwords includes numerous orthographically transparent Sanskrit terms, but also others that bear clear traces of Middle Indic phonology, and in particular of specific features of the Middle Indic Gāndhārī language. We know Gandhāra to have been an important cultural referent for all Serindian peoples in the early centuries CE, and since Gāndhārī was an active medium of Buddhist literacy in Gandhāra until the 3rd Century CE, but was later completely superseded by Sanskrit, examining the Gāndhārī and Sanskrit origins of Khotanese Buddhist technical terminology can provide a chronology of the spread of Buddhism to Khotan. This chronology pits a fairly mainstream early period against one dominated by terminology strongly associated with the Mahāyāna movement and with scholastic philosophy. This conclusion may superficially seem to simply echo well-known developments in South Asian Buddhism, but the examination also has the potential to complicate this very premise and to assign a stronger role in these developments to native Khotanese Buddhism.

**John Lowe, Jim Benson and Yiming Shen, University of Oxford**

Kaṇḍabhaṭṭa and Nāgeśa on Negation

The correct understanding of negation is an important philosophical and linguistic question. While the theories of negation in Indian philosophical systems such as Navya-Nyāya and Mīmāṃsā have been well studied (among many others, for example, Matilal's *The Navya-*



(2) [RC yah svabhāvo<sub>i</sub> hi yasya<sub>i</sub> syāt]

RP.NOM nature.NOM PTCL RP.GEN be.OPT.SG.3

[MC tasya<sub>j</sub> asau<sub>i</sub> duratikramah

CP.GEN CP.NOM hard-to-overcome.NOM.SG

‘Whatever nature<sub>i</sub> who<sub>j</sub> might have, that<sub>i</sub> is difficult to overcome of/by him<sub>j</sub>.’ = ‘Whatever nature someone might have...’ (Hitopadeśa 3.8, Hock 1989: 96)

Correlatives are typologically rare and often limited to head-final languages (Downing (1973), cf. Keenan (1985) and de Vries (2002)); yet they constitute the major relativization strategy in various Indo-Aryan and Slavic languages. The analysis of the constructions in (1-2) is not a central issue within the mainstream Indian linguistic tradition; in Western linguistics, they are predominantly analyzed as conjoined (Hock 1989a,b) or symmetrically adjoined (Davison 2009) based on evidence mainly from the multi-headed constructions in (2). The focus of prior work has been primarily on Vedic data.

In our study, we present the results of a large-scale corpus search, in which we have extracted all the relevant constructions from an electronic corpus of Sanskrit running to over 5 million words. We focus on Classical Sanskrit and aim to concentrate on aspects that have remained unanswered, such as the positioning of the relative and correlative pronouns within the clause, matching and head requirements (i.e. one-to-one correspondence between the RP and the CP), as well as the semantic interpretation of the multi-headed constructions.

## References

- DAVISON, A. (2009). *Correlatives cross-linguistically*, chapter ‘Adjunction, features and locality in Sanskrit and Hindi/Urdu correlatives’. John Benjamins, pp. 223–262.
- DE VRIES, MARK (2002). *The Syntax of Relativization*. Utrecht: LOT.
- DOWNING, BRUCE (1973). ‘Correlative-relative clauses in Universal Grammar’. *Minnesota Working Papers in Linguistics and Philosophy of Language* 2, pp. 1–17.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989a). ‘Conjoined we stand: Theoretical Implications of Sanskrit Relative Structures’. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989b). ‘(Pre-)Rig-Vedic convergence of Indo-Aryan with Dravidian? Another look at the evidence’. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.

KEENAN, EDWARD L. (1985). 'Passive in the World's Languages'. In Timothy Shopen (ed.), *Language Typology and Syntactic Description, Vol. 1: Clause Structure*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 243–281.

**Timothy Lubin, Washington and Lee University**

Distinctive Sanskrit Juridical Expressions in Southeast Asia

Indic legal concepts and practices began to be imported into Southeast Asia at least by the 8<sup>th</sup> century, as evidenced first in inscriptions and later (in Java) in Old Javanese texts. The chief source was the *Mānava Dharmaśāstra* (or at least the eighth and some of the ninth chapters thereof), along with material from the *Mahābhārata* and *nīti* lore. However careful reading of the Southeast Asian sources shows that some of the distinctive and common expressions used there to describe the duties of a judge or court assessor diverge from those familiar from Sanskrit Dharmaśāstra. These a number of expressions including the compound *guṇadoṣa* (verbalized, or used in conjunction with forms of the Sanskrit term *viccheda* or *pariccheda*, as well as the attributive *guṇadoṣa-darśī* in 16 Cambodian inscriptions, and compounds like *vyavahāra-vicchedaka* or *nyāyānyāya-[vyavahāra]-vicchedaka* appearing in 14<sup>th</sup>–century Javanese inscriptions and texts. This paper attempts to trace the path by which these expression came into use, finding clues in some Buddhist, Nyāya, and other philosophical discourse.

**Andrew Magnusson, University of Central Oklahoma**

Tax Them but Do Not Marry Them: *Matn* and *Isnad* Analyses of Two Hadiths about Zoroastrians

Two influential hadith attributed to the Prophet Muhammad sought to regulate Muslim interactions with Zoroastrians in the early caliphates. The first hadith, which appears in Abbasid-era manuals of taxation, permitted Muslims to collect *jizya* from Zoroastrians but not to marry or eat meat slaughtered by them. The second hadith, found in the same sources, urged Muslims to “follow the custom of the People of the Book” (*sunnu bihim sunnat ahl al-kitab*) with Zoroastrians. This paper analyzes the content and chains of transmission for each report. It

reveals that the first hadith was narrated exclusively on the authority of Hasan ibn Muhammad al-Hanafiyya (d. 100/718), grandson of Ali ibn Abi Talib, the imam-caliph. The content resembles Ali's reports about the Banu Taghlib, an Arab tribe with an exceptional tax status. The second hadith is transmitted exclusively on the authority of Muhammad al-Baqir (d. 115/732 or 117/735), the Fifth Imam and a respected jurist. While previous scholarship has noted that its chain of transmission is severed (*munqati'*), this paper argues that the report should be seen as a legal opinion of the late first/early second centuries rather than a statement of prophetic practice. This was the era, according to Harald Motzki and Scott Lucas, that Islamic law was incipient, and reports narrated on the authority of Companions and Successors were as influential as those from the Prophet. Ali's family could claim expertise on matters related to Zoroastrians because Ali professed to be the most knowledgeable person about Zoroastrians. The esteem of Ali's two descendants was such that their decisions were attributed to the Prophet. Their reports ultimately allayed concerns among early Muslim scholars regarding the accommodation of Zoroastrians as protected, tax-paying subjects of the caliphate (*ahl al-dhimma*) despite their lack of a divinely revealed scripture.

**Lillian McCabe, Yale University**

Celestial Spirits in Astral Magic and Sufism: Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī on the Rūḥāniyyāt

This paper presents Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's conception of celestial spiritual beings (*rūḥāniyyāt*) in two of his texts: *The Book of the Hidden Secret* (*Kitāb al-Sirr al-Maktūm*) and *The Exalted Inquiries* (*al-Maṭālib al-ʿāliya*). *The Book of the Hidden Secret* is a text on astral magic; Rāzī claims that the discipline (*ʿilm*) he describes therein enables the practitioner to witness the realm of the celestial spirits (*rūḥāniyyāt*), to communicate with them, and even to become like them. Through this connection with the spirits, the practitioner, who can be described as a magician (*sāḥir*), is able to exert influence over events in the sublunary sphere and also to produce talismans that harness the power of these beings. It is striking that Rāzī also discusses celestial spirits in the introductory section of his major work *al-Maṭālib al-ʿāliya*, which provides a doxographical overview of different proofs for God's existence. Here, celestial beings figure prominently in his exploration of a group he calls the 'Masters of Spiritual Discipline' (*aṣḥāb al-riyādiyyāt*), a term reminiscent of Sufis. I highlight the similarities in Rāzī's presentation of the celestial spirits in these two texts and also consider how spiritual discipline and training (*riyāḍa*)

figures in his discussions of both astral magic and Sufi practice. This paper builds off of recent scholarship on *al-Sirr al-Maktūm*, specifically on its relationship to the later *al-Maṭālib al-‘āliya*. I will suggest that the similarities between these texts have broader implications for the ways in which magical and mystical ontologies converge.

**H. Craig Melchert, Carrboro, NC**

Luvo-Hittite *latti*- 'Portion; Detachment'

New examples in ritual context (e.g., KBo 62.38:3-8) show that Hittite *latti*-, previously interpreted as 'tribal troops', means primarily 'allotment, portion (received)'. In military usage the sense is 'detachment' (a portion of troops received from a higher commander, as explicitly in KUB 5.1 ii 47-48). The correct sense makes clear that the word is a borrowing from Luvian, a verbal noun '(a) taking, receiving' < *lā*- 'to take, receive'. The logographic spellings are to be read as ŠU-TU(M)/TI, standing for Akkadian *qātu* in the meaning 'share, portion'. ÉRIN.MEŠ ŠU-TI<sup>(Hl.A)</sup> must be taken as a genitival expression 'troops of an allotment, contingent, detachment' like LÚ TE4-MI 'man of the message, messenger'. These must not be confused with ÉRIN.MEŠ SU-TE-I (KBo 5.6 ii 4), ÉRIN.MEŠ SU-TE<sup>MEŠ</sup> (KBo 5.6 ii 5)<sup>1</sup> and ÉRIN.MEŠ SÚ-TE-E (KUB 19.12 iii 8) all found only in the account of Šuppiluliuma I's Syrian campaigns and referring to "Sutaeen troops." Given that Akkadian *kiširtu* and *kišru* are used to refer to a contingent of soldiers and to a feature of the exta, the use of *latti*- for a part of the exta is surely based on the military sense of the Hittite word (with the CHD L-N: 49a).

<sup>1</sup> Thus with Güterbock (1956: 92) against Güterbock and Hoffner (1980:47b)!

**Chris Mezger, Yale University**

Retelling Scripture: Intertextual References in the Quran and the Quranic Audience

This paper investigates the distribution of Quranic intertextual references to the Hebrew Bible, New Testament, and other Jewish and Christian texts of Late Antiquity, as collected by Gabriel Reynolds in *The Quran and the Bible*. Comparing this distribution to the division of suras proposed by Andreas Kaplony in 2018 based on shared and almost mutually exclusive terminology for God, heaven, and hell, the intertextual references turn out to be strongly skewed toward one particular group, i.e. that featuring the alternative name for God *rabb*



*al-‘ālamīn*. This is especially true if considering only references to the Bible (HB/NT) itself – more than 80% are in the *rabb al-‘ālamīn* group, which only constitutes about half of the Quran. Such an unbalanced distribution must be non-random, providing additional support to Kaplony’s proposed division and raising the possibility of fruitful research into the composition of the Quranic audience. Assuming Kaplony’s groups of suras correlate with particular subgroups within Muhammad’s movement, as argued by Kaplony himself, these results suggest a correlation between the *rabb al-‘ālamīn* suras and Jews, Christians, or other ‘people of the Book’ among the earliest followers of Muhammad.

**Piotr Michalowski, University of Michigan**

The Emesal Variety of the Sumerian Language: Genderlect or Not

The ancient Sumerian language of Mesopotamia is attested in two main varieties, both of which underwent changes over the millennia. In addition to what is considered the main dialect, there was a variety that in native terminology was labeled Emesal. This last form of the language was used in heterogeneous contexts although only in poetry, sometimes to mark female speech, but also in certain literary genres. It has sometimes been described as a “women’s language,” or genderlect, but this does not account well for the complexity of Emesal usage. In this presentation I shall attempt to provide an account that takes into account the rich variety of this unique language practice.

**Christopher Minkowski, University of Oxford**

*Saṅjāyo vetti vā na vālorndale*

The Gaṇeśa-as-scribe episode of the *Mahābhārata* (Vulgate I.1.70-83) justifies the presence of thorny verses in the epic. It recounts how Vyāsa intentionally inserted difficult ślokas as he dictated the work, in order to slow Gaṇapati’s transcription down. It gives a count of such verses (8800), referring to them as a unit (*śloka-kūṭam*), knotty and knotted together even today (*adyāpi grathitaṃ sudṛḍham*).

Cataloguers of Sanskrit manuscripts as early Kielhorn in 1869 connected this story with the titles of early *Mahābhārata* commentaries. An influential history of the origins of epic commentary was evolved: viz. that the earliest commentaries were brief works designed to elucidate this set of difficult verses, spoken of as the *vyāsakaṣṭa*, *vyāsaghaṭṭa*, and so on. Vimalabodha's (12<sup>th</sup> or 13<sup>th</sup> Ct) commentary is indeed titled variously as an explanation, illumination, or breaking open (-*bodhinī*, -*prakāśinī*, -*bhañjikā*) of words, verses, or meanings (*pada*, *śloka*, *artha*) that are difficult to comprehend or construe (*durbodha*, *durghaṭa*, *viśama*, *duṣkara*, even *duḥkha*.)

In 1963 Raghavan expressed his doubts about this history of the origins of the *Mahābhārata*'s commentaries, because of the mismatch between the putative purpose of such early commentaries and the actual verses they commented on. Around the same time, Vaidya expressed doubts for different reasons, but also pointing to the verses selected, in this case from the *Kaṇva-parvan*.

This paper will consider the verses that Vimalabodha selected for discussion in his *Durghaṭārthaprakāśinī*, focusing on the battle books and later parvans, while considering the sort of treatment that Vimalabodha provides. To what extent, and in what sense, are the selected verses *durghaṭa*, and so on, as his title and *śāstrārambha* declare? What evidence is there that there were independent collections of *kūṭaśloka*s? What does this analysis suggest for the historiography of the origins of epic commentary?

### **Hanan Hamza and Ali Hussein Mohsin, Iraq Museum**

#### **The Topography of Ninḥursag's Mound Field and its Irrigation Facilities**

Mound fields are man-made hills which are constructed by farmers, and the workers whom they hired, to elevate the ground and plot their fields upon those mounds. Near the mound they would build a reservoir (to control the flooding) along with a water distributor and a pond to collect excess water. Our investigation of mound-fields incorporates 17 Ur III texts recorded in BDTNS as well as one unpublished text housed in the Iraq Museum (IM 183038) which records a receipt for planting seeds (Ur-E11-e) in the Ninḥursag field in the city of Umma.



Correlatives are typologically rare and often limited to head-final languages (Downing (1973), cf. Keenan (1985) and de Vries (2002)); yet they constitute the major relativization strategy in various Indo-Aryan and Slavic languages. The analysis of the constructions in (1-2) is not a central issue within the mainstream Indian linguistic tradition; in Western linguistics, they are predominantly analyzed as conjoined (Hock 1989a,b) or symmetrically adjoined (Davison 2009) based on evidence mainly from the multi-headed constructions in (2). The focus of prior work has been primarily on Vedic data.

In our study, we present the results of a large-scale corpus search, in which we have extracted all the relevant constructions from an electronic corpus of Sanskrit running to over 5 million words. We focus on Classical Sanskrit and aim to concentrate on aspects that have remained unanswered, such as the positioning of the relative and correlative pronouns within the clause, matching and head requirements (i.e. one-to-one correspondence between the RP and the CP), as well as the semantic interpretation of the multi-headed constructions.

## References

- DAVISON, A. (2009). *Correlatives cross-linguistically*, chapter 'Adjunction, features and locality in Sanskrit and Hindi/Urdu correlatives'. John Benjamins, pp. 223–262.
- DE VRIES, MARK (2002). *The Syntax of Relativization*. Utrecht: LOT.
- DOWNING, BRUCE (1973). 'Correlative-relative clauses in Universal Grammar'. *Minnesota Working Papers in Linguistics and Philosophy of Language* 2, pp. 1–17.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989a). 'Conjoined we stand: Theoretical Implications of Sanskrit Relative Structures'. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989b). '(Pre-)Rig-Vedic convergence of Indo-Aryan with Dravidian? Another look at the evidence'. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.
- KEENAN, EDWARD L. (1985). 'Passive in the World's Languages'. In Timothy Shopen (ed.), *Language Typology and Syntactic Description, Vol. 1: Clause Structure*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 243–281.

Thomas Motter, University of California Los Angeles

Hittite Determinate Correlatives are not Indefinite

This paper addresses the claim that Hittite correlatives should be read as sentences with existentially quantified indefinites, rather than as relative clauses. Originally proposed by Hahn (1946), this view was recently revived by Huggard (2015) for the “determinate” subclass (taken by others, e.g., Held (1957), to have definite reference). The two readings are illustrated below:

- (1) *UNUTE*.MEŠ=ya=kan      kue      andan      n=atšarādāi  
utensils=and=ptc      which inside      conn=them      up      takes  
Relative reading: ‘and the utensils which (are) therein, these he picks up’  
Indefinite reading: ‘and some utensils are therein; and these he picks up’

The motivation for this is that the relative pronoun has syntactic behavior similar to the Hittite indefinite pronoun; the claim is that the relative pronoun was originally an indefinite, and that the indefinite reading fits better with this origin. Diachronic plausibility notwithstanding, Hahn and Huggard seem to claim that the indefinite-sentence interpretation also applies synchronically.

I argue that determinate correlatives should not be understood as indefinite sentences. They are relative clauses with definite reference. I support this claim by evaluating the referential status of correlatives in discourse context, showing a variety of factors that can rule out indefinite readings. For example, some correlatives are anaphoric to a referent previously established; this is incompatible with an indefinite reading because the referent is already identifiable within the discourse. Some other correlatives feature demonstratives, which rule out the indefinite reading. In still other cases, an indefinite reading is disfavored for pragmatic reasons, e.g., informativity.

I also explain why an indefinite interpretation is sometimes possible. One subtype of definite expression, the “establishing” definite (Becker 2021), introduces a new referent with an implicit instruction to the hearer to construe it as uniquely identifiable. This referent introduction overlaps with the function of an indefinite sentence, permitting analytical misconstrual.

## References

- Becker, Laura. 2021. *Articles in the World's Languages*. Berlin: De Gruyter.
- Hahn, E. Adelaide. 1946. "The Origin of the Relative *kwi- kwo-*." *Language* 22 (2): 68–85.
- Held, Warren H., Jr. 1957. "The Hittite Relative Sentence." *Language* 33 (4): 7–52.
- Huggard, Mattyas. 2015. "*Wh*-words in Hittite: A Study in Syntax-Semantics and Syntax-Phonology Interfaces." Ph.D. diss., University of California, Los Angeles.

### Antonio Musto, New York University

#### The Many Faces of a *Miḥna*: A New Look at Ghulām Khalīl's (d. 275/888) Anti-Sufi Trial

According to various Sufi sources, Ghulām Khalīl (d. 275/888), a popular preacher and renunciant (*zāhid*) in Baghdād, instigated a trial (*miḥna*) against some seventy-odd Sufis. The charges were of heresy (*zandaqa*) or disbelief (*kufī*), and it was only through an impactful display of rhetoric, if not miraculous means, that the accused Sufis were spared the sword. Contemporary scholars have conventionally cast this *miḥna* as an instance of an old-guard "ascetic" reaction against a newly emergence "mystical" movement." Furthermore, they have placed this *miḥna* alongside the execution of al-Ḥallāj (d. 309/922) as two instances of widespread anti-Sufi persecution that were so significant, they engendered the production of a vast corpus of apologetic Sufi literature in the fourth/tenth and fifth/eleventh centuries. Recently, some scholars have called into question the casting of this literature as apologetic and have highlighted that the impact of al-Ḥallāj's trial and execution on later Sufis was not that significant. In line with this position, the goal of this presentation is to reexamine the place of this *miḥna* in Sufi historiography. This talk will move the discussion of Ghulām Khalīl's *miḥna* away from contemporary scholars' preoccupations with the ascetical and mystical divide and towards an examination of the *miḥna*'s role in the conceptual landscape of Sufi authors in the fourth/tenth and fifth/eleventh centuries. In doing so, it will become apparent that later Sufis did not view this trial as something to answer for or contend with, but instead they furnished it as an example for a wide array of Sufi concepts and beliefs. Chief among them is Sufi authors' portrayal of the *miḥna* as an instance of *balā'*, or tribulation, that should be understood as an example for the role of the altruism (*īthār*), forbearance (*ṣabr*), gratitude (*shukr*), and contentment with God (*al-riḍā*).

Erez Naaman, American University

Abbasid Plagiarism Disputes: People of Authority Respond (or Not)

Modern scholarship has already established that Islamic law did not recognize intellectual property and set no punishment for plagiarism. As a result, the only remedy against plagiarists available to their victims in the Abbasid period was the involvement of powerful figures or the pressure of public opinion.

The medieval Arabic sources include numerous allegations about plagiarized poetry. Much rarer, however, are reports that include details about the reaction of people of authority—be it the police chief, court patron, or vizier—to plagiarism allegations made by one poet against another. Based on my examination of cases found in the medieval Arabic sources, I discuss in this paper the gamut of response coming from people of authority, which ranged from no action to strong reaction. Cases in point involve the dispute between al-Sarī l-Raffā' (d. 362/972) and the Khālīdī brothers (Abū Bakr, d. ca. 380/990; Abū 'Uthmān, d. ca. 400/1010), and others between Abū Nuwās (d. 200/815) and the secretary Khiyār b. Muḥammad, al-Ṣāhib b. 'Abbād (d. 385/995) and an anonymous poet, and Abū l-Mu'āfā al-Muzanī (fl. 170/786) and an anonymous poet.

I argue that the absence of formal legal mechanisms and procedures to address plagiarism allegations facilitated apathetic, interested, or capricious responses. This absence could at times lead powerful figures, such as government administrators, officials, and court patrons, to react to plagiarism allegations with inaction and puzzlement. At other times they would respond with threats of violence, or with economic sanctions such as withdrawal of benefits and patronage. As a result of this absence, when people of authority made decisions based on considerations of interest and power relations, the political influence and access of one party were often enough for them to win over the other.

John Nemec, University of Virginia

Daṇḍin's *paśpaśa*

Daṇḍin opens his *Kāvyādarśa* with a series of verses that comment on the nature of language and literature and their study. The purpose of this presentation is to argue that he wishes with this introduction to evoke other Sanskrit traditions that reflect on the

nature and use of language, including the *Mīmāṃsā* but above all the tradition of Sanskrit grammar (*vyākaraṇa*) and, evidently, the *paspaśāhnika* of Patañjali in particular. This may be demonstrated by noting heretofore unrecognized allusions to the same in the introductory verses, among them: the evocation of a binary understanding of language-use as either correct or incorrect, this by way of reference to the word “cow” (*go*) in a manner reminiscent of both Patañjali’s *paspaśāhnika* and Śabara’s eponymous commentary on the *Mīmāṃsāsūtra*; allusion to *vivakṣā* or the desire of an individual to say something in particular; invocation of the authority of the wise (i.e., the *śiṣṭas*), though with an obscuring and fascinating twist of meaning that evokes poetic interpretation on Daṇḍin’s formal terms; and the evocation of a concept, prominent in Pāṇinian grammar, that the analysis of language and words may be performed by differentiating their sounds from their meanings. I conclude by suggesting that the most consequential quality of Daṇḍin’s allusions to precedent schools of linguistic analysis is the fact that he invokes the authority of those traditions while simultaneously challenging the exclusive power of the same.

**Patrick Olivelle, University of Texas at Austin**

Dharmaśāstras Circulation around the 9th Century CE

In my chapter “Social and Literary History of Dharmaśāstras: The Foundational Texts” in the volume on Hindu Law that I and Don Davis edited, I noted that “perhaps 90% of the Dharmaśāstras have been lost in the manuscript tradition.” Kane (I: 304) estimates that approximately 100 Dharmaśāstras are cited in medieval legal digests, of which we have complete manuscripts of about eight. We may question whether all the citations in the medieval legal digests and commentaries are from actual treatises available to their authors, or whether some may have been floating verses in the memory of experts, or, indeed, whether, some may have been simply invented as proof texts, as David Brick has shown with respect to the institution of *satī*. Nevertheless, there appears to have been a large-scale extinction of Dharmaśāstras. In this paper I seek not a solution to this problem, but to identify which of the one hundred or so texts ascribed to distinct authors in medieval texts were actually in circulation in the 9th century CE, when two extensive commentaries were composed, one on Yājñavalkya by Viśvarūpa and one on Manu by Medhātithi. I attempt here to reconstruct the texts and



authors known to them and analyze the citations ascribed to these authors in the hope of advancing the history of the Dharmaśāstric textual production.

**Øyvind Bjøru and Na'ama Pat-El, The University of Texas, Austin**

The Missing Link: There is no Copula in Akkadian

Unlike many West-Semitic languages, for most of its history Akkadian did not develop a copula. Some scholars (GAG §196c; Anttila 2000: 107; de Ridder 2018 §676) argue that at least in Neo-Assyrian, and possibly in Middle Assyrian, a copula on the basis of the 3rd person personal pronoun is used; for example, É-MEŠ *ra-a -pa-a-te ši-na* (SAA 1 124 o 5-6) 'The houses are built'. Copulas whose source is a personal pronoun are attested in many languages. In most cases, the copula construction developed from a reanalysis of a topic-comment construction, namely a nominal sentence where a constituent was topicalized via left dislocation. Although there are no diachronic studies of the copula in Akkadian, studies on other Semitic languages, like Hebrew and Arabic, largely corroborate this scenario.

In this paper, we will argue that the 3rd person personal pronoun in Neo-Assyrian has not in fact grammaticalized to become a copula. We will discuss a number of issues to substantiate our claim, among which the anaphoricity of the pronoun, its position, allomorphy, and distribution. We will show that the pronoun in Akkadian shows none of the expected behaviors of a copula and therefore should not be considered one.

**Jonathan Peterson, Stanford University**

The Grammar of Devotion: Kāśinātha Upādhyāya's *Viṭṭhalaṛṇmantrasārabhāṣya*

This paper examines how the eighteenth-century grammarian and prolific Dharmaśāstrin, Kāśinātha Upādhyāya, turned the *Ṛg Veda* into a paean to Viṭṭhala. In his unpublished *Viṭṭhalaṛṇmantrasārabhāṣya*, Kāśinātha marshals Pāṇinian derivational procedure, Mīmāṃsā, and even Alaṃkāra Śāstra to refigure the *Ṛg Veda* into a Viṭṭhala praise poem. The paper charts Kāśinātha's exegetical strategies and locates him within a longer arc of Vedic exegesis in the second millennium. Where other sectarian exegetes relied extensively on etymological and

*Uṇādi*-driven analysis, Kāśīnātha shows himself to be a far more deft and subtle grammarian. Kāśīnātha's project is intellectually rich, but it also raises a number of social-historical questions. The scholar of Marathi literature and folk religion Ramchandra Dhere has suggested it was a high-caste takeover of popular religion. P. V. Kane, on the other hand, understands it as a token of Kāśīnātha's fervent devotion. The paper uses Kāśīnātha's exegetical project to think about the tension between popular religion and elite Brahmanism in the twilight of India's early-modernity.

### **Maddalena Poli, University of Pennsylvania**

History and Fiction: the Tsinghua *Fu Yue zhi ming* 傳說之命 and the formation of the *Shangshu* 尚書

The *Shangshu* 尚書 (*Book of Documents*) has a famously complex textual history. Han dynasty (206 BCE–220 CE) sources recount multiple losses and recoveries of its contents. In 317 CE, Mei Ze 梅賾 presented to the Jin 晉 court a version of the *Shangshu* in 58 *pian* 篇 ("chapters") which, while raising some eyebrows, remained the standard edition until Qing scholar Yan Ruoqu 閻若璩 (1636–1704) proved that its so-called *guwen* 古文 chapters had been reconstituted by Mei Ze, or perhaps other third century intellectuals. Recently, Warring States manuscripts dated to circa the fourth century BCE have reopened a discussion of the textual history of the *Shangshu* and the *shu* 書 as a genre (Allan 2012). This paper addresses one of these manuscripts, the Tsinghua *Fu Yue zhi ming* 傳說之命, presented in its first publication as the pre-Qin version of the *Shangshu Yue Ming* 說命. I argue that the *Fu Yue zhi ming* is not one text divided into three parts (similarly to Li Rui 2016), but rather three texts concerning the relationship between Wu Ding 武丁 and Fu Yue 傳說. The content and form of these texts betray the likely pedagogical nature of these writings. Furthermore, the *Fu Yue zhi ming* casts light not only on the transmission of the *Shangshu* in the first centuries BCE, but also on the *modus operandi* of Mei Ze and his colleagues in producing what were then missing chapters of the *Book of Documents*.

**Michael A. Rapoport, Florida Atlantic University**

Perceive, Apprehend, Grasp, Understand: The Meaning of *idrāk* in Avicenna's *Pointers and Reminders*

The concept of *idrāk* plays a key role in the epistemological discussions in Ibn Sīnā's (d. 428/1037) *Pointers and Reminders* (*al-Išārāt wa-l-tanbīhāt*), not to mention the rest of his corpus. Scholars have resorted to a multitude of terms to translate *idrāk*: perception, apprehension, grasping, knowledge, awareness, to name just a few (cf. R. Arnaldez's entry on *idrāk* in the *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition). The two principal translators of the *Pointers*, A.-M. Goichon (*Livre des Directives et Remarques*, 1948) and Shams Inati (*Remarks and Admonitions, Part One: Logic*, 1984; *Ibn Sina and Mysticism*, 1996; *Ibn Sina's Remarks and Admonitions: Physics and Metaphysics*, 2014), both emphasize the need to pay close attention to the meaning and use of *idrāk* in context. Goichon variously renders it as "grasping," "perception," and "knowledge," while Inati arrives at "apprehension," "knowledge," and "perception." A close analysis of the term in the *Pointers*, however, reveals that none of those terms – "perception" perhaps being the term used most commonly to translate *idrāk* – adequately conveys how Ibn Sīnā employs *idrāk* with regard to our rational faculty. This paper will present an analysis of Ibn Sīnā's use of the term *idrāk* in the *Pointers* and other texts, and propose an alternative translation: to attain.

**James Reich, Pace University and Ben Williams, Naropa University**

Transmitting the Mind of the Author: Abhinavagupta on Saṅkrānti

It has long been recognized that for the Śaiva theologian Abhinavagupta there are deep, often implicit, connections between aesthetics and theology. This paper examines a previously unexplored convergence of these paradigms by comparing the theory of textual transmission in the opening portion of Abhinavagupta's *Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī* and in the commentarial essay on *rasa* in the *Abhinavabhāratī*. We will demonstrate that in both places Abhinavagupta uses parallel terminology to theorize how the awareness of an author is "transferred" [*saṃkram*] to a properly receptive reader, which suggests a similar mechanism of textual transmission. In both cases, this transference happens by means of a shift of grammatical person and tense, such that, for example, a statement that Utpaladeva makes about himself can eventually, via the

text, become a statement that the reader makes about themselves. Whereas in the *Abhinavabhāratī* this idea is fleshed out according to ideas and terminology drawn from Mīmāṃsā, in the *Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī* the term clearly resonates with concepts of direct "transmission" (*saṃkramaṇa*) of liberating insight from guru to disciple, prevalent in Abhinavagupta's Kaula scriptural sources. We will therefore argue that the underlying project uniting these disparate explorations, for Abhinavagupta, is the attempt to develop a model of how texts can, on their own and in the absence of their authors, successfully transfer the mind and experience of their author to the reader, akin to how liberation can be transferred by a living master during an initiatory ritual. We will further argue that this project itself has deeper roots in Abhinavagupta's concern to stabilize and preserve Kaula lineages that had come to be centered upon charismatic gurus, thus guarding against potential obsolescence in the absence of formal institutional structures.

**Aleksandra Restifo, Hebrew University of Jerusalem**

Shame, Fear, and Guilt: The Work of Emotion in Jain Drama

My paper focuses on the work of emotion in "Truthful King Hariścandra" (*Satyahariścandra*), a play by the Jain monk Rāmacandra (1093-1174). It investigates the emotional states of the king by drawing upon Rāmacandra's own accounts in his *Nāṭyadarpaṇa* (co-authored with Guṇacandra), and thereafter examines the findings in the context of modern scholarship on emotions. Thus this paper sheds light on the conceptions of the emotions of shame and guilt in medieval India and contributes to the field of emotions studies. The play begins with a tragic episode of the killing of a pregnant deer by Hariścandra that leads to him lose the kingdom and sell himself and his family into servitude. At the heart of the plot is a desire of jealous deities to test and undermine the king's *sattva*, courage to keep one's promise in the face of extreme suffering. This study argues for the significance of guilt in generating this virtue. Unlike fear and shame, guilt does not appear in the lists of emotions in Sanskrit texts on poetics. Scholars of emotions find affinity between shame and guilt, but they note that shame is often triggered by the fear of societal judgement and leads to "withdrawal and escape behaviors," while guilt is an emotion that generates remorse and "the need to make amends" (Miceli & Castelfranchi, 2018). By analyzing the king's emotional responses in the play, this paper argues that Rāmacandra understood the emotion of shame (*vr̥ṣṭā*) to encompass what we today understand as guilt. It is

closely linked to a sense of individual responsibility, a feeling of remorse, and a desire to do right, the components that are also essential for the production of *sattva*. This study further shows that Rāmacandra's perception of *sattva* differs from the way this virtue is envisioned in Buddhist contexts.

#### References:

Miceli, Maria & Cristiano Castelfranchi. 2018. "Reconsidering the Differences Between Shame and Guilt." *Europe's Journal of Psychology*, 14(3): 710-733. Published online 2018 August 31. <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC6143989/>

#### **Gabriel Said Reynolds , University of Notre Dame**

##### Ipsissima Verba? Thinking through Reported Speech in the Qur'an

The nature of reported speech in the Qur'an, and in particular the question of its relationship to Muhammad's historical conversations with his interlocutors, has been largely unstudied. Q al- 'Ankabut 29:50, for example, has his opponents say *lawla unzila 'alayhi ayatun min rabbihi* ("If only signs were sent down on him from his Lord"), but were those their very words? In secondary scholarship the answer is often assumed to be "yes" (although Nicolai Sinai, in his *Historical-Critical Introduction*, writes that while such exchanges "are not unreasonably seen as having some grounding in real debates, it would of course be naïve to treat them simply as unfiltered transcripts" [p. 14]). In a paper for the 2022 AOS annual meeting I will discuss the nature of reported speech in the Qur'an.

I will approach this question from two perspectives. First, I will discuss the linguistic nature of the Qur'an's reported speech and especially its relationship to the spoken dialects of Arabia, inasmuch as we understand them on the basis of recent epigraphical and papyrological studies (drawing on the work of Ahmad al-Jallad, Michael MacDonald, Leila Nehmé, and Sulaiman al-Theeb). This will also involve revisiting the position of Theodor Nöldeke (*Neue Beiträge zur semitischen Sprachwissenschaft*, 2–23) that the Qur'an was originally proclaimed in a fully inflected Arabic (*fusha*), which matched the spoken dialect of western Arabia (and considering also K. Vollers' reply in his *Volkssprache und*

*Schriftsprache im alten Arabien*, 185–95). In addition, it will involve comparing direct speech with indirect speech in the Qur'an. Second, I will consider the relationship between the nature of the speech discourse attributed to the opponents of the Qur'an's prophet with that attributed to earlier prophets and their people. Thereby I will consider if there are any turns of phrase or syntactical patterns that reflect the spoken speech habits of the early seventh century Hijāz.

**Jessie DeGrado, University of Michigan, and Madadh Richey, Brandeis University**

**Swords into Ploughshares: The Khirbet 'Aṭaruz Moabite Inscription**

In 2010, an inscribed stone incense altar was uncovered in an Iron Age II temple complex at the Jordanian site of Khirbet 'Aṭaruz (خربة عطور). Currently housed in the Madaba Archaeological Museum, the artifact bears two inscriptions, designated Inscription A and B respectively in the recently published *editio princeps* (Bean et al. 2018) and dated palaeography to the late ninth or early eighth century BCE. The first edition and all other presentations have understood Inscription B to be the laconic description of a military encounter involving “Hebrews” (*brn*). Although the text itself is unbroken and the editors' graphemic identifications can be confirmed via RTI photography, their lexical interpretations result in a syntactically disjointed and, as they put it, “tentative” translation (Bean et al. 2018: 229). We present a new morphological, lexical, and syntactic analysis of Inscription B and argue that it records a list of commodities given to the temple at Khirbet 'Aṭaruz. The items acquired include grain (*brn*), formerly understood as “Hebrews,” and products from the threshing floor (*grn*), formerly understood as “foreigners.” In addition to yielding a syntactically coherent text, our morphological analysis has implications for the final line of Inscription A (*bz k/ 10*), which likely records the total sum of goods exchanged, rather than identifying objects as plunder.

**Antje Richter, University of Colorado at Boulder**

"Outside the Southern Gate, Beyond the Eastern Gate: Reflections on Old Age and Illness in Buddhist Hagiography and Six Dynasties Poetry"

In this talk I will explore a crucial motif from the life of the Śākyamuni Buddha: the young Siddhārtha's earliest encounters with the reality of human suffering during his "excursions out of the city gates" (*simen you guan* 四門遊觀). Focusing on those two of his canonical four excursions where the young prince for the first time sees a sick man and an old man, I will begin by asking how Chinese translations of Indic hagiographies represent illness and old age, both in relation to indigenous Chinese literary traditions and other Chinese Buddhist translations. The second part of the talk is dedicated to the question how the scriptural representations of these sights lived on in early medieval Chinese poetry.

**Matthias L. Richter, University of Colorado, Boulder**

From memory cues to texts and from real-life context to paratext: degrees of explicitness in early Chinese texts

In early China studies it is increasingly acknowledged that we know little about the originators and editors of texts that have come down to us through transmission or recent manuscript discoveries, nor can we date most texts confidently. Traditional narratives of the history of early Chinese thought have therefore become largely untenable. Aiming to balance the resulting loss of contextual information, this paper makes observations about types of textual structures that may shed light on their functionality and help us rethink the social use and meaning of the texts at the time.

**D. A. Riedel, Columbia University**

"Repairs and Restorations as Evidence for the International Manuscript Trade"

I will compare the material evidence for restoration in two incomplete codices with medical literature: an anonymous Arabic recension of Dioscurides, *De materia medica* (dated 642/1245, BUB Ms 2954, <https://amshistorica.unibo.it/1672>); and Zayn al-Dīn Jurjānī, *Dhakhīra-yi Khwārazmshāhī* (no date, UPenn LJS 189, <https://archive.org/details/ljs189/>). Repair and

restoration are integral to the manuscript trade in every manuscript culture, and their best practices evolve in conjunction with the manuscript trade. I argue that the comparative study of restorations yields evidence for how in Muslim communities the trade with damaged manuscripts changed between the seventeenth and the twentieth century, thereby providing new insight how the manuscript-to-print transition in the nineteenth century impacted the sale of Islamic manuscripts to foreigners.

**Pavla Rosenstein, Yale University**

Whom Does Inanna Prefer? Whom Does the Lord Favor? A Comparison of the Shepherd-Farmer Rivalry in Sumerian Poetry and Genesis

The Cain and Abel passage in Genesis 4 is unique among Primeval History narratives in that it has no established Mesopotamian counterpart. The two creation stories have been compared to *Enūma Elish*, *Adapa* and *Gilgamesh*, Noah's flood bears striking parallels to *Atrahasis* and *Gilgamesh*, and the Tower of Babel is reminiscent of the temple of Marduk in Babylon. Yet the story of Cain and Abel awaits a careful comparative analysis contextualized within the Mesopotamian literary tradition. Kramer suggested that three Sumerian myths might have served as possible prototypes: *Cattle and Grain*; *Emesh and Enten*; *Enlil Chooses the Farmer God*, and *Inanna Prefers the Farmer*. My critical comparison of Cain and Abel and *Inanna Prefers the Farmer*, part of the so-called Dumuzi-Inanna cycle that also includes *Inanna's Descent into the Netherworld* and *Dumuzi's Dream*, presents three key parallels between the Sumerian and biblical narratives: the shepherd-farmer rivalry, the preference of the shepherd and his offerings by a deity, and an untimely death of the shepherd, who leaves no descendants. Dumuzi's image as a young, semi-divine shepherd married to a deity in the third millennium shifted towards an association with the netherworld in the second and first millennia, leading to an unofficial but widespread lamentation cult referenced in Ezekiel 8:14. Dumuzi's longevity, albeit in a range of shapes and guises, provides a plausible mode of transmission of the shepherd-farmer rivalry motif from Sumerian literary tradition to the Jahwist narrative in Genesis 4.



This paper re-examines the historical phonology and morphology of the palatal-stem declension of Vedic. This declensional type shows a number of odd morpho-phonological features that have never been adequately explained. The ending of the animate nominative singular regularly appears as both *-t* and *-k* (occasionally also *-ḥ*). The “*bh*-cases” show °*d-bh*° or °*g-bh*°, the place of articulation of the stem-final stop corresponding to that of the nominative singular.

These facts, though straightforward in their exposition, have generated significant controversy in the secondary literature dealing with the historical phonology of both Indic and Indo-Iranian. Explanations both phonological and analogical have been proposed in every possible constellation for the four endings in question, taking into account both intra- and inter-paradigmatic influences. I will first review these proposals, including those of Bezzenger (1878:152<sup>1</sup>), Bartholomae (1888:575) Wackernagel and Debrunner (AiGr 1,173, 176) Meillet (1905), Kuiper (1967), Jamison (1991), Wiedenmann (1992), Lubotsky (2008) and Lipp (2009:1,221<sup>171</sup>). I will then make the following arguments:

1. The phonologically regular ending of the animate nominative singular was *-t*. *-k* resulted from contamination of the palatal-stem declension with the velar declension. These two declensional types had fallen together before vowel-initial desinences in pre-Vedic. The *k*-allomorph was then exploited to avoid awkward sequences of retroflex (or perhaps more generally coronal) segments.
2. I will make the novel claim that the sequence \*°*j-bh*° gave \*°*d-bh*° by regular sound change. I argue that this change occurred as part of the elimination of voiced sibilants, i.e. \**jbh* [dʒbʰ] > \**db* [dbʰ]. This conjecture is supported by the fact that even prevocalic *j* is sporadically simplified to *d* in some lexemes: RV *jásamāna* : RV *dásamāna* ‘tired’; AV+ *tejañ* : MS+ *tedañ* ‘blood’; *Arigada* (PN) : *ariga-ja* ‘son, born of one’s body’; Pā. *digucchā* ‘disgust’ = Amg. *dugumchā* ‘id.’ < \**jugupsā*, Pā. *daddallamāna* ‘blazing’ < \**jājvalyamāna*, Amg., JM *digimchā* ‘hunger’ < \**jighatsā* etc. In light of these examples involving pre-vocalic *j*, a systematic reduction of \**jT* to *dT* in this more constrained phonetic environment is almost to be expected.

3. I argue that this \**dbh* supplied the model for case forms with intrusive *d* such as RV, AV *adbhiṣ* 'waters' ← \**abbhiṣ* [= YAv. *aβiiō*]; RV *nádbhyas* 'grandsons' ← \**nábbhyas* < \**náp(ṭ)-bhyas*; TB *samsṛdbhiṣ* (a class of deities).
4. But in the palatal-stem declension the nominative singular in *-ṭ* effected the retroflexion of \**°d-bh°* to \**°ḍ-bh°* in the *bh*-cases.

I will conclude my presentation with a discussion of the rather scant and internally contradictory Iranian material and show how it can best be reconciled with the Vedic data.

#### References:

- Bartholomae, C. (1888). Die arische Flexion der Adjektiva und Partizipia auf *nt-*. *Zeitschrift fürvergleichende Sprachforschung auf dem Gebiete der Indogermanischen Sprachen* 29(5/6), 487–588.
- Bezenberger, A. (1878). Miscellen. *Beiträge zur Kunde der indogermanischen Sprachen* 2, 123–160.
- Jamison, S. W. (1991). A cart, an ox, and the perfect participle in Vedic. *Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft* 52, 77–100.
- Kuiper, F. (1967). The Sanskrit nom. sing. *vit*. *Indo-Iranian Journal* 10(2/3), 103–125.
- Lipp, R. (2009). *Die indogermanischen und einzelsprachlichen Palatale im Indoiranischen*. 2 Bände. Winter.
- Lubotsky, A. (2008). Vedic 'ox' and 'sacrificial cake'. In *Evidence and Counter-Evidence: Essays in Honour of Frederik Kortlandt*. Volume 1: *Balto-Slavic and Indo-European Linguistics*, pp. 351–360. Brill Rodopi.
- Meillet, A. (1905). *Les nominatifs sanskrits en -t*. *Indogermanische Forschungen* 18, 417–421.
- Rothstein-Dowden, Z. (2021). On the inflection of palatal stems in Vedic. *Indogermanische Forschungen* 126, 387–404.
- Wackernagel, J. and A. Debrunner (1896-1957). *Altindische Grammatik*. Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht.
- Wiedenmann, F. (1992). Uridg. Palatal vor *s/t/st* im Altindischen und der Nom. sg. der Stämme auf *-s*. *Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft* 53, 241–249.

Alex Roy, University of California, Los Angeles

On the Imputed Pudor of the *Apsarás-*

The *apsarás-* (var. *apsarā-* = Pāli *accharā-*) known across the Sanskrit cultural sphere likely continues a character type inherited from an earlier Indo-European mythic tradition, corresponding most famously with the *nymph* and the *vila* of respective Graeco-Roman and Slavic lore (see among others West 2007: 284–291, 431). Since the stem *apsarás-* itself attests no identifiable Indo-European cognates outside Indo-Aryan, the name appears to be an innovation of that language branch. It is therefore likely to be a relatively young compositional epithet of its referent, coined from available Indo-Aryan linguistic material. One would expect, then, that the behavior of the *apsarás-* in the Indo-Aryan myth corpus should reflect the components of her epithet.

Today's conventionally preferred etymology (Wackernagel 1916; see EWAia I: 89) nevertheless relies heavily on Iranian data of questionable relevance and privileges unreliable textual depictions, while ignoring the Vedic corpus entirely. To justify the stem-final accent in *apsarás-*, Wackernagel arrives at an original sense ≈ 'shameless,' reconstructing a Proto-Indo-Aryan stem *\*psár-as-* 'shame,' built to a Proto-Indo-Iranian root *\*√PSAR*, with the privative *a-* (*náñ*).

My proposed alternative returns in part to ancient knowledge: since the bulk of Vedic depictions of the *apsarás-*, alongside many epic episodes, explicitly involve bodies of water, I follow Yāska and others in identifying the first component of the name with the stem *áp-* 'water.' I depart from Yāska, however, in connecting the second member of the compound not with the root *√SR* 'flow, move,' but rather with the (likely unrelated) nominal stem *sáras-* 'pond.' The resulting epithet belongs to a small class of bahuvrīhis including also *bṛihad-giri-* 'having → dwelling on the lofty mountains' (of the Maruts, RV 5.57.8) and *bṛihad-diva-* ~ *brhad- divá-* 'dwelling in lofty heaven' (of an RV poet and several divinities). The expected bahuvrīhi accent (*\*áp-saras-* 'having/dwelling in pools of water') meanwhile may have shifted under analogical pressure from the only other common feminine *-as-* stem, *uśás-* 'dawn.'

## References

### Abbreviations

EWAia: see Mayrhofer (1992–1996).

Mayrhofer, Manfred (1992–1996). *Etymologisches Wörterbuch des Altindoarischen*: I–II Band. Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag.

West, Martin L. (2007). *Indo-European Poetry and Myth*. New York: Oxford University Press.

## Relative Constructions in Classical Sanskrit

(1) [<sub>RC</sub> yasya                      no                      dāsyati                      pitā]

RP.GEN.SG                      we.GEN/ACC/DAT                      give.FUT.3.SG                      father.NOM.SG

[<sub>MC</sub> sa                      no                      bhartā                      bhaviṣyati]

DP.NOM.SG                      we.GEN/ACC/DAT                      husband.NOM.SG                      be.FUT.3.SG

‘of (= to) whom (our) father will give us, he will be our husband.’ (*Rāmāyana* 1.31.19)

Correlatives are typologically rare and often limited to head-final languages (Downing (1973), cf. Keenan (1985) and de Vries (2002)); yet they constitute the major relativization strategy in various Indo-Aryan and Slavic languages. The analysis of the constructions in (1-2) is not a central issue within the mainstream Indian linguistic tradition; in Western linguistics, they are predominantly analyzed as conjoined (Hock 1989a,b) or symmetrically adjoined (Davison 2009) based on evidence mainly from the multi-headed constructions in (2). The focus of prior work has been primarily on Vedic data.

In our study, we present the results of a large-scale corpus search, in which we have extracted all the relevant constructions from an electronic corpus of Sanskrit running to over 5 million words. We focus on Classical Sanskrit and aim to concentrate on aspects that have remained unanswered, such as the positioning of the relative and correlative pronouns within the clause, matching and head requirements (i.e. one-to-one correspondence between the RP and the CP), as well as the semantic interpretation of the multi-headed constructions.

## References

- DAVISON, A. (2009). *Correlatives cross-linguistically*, chapter 'Adjunction, features and locality in Sanskrit and Hindi/Urdu correlatives'. John Benjamins, pp. 223–262.
- DE VRIES, MARK (2002). *The Syntax of Relativization*. Utrecht: LOT.
- DOWNING, BRUCE (1973). 'Correlative-relative clauses in Universal Grammar'. *Minnesota Working Papers in Linguistics and Philosophy of Language* 2, pp. 1–17.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989a). 'Conjoined we stand: Theoretical Implications of Sanskrit Relative Structures'. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.
- HOCK, HANS HENRICH (1989b). '(Pre-)Rig-Vedic convergence of Indo-Aryan with Dravidian? Another look at the evidence'. *Studies in the Linguistic Sciences* 19(1), pp. 93–126.
- KEENAN, EDWARD L. (1985). 'Passive in the World's Languages'. In Timothy Shopen (ed.), *Language Typology and Syntactic Description, Vol. 1: Clause Structure*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 243–281.

## Jan Safford, Hebrew University Jerusalem

### Jewish Women in Cuneiform Sources During the Babylonian Exile

The Āl-Yahudu tablets are a collection of a just over 200 Akkadian cuneiform tablets which were written between 572 to 477 BCE and pertain to an exilic Jewish/Judean community in the Babylonian (and subsequent Achaemenean) empire. There are 24 women in the Āl-Yahudu corpus mentioned by name. Seven of those women were slaves, but others had more liberty and economic freedom; as is evidenced by women who jointly ran business ventures or invested their private money in them. One woman, presumably while her husband was away, paid his *ilku*-tax of 5 shekels of silver to the summoner. Other women appear in

legal contracts as guarantors (essentially co-signing) for their husbands. Most importantly, there is a marriage contract in which a mother consents to give her daughter away in marriage. All the witnesses have Hebrew names, but the bride and groom (Nanaya- Kānat & Nabû-bān-aḥi) bear Babylonian names. While other scholars (most notably Kathleen Abraham) have conducted important research on this *Qetuba*, Abraham analyzed and published this marriage contract *before* the publication of the rest of the Āl-Yahudu tablets. She did not have the ability to see how this contract, and the persons mentioned there- within, are connected to the rest of the Āl-Yahudu corpus. Because of this, she concluded that it is impossible to demonstrate that either the bride or groom is Judean. In my paper & presentation, I demonstrate through prosopographical evidence that the bride is most probably the granddaughter of Danaya and great-granddaughter of Shealti-El, who are prominent Judean figures in the Āl-Yahudu corpus. In this paper, I also compare and contrast the status of Judean women with that of “native” Babylonian women and women from other minority backgrounds living in the peripheries of the Neo-Babylonian empire.

**Richard G. Salomon, University of Washington**

The “Enigma of Harwan,” take 3

The Buddhist site of Harwan (Hārvan) in Srinagar District, Kashmir, the ancient *Ṣaḍarhadvana*, was said in Kalhaṇa’s *Rājataranginī* (I.173) to have been the residence of the “bodhisattva” Nāgārjuna. The site has long fascinated archaeologists and art historians for its courtyard paved with an elaborate repertoire of terracotta tiles bearing varied, imaginative, and unusual designs. Among their other peculiarities, the tiles bear, often in very conspicuous positions, numbers written in the Kharoṣṭhī system of additive numerals (with symbols for 1, 2, 3, 4, 10, 20, 100), which are usually assumed to be positional markers. However, these numerical markers have several peculiarities besides their unusual positions; for example, many of them are written defectively, either reversed or inverted, or sometimes even both. Also remarkable is that (contrary to what has sometimes been claimed) these are the only records of Kharoṣṭhī writing that have been found in Kashmir. It therefore seems that the Kharoṣṭhī numerical system was adopted in Kashmir for special or technical usages, a phenomenon which has a parallel in the stūpa at Bharhut in Satna District, Madhya Pradesh, well outside the normal range of use of Kharoṣṭhī writing. Thus the peculiar Kharoṣṭhī numerals at Harwan evidently reflect an extension and survival of the Kharoṣṭhī numerical system beyond its normal geographical and

chronological range. The case can be compared to the survival into the modern world of Roman numerals used for special technical or ceremonial purposes.

**Adheesh Sathaye, University of British Columbia**

Humor and Vulgarity in the Bhāṇas

Writing shortly after the publication of the *Caturbhāṇī* ("Quartet of Bhāṇas," 1922), S. K. De (1926) argued that the *bhāṇa*, a form of Sanskrit monological theatre, had undergone numerous generic changes from its early examples within the *Caturbhāṇī* (c. 500 CE) to versions produced in medieval times (1200-1600). In particular, De maintained that while the early bhāṇas were interested in satirical humor, the medieval examples demonstrate an "exclusive tendency towards the erotic" (84); likewise, while the language of the early bhāṇas would veer into the domain of "natural vulgarity," the medieval bhāṇas exhibit a "polished and factitious indecency" (86). This paper intends to assess De's argument by comparing evidence from the *Caturbhāṇī* and select medieval *bhāṇas*, and will ask how Sanskrit humor, vulgarity, or "artistic indecency" might be successfully translated into modern English – or indeed, whether it is valuable to do so.

**Peter M. Scharf, The Sanskrit Library**

Reduplication and Syllable Structure in Pāṇinian Tradition

Pāṇinian commentators generally assume that the syllable (*ekāc*) to be reduplicated in forms of the perfect, desiderative, intensive, class three present stems, and reduplicated aorist consists of a vowel and both all preceding and following consonants. They assume the same in vowel-initial disyllabic roots, common among desiderative, intensive, and causative roots, in which it is the second rather than the first syllable which is to be reduplicated, thereby including the initial *s* of the desiderative root-forming affix *san*. Commentators consider the objection that the second syllable would not include its leading consonants because they were included in the first syllable as its trailing consonants. They respond that the explicit negation of the reduplication of *n*, *d* and *r* in the second syllable by A. 6.1.3 indicates that leading consonants should be included anyway. Such a solution fails to recognize the phonetic insight that Pāṇini had in formulating A. 6.1.3 which indicates rather that the coda of an initial phonetic syllable is not included in the second syllable of a disyllabic root. Extending syllabic phonetics further would not include a single consonant initial in a subsequent syllable in the previous syllable as its trailing consonant either, thereby

excluding the *s* of the desiderative root-forming affix *san*. The absence of the *s* in the doubled sequence (*abhyasta*) implies its intervention eliminating immediacy (*ānantarya*) between the *abhyasta* and following affixes, an issue discussed in detail by Ben-Dor (2021: 171--216) "On the necessity of immediate sequence (*ānantarya*) in the *Aṣṭādhyāyī*" in शब्दानुगमः: *Linguistic studies in honor of Professor Cardona*, volume I, *vyākaraṇa and śābdabodha*.

### **Jens Schmitt, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München**

The Power of Life. Ibn Abī 'l-Ash'ath on Psychological Distinctions between Human and Non-Human Animals

The Arabic writer Ibn Abī 'l-Ash'ath (Iraq, 10<sup>th</sup> ct.) covers in his highly philosophical zoographical *Book on Animals* (*K. al-Ḥayawān*) also psychological topics as well as the generation of souls.

Among all animals, man is said to be the most intelligent, which is argued for by his most balanced humoral mixture. Due to animals lacking an intellect (*'aql*) in general, they're in need of one, which is supplied by means of a human being ruling them. Besides, humans are distinguished from animals by their unique insight into the sphericity of the heavens as well as their own createdness and the existence of a Creator. By this insight, their rational soul is capable of connecting to the universal intellect and is also immortal. But this immortality isn't achieved or even achievable for all humans, as there are some groups (of imbalanced climate zones) who have their rational soul only in potentiality, though not being fully actualized.

However, in his explanation of the generation of the different kinds of souls of living beings, he could be read as distinguishing between natural and vegetative soul (thus, distinguishing, besides the animal and the rational soul, four kinds of soul altogether) as well as granting also animals, not only humans, a rational soul (but not intellect), even though it might not be fully actualized (and is, therefore, not eternal). This generation of souls is in meticulous detail described for the different kinds of souls as arising from blood and different sorts of pneuma by required heavenly influences, such as granting a "power of life."

The paper will present the generation of the different souls, try to determine its sources, and discuss those passages that might question the rational soul's being exclusive to humans.



**Jason Schwartz, University of California, Santa Barbara**

On the Unmaking of Institutions: The unpublished *Pratiṣṭhāpaddhati* of the *Caturvargacintāmaṇi* and its real world impact.

This presentation introduces the scholarly community to the unstudied and unpublished opening division of the *Pratiṣṭhāpaddhati* of Hemādri's *dharmanibandha*, the *Caturvargacintāmaṇi*. Though integral to the core interpretive project of the work as a whole, this subdivision of the text has been omitted from both prior editions of the *Śrāddhakalpa*.

After demonstrating the work's authenticity along with a brief survey of its contents, our primary focus will be making evident the doctrinal and methodological discontinuities that exist between our *dharmanibandha*'s treatment of *pratiṣṭhā* and what we find in its most significant predecessor within the discipline of Dharmaśāstra, the *Pratiṣṭhā* chapter in Lakṣmīdhara's *Kṛtyakalpataru*.

I will argue that as part of a comprehensive program of social and institutional reform, the *Pratiṣṭhāpaddhati* sets out to reimagine the *brāhmaṇa* ritualist-legalist as the juridical agent solely responsible for overseeing all acts of religious institution making, management, and maintenance, from the ritual consecration of icons to the planting of orchards. Tactically speaking, the *paddhati* seeks to delegitimize the older office of the *pratiṣṭhāpanācārya*, well attested for the past seven centuries in both our documentary and prescriptive sources, a social function deeply entangled with Tantric knowledge systems to which earlier dharma traditions had at least grudgingly deferred. I will demonstrate how Hemādri's own *paddhati* appropriates substantial portions of its own ritual system from preexisting Tantric textual traditions and even presumes the prior existence of primarily Śākta work crews and artisans who are now to be placed under the exclusive direction of the *brāhmaṇa* legalist. I will also show that this is a new reinscription of *brāhmaṇical* identity, and one that sociologically speaking happens at the expense of a prior arrangement, at least tacitly accepted by prior Dharmaśāstra, that had distributed such functions across a wider range of social actors hailing from diverse caste communities.

**Stuart D. Sears, Arabic Language Associates, LLC**

Sacral Kingship and the Legitimation of Government: The Origins of the Kalima in the Late Seventh Century Caliphate

This paper discusses the political and religious calculus behind the formulation of the *kalima*, a distinctly Muslim declaration of faith, at the end of the seventh century CE. The formula, “There is no god but God, alone. Muḥammad is the Messenger of God,” appears on the coinage of the Umayyad caliph ‘Abd al-Malik b. Marwan across the caliphate in the 70s H / 690s CE. It is known today throughout the Muslim world in nearly the same form. Its antecedents lie in Iranshahr almost a decade earlier during the Second fitna.

Modern scholars have little or no explanation for the *kalima*. Following later Muslim sources, they tend to assume that it was formulated and adopted in Syria by the Umayyad caliph ‘Abd al-Malik b. Marwān after provocation by Byzantine Christians, if not Jews and polytheists. It merely affirms widely held tenets of faith.

My paper argues that the *kalima* emerged in Iranshahr during the Second Fitna in a dispute between Muslims over sacral kingship. It seeks to reconcile opposing viewpoints. Absolutist governors such as Ziyād b. Abī Sufyān and his son, ‘Ubaydallāh, openly associate the ruler with God. A piety-minded opposition, including Khārījites, identify God with an impersonal law that stands above human corruptibility. The *kalima* asserts the unity of the community behind God but also raises the Messenger as a model of right conduct. Just as the “Messenger” was bound by Qur’anic law so are the rulers who succeed him. In the *kalima*’s original semiotic context, “God” signals the ruler and “Messenger,” those to whom authority has been delegated. The chief proponents of this compromise formula are Muṣ‘ab b. al-Zubayr and notables in Baṣra.

This paper relies on a number of unusual sources and innovative methodologies. First, it examines the legends and iconography on early Muslim coins, particularly early Muslim drachms and coppers. All elements of the *kalima* first appear on the coinage of the East. This coinage offers clearer and fuller statements about sacral kingship than what can only be inferred from literary sources. Secondly, the paper traces the personal relationships between the different political factions. It notes the close marital ties and political alliance of Mu‘ab b. al-Zubayr with different branches of ‘Ālids as well as his study of the Qur’ān in Medina with the

future caliph, ‘Abd al-Malik b. Marwān. These relationships help explain the quick and ready acceptance of the *kalima* by the Umayyads after their conquest of the East at the end of the second fitna.

**Tonia Sharlach, Oklahoma State University**

Title: “Economy, Politics and State Administration in the Later Ur III Period”

Despite copious records from the reigns of Amar-Sin and Shu-Sin, we are only beginning to disentangle how changing economic realities affected royal decision-making. Tax records provide an excellent window, showing us times when the king’s actions seem to have been forced upon them by economic conditions, and other times when kings did seem to set and shape the economic trajectory. Records of unpaid taxes and tax arrears from the Umma province are particularly helpful in showing when these two kings seem to have been reacting to rather than creating economic reality.

**Ishaan Sharma, University of California Berkeley**

Agents of War: *Dūtas* in the Udyogaparva of the Mahābhārata

A large section of the *Udyogaparva* of the *Mahābhārata* revolves around perceived efforts to circumvent the war between the *Pāṇḍavas* and the *Kauravas*. *Dūtas* (Messengers) serve as the primary medium of dialogue between the two parties. My paper will study the representation of *dūtas* in the final pre-war book of the Epic.

I will be arguing that rather than being depicted as passive instruments to convey information, the text imbues messengers with active agency, albeit distributed unevenly, in determining the outcome of the negotiations. This will be carried out through a close analysis of the arguments and rhetorical devices deployed by the respective messengers in their speeches, studied in contrast to the initial message or intention to be conveyed.

Moreover, I will argue that in granting such agency, the text opens up normative questions regarding the nature, types and duties of messengers on the one hand and the effective modes of *Upāyas* (strategies) on the other. These questions will be placed in the context of

debates around the same in the *Nīṭisāstra* tradition, focusing particularly on the *Arthaśāstra*. Lastly, I will demonstrate that through the role of Kṛṣṇa as messenger in particular, the *Mahābhārata* is exploring a radically new model of a *dūta*.

**Saad Shaukat, University of California, Los Angeles**

*ʿAḍud al-Dīn al-Ījī's Kalām Texts in Mamlūk Syria and Egypt*

Despite the recent scholarly focus on *kalām* in post-classical Islamic intellectual history, its development in the Mamlūk domains- an important region of the pre-modern Islamic world – has remained a largely uncharted territory. As a result, Mamlūk Egypt and Syria are often known to represent the traditionalist- primarily Ḥanbalī- strand of Sunni theology. This impression is reinforced by the disproportionate focus on anti-*kalām* scholars in this region, such as Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728/1328) and his student, Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya (d. 751/1350). While recent scholarship has shown convincingly that *kalām* remained an important intellectual discipline in post-classical period (11<sup>th</sup> century onwards), we still lack sufficient understanding of the key texts, scholars, and ideas that represent the development of *kalam* and its importance to the intellectual life in the Mamlūk domains.

To address this gap, this paper is preliminary attempt to study the circulation and reception of ʿAḍud al-Dīn al-Ījī's (d. 756/1356) *al-Mawāqif fī ʿilm al-Kalām* and *al-ʿAqāʾid al-ʿAḍūdiyya* in the Mamlūk domains. Primarily based on the study of biographical literature, this paper analyzes the social, institutional, and intellectual networks involved in the circulation of al-Ījī's *kalam* works in this region. My paper suggests that both texts were being studied and commented upon in Cairo by the second half of the 8th/14th century and this engagement only grew over time. The scholars engaged with these texts were associated with a few particular *madrasas* in Cairo, which suggests that these *madrasas* possibly played a role in circulation of al-Ījī's *kalam* texts. These scholars often held important social positions in the Mamlūk society, and a few were known to be close to the Mamlūk court. Based on this evidence, this paper suggests that study of *kalām* was not a marginal activity in the Mamlūk domains. Instead, we find signs of significant engagement with major *kalam* texts by prominent scholars, which merits further research to understand the full extent of development of *kalam* in the Mamlūk regions.

**Yiming Shen, University of Oxford**

An Annotated English Translation of the *Samanvayadiś*

The so-called 'samanvaya tradition' is a Sanskrit grammatical school found in Kashmir in the late first millennium and early second millennium A.D. The tradition seems to be under the influence of both the Pāṇinian grammatical school and non-Pāṇinian grammatical schools such as the Kātantra. As the name implies (samanvaya means roughly 'mutual connection; syntax'), the texts in the 'samanvaya tradition' focus more than usual on the syntax of Sanskrit, and do so in a distinctive way. The Samanvayadiś is perhaps the oldest text in this 'samanvaya tradition', and provided the foundation for younger texts such as the Samanvayapradīpa. The text of the Samanvayadiś, extant in an incomplete form, has been edited in Slaje 1992 (reference below), but a translation and, on that basis, study of this text is still a research desideratum. I would like to present my ongoing work on an annotated English translation of the Samanvayadiś — in particular, I study the elements (e.g. sūtra quotations and particular suffixes) in the Samanvayadiś taken from other grammatical schools such as the Pāṇinian and the Kātantra and attempt to shed light on the intellectual milieu in which the Samanvayadiś was situated.

[Reference]

Slaje, Walter (1992). 'Kuḍakas Samanvayadiś und die Folgeliteratur'. Wiener Zeitschrift für die Kunde Südasiens und Archiv für indische Philosophie 36: 105-126.

**John Lowe, Jim Benson and Yiming Shen, University of Oxford**

Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa and Nāgeśa on Negation

The correct understanding of negation is an important philosophical and linguistic question. While the theories of negation in Indian philosophical systems such as Navya-Nyāya and Mīmāṃsā have been well studied (among many others, for example, Matilal's *The Navya-Nyāya doctrine of Negation*, HOS 46, 1968), the theory of negation developed by the later Indian grammatical (vyākaraṇa) tradition, which set itself in direct competition with Nyāya and Mīmāṃsā, remains underexplored. We report on a detailed study and comparison of five discussions of negation, two by Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa, in his *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇa* and *Vaiyākaraṇabhūṣaṇsāra*, and three by Nāgeśa, in his *Laghumañjūṣā*, *Paramalaghumañjūṣā*,

and *Vaiyākaraṇasiddhāntamañjūṣā*. On the basis of these texts we establish in broad terms the grammarians' theory of negation, and we compare and contrast this with the competing views of the Naiyāyikas and Mīmāṃsakas. At a greater level of detail, however, we find differences not only between Kauṇḍabhaṭṭa and Nāgeśa, but even between the different works of each author. This enables us both to trace the development of grammatical theorizing about negation, and also to gain a better understanding of the relations and differences between these five major texts of the late grammatical tradition.

**Colton Siegmund, University of Chicago**

Debating Culpability: Epistemic Modality in “The Nippur Murder Trial”

The “Nippur Murder Trial” is a literary court case written in Sumerian that captures the modern imagination all the while encapsulating Mesopotamian concepts of jurisprudence. While the composition provides unique insight into Mesopotamian law, this presentation will focus on the ways in which the modal prefix {he} operates epistemically to convey previously unrecognized modal notions. Within this composition, the prosecuting assembly and the defense's character witnesses debate the culpability of a woman who was made an accessory after the fact. It is in this exchange that we find the {he} modal prefix connoting epistemic notions of doubt, speculation, and certainty. This sophisticated interplay of modalized speeches traded between opposing parties provides the scholar with an intriguing glance into the complexities of Sumerian modality, the in-depth study of which has been a desideratum.

**Barbora Sojkova, Balliol College, University of Oxford**

Standing Tall in Vedic

The Vedic formula *ūrdhva- sthā-*, “to stand upright” has been noticed by a few scholars but never sufficiently explained. Whilst Lommel (1931) and Bailey (1954) thought that it might mean “to be helpful, to serve”, Kuiper (1960) argued that it is connected with overcoming darkness and death. All of these authors, however, based their interpretation solely on the Ṛgveda (RV). This paper will attempt to deepen our understanding of the formula on the basis of later Vedic literature. To set the scene, I will discuss the ten-odd RV instances of the formula and its Indo-European

cognates, including the Avestan *ərəδβa- stā-* (Yt 13.76). I will suggest that in the RV, the phrase is applied only to a specific group of gods and phenomena: Dawn, Agni, Indra, and a sacrificial post.

The second part of my paper will consider the post-RV development of the formula. I will discuss the occurrence of the phrase in the Atharvaveda, including the famous healing hymn AVŚ 4.12. This hymn concludes with a non-metrical phrase *prāti tiṣṭhordhvāḥ* which suggests that when a person stands up after a healing ritual, they are healthy (cf. the Greek cognate ἑστασεν ὀρθοῦς in Pindar's *Pyth.* 3.53.) I will connect the phrase to the Brāhmaṇa material: in particular to the dichotomy of *ūrdhva* and *āvañc* creatures (PB 6.2.8, ŚBM 2.5.2-3, AB 2.2, etc.), and the mythical narrative according to which animals (*paśu*) used to walk upright and on two feet but due to their fear of sacrifice, they started crouching down and ended up on all fours (ŚBM 3.7.3.1-3). Based on these passages, I will argue that the phrase *ūrdhva- sthā-* seems to describe the characteristic feature of people: an upright, bipedal position – an exact opposite of the four-footed, down-looking animals. I will suggest that in late Vedic prose, 'to stand tall' has a connotation of a healthy human being.

### **Hannah Stork, Yale University**

Lexical Borrowings and the Qur'ān's Social Environment(s): Reassessing "The Foreign Vocabulary of the Qur'ān"

In 1938, Australian scholar Arthur Jeffery published *The Foreign Vocabulary of the Qur'ān*, the first draft of which he had written in 1926. The book, which provides a historical discussion of each of 275 identified loanwords in the Qur'ān, has since become the standard citation for scholars working on the composition of the Qur'ān or the origins of Islam. However, despite the linguistic advances of the last 80 years, no one has systematically reexamined the makeup of Jeffery's list of loanwords; in particular, no one has highlighted the significant distinctions between Jeffery's three categories of "foreign vocabulary"—only one of which truly constitutes genuine lexical borrowing.

My paper makes a preliminary attempt at paring down Jeffery's list to a smaller collection of only legitimate loanwords. Having done so, it then analyzes these loanwords in light of recent sociolinguistic advancements and developments in social network theories, seeking to learn more about the social context out of which the Qur'ān arose.

In particular, I focus on the location of these loanwords within the Qur'ān, comparing their distribution with the subdivision of suras proposed by Andreas Kaplony in 2018. On the basis of features like the specific terms used for God (*rabb al-‘ālamīn*, *al-raḥmān*, or other), Kaplony proposed that the suras of the Qur'ān can be divided into distinct groups, likely of diverse provenance. My analysis of lexical borrowings in the Qur'ān reinforces Kaplony's theory: the overwhelming majority of the Qur'ān's loanwords are found only in suras from Kaplony's *rabb al-‘ālamīn* group. The findings suggest that these suras arose from a cultural context characterized by open social networks and extensive contact with communities using Ge'ez, Hebrew, and Aramaic. The compositional context of the suras in Kaplony's *al-raḥmān* group, meanwhile, seems to have involved far less social contact with foreign communities.

**Sally J. Sutherland Goldman, University of California at Berkeley**

The Never-Ending Story: Obsession and Repetition in Vālmīki's *Rāmāyaṇa*

Well known to audiences of both the *Mahābhārata* and the *Rāmāyaṇa* are the plethora of popular *upākhyānas*, “secondary narratives,” and purāṇic-style narratives that fill both epics. These episodes, both individual and collectively, have been the focus of numerous important and influential studies that have furthered our understanding of the textual, literary, social, religious, and political histories and influence of these seminal epics.<sup>1</sup> One of the striking features that has seemingly marked a major differentiation between the two epics has been the location, frequency, and use of these substories within their respective textual traditions. The *Mahābhārata* has many more such individual episodes and these occur throughout the entire epic. Moreover they are, for the most part, considered well integrated into the style and flow of the frame story. On the other hand, the *Rāmāyaṇa* locates its subnarratives sparsely within the larger narrative, primarily locating them in its first and last books. Their narrative significance is not as obvious as those found in the larger epic, and their linguistic and poetic style has been questioned. These features have led to a common assumption that these “purāṇic-type” tales are relatively late accretions to the larger text. However, there is a second type of sub-narrative



found in the Rāmāyaṇa—one that is ubiquitous. This is the story of the *Rāmāyaṇa* itself. While the focuses on sub-narratives that tell stories that highlight and the frame the concerns and anxieties of the main story and characters, the *Rāmāyaṇa* rather obsessively retells its own story throughout the epic from the view-points of numerous and varied figures. It is on these retellings that this paper focuses with an eye to demarcating, contextualizing, and analyzing their function and purpose within the larger epic story.

<sup>1</sup> See, for example, Brockington (*The Sanskrit Epics*, Leiden: Brill, 1998), Adluri and Bagchee (*Argument and Design: The Unity of the Mahābhārata*, Leiden: Brill, 2016); Goldman and Goldman (*The Rāmāyaṇa of Vālmīki: Volume VII, Uttarakāṇḍa*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016, pp. 1–222).

### **Eli Tadmor, Yale University**

#### **Erudite Savagery: An Instance of Intertextuality in Ashurbanipal's Inscriptions**

In recent years, several scholars have studied intertextuality in Assyrian royal inscriptions, and many passages in them have been found to include references and allusions to various Mesopotamian literary and scholarly texts. One passage that has not yet been examined for possible cases of intertextuality is the description of the Ashurbanipal's sack of Babylon in 648 BCE, found in three identically worded passages in the king's inscriptions. This presentation examines two sections of this description, numbering 13 lines in total. It aims to demonstrate that they contain several allusions to Standard Babylonian literary and religious texts: *Erra and Išum*, the *Babylonian Theodicy*, and the *Marduk Prophecy*. The ways in which the author of the inscription alludes to these texts are analyzed, and hypotheses regarding the ideological meaning of the allusions are proposed: First, that these learned intertextual references are meant to stress Ashurbanipal's self-professed erudition to the reader. Second, that all of the texts alluded to describe suffering which was divinely inflicted, thus reinforcing the message that the misery of the Babylonians was sanctioned by the gods. Third, the attribution to Ashurbanipal of violence reminiscent of that committed by deities in literature makes the great king appear like their agent or an almost god-like figure, thus magnifying his importance.

**Jennifer Tobkin, George Washington University**

Muḥammad b. Dāwūd's Poetic Nostalgia for an Idealized Brotherly Friendship

Muḥammad b. Dāwūd's Poetic Nostalgia for an Idealized Brotherly Friendship

In *The Zephyrs of Najd*, Jaroslav Stetkevych demonstrated how Arabic poets throughout the centuries, and working in various poetic forms and genres, evoked nostalgia by repurposing motifs from the *nasīb* section of the pre-Islamic *qaṣīda*. This way of reading Arabic poetry is helpful in interpreting the poems attributed to the pseudonymous *baʿḍ ahl hādhā al-ʿaṣr* (a Man of Our Times) in *Kitāb al-Zahra*, an anthology that focuses on *ghazal* and in which Abbasid poets feature prominently. The presumptive author of the Man of Our Times poems is Muḥammad b. Dāwūd al-Iṣfahānī al-Zāhirī (d. 297/910), the compiler of *Kitāb al-Zahra*. The Man of Our Times poems describe or allude to the persona's nostalgia for his erstwhile friendship with a man he refers to as his "brother." In some of the poems, he uses features of the *nasīb* to dramatize the relationship and his emotional response to it. Some poems include passing references to *nasīb* motifs such as deserted encampments, the day of separation, and sleepless nights where the persona keeps watch over the stars. One poem, ostensibly a petition for the Brother's forgiveness, interpolates a famous line by al-Khansā' to this effect. Twenty-six of the Man of Our Times poems are either explicitly set in the desert wilderness or at least imply that the persona is traveling. It is in these poems that nostalgia is most evident. Some of them include toponyms of remote places, whereas the Man of Our Times otherwise presents himself as a Baghdadi gentleman. It is as if the loneliness and confoundment of the wilderness is a macrocosm of the sorrow of the lover separated from his beloved.

**Gary Tubb, University of Chicago**

Bharata Miśra and the Śṛṅgeri Movement

The *Spṛṇṇasiddhi* of Bharata Miśra is a prose treatise in Sanskrit supporting much of the content of Maṇḍana Miśra's famous work on grammatical philosophy by the same name. Although almost nothing is known about its author or the date of its composition, several scholars have suggested a date in the mid-16<sup>th</sup> century. The work is notable for several apparent innovations of philosophical interest, including new ideas on the role of Vedic texts as evidence for ontological and metaphysical views. Some of these ideas are presented in the

same sequence in a commentary on Maṇḍana Miśra's text, the *Gopālikā* of Ṛṣiputra Parameśvara, composed early in the 15th century, but hardly any scholarship on the relationship between Bharata's treatise and Parameśvara's commentary exists.

An examination of the relevant passages in these texts and their connection with other Sanskrit works on grammar and philosophy will suggest that Bharata Miśra's treatise was probably known to Parameśvara, and that it reflected new thinking on language and philosophy looking back to the views of the early philosopher-grammarian Bhartṛhari but differing from some mainline stances among later grammarians, and recognizably shaped by new outlooks on Advaita Vedānta, on related forms of nondualist philosophy, and on the uses of Vedic language, developed under the influence of treatises associated with the Śringeri monastery during the early period of the Vijayanagara empire.

**Elizabeth Tucker, University of Oxford**

Did the rishis of the Rigveda have evil cousins? Atharvaveda Paippalāda 11.4.5, Atharvaveda Śaunaka 19.35.5.

A hapax legomenon *ṛṣṇavo* occurs in an interesting Atharvaveda stanza of a hymn to the *Janigida* plant. The form does not appear in any of our lexica and has been overlooked by historical linguists as the Śaunaka manuscripts read *kṛṣṇávo*, and in the Śaunaka edition by Roth and Whitney (1856) this has been emended to *kṛtvano*, translated '[witchcraft] workers' by Whitney and Lanman (1905).

However, the existence of the form *ṛṣṇavo* in the Paippalāda is proved to be ancient by the agreement in reading between the Oriya palm-leaf manuscripts first discovered by Durgamohan Bhattacharya in 1950s and the birch-bark manuscript brought by Roth to Tübingen from Kashmir in 1875. Since *kāṇḍa* 19 is a supplement to the Śaunakasaṃhitā which consists mostly of Paippalāda material, it is likely that the Śaunaka Atharvaveda also originally read *ṛṣṇávo*, especially as this reading appears in the commentary by 'Sāyaṇa'. *kṛṣṇávo* may be explained as a later corruption of obsolete *ṛṣṇávo*, understood in its context as 'dark ones'.

The paper will discuss the whole AV stanza (AVP 11.4.5, AVŚ 19.35.5), where the syntax clearly shows that *ṛṣṇávo* must be nominative plural from a *u*-stem noun *ṛṣṇú-*. On the basis of a

morphological analysis *ṛṣ-ṇú-*, and parallels for the use of *devákṛta-* which qualifies *ṛṣṇávo*, it will be argued that *ṛṣṇú-* may be etymologically related to the Indo-Iranian noun *ṛṣi-* ‘composer of hymns, poet, sage’, Old Avestan *ərəši-* probably ‘poet, sage’. It can be envisaged that *ṛṣṇú-* like *ṛṣi-* originally referred to people who knew powerful verbal formulae (*deváttam bráhma* RV 1.37.4, 8.32.27); but that, whereas the *ṛṣi-* was associated in early Vedic culture with using them for good ritual purposes, the *ṛṣṇú-* became associated with bad or hostile uses.

**Janet Um, University of California, Berkeley**

Name-Dropping in the *kavipraśaṃsā* of Daṇḍin’s *Avantisundarī*

Daṇḍin’s *gadyakāvya* (literary prose composition) the *Avantisundarī* opens with a twenty-seven verse preamble. In it, the *kavipraśaṃsā* (praise of poets past) extols well-known authors, such as Śūdraka, Bhāsa, Sarvasena, Kālidāsa, Nārāyaṇa, Bāṇa, and Mayūra, and famous literary works, such as the *Rāmāyaṇa*, the *Mahābhārata*, the *Bṛhatkathā*, and the *Setubandha*. Due to this illustrious list of poets and works in the *Avantisundarī*’s preamble, and coupled with the biographical mode of the work’s framing narrative, the primary interest of modern literary scholars has been in the historical usefulness of these sections for creating literary and dynastic chronologies.

Building on Sheldon Pollock’s (1995) examination of the *kavipraśaṃsā* as an entry into a work’s literary history and as a means of both canon-creation and self-canonization on the part of a work’s author, my paper repositions the significance of the *Avantisundarī*’s preamble. In it, I explore the *Avantisundarī*’s verse preamble, not as a poetic convention, but rather as a metadiscursive site where the poet articulates the work’s artistic project and its relationship with past poets and poetic traditions. By placing its *kavipraśaṃsā* in conversation with the *kavipraśaṃsās* of other works of literary prose, such as Bāṇa’s *Harṣacarita* and *Kādambarī*, I point to the family resemblances among these works and explore the narrative traditions that animate the literary genre of *gadyakāvya*.

**Yusuf Unal, Emory University**

The Genesis and Evolution of a Religious Narrative in Safavid Iran: “The Green Island Story” (*Jazīrah-i Khadrāʾ*)

This paper examines a popular Persian religious narrative that appeared in Safavid Iran during the reign of Shah Tahmasb (r. 1524-1576) and describes an intriguing journey to “the Green Island,” where the Twelfth Imam and his companions were believed to be living. It shows how the Green Island story was produced from the model of a pre-existing Arabic framed tale, “The Story of the Five Islands,” which had been in circulation in the central Islamic lands prior to the advent of the Safavids in 1501. A comparative reading of the two stories demonstrates that sixteenth-century writers developed the Green Island story into a detailed narrative presenting the model of a utopian Shiite state that would resonate with the nascent Safavid state and its main religious and political concerns. Hints in the text suggest that the Green Island story was germane to the polemical sensibilities of the time, and especially to the contested issue of the legal status of the Friday prayer. This study argues that the production and dissemination of the story were undertaken to drum up popular support for a view that held that that Friday prayer could be performed if a mujtahid presided over it or granted permission for its performance, a view advocated mainly by al-Muhaqqiq al-Karaki (d. 940/1534) and his grandson, Mir Husayn Mujtahid al-Karaki (d. 1001/1592-93). Moreover, by comparing one of the earliest extant copies of the story, still in manuscript, with a version recorded by Muhammad Baqir Majlisi (d. 1111/1699) in his *Bihar al-anwar*, this study highlights notable alterations in the later version that are in line with the changing religious landscape during the late Safavid period. More broadly, this study maintains that the exploration of popular religious narratives plays a crucial part in exploring the contours of conversion to Shiite Islam and the imagination of a new society and religious identity through imagined narratives in Safavid Iran.

**Kevin van Bladel, Yale University**

Another Hypothesis on the *Ṣābiʾūn* of the Qurʾān

In three passages the Qurʾān mentions people called *al-ṣābiʾūn*, together with believers (“those who believe”), the Jews (*al-Yahūd*), and the Nazoraeans or Christians (*al-Naṣārā*).

From this context, a list of religious groups, it is evident that the *ṣābi'ūn* were a group distinct by their religious background.

Within a few generations of Muḥammad, the people intended by the term *ṣābi'ūn* became controversial, if not completely forgotten. This allowed different groups to claim the scriptural epithet to acquire legitimacy under the domination of Muslims. In the ninth century, even the pagan community remaining at Ḥarrān laid claim to the name. Some Muslims pointed to other less well-known religious sects, such as the Mandaean, as the “true *ṣābi'ūn*.” To this day, however, nobody knows with certainty who the *ṣābi'ūn* were supposed to be in the time of Muḥammad. Modern scholars have offered many conflicting hypotheses about their identity.

This paper reviews previous suggestions and offers a new hypothesis to identify the *ṣābi'ūn*. It proposes that the identity of the *ṣābi'ūn* has been hiding in plain sight.

**Jacqueline Vayntrub, Yale University**

The Voice Remains: A Biblical Poetics of Memorial and Testament

Scholars estimate that up to a third of the Hebrew Bible is poetry, including hymns, victory songs, laments, and prophecy. These have been studied by the literary principles of rhythm and poetic structure. But what if this is not the only way to think about biblical poetry? My project begins with a different question: How did biblical authors *themselves* understand poetry? What we tend to read as “poems” function in the Bible as a special kind of speech, that is, representations of the embodied human voice. Scholars have gestured towards theorizing the voice in biblical poetry by applying theories of performance and emphasizing biblical poetry’s oral origins—variously, its historical development, authorial mindset, or informing style. In “The Voice Remains,” I move this conversation forward using theories of the voice and its role in literary production found in philosophy, comparative literature, media studies, and the Classics, showing how biblical poets creatively sought to inscribe their craft of beauty and persuasion as a living, breathing artifact of the embodied voice. Reading biblical deathbed poems of Isaac, Jacob, and Moses alongside West Semitic Iron Age monumental inscriptions (e.g., Mesha, Kulumuwa, Azatiwada, etc.) I generate a theory of the poetic voice as extension of the social individual whose words persist in their inscription.

**Paul E. Walker, University of Chicago**

Shahrastani and the Ismailis: A critical reappraisal of the evidence

One of the major puzzles of classical Islamic thought is the exact sectarian affiliation of Shahrastānī (d. 1153), the author of the *Book of Religions and Sects* (*Kitāb al-milal wa'l-niḥal*) and a noted champion of Ash'arite *kalām*. Was he, however, either secretly or overtly, an adherent of the Ismaili cause as alleged by a few of those who knew him personally and by a growing number of modern scholars? Despite considerable recent scholarship that purports to establish a connection, much vital evidence has either been missed, or ignored, and often interpreted in a tendentious manner to prove that he was an Ismaili. The evidence falls into three clusters: a) some off-handed remarks by his own contemporaries; b) what he himself has to say about the Ismailis in a special entry at the end of his review of Muslim sects in the above mentioned book; and finally c) a fairly distinct set of doctrines or analytical categories he uses rather prominently in his later writings (*Masāra'a*, *Mafātīḥ* and *Majlis*). However, a close, impartial look at the evidence in almost no way supports the Ismaili claim.

What he wrote in the *Milal* comprises reports respectively on the doctrines of the older Ismaili *da'wa* and newer *da'wa* of Ḥasan-i Ṣabbāḥ. The first attributes to the Ismailis doctrines, some recognizable as being Ismaili and some, at least one in particular, no Ismaili would ever have advocated. The second faults Ibn Ṣabbāḥ for sharply restricting the doctrinal message of his followers to the *ta'lim* argument and nothing more, no theology and no further discussion. It is hard to argue that Shahrastānī, based on this evidence, was an Ismaili, even intellectually. Lastly we have the set of terms and concepts that are undeniably his but have no known Ismaili precedents. They appear to be original with him. That they were adopted among the Nizārī Ismailis of later decades does not prove that the man who invented them was himself one of them despite persistent attempts to claim him retroactively.

**Bruce Wells, University of Texas at Austin**

Trial Records, Manumissions, and the Legal Status of the Babylonian Temple Oblate

In recent scholarship, one finds at least four different views on the legal status of the temple oblate (*širku*) during the sixth century BCE: enslaved (Westbrook 2004), free (Ragen 2007),

emancipated (Wunsch and Magdalene 2014), and imprecise (Kleber 2011). The problem is that some texts, especially certain trial records, appear to use terms for oblate status (*śirkūtu*) and free status (*mār bānūtu*) interchangeably and other texts, especially sale contracts, in a mutually exclusive fashion. What seems to have gone unnoticed is that most manumission documents from this period not only declare an individual to be free from enslavement but also specify what his or her subsequent status will be—e.g., adoptee, temple oblate, free citizen. I argue that this element of manumission documents points the way to a clearer understanding of how oblates were treated by the legal system of the time. It strongly implies that the initial act of manumission removed individuals from slave status but that a second declaration was required for them to receive the full status of a free citizen. The conclusion is that oblates held a status such as emancipated and could not be bought and sold as ordinary slaves but were still subject to the authority of the household's *paterfamilias*, which in their case was the temple of the deity whom they served. The paper will survey the relevant evidence and show how this conclusion presents the most plausible explanation.

### Jarrod Whitaker, Wake Forest University

The Danger of Picking Unripe Fruit: Rebellion, Revolution, and Military  
Dissension in Ancient India.

This paper will examine the complex ways that the *Arthaśāstra* (c. 100-300 CE) classifies and responds to revolt, rebellion, or insurrection, which can arise from the king's subjects, ministers, military forces, and political enemies. The Sanskrit word commonly used for revolt is *kopa*, which comes from the verbal root √*kup* "to be agitated, angry." It appears throughout the text 89 times, either as a standalone noun (*kopa*, cf. *prakopaka*) or in compounded forms (e.g., *antaḥkopa*, *abhyantarakopa*, *bāhyakopa*, *paścātkopa*, *prakṛtikopa*). In several cases, verbal forms are also used (e.g., *kupyati*, *kopayati*). Kauṭilya is well aware that the king must mitigate the threat of rebellion 1) to protect his public image and good standing; 2) to maintain geopolitical control; 3) to avoid uprisings during campaigns, and 4) to safeguard his rule from internal dissension and treason. In his typically shrewd manner, Kauṭilya advises the king on ways he can take advantage of, and even instigate, social unrest for political gain (5). A systematic examination of



these issues will underscore the very real threat rebellions posed to ancient Indian rulers, while also highlighting some of the intricacies of statecraft in ancient India around the turn of the Common Era.

**James Reich, Pace University and Ben Williams, Naropa University**

Transmitting the Mind of the Author: Abhinavagupta on Saṅkrānti

It has long been recognized that for the Śaiva theologian Abhinavagupta there are deep, often implicit, connections between aesthetics and theology. This paper examines a previously unexplored convergence of these paradigms by comparing the theory of textual transmission in the opening portion of Abhinavagupta's *Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī* and in the commentarial essay on *rasa* in the *Abhinavabhāratī*. We will demonstrate that in both places Abhinavagupta uses parallel terminology to theorize how the awareness of an author is "transferred" [*saṃkram*] to a properly receptive reader, which suggests a similar mechanism of textual transmission. In both cases, this transference happens by means of a shift of grammatical person and tense, such that, for example, a statement that Utpaladeva makes about himself can eventually, via the text, become a statement that the reader makes about themselves. Whereas in the *Abhinavabhāratī* this idea is fleshed out according to ideas and terminology drawn from Mīmāṃsā, in the *Īśvarapratyabhijñāvimarśinī* the term clearly resonates with concepts of direct "transmission" (*saṃkramaṇa*) of liberating insight from guru to disciple, prevalent in Abhinavagupta's Kaula scriptural sources. We will therefore argue that the underlying project uniting these disparate explorations, for Abhinavagupta, is the attempt to develop a model of how texts can, on their own and in the absence of their authors, successfully transfer the mind and experience of their author to the reader, akin to how liberation can be transferred by a living master during an initiatory ritual. We will further argue that this project itself has deeper roots in Abhinavagupta's concern to stabilize and preserve Kaula lineages that had come to be centered upon charismatic gurus, thus guarding against potential obsolescence in the absence of formal institutional structures.

**Kai Sum WONG, University of Arizona**

Reexamining the Formation History of *Kongzi jiyu*

*Kongzi jiyu*, edited and commented by Wang Su (195-256), is a compilation of political discourse and anecdotes centering around Confucius and his disciples. Since scholars from the tenth century onward tend to regard *KZJY* as a forged text, its study had been largely neglected until the recent decade, when excavated manuscripts necessitated its reexamination. While *KZJY* is often postulated as a product of gradual textual accretion, existing studies have yet to identify concrete evidence to disentangle its formation process.

My investigation of the formation and redaction history of *KZJY* examines two types of evidence, that require further scholarly attention: 1) The three postscripts of *KZJY*: Moving beyond the existing dispute over their authenticity, this study turns to a rhetorical analysis, examining their structure, literary devices and narrative strategies. It suggests an anxiety of orthodoxy, with which these materials prescribe to the later audience how they should read and understand *KZJY* in the context of Han period intellectual history. 2) A comparison of textual sharing between *KZJY* and *Liji*. Previous research has shown that *KZJY* contains extensive textual parallels with over twenty early Chinese compilations, with the largest amount being between *KZJY* and *Liji*. By comparing these two texts, this paper sheds light on how the *KZJY*'s redactors might have revised and transformed earlier writings, arguing for the existence of a multiplicity of textual layers within *KZJY*. Together, these two lines of inquiries reveal not only the early evolution of *KZJY*, but also textual and scholarly practices during the Han period.

**Yan Xu, Fudan University**

Reinterpretation of Tao Yuanming's (ca. 365–427) Thirteen Poems: A Zhuangzian Perspective

Although some scholars have successfully challenged traditional biographical reading, which often takes the author's biography as important reference, and proposed proper reinterpretation for many of Tao's poems, we can still find its dominance in the interpretation of words and sentences, even structure and theme of some of Tao's poems. In light of the above-mentioned issue, this paper will reinterpret 13 Tao's poems based on our detailed investigation of all the existing notes on Tao's poems. Most biographical reading, shaped by the ideal image of

intellectuals portrayed in the *Analects* 論語, conceals the substantial connections with *Zhuangzi* 莊子 in Tao's poetry in different degrees. Our reinterpretation focuses on the revelation of intertextual relationship between Tao's poems and *Zhuangzi*, and unfolds from three aspects: the joy of drinking, the pain in reality, and the worldly concerns. These are the three main aspects of both Tao's poetry and his biography, thus reflecting the influence of biographical reading and the process to extricate the reading of Tao's poetry from such influence. As the gist of *Zhuangzi* is often opposite to the gist of the *Analects*, our reinterpretation, focusing on the implication of *Zhuangzi* which has been neglected, quite differs from existing annotations with the remains of biographical narrative centering on the *Analects*, and sometimes discovers values contrary to that claimed by existing readings. Through such reinterpretation, we can see that the influence of *Zhuangzi* on Tao's poetry is more extensive and far-reaching than that has been disclosed. It may deepen our comprehension of how the voice of *Zhuangzi*, such as the thoughts on freedom, benevolence and righteousness 仁義 and accomplishments, echoes in Tao's poems. This can also help us discover the connection of Tao's poetry with the metaphysical institution 玄風 in the Eastern Jin dynasty, which sought a view of life from *Zhuangzi* instead of taking Confucianism as the only source.

**Baoli Yang, Brown University**

Wang Zhaojun in Dunhuang: The Isomorphism of the Family and State in Medieval Chinese Manuscript Culture

My paper discusses populist ambivalence over medieval imperialism in the prosimetric manuscript (Dunhuang P. 2553) featuring the historical figure Wang Zhaojun of the Han dynasty (202BC -220 AD). Methodologically, this paper synthesizes the literary, historical, and material approaches to Tang studies exemplified by scholars like Stephen Owen, Jack Chen, and Christopher Nugent, to explore the agencies of border regions in medieval China. It contributes to a new understanding of Tang's imperialism.

The Dunhuang prosimetric text, by refashioning the historiographic and poetic narratives of Wang Zhaojun's marriage diplomacy, articulates an incongruence between the Tang's lucid imperialist agenda and the opaque conceptualization of "imperial subjects" in the frontier

region. This incongruence largely appears when the main characters in the prosimetric text alter their behavior patterns stipulated by “the isomorphism of the family and state,” an important notion which has not garnered sufficient scholarly attention. Historically, to achieve hegemonic power by tightly controlling his subjects' ideology, Emperor Xuanzong (713-756) implemented a series of policies, including emphasizing *The Classic of Filial Piety* with his own commentary. His commentary highlighted a transferability between an individual's filial piety and political loyalty. This transferability, forming an analogous cosmos between the family and state, advocates total submission from the imperial subjects, especially those who partake in marriage diplomacy.

Yet, the Dunhuang presomeric text foregrounds Wang Zhaojun's lyrical obsession with the Han emperor and the foreign chanyu's unrestrained chivalry to his unrequited lover. Both characters acknowledge and renege on their obligations assigned by the logic of marriage diplomacy, namely the isomorphism of the family and state. Zhaojun becomes a painstaking defender for her subjectivity rather than a sexually re-exploited imperial subject, while Chanyu assumes the role of a capable, decisive sovereign. I argue that the remodeled Chinese romantic tragedy parallels the historical transferability of the border town Dunhuang.

### **Xiaoshan Yang University of Notre Dame**

#### **Buying, Borrowing, Swapping, and Swindling: Modes of Collecting in the Northern Song**

This presentation investigates the modes and significance of the circulation of aesthetic artifacts (such as paintings, calligraphy, and fantastic rocks) in the collecting culture of the Northern Song. It sheds spotlight on three areas that have not been explored by art and cultural historians in depth so far. The first is the underhanded ways and means through which such artifacts are acquired and collected. The second is the tensions over these objects in social interactions among literati as recorded by in the writings of the collectors themselves as well as other sources. These tensions are often informed by and revelatory of the power relations between the parties involved. The third is the participation of elements from the lower strata of society in the culture of collecting and the resultant inter-class sociality between literati and commoners. The presentation draws primarily on the writings by and about Su Shi

(1037–1101), Huang Tingjian (1045–1105) and Mi Fu (1051–1117), three of the greatest artists of the Northern Song.

**Zhuming Yao, Princeton University**

**The Two Faces of the Early Chinese Cultural Hero**

In early Chinese writings, cultural heroes have a heavy presence. From epigraphy to philosophy and history, such figures like the sage kings of the past not only frequent the texts by allusion but also present themselves to be speaking directly to an audience. Later in the tradition, other figures like the loyal advisors to the king also began to capture the *imaginaire* of literary creation. Poetry and prose both exploited their loyal service for inspiration. Behind such prevalence of the cultural hero, this paper argues, lies two different processes of mythmaking. The kings started out as allusions and as the spokespersons of good order. Their appearance in writing serves the purpose of engagement with the past, and their individual identity makes little difference if at all introduced. Tokenization of a discursive purpose is what they all represent. The loyal advisor, on the other hand, is the product of biography. In that tradition of biographical writing, one name—Qu Yuan, for example—has only one or one type of attributes; they all come onto the historical stage fully prepared to do and only do what they are known for. A name is therefore a tokenization of a biographical attribute. This difference allowed the writers at the time to easily identify with, write about, or directly impersonate a name with whom they shared the same attribute, however aspirational. From there, this paper concludes, arose the first instances of the “lyric I” in the Chinese tradition. Altogether, this paper portrays a nuanced history of mythmaking previously unrecognized, based on which a new account for the mimetic nature of early Chinese first-person poetry is also proffered.

**Mina Yazdani Eastern Kentucky University**

**Poetry as a Means of Confessional Expression: The Case of Shaykh al-Raʿīs’s Ode**

The complex life and legacy of Abū al-Ḥasan Mīrzā Shaykh al-Raʿīs (1848-1920) are in dire need of further study. An unusual figure, Shaykh al-Raʿīs was an Iranian prince, a cleric, a poet, an advocate of Islamic unity, a constitutionalist, and a heterodox in his religious affiliations. A

grandson of the Qājār ruler Fath-‘Alī Shāh (d. 1834), Abu al-Ḥasan Mīrzā received the title Shaykh al-Raīs from his cousin Nāṣir al-Dīn Shāh (r. 1848-1896). After studying literature and philosophy in Iran, Shaykh al-Raīs moved to the Shī‘ī shrine cities of Iraq where he became a student of Mīrzā Ḥasan Shīrāzī (d. 1896), the preeminent Shī‘ī scholar of the time, and attained the status of a mujtahid. While Shaykh al-Raīs’s unique constellation of identities has attracted the attention of both Iranian and Western scholars, Muslim Iranian scholars writing about him, such as his biographer Ibrāhīm Ṣafāī, have denied his true religious identity as a follower of the Bāb (d. 1850) and Bahá’u’lláh (d. 1892), the founders of the Bahā’ī religion. Juan Cole, exploring Shaykh al-Raīs’s life, has provided ample evidence for Shaykh al-Raīs’s being a Bahā’ī, notwithstanding Shaykh al-Raīs’s own “strategic silence” about this issue, the full disclosure of which would have endangered his life in nineteenth century Iran. Through a close reading and analysis of one the most eloquent odes written by Shaykh al-Raīs, beginning with “*Tamashshīkun, tamāshā kun*” (“Walk the path and observe”), this paper argues that to the eyes of the readers familiar with the fundamental tenets of the Bahā’ī religion, this ode marks a declaration of the author’s faith in the Bāb and Bahá’u’lláh.

**Zhang Zhan 張湛, University of Oxford**

Early New Persian in Non-Arabic Scripts

The large number of loanwords from Arabic in New Persian is one of the most prominent linguistic features that set New Persian apart from Middle Persian/Pahlavi. While most New Persian manuscripts were written in Arabic script, a few, including some very early ones, were written in non-Arabic scripts, including Hebrew, Syriac, and Manichean scripts. Are there as many Arabic loanwords in these manuscripts? What could they tell us about the development of Early New Persian and its speakers?

In my presentation, I shall investigate such three groups of New Persian manuscripts in non-Arabic scripts, all discovered in Xinjiang, China. The first group includes two letters from eighth-century Khotan in Hebrew script, Or.8212/166 in the British Library and BH1-19 in the National Library of China. The second group includes two manuscripts in Syriac script from the German Turfan Collection, MIK III/112+SyrHT 153 and M 7340 (T II Toyo). The third group includes 12 fragments from five manuscripts in Manichean script, also from the German Turfan Collection. All

of them have been edited and published before, but no attempt has been made to study them comparatively. I shall show how New Persian in these manuscript groups converge and diverge in term of grammar, orthography, and percentage of Arabic loanwords, which in turn can be an indicator of their dates.

**Amy Zhang, Harvard University**

Articulating “What is Intently on the Mind”: Poetic Composition in the Tang Tale

The study of Tang tales has seen significant increase over the past two decades, and important work has been done to complicate the simplistic binaries of “fiction” and “history” that had dominated traditional discourse on this multivalent body of texts. However, its relationship with poetry deserves more scholarly attention, especially texts that claim to provide the story behind the composition of a poem, traditionally understood to articulate “what is intently on the mind.” In this paper, I discuss two such tales, both concerning historical or semi-historical figures and their act of poetic composition during an important moment in their life. The framing narratives are drawn from both historical biographies and anecdotal accounts, and its juxtaposition with the poem creates new interpretative potential that raises more questions than answers. In what ways is the significance of poetic performance mediated by community and stripped of its author’s intent? How successful is the attempt to preserve the context of a poetic utterance, lost to us forever from the moment it was initially uttered? I argue that Tang tales is a space where the complexities of poetry, rather than its consistencies, are given expression through nuanced storytelling: poetry can become a site of negotiation between internal reflection and external events, and the notion of “poetic intent” is perhaps not merely natural spontaneity, but also conscious construct.

**Mengdie Zhao, Harvard University**

Writing Her Scandal Out: Elite Women and the Justice System in Late Imperial China

In late imperial China, women seeking to file lawsuits usually had to be represented by a male relative. Despite this inconvenience, archival records show that women were active participants

in the legal system. Most of these women whose names are recorded in these archives were poorer or lower-class. Elite families, however, usually refrained from recording family scandals, and elite women were careful to avoid becoming involved in legal disputes. We must therefore rely on literary and anecdotal sources to fill in these gaps in the archival records.

This paper examines poetry attributed to a female litigant who lived in the fifteenth century. The woman was from a gentry family but found herself caught up in unfruitful premarital relationship. Unable to defend herself directly in court or seek informal mediation due to socio-cultural pressure, she eventually wrote her sufferings in poems and sent them to the judges as a last attempt to get justice done. The poems she composed for the court were framed as literary biographical works, but in practice, they served as accusations and evidence against the alleged wrongdoer. In this way, although the woman got herself into trouble due to her “indulgence” in literature, she was also able to right the wrong with her literary talent. While the extent to which these poems reflect historical “fact” is unclear, as works of literary imagination, they provide literary critiques from a female point of view of elite women’s lack of participatory access to the legal system.

**Shiwei Zhou, University of Washington**

Understanding “Slandering”: A Study of Luo Yin’s *Writings of Slandering*

This paper studies a collection of fifty-eight short essays-*Writings of Slandering* written and compiled by the late Tang scholar Luo Yin. Aspiring to a career as an official, Luo Yin failed the civil service exam numerous times and thus was perceived as a clichéd Chinese scholar filled with bitterness and desperation. He was marginalized by contemporaries for his arrogance and idiosyncrasies, while readers from later generations admired him for his acrid yet insightful writings. The controversy among scholars lies in how to view the collection. On the one hand, it has been seen as typical materials prepared according to the “Circulating the Scrolls” tradition; on the other hand, his publications were viewed as the harsh “slandering” projected to the court and the high officials. By analyzing the prose articles’ themes and metaphors, this paper intends to find out who was slandered and how. If Luo Yin was blunt enough in his writing, then he should be recognized as a rebel of the “Circulating the Scrolls” tradition. If “slandering” was only a great title to attract attention and held only mild criticisms, the admiration should purely be for



his writing skills. A study of the themes of the prose articles and close reading of selected pieces show that Luo Yin's "slandering" was largely direct. Although no real name was given, the "slandering" was often directed to specific events where the slanderers played significant parts. Concerning the literary style, the author was most sarcastic towards the ministers. Yet, he respectfully admonished the emperor. Thus, *Writings of Slandering* is a writer's struggle for Luo Yin. He tried to gain recognition and appreciation by producing eye-catching pieces, hoping to launch a career as an official. Still, he could not restrain from criticizing the evil officials and ignorant emperor, apparently harsher than he intended to.

**Zubieta Lupo, Valeria (Independent Researcher, Los Angeles)**

Hittite Medical Prescriptions: CTH 461 Revised.

Among all the documented healing rituals and methods in the Hittite archives, the tablets listed in Laroche's catalogue as "Hittite medical texts" deal with the healing of a diseased person. Each tablet is a compilation of pharmaceutical prescriptions for one or more ailments. The prescriptions are written on a case-by-case basis (beginning with the condition, then the instruction) and organized by disease or afflicted body part.

Burde edited most of the texts cataloged under CTH 461 in 1974. Trémouille (2004) later analyzed specific aspects of the text's structure and vocabulary, and in 2010, Klinger provided a translated version of KUB 44.63 + 8.38 in which he briefly described some aspects of the Hittite medical prescriptions. In addition, Haas (2003) gave a summary of substances used as medical ingredients in a plethora of Hittite texts, including CTH 461. Since the publication of Burde, however, several new texts have come to our attention, and a thorough philological study of the entire corpus has yet to be published.

The purpose of this contribution is to present new corpus findings, and a revised edition of CTH 461. These results are part of my PhD project for the graduate school Early Concepts of Man and Nature: Universal, Local, Borrowed at Johannes Gutenberg Universität in Mainz.

## References

- Burde C. 1974. Hethitische medizinische Texte. Studien zu den Boğazköy-Texten 19. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Haas V. 2003. *Materia Magica et Medica Hethitica*. Ein Beitrag zur Heilkunde im Alten Orient. Berlin: New York.
- Klinger J. 2010. "Hethitische Texte zur Medizin." In *Texte zur Heilkunde*, edited by B. Janowski and D. Schwemer, pp. 177–87. *Texte aus der Umwelt des Alten Testaments: Neue Folge* 5. Gütersloh: Gütersloher Verlagshaus.

